

Comparative Analysis of the French, English,
and Russian Versions of the Musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*

Lira Nassiboullina

A Thesis

in

The Department

of

Études Françaises

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of Master of Arts in Traductologie (Translation Studies) at
Concordia University
Montreal, Quebec, Canada

December 2010

© Lira Nassiboullina, 2010

CONCORDIA UNIVERSITY

School of Graduate Studies

This is to certify that the thesis prepared

By: Lira Nassiboullina

Entitled: Comparative Analysis of the French, English, and Russian
Versions of the Musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*

and submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts (Translation Studies)

complies with the regulations of the University and meets the accepted standards with respect to originality and quality.

Signed by the final examining committee:

Pier-Pascale Boulanger _____ Chair

Deborah Folaron _____ Examiner

Pavel Trofimovich _____ Examiner

Sherry Simon _____ Supervisor

Approved by Caignon Philippe
Chair of Department or Graduate Program Director

_____ 2011 _____

 Brian Lewis
Dean of Faculty

Abstract/Résumé

Comparative Analysis of the French, English, and Russian Versions of the Musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* Lira Nassiboullina

This thesis presents a detailed comparative analysis of the French, English, and Russian versions of the widely acclaimed musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*. For this study, I will examine three versions of *Notre-Dame de Paris*: that were presented in France, in the United States and Great Britain, and in Russia. Although its focus is on translation studies, much of my research is indebted to the contributions of scholars in the field of musical theatre, particularly in the translation of musicals.

I discuss the problems with the English and Russian translations as well as their deviations from the original French text. My methodology is rooted in the analysis of linguistic level such as syntactical figures and rhetorical devices. The results of this research demonstrate how the translator's vision or interpretation of the reality he or she describes can modify the original message of the source text, as displayed by the translations of selected songs. The analysis shows that the English version reproduces the style and content of the source text as closely as possible, whereas the Russian version interprets the source text more freely. Furthermore, I analyze the relationship between the translation of a musical and the reception of the production by its target audience.

Cette thèse présente une analyse comparative approfondie des versions française, anglaise et russe de la comédie musicale largement acclamée *Notre-Dame de Paris*. Aux fins de cette étude, j'explore trois versions de *Notre-Dame de Paris*, celles qui sont présentées en France, aux États-Unis, en Grande-Bretagne et finalement, en Russie. Bien qu'appartenant au domaine des études de traduction, ma recherche est également basée sur les contributions faites par des chercheurs dans le domaine du théâtre musical, en particulier, des comédies musicales et de la traduction.

Je discute des problèmes et des différences qu'on trouve dans les traductions anglaise et russe du texte original français. Ma méthode d'analyse repose sur les niveaux linguistiques qui comprennent les figures syntaxiques et rhétoriques. L'analyse démontrera la façon dont la vision ou l'interprétation de la réalité décrite par le traducteur peut modifier le message d'origine du texte source, ce qui peut être le cas dans la traduction de certaines chansons. L'analyse montre que la version anglaise reprend le style et le contenu du texte source d'aussi près que possible, alors que la version russe donne une idée de la libre interprétation du texte source. Dans cette étude, je présente également une analyse de la relation entre la traduction des comédies musicales et la réception de la production par le public cible.

Dedications

To my late uncle, Tariz Talipovich Nassiboullin, the former director of a School of Art, who dedicated his life to teaching the beauty of the arts, who supported me in all my ventures and encouraged me to discover new cultures and to learn languages.

Acknowledgements

I am sincerely thankful to my adviser, Dr. Sherry Simon for her comments and feedback while working on my research. I appreciate her support when I had doubts about continuing with this project.

I would like to express my gratitude to Tatyana Shestakov for supporting me in my choice to enroll in the Translation Studies program and inspiring me with the subject of this thesis.

I am grateful to Miriam Bitton for providing detailed comments during the process of writing of this work.

I greatly appreciate the assistance of David Bitton whose passion for musicals and critical thinking contributed to development of the subject of this thesis.

I would like to acknowledge Tony Bassil for his encouragements and help through the years of study in this program.

Special thanks go to my parents, relatives, cousins, and friends for their support and interest that has meant a lot for me.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Choice of <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> within the Context of Translation Studies | 1 |
| Objectives | 3 |
| CHAPTER 1. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK..... | 4 |
| Introduction..... | 4 |
| 1.1 Theoretical Framework for Musical Translation | 5 |
| Conclusion | 13 |
| CHAPTER 2. ADAPTATION OF THE NOVEL <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> INTO A MUSICAL FORMAT..... | 14 |
| 2.1 Victor Hugo and the Musical Adaptation of His Novel..... | 14 |
| 2.2 Adaptations of <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> into Movies, Operas, Ballets, etc. | 15 |
| 2.3 Adaptation of the Novel <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> into the Musical..... | 17 |
| 2.4 Luc Plamondon: A Short Biography..... | 18 |
| 2.5 The Rock-Opera <i>Starmania</i> as a Turning Point in French Musical Culture of the 1980s | 19 |
| CHAPTER 3. RECEPTION OF THE MUSICAL | 22 |
| 3.1 Origins of the Musical..... | 22 |
| 3.2 Origins of Musicals in America and Britain | 23 |
| 3.3 The Musical Genre in Russia | 26 |
| 3.4 <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> in France: Migration of the Musical through Different Cultures..... | 28 |
| 3.5 Reception of <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> in Las Vegas (2000) | 31 |

| | | |
|---|---|----|
| 3.6 | Reception of <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> in London (2000)..... | 31 |
| 3.7 | Reception of <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> in Russia (2002) | 34 |
| | Conclusion | 35 |
| 3.8 | Reception of Translation in London, Las Vegas, and Moscow | 36 |
| | Conclusion | 39 |
| CHAPTER 4. ANALYSIS OF FRENCH-ENGLISH-RUSSIAN VERSIONS OF | | |
| SONGS IN THE MUSICAL <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> | | |
| | SONGS IN THE MUSICAL <i>Notre-Dame de Paris</i> | 40 |
| 4.1 | Norms and Problems of Translation..... | 40 |
| 4.2 | English and Russian Translators of the Musical | 46 |
| 4.3 | Comparative Analysis of the Song <i>Belle</i> | 48 |
| 4.4 | Quasimodo's Part | 51 |
| 4.5 | Frollo's Part..... | 56 |
| 4.6 | Phoebus' Part..... | 61 |
| 4.7 | The Final Part | 64 |
| | Conclusion | 66 |
| 4.8 | Translation of Biblical Allusions in the Musical | 67 |
| 4.9 | Comparative Analysis of the Song <i>Les Cloches</i> | 78 |
| | CONCLUSION..... | 86 |
| | Appendix A..... | 91 |
| | Appendix B..... | 94 |
| | Works Cited | 97 |
| | Primary sources..... | 97 |
| | Secondary sources..... | 99 |

Translating is a complex activity, and the devising of singable texts is more difficult than most translating tasks.

Peter Low (2008: 2)

Choice of *Notre-Dame de Paris* within the Context of Translation Studies

My choice of subject matter is based on my personal interest in music and musical theatre. *Notre-Dame de Paris* was selected not only because it has been translated into many languages (English, Italian, Spanish, Korean, and Russian), but also because it was the first French-Canadian musical to achieve commercial and critical success on the Russian stage. Furthermore, it was the first musical officially translated from French into Russian and had inspired many fans to try their hand in providing alternative Russian translations of the French songs.

When I first experienced the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* in French, in English, and later in Russian, I became increasingly fascinated by its astounding cross-cultural flexibility and creativity across an array of different languages and musical traditions. My philological background was also instrumental in launching me into my main thesis subject, as my diploma in French literature and linguistics offered me a basis for research within the field of Translation Studies. When I heard the musical in its English and Russian interpretations, I sought to compare them to the original French version. Some of

the verses varied unaccountably from the original, while others remained somewhat closer in meaning to the source.

One problem facing the translators is that these languages belong to three different families: Romance, Germanic, and Slavic. Although English and French are similar in mode and expression, Russian is differentiated by its singular grammatical structure, its unique stress, and its synthetic form. Therefore, the Russian translator had to adapt to a new set of grammatical rules and choose appropriate words while still preserving the stress and rhythm of the music. My thesis examines whether the translators successfully conveyed the sense of the original text without detracting from its musical qualities. In order to do so, I will discuss the problems with the English and Russian translations as well as their deviations from the original French text.

Objectives

For this thesis, I will start with the theoretical principles behind the translation of musicals, as well as an overview of recent accomplishments in the field of translation of musical material. Furthermore, I will discuss elements of the musical's reception in Britain, the United States, and in Russia, such as the critics' opinions and audience attendance for both versions of *Notre-Dame de Paris*. This allows for the examination of extra-textual influences (for example, the audience's expectations and the contemporary social and cultural factors) that typically play an important role in the translation of a musical. I will also provide a short biography of the French-Canadian lyricist Luc Plamondon, the author of the *Notre-Dame de Paris*, and address his distinctive contribution to French musical theatre. I will analyze two songs from the musical (*Belle* and *Les Cloches*) in order to compare the linguistic approach of the English and Russian translators and explore the translation constraints and their solutions for these songs.

CHAPTER 1. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Introduction

The practice of translating lyrics started centuries ago, and translated lyrics - for folk songs, pop and rap songs, children's songs and lullabies, and musical cartoons and films - are omnipresent in our culture. Research into the translation of musicals was treated as a distinct field from translation studies for many years, perhaps because many considered lyrics to be a subject unworthy of research and musicals a "non-canonized" genre. By examining a musical through the perspective of translation studies theory, we attempt to discern what the translation of the lyrics tells us about the musical itself.

The problems entailed by the translation of musical productions have recently become the subject of academic study. For the most part, research in translation and music has focused on opera and song translation. Researchers who have written on opera and song translations include Ronnie Apter (1985), Peter Low (2003), and Dinda L. Gorfée (2005), but very few works are dedicated to the translation of musicals.

As the concept of vocal translation is comparable to the translation of musicals, the recent works of Gorfée (2005) and Susam-Sarajeva (2008) serve as the theoretical basis for this thesis. Their publications discuss various aspects of translation, including possible constraints, in genres as disparate as church hymns, opera libretti, popular music, and musical comedy.

1.1 Theoretical Framework for Musical Translation

The subject of translated musical texts raises many questions: how music and translation function together, what strategies are required by musical translation, whether the socio-cultural factors of the given country and epoch influence the translation of the lyrics, and how audience tastes and expectations affect the reception of the final product. Several recent studies have addressed these issues to an extent. In this chapter, I examine the concept of a translation strategy for musical material.

Many researchers dissent on what approach to use in the translation of musical texts, because the boundaries between translation and adaptation are difficult to identify. Susam-Sarajeva (2008: 189) observes that there has been limited interest in the field of translation and music, except in the area of canonized practices such as those undertaken for the opera. She states that “in non-canonized music, such as pop and folk song, it is difficult to find out where the translation ends and adaptation begins.” Nevertheless, Susam-Sarajeva suggests that the expansion of translation studies to non-canonized genres is an enriching experience and disregarding this kind of translation would “mean missing out on very illuminating cases, both in terms of intercultural communication and of the social, cultural and linguistic practices prevalent in a given target system” (ibid.). Similar arguments can be made for the merits of studying the translation of musical theatre for information on a target society.

According to Johan Franzon, song translations have a clear need for functionality due to the requirement to fit the lyrics to the music and to use them in a singing performance. He then relies on the *skopos* theory, which depicts “a good translation” as

one that is suitable for a particular purpose, to describe translations with ‘variable fidelity’ and uses the term “textual approximation” (2008: 375). He defines song lyric translation “as a text that is similar to its source text in aspects relevant to its target culture presentation as a staged narrative to music” (2005: 267). Furthermore, he suggests that a musical presents a multimedia message composed of a staged performance, a narrative co-text, and the verbally empty rhetorical shape of the music.

As a musical is a staged narrative presented by a series of songs, its translation is often subject to changes of the meaning and facts presented in the original text. Franzon uses the term “creative transposition” that Roman Jakobson coined for poetry translation¹ (2005: 264). He also suggests another term for song translation - adaptation, “since the target lyrics must be adapted to the musical line” (2005: 265). An adaptation, according to Franzon, is distinct from “translation proper,” and the methods for each should be separate (ibid.). Franzon conceives an imaginary scale for translations, based on the degree of closeness to the original text. Theatrical productions, according to Franzon, are placed at one extreme (the theatre translations are generally quite close to the original) and commercial music at the other extreme (where there is less respect for the lyricist). In relation to other musical formats, Franzon defines the genre of musical comedy as situated between commercial popular songs and theatrical productions.

Using the example of the three Scandinavian (Norwegian, Swedish, and Danish) versions of the famous Broadway musical comedy *My Fair Lady*, Franzon focuses on the importance of singability in song translation, illustrates the elements that are lost or

¹ According to Jakobson, “poetry by definition is untranslatable” (1987: 434). Since the translation of poetic arts from one language to another cannot provide full equivalence, Jakobson declares that poetry can only be interpreted through a process that he calls “creative transposition”. He further separates this process into three categories: interlingual, intralingual, and intersemiotic.

compensated in translation and discusses the cases of acculturation and domestic allusions. Observing that all three translations differ from the source text and do not reproduce all the communicative clues of the original, Franzon states that vocal translation is equivalent to a “functional re-interpretation” (2005: 292). By “function” he means “format”, which in the case of musicals refers to both “theatrical presentation” and “musical information” (ibid.). Whereas “fidelity (of some kind) is what distinguishes a translated song from all-new lyrics to old music,” format is the transformation of lyrics into a singable and performable version (Franzon 2005: 266). Translation, to Franzon, should preserve the meaning of the original, although he admits this goal is unachievable in practice.

Opera, songs, and musicals are all dependent on the interplay between the linguistic text, the music for which it was written, and the act of performance. It is very important that vocal translation takes into account that the music and lyrics to be adapted are intended for performance. This aspect has led Dinda Gorrée to provide a broader definition of vocal translation as “the translation of the poetic discourse in the hybrid art of musicopoetic (or poeticomusical) forms, shapes, and skills, harmonizing together the conflicting roles of both artistic media: music and language in face-to-face performances” (2005: 7).

Although none of these authors defines translation and adaptation as completely separate, non-overlapping concepts, the distinction between each is still noteworthy. Along with the definitions of adaptation and translation, there is debate on the question of fidelity to the text. The role of translators of musical material is ambiguous. The musical translator, Grandmont, compares her work to the minute labours of a Benedictine monk:

Mais, lorsqu'un texte poétique est mis en musique, l'œuvre du traducteur devient travail de bénédictin car, à toutes les difficultés inhérentes à la traduction, s'ajoutent des exigences de la cadence, de la mesure, du tempo et de l'accent tonique. (1978: 98)

Nida, who writes about song and motion picture translation, introduces the concept that translation need not necessarily be true to the source text because translators have innate cultural restrictions manifested in their “attitudes about so-called ‘faithfulness’” (1964: 177). This concept is further discussed by Apter, who states that the opera translator “must not only find the right meaning; he must place the right meaning on the right note” (1985: 309). Vocal translation is a challenging process, as the translator has to translate syllable for syllable, stress for stress, and burden for burden. It is evident that both Nida and Apter find it acceptable for the translator to alter the meaning of the original song text to satisfy its metrical and musical restrictions.

Translation and Music, the 2008 special issue of the international journal *The Translator*,² outlines the problems of translation and music. For instance, in the article titled *Anglo-American Musicals in Spanish Theatres*, Marta Mateo examines extra-textual factors of reception, such as the criteria for selection of an Anglo-American musical in Spain, audience expectations, production processes, commercial aspects, and problems of ‘cultural gaps.’ Mateo further describes the crucial role of translation in the increasing presence of Anglo-American musicals on the Spanish stage.

Klaus Kaindl's (2005) contribution is based on the socio-semiotic perspective, in that he analyzes the production, reception, and translation of popular songs using both the

² Susam-Sarajeva, Sebnem, ed. “*Translation and Music*.” *The Translator* 14.2 (2008): 187-462. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome Pub.

polysystem theory (developed by Itamar Even-Zohar and Gideon Toury) and the semiotic aspect (based on Peirce's definition of a sign). One of Kaindl's ideas is that the study of popular music and its translation cannot be based solely on language or on musical semiotics. Kaindl states that the "esthetic standards which are generally derived, also in musical semiotics, from classic music" ignore numerous other elements that are important to popular music (2005: 245). Some examples of such elements include values and meanings derived from the "socio-cultural environment" as well as visual, tonal, and acoustic parameters. As a more appropriate method for the analysis of popular music translations, he suggests, among other options, the use of the "hermeneutic-semiological method" of Philip Tagg, using aspects of time, melody, tonality and texture, and dynamic and acoustical features (ibid.).

Yet another approach to the translation of songs, presented by Peter Low (2005: 185), includes the *Pentathlon Principle*. Low's research is based on the *skopos* theory of Hans J. Vermeer and on Jakobson's model of communicative code. Low suggests a new model, which he names the *Pentathlon Principle* after the five elements of Olympic pentathletes that he has transformed into five criteria for singable translations: *singability, sense, naturalness, rhythm, and rhyme*. Low argues that balancing these five criteria may assist translators in their tasks. This approach is a response to those who advocate strict rules, such as "Rhyme should be perfect" or "Keep the same metaphor" (Low 2008: 5-6). Low suggests tolerating some "small margins of flexibility in several areas – one can more easily avoid serious translation loss in any single area, and can 'wiggle out of the strait-jacket'" (ibid.). On the other hand, Low posits that disregarding the sense of the

original message should not be considered as translation. In his work on song translation, Peter Low states:

I note in passing that some people ignore sense altogether: they take a foreign song-tune and devise for it a set of TL [target language] words which match the music very well but bear no semantic relation with the ST [source text]. While this may at times be good and appropriate, it is not translating, because none of the original verbal meaning is transmitted. Such practices have no place in discussions of translation. (2005: 194)

Rephrasing the *Pentathlon Principle*, Low states that no one feature of the original text (e.g. rhyme, metaphor, syllabicity) is sacred to the point that it must be absolutely kept in translation. In other words, translation is described as a conscious manipulation of the source text with the intent of transferring the verbal message with the same musical format to the target language audience.

Two important theses on translation of musicals have been undertaken in the Translation Studies Program at Concordia University: *Translating the Musical Les Misérables: A Polysystemic Approach*, written by Myles McKelvey; and *Translation, Politics, the Actor: Translation of the Musical "Cabaret,"* by Tatyana Shestakov. McKelvey's work uses the polysystem theory as a heuristic tool to describe and analyze the various translations of *Les Misérables* (the novel) and *Les Miz* (the musical). McKelvey demonstrates technical problems involved in the translation of vocal music, such as vocal, prosodic (meter and rhyme), and rhythmic (matching foreign rhythms) constraints. In analyzing rhythmic constraints more precisely, he assumes that keeping the rhythm in the translation of verses cannot provide an accurate version. In the example of word-for-word translation, the strong beat of the music can fall on the weak syllables (such as the definite article *les*), which becomes a compositional inaccuracy. Therefore,

in order to render quality, the French translator had to violate rhythmic principles of the musical text.

Although I do not attempt to dissect on a deep level the vocal and rhythmic constraints in *Notre-Dame de Paris*, McKelvey's chapter of contrastive analysis of the musical *Les Miz* drew my attention. This part of his research, based on Antonia Alvarez's work *On Translating Metaphors* (1993), concerns the rendering of metaphorical elements into the English version. In my study of the French, English, and Russian versions of the musical, I similarly examine metaphors and their analogues in related translations.

Shestakov's thesis *Translation, Politics, the Actor: Translation of the Musical "Cabaret"* is dedicated to the relationship between the translated text and the final production, as well as the impact that the translator, the actor, and the target audience can have on the translation process, and subsequently the theatre production. The different textual versions of *Cabaret* are related to the social, historical, political, and cultural standards of both the source and the target societies. Exploring the historical situation of Germany in the 1930s during the rise of Third Reich, Shestakov gives examples that demonstrate how national and social issues (such as Nazi ideology, anti-Semitism, homosexuality, etc.) affected the spirit of *Cabaret*. Her thesis further deals with three versions of the musical: English, German, and French. The purpose of Shestakov's research is to illustrate how different epochs and societies (that is, America in the 1960s and 1990s, Germany in the 1960s and 1990s, and Quebec in the 2000s) influenced the creation or revival of the musical in those countries. Shestakov finds textual changes and linguistic interference between the translated versions (for example, the appearance of German words in the English version of 1998). The study of linguistic, political, social,

sexual, and historical issues enables Shestakov to illustrate the importance of contextual differences and the relationship between the theatre text and the target society.

The linguistic approach served as a valuable tool for Charlotte Bosseaux (2008), who demonstrates an original method of analysis in her audiovisual translation of the American TV series *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*. Based on lyrics, with an emphasis on the meaning within the plot, the author analyzes how the perception of fictional characters shifts in the French version of a musical episode. In the French version, Buffy looks “more mature and sophisticated, and seems to have more control over her life” (2008: 343). Bosseaux attempts to analyze the texts using not only a linguistic approach, but also audio-visual aspects, such as acting (hand gestures, head, and body movements) and voice quality. Combining the two methods allows her to interpret the French version from different points of view. In examining the translator’s choice of vocabulary, Bosseaux concluded that:

- 1 The translator is mostly focused on creating a ‘singable’ version, where rhyme and rhythm are of primary importance and the lyrics fit the music.
- 2 Linguistically, the French version presents a different picture of the main character.

The critical review shows that the theoretical gap in translation studies related to the translation of musicals should be defined and will lead to the foundation for further study. Consensus on the translation of musicals accepts that the translator is not required to stay close to the source text due to multiple constraints on the format. Analysis of musicals can thus be completed on different levels, by taking into consideration both the

translator's approach and the sociopolitical and historical issues of the musical's period of creation.

Conclusion

While the aforementioned works are thematically relevant to my project, very few of them include a linguistic analysis of the translated songs, which I undertake in my own work. As mentioned above, Myles McKelvey provides detailed analysis of the vocal, prosodic, and rhythmic constraints in translation of the musical *Les Misérables*. The conclusion he reaches – that the musical constraints demand an adaptation rather than a translation - apply to any translated musical text. Rather than concentrating on the musical constraints functioning in the pre-composed music, I decided to focus on the characterization and interpretation of the main characters, as well as examining the linguistic challenges occasioned by the religious renditions in the translated versions. The linguistic approach has proven to be the most valuable tool in my research, since it is undertaken from a multilingual standpoint.

The analysis of songs will show that characters in the English version remain identical to the original French version. In the Russian version, however, the characters are concentrated more on their personal emotions and inner world than in the original French version, in which characters are focused on the object of their love.

CHAPTER 2. ADAPTATION OF THE NOVEL *Notre-Dame de Paris* INTO A MUSICAL FORMAT

Translation of the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* takes into account two problems: adaptation of the novel into a libretto, which was accomplished by French-Canadian librettist Luc Plamondon, and translation of the musical into other languages. Although the main concern of this thesis will concentrate on problems of translation per se, in the following chapters I provide a few comments on the adaptations of Hugo's novel.

2.1 Victor Hugo and the Musical Adaptation of His Novel

Victor Hugo (1802 - 1885) is well known as a novelist, publicist, poet, and dramatist. He was also devoted to politics and opposed to social injustice and poverty. The foremost element in this diversified body of work was the compassion he demonstrated toward impoverished and miserable people. From his father, a general in Napoleon's army, Victor learned his passion for social activism; from his mother, he inherited an unconventional piety and respect towards the church and religion (Peyre 1972: 5-14). The novel *Notre-Dame de Paris* was set in 1482, and was written in 1831; yet it has preserved its original narrative and popular appeal through successive adaptations.

In the chapter "Ceci tuera cela" the Archdeacon of Notre Dame, Claude Frollo, saw the book as a threat to the religion: "the book will kill the building" (Hugo 1967: 190). Hugo claimed that the invention of the printing press would ultimately destroy eternal values. In the modern world, printed literature is being gradually replaced by

other media, such as TV, radio, and the Internet. However, people have the chance to discover literary works that they may not otherwise have known through the cinema, theatre, opera, ballet, and other performing arts.

In 1835, Hugo penned lyrics to the opera *La Esmeralda* based on the main character in *Notre-Dame de Paris* with some changes to the plot and characters (Robb 1997: 550). The idea of adapting the novel *Notre-Dame de Paris* into a musical did not become a reality, however, until French-Canadian lyricist Luc Plamondon succeeded in 1997. Along with Richard Cocciante, Plamondon adapted the musical from Victor Hugo's novel more than 160 years after its first publication, accounting for his choice, simply enough, as follows: "Il y a longtemps que je cherchais un sujet intemporel...je suis retourné aux sources en relisant le livret d'opéra qu'avait écrit Victor Hugo en 1835..." (Rioux 1997: A1).

2.2 Adaptations of *Notre-Dame de Paris* into Movies, Operas, Ballets, etc.

Hugo's novel seemed destined for numerous interpretations from the time it first appeared. The captivating legend of the hunchback, at once the symbol of pureness and honor despite his forbidding appearance, soon took root in the modern arts.

Victor Hugo himself contributed to the popularity of his novel owing to his multiple theatrical connections. In 1850, he approved a stage version of *La Esmeralda*, by Paul Foucher, who drastically changed the ending. Over the years, several adaptations were made from the novel into movies, operas, ballets, and animated films. The most

well-known productions include: *The Hunchback of Notre Dame* (USA, 1939); *Notre-Dame de Paris* with Gina Lollobrigida as the main character (France, 1956); *The Hunchback* (USA, 1997) with Salma Hayek as Esmeralda; and the Walt Disney animated feature *The Hunchback of Notre-Dame* (USA, 1996). There are two ballet versions as well: *La Esmeralda* (1844) and *Notre-Dame de Paris* created by Maurice Jarre (1956).

The Russian ballet artists paid particular attention to Hugo's original novel *Notre-Dame de Paris*. To date, the full-length version, a three-act ballet, has only been performed in Russia and in Eastern Europe.³ In 2003, the Bolshoi theatre presented *Notre-Dame de Paris* as choreographed by Roland Petit. The *Mariinsky Ballet* of Saint Petersburg has had the original version of the ballet *Esmeralda* (by J. Perro and C. Pugni) in its repertoire since 1886 (Scholl 1994: 19). Thus, the Russian audience has been acquainted with numerous ballet interpretations of Victor Hugo's famous novel before the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* was launched on the Russian stage.

Each of these adaptations adopted a range of different approaches to take into account the particular contexts, intrigues, and artistic preferences chosen to draw attention to the characters. In some cases, the adaptation simplified characters or modified the plot. "In the case of *Notre-Dame de Paris* and *Les Misérables*," Kathryn Grossman writes regarding fidelity to Hugo's novel, "the metaphorical playfulness, historical and cultural digressions, and allusions to republican politics disappear in most of the cinematic interpretations" (Grossman 2001: 486). Disney's animated feature *The Hunchback of Notre-Dame* (1996) opted for a comic ending in which a gargoyle protects

³Великие балеты. *The Great Ballets*. Web. 1 Mar. 2009. <<http://www.ballet-theatre.ru/esmeralda.html>>. (Translation of Russian review titles and song lyrics in this thesis are mine, unless indicated otherwise - L.N).

Quasimodo in the fight against Frollo. In Fochoer's play (1850), Esmeralda lives happily with Phoebus and even finds her mother (Laster 1981: 311-312). In these cases, Grossman opposes the commercialization of cinematic appropriations seeking to profit from the films, while Hugo's name becomes invisible (2001: 491).

2.3 Adaptation of the Novel *Notre-Dame de Paris* into the Musical

In 1993, Luc Plamondon began searching for the subject of a new musical. Looking through a literary encyclopedia, he was attracted by the legend of the famous hunchback. Plamondon states:

Le roman de Victor Hugo parle d'exclusion et de climat social. Je me suis dit : pourquoi ne pas reprendre son idée, et parler d'actualité? J'ai réalisé que cinq siècles après Victor Hugo, les relations humaines étaient restées les mêmes : il y a toujours des luttes de pouvoir, des exclus, des miséreux. (Egloff, 1998, "Lorsque les vitraux de *Notre-Dame* éclairent les temps modernes")

The story of Quasimodo was adapted into a musical with the help of French-Italian singer-songwriter Richard Cocciante. Director Gilles Maheu and producer Charles Talar showed an interest in the project and invested \$4,000,000 dollars in it. They even booked the 3,700-seat *Palais des Congrès* in Paris. In casting, 400 singers and actors tried out, and eminent French and Canadian performers such as Daniel Lavoie, Bruno Pelletier, Luck Mervil, and Héléne Ségara were chosen, as well as the young and not very well known Garou and Julie Zenatti.

For the stage adaptation, Plamondon had to cut down the content of the novel: «J'ai beaucoup élagué le mélodrame» (Rioux, 1997: A1). Although the stage version cannot replace the pleasure of reading Hugo's novel in the original, the musical *Notre-*

Dame de Paris turned out to be a successful adaptation. Viewing this musical in the brief passage of three hours allowed the audience to overlook the 15th century setting, and simply view it as a colorful backdrop to the dramatically unfolding events.

The producers kept to the main outline of the novel. The Archdeacon of Notre Dame, Claude Frollo, and a bell ringer, Quasimodo, whose lives are tied together by religious devotion, both fall in love with a beautiful gypsy. Esmeralda gives her heart to Phoebus, the Captain of the King's Guard, while Frollo, who lusts after Esmeralda, then stabs Phoebus with a knife. Esmeralda is unjustly accused of the attempted murder and of witchcraft, and she is sentenced to death. When Frollo offers her freedom in exchange for her love, she rejects him. Quasimodo then saves Esmeralda and grants her sanctuary in his bell tower. At this point, Frollo orders the soldiers to break into Notre-Dame to catch Esmeralda. However, Phoebus betrays Esmeralda by giving her up to the executioners. Quasimodo then becomes angry when he learns that Frollo organized Esmeralda's death. The hunchback throws the archdeacon down from the tower. In the final scene of the musical, he mourns Esmeralda's death and promises to stay with her until the end of his days.

2.4 Luc Plamondon: A Short Biography

Luc Plamondon was born in 1942, in St-Raymond-de-Portneuf near Quebec City. He was raised on a farm and initially wanted to be a priest. When he was nine years old, he started taking piano lessons with the village organist, Augustine Plamondon. He continued his musical and classical studies at the Séminaire du Québec, the Collège des

Jésuites, and later at the Université de Montréal. His father's fortune gave him the chance to travel abroad for six years and learn foreign languages: Spanish, English, German, and Italian. While studying languages, he also discovered the arts and the theatre (Thérien and D'Amours 1992: 390). Plamondon then began writing lyrics for singers, and by 1980 he established himself as one of the most famous lyricists in both Canada and France. In 1990, he was made a Knight of the National Order of Quebec. In 2002, he was nominated as an Officer of the Order of Canada, and in 2003 he was inducted into Canada's Walk of Fame.

2.5 The Rock-Opera *Starmania* as a Turning Point in French Musical Culture of the 1980s

It is not easy to find extensive material about such contemporary artists as Luc Plamondon and his works. An explanation, therefore, of the significance of Plamondon's rock-opera *Starmania* helps define his role in a distinctively French-Canadian cultural context.

In the early 1980's, along with pop music, Luc Plamondon tried his hand at writing librettos for modern operatic works: the rock-opera *Starmania* (1979), sub-titled *Starmania, or the Passion of Johnny Rockfort According to the Televised Gospels*; the cartoon-opera *Dioxine de Carbone* (1983); and the musical *Lily Passion* (1986). Of all the above-mentioned works, *Starmania* eventually became successful, inaugurating a new trend in the French musical genre. Influenced by *Jesus Christ Superstar* (1970) and

Hair (1968), Luc Plamondon sought to introduce the North-American concept of rock-opera into the French musical.

Starmania was translated into English by Tim Rice (one of the creators of *Jesus Christ Superstar*) in 1992 and released on CD, but it had never been performed on the British stage. In 1990, the French version of the musical was performed in both Moscow and Saint Petersburg for a non-French-speaking audience. The first attempt to produce this show for spectators who did not understand the French language turned out to be a great success. Ten performances were made in Moscow and Saint Petersburg, and a total of 35,000 spectators attended the show (Dostie, 1990: D3). Although the French producers did not make a profit, Plamondon and Berger were surprised by a standing ovation that lasted over ten minutes (ibid.).

The story of *Monopolis*, the mystical city, initially captivated the audience through its fantastic plot, as science fiction was a very popular genre in the 1970s. Distinct from American science fiction, where space travel and adventure assume the biggest place, French science fictional authors (such as Francis Carsac and Gérard Klein) were oriented towards specific social problems. *Starmania* became well-known not only for its rock-based music, but also for its futuristic allegory on social subjects. As Luc Plamondon said in his interview: “Michel Berger m’a commandé un opéra sur la violence du monde moderne, « Starmania ». Berger voulait que cet opéra rock le propulse dans le monde” (Médioni, 1999, “Notre-Dame selon Luc”). In particular, the musical broached a range of menacing contemporary problems, such as terrorism, totalitarianism, and human individualism, as well as some of the more gratuitous forms of egotistic behavior and the lack of true relationships that ensue. Beaunoyer and Beaulne stated about this musical:

Since 1980, *Starmania*, the musical comedy he [Luc Plamondon] wrote with Michel Berger, had literally transformed Francophone music. Until he came along, people said it was impossible to sing rock in French. With *Starmania*, French music emerged into the modern world, and since then young people have been swinging, rocking, and swaying in French to songs like “Coeur du rocker,” “Oxygen,” and “Nuit magique,” to mention just a few hits equally well known in France and Quebec. (2004: 204)

Starmania enjoyed an unbroken production run of almost 30 years on the international stage. As stated by Arthur Kaptainis, the success of this musical owed much to its “timelessly futuristic text and fluid music” (2009: E2). The most recent version of *Starmania*, which was presented by the *Opéra de Montreal* in March 2009, preserved the melody and lyrics, but the style shifted from an emphasis on rock to a more fully operatic version.

CHAPTER 3. RECEPTION OF THE MUSICAL

3.1 Origins of the Musical

Much research in the field of music studies has sought to define the musical as a genre. In the *Oxford Encyclopedia of Theatre and Performance*, the musical is considered “a musical play (also called musical comedy, musical theatre, or musical) in which music, usually in the form of songs, is essential to the narrative” (Kennedy 2005). The *Encyclopedia of Music in Canada* describes musical theatre as “a broad performance genre combining music and drama or comedy. Thanks to large-scale productions and cross-pollination, the genre has become increasingly difficult to differentiate from other marriages of music and drama.” (Kallmann et al., 1992).

In short, the musical is a theatre play telling a story through song and dialogue, in which music makes up an important part of the performance. Music, song, and dance have been elements of theatre from its beginning. Greek tragedy included music as an integral element, medieval dramas were mostly performed by troubadours as narrative ballads, and classical playwrights incorporated both song and dance in their plays. This work does not aim to dissect all the influences on the genesis of the musical. Rather, I take a look at various forms of live entertainment in America, Britain, and Russia in order to better understand how the expectations of audiences affected the reception of *Notre-Dame de Paris* in these countries.

3.2 Origins of Musicals in America and Britain

Many forms of live entertainment influenced the American musical as a genre of popular musical theater. The *ballad opera*, one of these forms of performance, was brought to America by British immigrants in the 18th century. The ballad opera, in turn, had been influenced by *Italian opera*. A similar form of entertainment was early 19th century *burlesque*, usually performed by female actors and resembling a song-and-dance show composed of scenes, sketches, and interludes. Burlesque evolved into *vaudeville*, originally called a *variety show*. Vaudeville had become the primary form of popular culture in America by 1920, only dying out when new forms of entertainment, such as cinema, radio, and television, replaced it. Yet another form of entertainment that contributed to the creation of the musical was the *minstrel show* – a popular theater genre in America that helped highlight social and political problems associated with slavery in the beginning of the 19th century. David Walsh and Len Platt stated in their work that “slavery and its institutionalization in the American South gave the minstrel show a particular context and serious topicality in America” (2003: 21).

By 1880, the minstrel show had been replaced by other theatrical forms, such as the *revue* and the *melodrama*. The melodrama, as a form of drama, required that actors be able to sing and dance as well as act. Walsh and Platt describe the influence of melodrama’s marriage of theatre, dance, and song on the genesis of the musical:

The element of dance in melodrama was ... important for the emergence of the musical. Melodrama as the legitimate theater of America entailed the training of actors to dance, sing, and act and to relate all three to one another. Indeed, for much of its life, melodrama did not really distinguish between acting, pantomime, and ballet in any strict way. (2003: 31)

Other song-and-dance trends also contributed to the development of musical theater in the United States. The *revue* was a mid-nineteenth-century French invention as an annual show incorporating sketches, songs, and dance to review the main events of the year. In Europe, the revue turned into *cabaret*. The American revue, however, aside from inheriting the satirical nature of the ballad opera, concentrated on the text instead of the music alone. The revue was an ancestor to the musical, combining other forms of popular music and dance theater: from vaudeville it took the comedy and variety of acts, from burlesque satirical sketches, and from the minstrel show it borrowed the diversity of scenic activity by individual performers. Yet *musical comedy* contributed the most to the creation of the genre of the musical. Musical comedy emerged in London and was imported to New York, where songwriters would “americanize” the music and text.

The first four decades of the 20th century saw the development of musical theater as a hybrid of revue, musical comedy, and melodrama. This fusion was the origin of the “classic” Broadway musical that became popular in North America. Broadway flourished because the cost of musical productions was rather low, and the transformation from a vaudeville star to a musical performer was fairly easy due to the relative similarity of both genres. The musical flourished owing to “big names” and therefore advanced the state of show business in America. Walsh and Platt note that the new commercialization of musicals “was genuinely paradoxical. On the one hand, many of them were flimsy and formulaic mass entertainment; on the other hand, many exuded an exuberant popularism that kept them vitally in touch with popular culture and the contemporary world of America” (2003: 73). The first successful musical *The Black Crook*, produced in New

York in 1866, was originally conceived as a melodrama (Knapp 2005: 20). Written by Americans, the musical demonstrated some elements identifying American musical comedy: an all-female dancing chorus, magic-inspired stage effects, scene changes, elaborate outfits, and songs with sexual context. Thus, by the 1920s, the Broadway show became a lively and dominant trend in American musical theatre.

By 1890, Britain had experienced the Industrial Revolution and the middle class knew social success. British producers started to set up musical entertainment for this newly modern society. This target-oriented approach attracted American producers, who adapted British musical comedies to American soil. However, the impact of British comedy on the development of American musical theatre has been neglected by scholars such as Julian Mates in his 1985 work on American musical theatre. Len Platt notes that:

Julian Mates pays much greater attention to the popular and multifarious origins of the American musical, but has a blind spot similar to Lerner's as far as musical comedy produced in London's West End at the turn of the last century is concerned. (2004: 13)

The neglect of the West End musical could be explained by the different musical traditions in those countries. In British culture, the musical was considered to be popular entertainment, but in America the musical became a part of national culture:

Whereas in America the musical has become an institution, a cultural tradition entwined with nation-building and national identity, in Britain musicals have been more understood as light, insignificant entertainments. (Platt 2004: 16)

However, the influence of British musicals on American musical theatre is undeniable. For example, the British musical giant Andrew Lloyd Webber made *Jesus Christ Superstar* (1971), *Evita* (1979), and *The Phantom of the Opera* (1986) household

names by bringing them to the Broadway stage and to delighted audiences around the world.

3.3 The Musical Genre in Russia

In Russia, the tradition of the musical was established much later than in Europe or America. In the 18th century, Russian musical theatre was influenced by Italian opera and comedy, as well as by French ballet. We lack solid information about the origins of the musical in Russian theatre from published sources, although musical theatre was likely a foreign import.

During the Soviet era, the musical as a genre was rejected by Soviet critics as a part of bourgeois culture, which was synonymous with being cheap and vulgar. All attempts to create musical theatre in Russia failed. For instance, the *Moscow Music Hall* was closed in 1926 due to a “lack of repertoire” (Markov 1969: 1025).

In 1934, the filmmaker Grigori Aleksandrov created the first Soviet musical comedy film, *Jolly Fellows*. Initially the official censors prohibited the screening of the comedy, but Aleksandrov’s friends showed it to Stalin, who approved its release (Taylor 2007: 86). The film was saved, and according to the documentary “East Side Story,” this became the first “Hollywood-style” musical comedy made in the Soviet Union. However, some of the crewmembers were persecuted during the campaign of the Great Purge. One of the screenwriters of *Jolly Fellows*, Nicolai Erdman, was arrested during filming and deported to Siberia. Cameraman Vladimir Nilsen, accused of anti-Soviet activity, was

arrested and executed in 1938 (ibid. 80). In 1956, Nilsen was rehabilitated, as were many of the other victims of the Soviet repression.⁴

Almost 50 years passed until the emergence of the next musical. In 1981, talented composer A. Rybnikov and lyricist A. Voznesensky created *Juno and Avos*. In that period, nine years before the end of Soviet Union, the term “rock opera” was banned. Therefore, the director had to call the musical a “modern opera” in order to avoid persecution. The musical consisted of religious words such as *hallelujah*, references to the Virgin Mary, and Slavic church songs, which were popular at that time (Rzhevsky 2008: 170). The musical went beyond the Russian stage. Pierre Cardin, the famous French clothing designer who was also director of Cardin’s Theatre, brought the musical to France (Agence France Presse, 2008, “Pierre Cardin honorary member”). The musical was also staged off-Broadway in 1989. After celebrating its 25th anniversary in 2008, the musical is the longest-running show on the Russian stage.

Beginning in the mid-1990s, Russia opened up to western culture. With the fall of the iron curtain, western culture started penetrating every aspect of human activity: media, art, and everyday life. From that time on, it became possible to produce well-known foreign musicals on the Russian stage, among them *Notre-Dame de Paris* (2002), *Chicago* (2002), *42nd Street* (2002), and *The Witches of Eastwick* (2003). Of all these musicals, only *Notre-Dame de Paris* yielded a net profit. The fame of the Victor Hugo

⁴ The history of the Russian musical is tightly connected to the political life of the country. In one of the more dramatic moments, on October 23, 2002, when Chechen militants attacked the Dubrovka theatre in Moscow during the performance of the musical *Nord-Ost*, terrorists took 763 hostages for three days. After the hostage rescue operation, all 50 of the terrorists were killed. Unfortunately, 130 people, including two theatre actors, died during the operation. (Bellaby, Mara D. “Russia bids its farewell; Most accept need for gas attack.” *The Hamilton Spectator*, 30 Oct. 2002: D02.)

novel upon which it was based may have contributed to the musical's popularity in Russia. Russian society historically was passionate about French culture. In the 19th century, many Russian nobles had mastered the language of Voltaire and Diderot, because it was considered a necessary part of aristocratic upbringing.⁵ Since that time, Russians have always been among the world's greatest admirers of French writers, *chansonniers*, painters, and actors.

The Russian audience liked the musical stage adaptation of the Hugo novel more than the Broadway musicals. For two years (2002-2004), *Notre-Dame de Paris* was attended by 500,000 spectators in Moscow alone. After that, the popular musical started touring in provincial Russian cities.

3.4 *Notre-Dame de Paris* in France: Migration of the Musical through Different Cultures

The first production of the musical took place in Paris in September 1998. One of the biggest successes in the history of French-Canadian musical theatre, it was seen by more than ten million people worldwide (Shew, 2006, "Street fuelled hit"). *Notre-Dame de Paris* originally premiered to sold-out audiences at the 3,800-seat *Palais des Congres* in Paris.

Since its premiere, the full version has also been performed on a sold-out tour of Switzerland, Belgium, and Canada with similar success. A shorter version of the musical

⁵ One of the most illustrative examples of this affection toward the French culture is the fact that notable Russian writers had perfect knowledge of the French language. For instance, Leo Tolstoy inserted French passages to describe the war in his novel *War and Peace*. Ivan Turgenev wrote the stories in French (*Le Stepovik*, *Un incendie en mer*) and translated poetry of A. Pushkin and M. Lermontov in collaboration with P. Mérimée, G. Flaubert, and L. Viardot.

was presented in Las Vegas in January 2000, and in London it ran for sixteen months. The musical was subsequently staged over 3,000 times in different countries, including France, Canada, Great Britain, America, Belgium, Switzerland, Lebanon, Russia, Spain, Italy, Monaco, China, Korea, and Singapore. *Notre-Dame de Paris* was also translated into several languages: English, Italian, Spanish, Russian, Dutch, and Korean.

The performance history of *Notre-Dame de Paris* around the world is illustrated in the following chart, presented in chronological order:⁶

| COUNTRY | PERIOD | LANGUAGE |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|
| France 1998 | two years | French |
| Belgium 1998 | six weeks | French |
| Québec 1999 | 230 performances | French |
| Switzerland 2000 | 25 performances | French |
| US, Las Vegas 2000 | 200 performances (six months) | English |
| Britain, London 2000 | 18 months | English |
| Spain, Barcelona 2001 | one year | Spanish |
| Lebanon 2001 | five performances | French |
| Russia, Moscow 2002 | six years | Russian |
| China 2002 | 5 performances | French (with surtitles) |
| Italy, Rome 2003 | three years | Italian |
| Korea, Seoul 2005 | 30 performances | French |
| Taiwan, Taipei 2005 | 15 performances | French |
| Korea, Seoul 2006, 2008 | 80 performances ⁷ | French, Korean |

⁶ Source: <http://www3.sympatico.ca/rachel.thibodeau/divers/paris/damesin.html>

⁷ Source: "Les Grands moments de la vie de Mishel". MichelPascal. n.d. Web. 21 Apr. 2009. <<http://www.michelpascal.com/biographie/fr/biographie.htm>>.

Spectatorship reached 8 million people by 2005, including:⁸

- more than 3 million in France
- more than 2 million in Italy
- more than 500,000 in Québec
- more than 500,000 in Moscow
- more than 200,000 in Belgium
- 200,000 in London
- 200,000 in Barcelona
- more than 100,000 in Switzerland
- more than 50,000 in Beijing and Shanghai
- more than 25,000 in Las Vegas
- more than 25,000 in Lebanon
- 190,000 in Korea.⁹

In addition, more than 12 million CDs were sold, as well as over 1.5 million videos in Europe alone.

The success of *Notre-Dame de Paris* around the world encouraged producers to develop many other French musicals. *Notre-Dame de Paris* was followed by several musicals: *Ali Baba* (2000), *Les Dix Commandements* (2000), *Romeo and Juliette* (2001), *Cindy* (2002), *Le Petit Prince* (2002), *Don Juan* (2005), *Dracula* (2005), *Le Roi Soleil* (2005), *Mozart, l'opéra-rock* (2009), *Il était une fois ... Joe Dassin* (2010). None of these musicals achieved the same commercial success, but most were well-received. Thomas P. Finn discussed the phenomenon of *Notre-Dame de Paris*¹⁰:

⁸ Source: Sarfati, Sonia. "Notre-Dame de Paris en cinémascope" *La Presse*, Arts Spectacles S1. 2 July 2005, "Notre-Dame débarque en Chine." *Le Soleil*, Arts et Vie, 17 Dec. 2002, p. B3.

⁹ Source: Chung Ah-young. "Notre Dame de Paris Makes Splash in Korean Production." 23 Jan. 2008. Web. 21 Apr. 2009. <http://www.koreatimes.co.kr/www/news/art/2008/04/145_17747.html>.

¹⁰ Dr. Thomas P. Finn, Professor of French and Spanish in the Department of Modern Languages at Ohio Northern University.

The late 1990s ... were witness to an explosion of French musicals after the premiere of Plamondon's *Notre-Dame de Paris* (1998) and its subsequent stunning triumph. A grand production with outstanding visuals, it went on tour around France and to Québec, seemingly paving the way for the plethora of French musical theatre we see today. (2003: 303)

3.5 Reception of *Notre-Dame de Paris* in Las Vegas (2000)

The English version of the musical was produced in January 2000 at the new 1,200-seat *Paris Hotel-Casino* in Las Vegas. Despite critics who never believed the musical could work in Las Vegas, producer Wayne Baruch gambled in selecting Las Vegas over New York City or Los Angeles. Bringing this show to a city with so many available entertainment options was risky. However, *Notre-Dame de Paris*'s reception was positive, and after its debut, Baruch stated: "I am excited about the response. ... I never dreamed the audience would react this way" (Macy, 2000, "French musical hit"). The audience gave a five-minute standing ovation after the show. The musical ended in July 2000, after having completed 200 performances within six months, which Baruch considered "a very long run" (Weatherford 2000: 5B). The musical was complimented as "the first musical-dramatic work ever developed for the American stage in Las Vegas" (ibid.).

3.6 Reception of *Notre-Dame de Paris* in London (2000)

The British version of the musical was produced on the biggest stage in the West End, at the *Dominion Theatre*, with a seating capacity of 2,182. The musical with the French and English cast opened in May 2000 with the same Canadian vocalists as in the

original production, joined by Australian singer Tina Arena and British star Steve Balsamo, well-known as the lead in Andrew Lloyd Webber's *Jesus Christ Superstar*.

Notre-Dame de Paris, which captured the attention of French-speaking people, was expected to elicit massive public approval in London. However, reviewers were unenthusiastic. The show provoked numerous negative articles from the cheerless newspaper theatre critics.

Critics were merciless in their expressions: "Schlock-rock," "a complete flop," a "sprawling, maudlin mess," a "ghastly robotic Gallic musical" (Freeman 2000: R1). Some of them were impressed neither by the music and choreography nor by the plot and lyrics. Critics blamed producers for having turned a classic novel into "Eurovision power ballads and pomp rock" (ibid.). For some reviewers, the music was "superb" even though it was prerecorded, but they found the production to be "awful" (Dalglish, 2000, "Notre Dame de Paris").

Journalists revived debates about the English attitude towards French culture. After reading the negative reviews, producer Michel White declared: "It's just part of the same thing that goes right back to Napoleon. Read any war memoir and it's full of stuff about 'the bloody French,' 'bloody de Gaulle causing trouble' and so on" (Lezard 2004: 4). The reaction was so unfavourable that some critics felt compelled to ask the question: "Are we Francophobic?" (ibid.). As Britta Martens noted, past wars between Britain and France, particularly the Battle of Waterloo, influenced the development of a British national identity (2006: 562-571). Cultural and religious divergences between these two countries have been the subject of research, books, and conferences and undoubtedly affected theatrical criticism. Even positive reviews noticed that the show was not really a

musical at all: “It is a concert with dance, lighting effects, and a lot of French singers throwing their hair around in a collective display of gravelly voiced pique” (Coveney 2000: 56). As Bill Hagerty commented:

On the credit side, there is some terrific acrobatic dancing and daring clambering up and down the walls of Notre Dame Cathedral, but what all this has to do with Victor Hugo’s tragic story of the hunchback Quasimodo and his devotion to Esmeralda is unclear. (2000: 665)

Therefore, another reason for the unenthusiastic reception may have been the French musical’s lack of conformity to the “classical canon” of the “musical” genre. The musical, as mentioned above, is a form of theatre that includes music, song, spoken dialogues, and dance. In musicals, actors are expected to sing, dance, and perform at the same time. However, the French musical did not perfectly meet this classic definition. Regarding casting, Plamondon said: “I don’t write traditional musicals... I don’t use actors, I use singers. They are not actors who can sing, they are singers who can act while they sing, and occasionally they can also dance” (McLaren 2002: R1). The lead actors, Bruno Pelletier and Luck Mervil, also admitted a difference in musical styles: “For us, it just confirmed that we came here with a performance that’s very different from what they’re [critics] used to seeing” (The Toronto Star 2000: EN02).

In spite of critics’ opinions, the audience continued to attend the musical, which enjoyed a 16-month booking period, attracted by the dynamic choreography and spectacular live vocal performances. Therefore, we can observe an explicit discrepancy between the audience’s and the critics’ points of view. In fact, theatre critics cannot influence attendance, because the only critics that can decide whether or not to go to a show are the general public. Michel Masson, coproducer of the musical, stated: “C’est un

très beau succès, étant donné la méchanceté délirante de la critique londonienne, d'ailleurs à connotation xénophobe” (Robitaille 2000 : D6).

3.7 Reception of *Notre-Dame de Paris* in Russia (2002)

The Russian version of the musical was funded by producers Katerina Von Guetchmen-Valdek, Aleksandr Weinstein, and director of the *Moscow Operetta Theatre* Vladimir Tartakovsky. The budget amounted to \$2.7 million (USD) for the exclusive rights and \$800,000 for producing the musical for six years.¹¹ Of the 2,000 artists who participated in the casting call, only 45 were chosen, and 24 of those actors were engaged in every concert – seven soloists, twelve dancers, four acrobats, and one break-dancer.

The Russian producers staged the musical according to the license agreement with the producers of the French version. Accordingly, the French producers worked with Russian artists and participated in casting and final rehearsals in Moscow in order to create an accurate copy of the original.

The musical premiered on the Moscow stage on May 21, 2002 and it enjoyed a triumphant six-year run in Moscow. It was critically-acclaimed and popular among a large cross-section of the Russian public. Theatre critic Daria Korobova wrote that the Russian version lived up to every expectation - the musical was not worse than the French version - rather, it was even more impressive than the original (2002: 8). Furthermore, the director of the *Moscow Operetta Theatre*, Vladimir Tartakovsky, noted

¹¹ Source: Voitsehovskij, Boris. “Zametki na polah programmki.” “Notes in the Margins of a Theatre Booklet.” *Komsomolskaya Pravda* (Newspaper). 22 Apr. 2002. Web. 20 May 2009 <<http://www.kp.ru/daily/22553/17591/>>.

in an interview that *Notre-Dame de Paris* was the most popular of all musicals staged in Russia. He was surprised by the huge success of the musical and noted that it attracted not only people who were usually interested in the arts, but also younger spectators, attending the theatre for the first time (Tueva 2005: 24-25). This phenomenon can be explained, in part, by the producer's casting decisions. Whereas the cast of the original French musical consisted of actors with considerable experience, the Russian show used mostly relatively unknown young actors, giving them an opportunity to display their talent. These performers attracted a younger audience, more used to attending discotheques and nightclubs rather than the theatre.

Conclusion

The reception of a musical depends on a number of different perspectives, and it is necessary to consider the cultural context of the given country. The analysis of reception shows that *Notre-Dame de Paris* was the subject of critical disapproval by English-speaking reviewers, partly due to a British national identity that was somewhat at odds with imported French culture. Moreover, the French musical did not please critics who expected to see a more traditional Broadway musical. As Michel Vaïs¹² notes, some producers addressed this issue by calling this kind of show *un spectacle musical*, instead of *a musical comedy*, in order to differentiate between these genres: “Ce fut le cas de *Notre-Dame de Paris* et de *Don Juan*. La version française du genre a pris cette appellation [*spectacle musical*] pour se distinguer des spectacles de type Broadway”

¹² Michel Vaïs, theatre critic and the editor of *Cahiers de théâtre Jeu*.

(2007 : 110). Thus, the commercial success of *Notre-Dame-de-Paris* initiated a new trend *le spectacle musical* and created theatrical interest in French musical theatre.

Despite the harsh reviews, the audience reception in London was rather positive, and the musical was adapted for different stage productions elsewhere in the world. In particular, in Moscow, where musicals were a relatively new form of entertainment, *Notre-Dame de Paris* became a preferred choice for theatre-goers.

3.8 Reception of Translation in London, Las Vegas, and Moscow

An analysis of the musical's reception would not be complete without reviewers' opinions on the translated lyrics. For my research, I examined the comments of English, American, and Russian critics related to the translation of the lyrics from the original French version. To gain insight into the English and American critics, I used articles from *The Independent*, *Financial Times*, *The Evening Standard*, *Theatre Record Review*, *The Times*, *Daily Mail*, *The Guardian*, and *The Las Vegas Review*. Most reviewers found that Will Jennings' English version was not elaborated enough. David Benedict of the *Independent* points to problems of rhyming lyrics:

When did he write them? In a lunch break, perhaps? A coffee break? Realizing that the name Esmeralda isn't exactly famous for its record appearances in a rhyming dictionary, he and the original lyricist Luc Plamondon call her Belle (let's not discuss the pun, shall we?) and then wring every imaginable rhyme out of it - even "quell" makes an appearance. (2000: 12)

Ian Shuttleworth from *Financial Times* reproaches the lyricist not only for weak rhyming, but also for the discordance between verbal stress and musical accent:

As for Will Jennings' English lyrics, it would be charitable not simply to draw a veil over them but to weight them down and throw them into a swamp. Charitable, but not as much fun as recounting couplets like "Arrest that man/He's the Hunchback of Notre Dame!" and "In Florence they have found/That the world's really round." Cocciante's score (which is pre-recorded; the only live orchestra is in the foyer at the interval) unintentionally warps English lyrics by forcing them to give every syllable equal emphasis; the first couple of times this seems novel, but it soon settles into irritation. (2000: 22)

Nick Curtis (*The Evening Standard*) also found that the lyrics were primitive and seemed disharmonious with the music:

Jennings has come up with some truly awful lyrics. Esmeralda sings of Phoebus: "He is shining like the sun, but he's as tough as anyone". The original pronunciation of all the names has been preserved to fit the cadences of Cocciante's songs, which makes them sound even more absurd. (2000: 3)

In Las Vegas, the critics found that the Jennings simplified the plot of the musical:

The pace was relentless, the music light on distinctive melodies and the English lyrics often atrocious: "Love is all I'm made of/the sun will shine above our love". Nearly every song was a merciless hail of rhymed couplets: "hair," "air," "care," "wear," "swear." Stop! We surrender! (Weatherford 2000: 1K)

Upon closer examination of the articles, it becomes clear that many of the reviewers criticized the lyrics but praised Cocciante's music, the singers' performances and the choreography.

For the analysis of the Russian critics' opinions, I used Russian periodicals such as *Коммерсант* (*Kommersant*), *Культура* (*Kultura*), and *Петербургский театральный журнал* (*Theater Journal of Saint Petersburg*), as well as articles from the site of the Russian songwriter Yuliy Kim.

The news that an adapted version of *Notre-Dame de Paris* would arrive to the Russian stage generated mixed reactions. Optimists, already acquainted with the Russian

version of the hit *Belle*, waited impatiently for the performance.¹³ Skeptics, however, did not believe that the French musical could successfully be translated into Russian. Some theatre critics, such as Marina Timasheva, advocated that a musical, like opera, should be performed in its original version, because fitting the language of the translated version to the music is difficult (qtd. in Vyle, 2002, “Premiere of the Musical...”). The critic of *Kommersant*, Marina Shimadina, stated that the charm of language tends to disappear in translation, as happened to the song *Yesterday* in the Russian version (2002: 6). She notes that the translated lyrics became banal; for instance, the song *Belle* was reduced to a clumsy popular song.

Anna Yampolskaya analyzed the Russian translation in detail. She states that the original musical raises such important social issues as xenophobia and social inequality (2003: 45-56). The social ideas are transmitted by Clopin, who repeats in *La cour des miracles: ici on est tous des frères, nous sommes de la même race, vous ne trouverez chez nous ni religion ni nation*. According to Yampolskaya, the Russian version does not retain the reference to refugees. For example, *Nous sommes des étrangers des sans papiers* is translated as *Мы люди без бумаг – толпа бродяг*, which literally means *We are people without papers – a crowd of tramps*. In Russian, the expression “without papers” does not bear the same social nuance. Therefore, the Russian translation lost the sense of “des étrangers” as in the original; it just presents a crowd of vagabonds. The Russian version, as Yampolskaya states, preserves only the love plot and avoids conveying the social commentary.

13 “Presentation of the Russian version of musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*.” Web. 15 September 2009
<http://www.newsru.com/cinema/25apr2002/notre_dame.html>

Conclusion

The British press portrayed *Notre-Dame de Paris* as a musical that did not conform to Broadway traditions. Not surprisingly, the English version was not warmly received by reviewers. Analysis of the British reviewers shows that critics pay close attention to the lyrics and discuss the imperfections of the medium of translation. It is remarkable that the term “translation” does not appear in reference to Jennings’ lyrics in theatrical reviews. Russian critics more often discuss “translation” and “adaptation.” Although the Russian version was criticized, most of reviewers were conscious that Russian translators encounter many language problems and that “the translation of rhyming text into pre-composed music is very problematical work” (Fihtengolts 2005: 1). Critics commented on the omission of social problems discussed in the original French version.

CHAPTER 4. ANALYSIS OF FRENCH-ENGLISH-RUSSIAN VERSIONS OF SONGS IN THE MUSICAL *Notre-Dame de Paris*

4.1 Norms and Problems of Translation

The main task in translating musical songs lies in fitting lyrics to the music. This process imposes an additional difficulty on the translators, because they are subject to the constraints of pre-existing music. In translation, the music stays intact. Therefore, the translation requires that chosen words preserve the stress and rhythm implied by the music while remaining true to the meaning of the words in the original text. In other words, the translator must set the lyrics on a musical underlay, or make a singable version.

Some researchers, such as Marta Mateo (2008), place the musical genre close to the opera genre because they both convey verbal text through singing in a theatrical scene. In regard to the norms of translation for these two genres, however, Mateo (2008: 320) notes that the majority of operas are subtitled, whereas most musicals are translated into the target language. By convention, most operas were performed in the original language: Italian compositions in the Italian language, French ones in French, and German works in German. However, after World War II, many operatic productions were disseminated in Britain and America in translated English-language versions in order to popularize the opera genre in those countries. Musical, on the other hand, were usually translated into the native language to attract a larger audience, to help them understand the storyline, and to encourage them to enjoy the show.

Opera goers, who like to attend their favorite show in its original French, German, or Italian version, may complain of the effect that translation has on the opera's artistic value. Some of these complaints are the result of poor librettos in the original opera, asserts Walter Volbach¹⁴, which forces authors to focus on the music and dramatic lines rather than on literary features (1953: 214). On the other hand, argues Volbach, if we accept that "Carmen must be performed in French, Tristan and Isolde in German, and La Bohème in Italian, because they will not sound well in English, then we should not permit translations of European drama either" (ibid.). Edward J. Dent, a British music writer and translator of many libretti, outlined additional problems with the translation of opera, including the importance of knowledge of both languages (ibid. 215). The translators need to master the source and target languages in order to convince the public that the translated version truthfully conveys the original message.

Although the norms for opera translation were elaborated in the 1950s, they are functional and can also be applied to translation of musicals due to the similarities of these genres. The main norms are¹⁵:

1. The music remains untouched.
2. The accent of the declamation is strictly observed, even in ensembles.
3. All forced methods of making lines fit by means of abbreviations, twisting of phrases, or contractions like e'er, you'll, he'd, etc. have been avoided, except when typical.

¹⁴ Volbach, Walther R. (1897-1996), the theatre historian and stage director.

¹⁵ Volbach, Walther R. "Foreign Opera in English." *Educational Theatre Journal* 3.3 (Oct. 1953): 214. Print.

4. The number of syllables in a phrase is never augmented or diminished.
5. The organic breathing points are accurately preserved. No phrase is distorted by an inorganic splitting, nor do false connections alter the original phrasing.
6. The original vowel is maintained to the greatest possible extent at all exposed places where the nature of the vowel is part of the musical effect.
7. To ensure clear enunciation and good diction, words that are difficult to pronounce are not crowded, especially in passages of rapid tempo.
8. Throughout the entire opera, the translation endeavors to follow the original as closely as possible in the conviction that the further a translation digresses from the original, the less it will preserve the unity of words and music.

As a contribution to the above-named features of operatic translation, Carolyn Roberts Finlay asserts that the translation must always complement the music, preserve the meaning of the original, and include the same number of syllables (1983: 201). Preserving the metrical pattern is important as well: “Scansion of the music is necessary here (ideally the translator will also be a trained musician), for the translation must approximate the stresses of the original not as it is spoken but as it would be sung” (ibid.). According to Finlay, an example of awkward translation is when the singer has to sing with the musical accent on a phonologically unstressed syllable.¹⁶ Verbal stress and musical accent must correspond to each other in order to follow standard phonetic rules of the target language. The stress shift can be illustrated by the example of the Russian

¹⁶ Finlay suggests defining the terms “stress” and “accent” as follows: stress is used for phonological stress only, whereas accent refers to musical meter (1983: 201).

song *Gde ona? (Ou est-elle?)*. In this song, the word *Esmerálda*, habitually stressed on the third syllable, is articulated as: *Esmeraldá*, with the stress on a last syllable. This change in stress sounds unusual to Russian listeners.

The norms of operatic translation can serve as a model for translation of musicals, although they are not easy to follow due to grammatical and syntactical differences between languages. As Christiane Nord states:

The structural differences between two languages, particularly in lexic and sentence structure, give rise to certain translation problems which occur in every translation involving this pair of languages, no matter which of the two serves as source and which serves as target language. (1991: 159)

For example, the order of words in French and English tends to be: *Subject + Verb + Object*. In French, the object can sometimes come before the verb but after the subject: *Subject + Object + Verb*. In the Russian, the word order is very fluid, and the object can precede the subject: *Object + Subject + Verb*, or *Verb + Object + Subject*, or *Verb + Object + Subject*. English and French have an analytical structure in which grammatical meaning is largely expressed through the addition of words (such as auxiliaries) and by changes in word order within limited boundaries. Russian, on the other hand, is synthetic, in which the message is conveyed by adding prefixes, suffixes, and inflectional endings. In Russian there are only three tenses: past, present, and future. The present continuous tense exists only for some motion verbs; non-motion verbs do not have the progressive aspect. Russian has no articles and has very few auxiliary verbs. Nouns have three genders (masculine, feminine, and neuter).

The following table demonstrates the examples of a fluid word order in Russian:

| <p style="text-align: center;">Russian Version and Word-for-Word Translation</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">Literal Translation</p> |
|--|---|
| <p>Я состраданье за любовь готов принять. I am compassion for love willing to take. <i>(Subject + Direct Object + Prepositional Phrase + Compound Verb)</i></p> | <p>I am willing to take compassion for love. <i>(Subject + Compound Verb + Direct Object + Prepositional Phrase)</i></p> |
| <p>Обещают рай твои объятья. Promises paradise your embrace. <i>(Verb + Direct Object + Subject)</i></p> | <p>Your embrace promises paradise. <i>(Subject + Verb + Direct Object)</i></p> |
| <p>Цыганка дерзкая мою сгубила жизнь. Gypsy audacious my ruined life. <i>(Subject (noun + adjective) + Verb + Direct Object)</i></p> | <p>Audacious gypsy ruined my life. <i>(Subject (adjective + noun) + Verb + Direct Object)</i></p> |
| <p>Я душу дьяволу продам за ночь с тобой. I (my) soul to the devil would sell for (one) night with you. <i>(Subject + Direct Object + Indirect Object + Verb + Prepositional Phrase)</i></p> | <p>I'd sell my soul to the devil for one night with you. <i>(Subject + Verb + Indirect Object + Prepositional Phrase)</i></p> |

The syntax of song lyrics differs from the typical word order of prosaic language. A shift in syntax of song lyrics is used to emphasize the nuances of meaning; on the other hand, twisting the order of words is sometimes the only way to finish the verse. For example, if the word order of the famous ABBA song *Dancing Queen* is changed into *Queen Dancing*, the context of the song is affected. Instead of a great 17-year-old dancer, we imagine a real queen who is dancing. The placement of words depends on nuances of meaning that the translator wants to accentuate.

When translating opera from one language to another, the translator not only has to find the right meaning of the word, but also has to save the rhythm and the musical line. For this reason, Brian Blood¹⁷ notes that “translations of opera libretti are rarely ‘literal’” (2010: 1).

¹⁷ Dr. Blood is a former chairman of the [Southern Early Music Forum](#), webmaster of [Dolmetsch online](#), and the author of [music theory & history online](#).

4.2 English and Russian Translators of the Musical

Will Jennings, an American songwriter born in 1944 in Kilgore, Texas, translated 50 songs of the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* from French into English. Jennings graduated from Stephen F. Austin State University, earning a bachelor's degree in 1967, and went to work as a college instructor in Tyler, Texas. In the 1970s, Jennings tried his hand at writing songs in Nashville and then moved to Los Angeles to put his musical career on the fast track. He has written songs for motion picture soundtracks and for such famous singers as B.B. King, Eric Clapton, Joe Cocker, Whitney Houston, and Diana Ross. Jennings' work has earned him a number of Grammys, Golden Globes, and an Oscar win in 1998 for *My Heart Will Go On* sung by Céline Dion. Unfortunately, we cannot provide extended information about this songwriter.

Yuliy Kim, who completed the Russian version of the musical, was born in 1936 in Moscow and became one of Russia's prominent *bards*,¹⁸ songwriters, and playwrights. Kim's parents were Korean and Russian, one a journalist and one a Russian language teacher. During Stalin's purge in 1937, Kim's parents were arrested. His father was executed, and his mother was sentenced to exile (Daughtry 2006: 116). Until he was nine years old, Kim was not raised by his mother. After her rehabilitation, he was free to join his mother, but they had to live far away from Moscow. Only in 1954 was Kim able to come back to the capital and enter the Moscow State Pedagogical Institute, where he studied history and philology. When he started to work as a teacher, he joined a group of

¹⁸ *Bard* in Russia means a songwriter (often without professional affiliation) who performs his own songs. The bard movement appeared during the Soviet period in opposition to the communist regime of the 1960s. A few of the bards' parents, like Kim's, were victims of Stalin's purges. Accused of anti-Soviet activity, several bards even had to leave the country.

dissidents, and he belonged to an underground movement seeking to undermine the Soviet system. He lost his job due to his dissident activity but continued writing songs for plays and movies under the pseudonym Y. Mikhailov. After the fall of the Soviet Union, Kim began to perform legally. His songs are still popular in Russia and abroad. Nowadays, he regularly travels to the USA, Europe, and Israel to give concerts, principally performing his songs for Russian immigrants.

For Yuliy Kim, working on the musical was challenging for several reasons. First, Kim does not speak French and thus had to rely on a word-for-word translation from French into Russian and the English translation. In an interview, Kim stated that writing songs without any knowledge of the French language proved to be challenging work. Moreover, he admitted that his version departed far from the original text (Khafizov, 2006, “From Kamchatka to Notre Dame”).

Kim translated 46 songs of the musical. The songs *Belle*, *Vivre*, and *Danse Mon Esmeralda* were translated by Susanna Cyruk, a producer at the Mariinsky Theatre in Saint Petersburg. One song, *Ces diamants-là*, was translated into Russian by a high school student, Dasha Golubovskaja.

According to Kim, the French producers established a contest for someone to translate the last four mentioned songs (Nuzov, 2002, “Yuliy Kim”). Moreover, the French partners relied on their own consultants, who closely supervised the process of translation from the original. In fact, when the contest was announced, many professionals and amateurs attempted the translation from French into Russian. Several non-official versions are still available on Russian websites dedicated to *Notre-Dame de*

Paris.¹⁹ Natalia Karpova, who provided her own interlinear translation of the musical and poetic versions of several songs, demonstrated the reason why so many people wanted to perform the translation:

Why have I encroached on the “icon” and tried to translate it? Well, for the same reasons that V. Briusov and K. Balmont, among others, have already translated “The Raven” of Edgar [Allan] Poe several times. First of all, [I did it] out of love. Secondly, it is a call, a challenge. “It is unfeasible? And we will try!” However, let’s face the truth: poetic translation is a fiction; it does not exist in nature. It is impossible to “translate” the lyrics. It is possible to compose something similar, conveying the message and rhythmic structure more or less truly, but no more. ... As a result I was guided by music. The test for singability... that is, an opportunity to be sung... this translation has passed successfully enough. (2004, “Belle”)

This explanation shows that Karpova was mostly focused on creating a ‘singable’ translation, one in which certain features such as rhyme and rhythm are accorded priority and in which the lyrics fit the music. To accomplish this task, the translator should have some knowledge of music, of vocal technique, of prosody, and of rhyme. As Ronnie Apter states, “When music and words fit, and properly reinforce each other, the laboring translator is well rewarded” (1985: 309). Some of the finest songwriters and composers of musicals who mastered setting lyrics to music include Ira and George Gershwin, Irving Berlin, and Cole Porter.

4.3 Comparative Analysis of the Song *Belle*

Comparative analysis is a technique from the field of linguistics. As Lefevre said, “When translation thinking began to shift away from literary texts, it began to look forward to linguistics” (1992: 7). The linguistic-based approach to comparative analysis

¹⁹ Russian versions are available from: <http://www.frenchmusicals.ru/modules/news/>, <http://marakulin.musicals.ru/>, <http://stihi.ru/avtor/>. [Accessed 25 November, 2009].

involves two main concepts. The first is the controversial notion of “dynamic equivalence,” which was introduced by Nida and “attempted to define a translation as the closest natural equivalent to the original” (ibid.). The second phase, Lefevere notes, is focused on text linguistics (ibid. 8).

The philological motivation of linguistic research is focused on a better understanding of lyrics, audiences, and authors. Stylistic figures represent an approach that can help the author communicate the content. This technique can depend on author preferences and competence, as well as the intended audience. Lefevere further explains that “In practice, translators translate not for all potential readers ‘out there’ but for a subaudience likely to be interested in a given translation” (1992: 19).

Comparative analysis is determined to display how the translated versions relate to the original. Similarities and differences indicate the relationship between the translated versions and the original. I proceed with my analysis of *Notre-Dame de Paris* on both the stylistic and rhetorical levels of two translated versions, the English and the Russian. I did not limit the research to the comparison of one original and one target text; rather, I compare variations among the three versions in order to establish more similarities and differences between the translated texts. This analysis will demonstrate how the translator’s vision or interpretation of the reality he or she describes can modify the original message of the source text, as may be the case in the translation of certain songs.

In this section, I compare the English and Russian versions with the original French song *Belle* using the original lyrics from the musical.²⁰ The aim of this research is to show the translator's lexical choice in interpreting the main characters' feelings and how the translation choices can affect the characters' images.

According to the French Singles Chart (an online compilation of the top selling singles in France), *Belle* became the best-selling single in France in 1998. The song had a long, successful runs in both France and Belgium.²¹ This song occurs as the climax of the musical when three men – the priest Frollo, the bell ringer Quasimodo, and captain Phoebus – declare their love for Esmeralda. The song's selection was not just owing to its popularity. A close reading of the song lyrics enabled me to examine the variations in the interpretation of the images in the translated versions and further analysis allowed me to identify the allegorical expressions used to provide a fuller portrayal of the characters.

In the scene preceding this song, Frollo conceives kidnapping Esmeralda. Quasimodo, who cannot disobey Frollo, tries to capture Esmeralda and gets arrested by Phoebus. The latter, engaged to Fleur-de-Lys and attracted to Esmeralda, is torn by his affection for two women. All three characters, willingly and unwillingly involved in the scene of capturing Esmeralda, are afflicted by passion for her. This song is the climax of the first part, where the principal characters express their feelings for Esmeralda.

²⁰ The French and English lyrics are from books included with the DVD *Notre-Dame de Paris*, 1999, and the CD *Notre-Dame de Paris*, 2000. The Russian version is available from <http://frenchmusicals.narod.ru/notre/notremenu.htm> [Accessed 1 July 2009].

²¹ Source: <http://www.ultratop.be/nl/>, the official Belgian record chart.

The song consists of four verses; three of them contain ten lines, and the last part has six lines. I have divided my analysis into four parts according to each character's performance: Quasimodo, Frollo, Phoebus, and the last part, sung by all three of them.

4.4 Quasimodo's Part

As mentioned in a previous chapter, the English version of the song *Belle* was translated from the French in 1999, and was translated into Russian in 2002. The title of the English version maintains the word *Belle*, and each solo part starts with an address to *Belle*. Keeping the word *Belle* in the English version reminds us of the French origins of the musical. The title of the Russian version of the song, translated by Susanna Cyruk, is *Красавица*, (*Krasavitsa*, beauty, meaning a beautiful woman or a beautiful girl). The word *Belle* cannot be rendered by a one-syllable word in the Russian language. Instead of *Belle*, the translator uses one-syllable words to start every solo part: *Свет* (*Svet*, light), *Раи* (*Rai*, paradise), and *Сон* (*Son*, dream) which are metaphorically associated with the image of Esmeralda.

If we compare the first part of the French and English versions, we can see that the English version does not significantly depart from the original (table 1).²² The song starts with a metaphorical comparison to a bird and includes the image that Esmeralda's dance evokes in the eyes of Quasimodo: Hell. The key words are closely rendered: *un mot/the word, un oiseau/a bird, l'enfer/Hell, elle danse/she dances*.

The Russian version does not maintain the image of a dancing gypsy girl (table 1). Rather, this version is about the emotions that captured Quasimodo: he divulges his

²² The table includes my comments in italics regarding the differences between the source text and its translated versions.

hidden affection for the gypsy girl and he realizes that his dream is obviously hopeless as he is doomed to suffer eternal punishment for his ugly looks. The key expression here is the *sick soul*, which refers to Quasimodo's inner feelings. Interestingly, the word *soul* is not mentioned in the source (French) text. The character of Quasimodo presented in the Russian version seems to be more focused on his own inner world, whereas in the original, he is concentrated on the object of his love.

Table 1

| French Source Text | English Version | Russian Version ²³ |
|---|--|--|
| <p>QUASIMODO Belle</p> <p>Belle C'est un mot qu'on dirait inventé pour elle Quand elle danse et qu'elle met son corps à jour Tel Un oiseau qui étend ses ailes pour s'envoler Alors je sens l'enfer s'ouvrir sous mes pieds</p> | <p>QUASIMODO. Belle, belle Belle Is The Only Word</p> <p>Belle, is the only word I know that suits her well When she dances oh the stories she can tell A free bird trying out her wings to fly away And when I see her move I see Hell to pay</p> <p><i>Keywords translation: un mot/word Elle danse/she dances Un oiseau/bird L'enfer/Hell</i></p> | <p>QUASIMODO. Красавица The Beauty</p> <p>Light illuminated my sick soul No, I will not disturb your peace with passion Raving, Midnight ravings torment my heart again, Oh Esmeralda! I dared to desire you</p> <p><i>Esmeralda is compared to the Light in the soul of Quasimodo. There is an appeal to Esmeralda. The words my sick soul demonstrate reference to inner feelings.</i></p> |

²³ My translation – L.N. Original Russian lyrics are provided in Appendix A.

In the next part (table 2), the word *soul* appears in the English text and we can assume that the Russian translator was influenced by both the French and English texts. This part of the original includes a Biblical allusion: *Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre?*, which refers to Jesus defending an adulteress against those who wanted to throw a stone at her. This rhetorical question, articulated by Quasimodo, serves to portray Esmeralda as an innocent person. It is closely translated into English as *Who'd be the first to raise his hand and throw a stone?* The Russian version does not render this idea in the corresponding line (*A rejected hunchback, a curse written on the brow*), nor in the whole translated version. As above, the English translation reproduces the content of the source text as closely as possible. The difference lies only in the part of the French version where Quasimodo says that the person who blames Esmeralda does not deserve to live on Earth, whereas in the English version, he “threatens” to hang that person. In the original version, Quasimodo successively appeals to Notre-Dame and Lucifer (the name that refers to Satan). The English version keeps those pleas.

In the Russian version, Quasimodo does not mention the cathedral, but appeals directly to Esmeralda saying *Oh Esmeralda!* and calling her *you: I dared to desire you*. Quasimodo is hopeless for his eternal mark of monstrous looks. He is not happy on Earth and even after death he will not find peace.

Table 2 (continuation of the song)

| French Source Text | English Version | Russian Version |
|---|--|---|
| <p>J'ai posé mes yeux sous sa robe de gitane A quoi me sert encore de prier Notre-Dame?</p> <p>Quel Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre? Celui-là ne mérite pas d'être sur Terre</p> | <p>She dances naked in my soul and sleep won't come And it's no use to pray these prayers to Notre-Dame</p> <p>Tell, Who'd be the first to raise his hand and throw a stone I'd hang him high and laugh to see him die alone.</p> | <p>Ugliness is my eternal brand and heavy burden I am willing to take compassion for love</p> <p>No! A rejected hunchback, a curse written on the brow I will never be happy on Earth</p> |
| <p>Ô Lucifer! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Glisser mes doigts dans les cheveux d'Esmeralda</p> | <p><i>Quasimodo is willing to "hang" and "laugh" at one who dares to blame Esmeralda</i></p> <p>Oh Lucifer Please let me go beyond God's law. And run my fingers through her hair- Esmeralda!</p> | <p><i>Quasimodo is a tragic figure of heavy destiny, focused on his feelings as an unhappy outcast. No appeals to Notre-Dame and Lucifer.</i></p> <p>And after death I will not find peace I'd give my soul to the devil for one night with you</p> |
| | | <p><i>His eternal torments don't bring him tranquility; he can give his soul to the devil for joining Esmeralda</i></p> |

This part of the song (table 2) shows the divergence of messages: in the original French, as well as in the English, Quasimodo prays to just pass his fingers through Esmeralda's hair, but in the Russian version he goes beyond this desire and is ready to give his soul to the devil for one night with Esmeralda.

The analysis of this part shows that the English translator keeps his version close to the style used in the source text: he maintains the metaphorical comparison (*un oiseau/a bird*), the apostrophes (appeals to Notre-Dame and Lucifer), and the Biblical reference (*Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre?*). The Russian translator does not preserve those stylistic or rhetorical elements of the original.

4.5 Frolo's Part

The second part of the song is performed by Frolo. In the original version of the musical, Frolo talks about the evil passion that turned him away from God (table 3). The English version conveys the same idea: he is caught between his behavior and his vows. The antonymy *diable/Dieu* and *demon/God* in both versions emphasizes his contradictory feelings (table 3).

Table 3

| French Source Text | English Version | Russian Version |
|---|--|---|
| <p>FROLLO</p> <p>Belle Est-ce le diable qui s'est incarné en elle</p> <p>Pour détourner mes yeux du Dieu éternel?</p> | <p>FROLLO</p> <p>Belle, there's a demon inside her who came from Hell</p> <p>And he turned my eyes from God, and oh, I fell</p> <p><i>The antonymy le diable/le Dieu is translated as demon/God.</i></p> | <p>FROLLO</p> <p>Paradise Your embrace promises paradise</p> <p>Give me hope, Oh my curse! Know</p> <p><i>The antonymy le diable/le dieu is translated as paradise/curse Archdeacon Frolo does not appeal to God.</i></p> |

In the Russian part, the antonymy *demon/God* has disappeared but substituted to *paradise/curse*. Thus, there is no mention of God; instead Frolo exclaims: *Oh my curse!*

In the next part of this song (table 4), Frolo mentions *le Ciel*, (*God* in the English version), whereas in the Russian version he just calls himself *madman*. Frolo is therefore not pleading to a higher power for help, but rather blaming himself for his passion. He reveals himself as a human being who has the right to love and who suffers because of his love. The Russian Frolo evokes the audience's sympathy by appearing as a human being rather than just a religious character.

In this part of the couplet, Frolo shares his mixed emotions of desire and shame. The noun expression *désir charnel* is translated into English as the developed expression *the heat inside me I'm ashamed to tell*. The Russian translator, on the other hand, renders

the metaphorical phrase *the blind power of sinful thoughts*, which is stronger expression of feelings than *désir charnel*.

Table 4 (continuation of the song)

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>Qui a mis dans mon être ce désir charnel</p> | <p>He put this heat inside me I'm ashamed to tell</p> | <p>The blind power of sinful thoughts is sweet</p> |
| <p>Pour m'empêcher de regarder vers le Ciel?</p> | <p>Without my God inside I'm just a burning shell</p> | <p>Madman I haven't known what passion is</p> |
| <p><i>Frollo is taken by desire (désir charnel).</i></p> | <p><i>Frollo is confused by his feelings (I'm ashamed to tell).</i></p> | <p><i>Frollo is blinded by passion. Frollo does not plead to Heaven/God, he refers to himself as a "Madman."</i></p> |

In the subsequent part of the verse (table 5), the French version includes another Biblical reference, *le péché originel*, which is closely translated into English as *the sin of Eve*. In the Russian version, though, this reference is omitted. The idea of "sin" is instead transmitted by *lecherous girl, audacious gypsy*. In the French text as well, Esmeralda is described as a harlot: *une fille de joie, une fille de rien*, whereas the English translation makes no mention of her sexual character. The English translator thereby avoids besmirching Esmeralda's image. There is one more Biblical allusion (table 5), *porter la croix du genre humain*, which is translated in English as *bear the cross of all our human sin*. This song also includes an appeal to Notre-Dame, which is preserved in English lyrics. In the Russian version (table 5), the expression of bearing the cross is not translated. Instead, Frollo is described as a victim of his indecent behavior. His "cross" is to be *doomed to torture in hell*.

Obsessed by love, Frollo accuses Esmeralda of destroying his life. He is mad at her and loves her at the same time, but desire wins out and Frollo is ready to transgress a Biblical commandment – *pousser la porte du jardin d'Esmeralda*, or *open the door of love inside Esmeralda* in the English text. In the Russian version, this desire is transformed into willingness to sell his soul to the devil for one night with Esmeralda. The idea of selling one's soul was first mentioned in the English version: *For want of her I know I'd give my soul to sell* (table 5). The last expression was incorporated into the Russian version: *I'd give my soul to the devil for one night with you*, providing further evidence that the Russian translator, Susanna Cyruk, was influenced not only by the French, but also by the English version of the song.

Analysis of this part (table 5) shows that the English translator of the original French song, *Belle*, offers a closer translation than his Russian counterpart. The English translator succeeded in conveying a similar portrait of the priest from the original, a man who is tortured by his feelings. The original text includes such stylistic figures as antithesis, Biblical expressions, and the appeal, all of which are rendered into the target English text. The Russian version, on the other hand, seems to be a free interpretation of the source text. There are some key rhetoric elements missing in the Russian translation, most notably the Biblical references and the appeal to Notre-Dame. The image of Frollo in the Russian version seems to be more vividly human: he is not addressing God, but rather himself, so the audience perceives him as a human being who experiences deep feelings of affection toward a gypsy girl.

Table 5 (continuation of the song)

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| <p>Elle porte en elle le péché originel La désirer fait-il de moi un criminel?</p> <p>Celle Qu'on prenait pour une fille de joie, une fille de rien Semble soudain porter la croix du genre humain</p> <p>Ô Notre Dame! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Pousser la porte du jardin d'Esmeralda</p> <p><i>Frollo wishes to open the garden door.</i></p> | <p>The sin of Eve she has in her I know so well For want of her I know I'd give my soul to sell</p> <p><i>“Le péché originel” is translated as “the sin of Eve”. Frollo is ready to sell his soul to meet Esmeralda.</i></p> <p>Belle This gypsy girl, is there a soul beneath skin? And does she bear the cross of all our human sin?</p> <p><i>Frollo sings of Esmeralda. “Porter la croix du genre humain” is translated as the rhetorical question “does she bear the cross of all our human sin?”</i></p> <p>Oh Notre Dame Please let me go beyond God’s law Open the door of love inside Esmeralda!</p> <p><i>Frollo wishes to open the door of love.</i></p> | <p>Possessed by a lecherous girl, like by a demon, Audacious gypsy ruined my life</p> <p><i>There is no translation of “le péché originel.” Comparison to a “lecherous girl” and “audacious gypsy.”</i></p> <p>A shame Clad in a cassock by ironic fate I am doomed forever to torture in hell</p> <p><i>Frollo addresses to his inner emotions. “Porter la croix du genre humain” is not translated.</i></p> <p>And after death I will not find peace I’d sell my soul to the devil for one night with you</p> <p><i>No appeal to Notre-Dame. Frollo could sell his soul to be with Esmeralda.</i></p> |
|---|---|--|

4.6 Phoebus' Part

In both the English and Russian translated versions, Phoebus appears as a seducer who is torn by his desire for both the gypsy girl and his fiancée. The handsome captain confesses being untrue to Fleur-de-Lys and says that he lacks the willpower to resist the exotic beauty of Esmeralda. The English version (table 6) approaches the original in describing Esmeralda: her eyes (*ses yeux*), her bright-colored dress (*son jupon aux couleurs de l'arc-en-ciel/her rainbow-colored dress*). She is described as *pucelle*, which is translated by the developed expression *more pure, more pure than words can tell*. Frolo's fiancée Fleur-de-Lys is called *ma dulcinée* in the original, whereas in English she is *my promised one*.

Although there is textual resemblance, there are some nuances that are not conveyed in the English translation. For instance, the metaphorical expression *Quand ses mouvements me font voir monts et merveilles* is rendered as *when she dances, feelings come no man can quell*, which is not comparable to the idiomatic French expression (cf. *promise the moon, promise the earth*).

The next lines include a metaphorical allusion to a pillar of salt (*statue de sel*), taken from the Biblical story of Lot. This expression shows that the beauty of the gypsy is so striking that no man can avert his eye from her, even if it should turn him into a pillar of salt. In the English version, Phoebus offers himself to the devil with no mention of *pillar of salt*: *To be with her, I'd let the devil take me whole*.

Table 6

| French source text | English version | Russian version |
|--|--|--|
| <p>PHOEBUS</p> <p>Belle Malgré ses grands yeux noirs qui vous ensorcellent La demoiselle serait-elle encore pucelle? Quand ses mouvements me font voir monts et merveilles Sous son jupon aux couleurs de l'arc-en-ciel Ma dulcinée laissez-moi vous être infidèle Avant de vous avoir menée jusqu'à l'autel</p> <p><i>Keywords translation: ses yeux/her eyes, pucelle/more pure than words can tell, ma dulcinée/my promised one.</i></p> <p>Quel Est l'homme qui détournerait son regard d'elle Sous peine d'être changé en statue de sel?</p> | <p>PHOEBUS</p> <p>Belle, Even though her eyes seem to lead us to Hell She may be more pure, more pure than words can tell But when she dances feelings come no man can quell Beneath her rainbow-colored dress there burns the well My promised one, please let me one time be untrue Before in front of God and man I marry you</p> <p><i>“Voir monts et merveilles” is not translated idiomatically in the English or the Russian texts.</i></p> <p>Who Would be the man who'd turn from her to save his soul To be with her I'd let the devil take me whole.</p> <p><i>“Etre changé en statue de sel” is rendered as “let the devil take me whole.”</i></p> | <p>PHOEBUS</p> <p>Dream Esmeralda, my joyful dream filled with light Moan My moan of sinful passion, Esmeralda It Escaped my lips and rolled down like a stone It broke the heart of fair Fleur-de-Lys Virgin Mary you cannot help me I lack the power to overcome forbidden love</p> <p><i>Love is a sinful passion that makes him break the promise to his fiancée.</i></p> <p>Wait Do not leave me A crazy dream! The beauty makes slaves of men</p> <p><i>“Etre changé en statue de sel” is rendered as “The beauty makes slaves of men.”</i></p> |

In the Russian version, the translator has omitted the description of Esmeralda's beauty (table 6). Phoebus sings about his sinful passion to Esmeralda which urges him to be unfaithful to his fiancée. The address to the Virgin Mary²⁴, serves to emphasize his feelings, but this rhetorical figure is not present in the original French text. We can assume that in the Russian version, Phoebus is instead turning into his own description of his pain and suffering, in contrast to the original, in which the lyric is dedicated to the portrayal of Esmeralda. As for the allusion (*Sous peine d'être changé en statue de sel?*), the Russian translator reinforces the idea of transformation. However, instead of turning into a statue of salt, Phoebus transforms into a slave: "The beauty makes slaves of men."²⁵ In this part, there are two approaches to interpreting the Biblical allusion: in the English version, it was omitted entirely, whereas in the Russian version it was replaced by another metaphorical expression. In both cases, the allusion depicts Phoebus' passionate obsession for Esmeralda.

Table 7

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Ô Fleur-de-Lys Je ne suis pas homme de foi J'irai cueillir la fleur d'amour d'Esmeralda</p> | <p>Oh Fleur-de-Lys I am a man who knows no law I go to open up the rose – Esmeralda!</p> | <p>And after death I will not find peace I'd sell my soul to the devil for one night with you</p> |
|---|---|---|

²⁴ The translation of "Святая Дева" would be "Saint Lady" which refers to Virgin Mary.

²⁵ The translation of "В раба мужчину превращает красота" into English would be: "The beauty turns a man into a slave."

In the last part of the couplet (table 7), Phoebus appeals to Fleur-de-Lys. The appeal is replicated in English version but has disappeared in the Russian lyrics. There is a metaphorical phrase that expresses the desire to meet Esmeralda: *J'irai cueillir la fleur d'amour d'Esmeralda* or *I go to open up the rose – Esmeralda!* in the English version. In the Russian version, Phoebus repeats the wish to sell his soul to the devil for the night, which was articulated by Quasimodo and Frollo in previous couplets.

4.7 The Final Part

The finale (table 8) is performed by all three men. In the English version, as in the original, they repeat Quasimodo's lyrics. In the Russian version, the lines are taken from Phoebus' piece. In the French and English versions, there is an address to Lucifer with the desire to touch Esmeralda's hair. In the Russian version, this appeal to Lucifer is omitted and everyone sings about the same thing: they want to sell their soul to the devil for one night with Esmeralda; *I'll sell my soul to the devil for one night with you*, as if they all have the same desire. However, each character of the musical has different feelings toward Esmeralda: Quasimodo is desperate, Frollo is torn between his religious vows and passion, and Phoebus, the handsome captain, is just looking for an adventure. When the characters in the Russian version of the song sing the same line about wishing to spend one night with Esmeralda, this simplifies the characters and leaves us with similar images of them.

Table 8

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| <p>LES TROIS</p> <p>J'ai posé mes yeux sous sa robe de gitane A quoi me sert encore de prier Notre Dame Quel est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre Celui-là ne mérite pas d'être sur Terre</p> <p>Ô Lucifer! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Glisser mes doigts dans les cheveux d'Esmeralda Esmeralda</p> | <p>Quasimodo, Frollo and Phoebus</p> <p>She dances naked in my soul and sleep won't come And it's no use to pray these prayers to Notre-Dame Tell who'd be the first to raise his hand and throw a stone I'd hang him high and laugh to see him die alone</p> <p>Oh Lucifer Please let me go beyond God's law And run my fingers through her hair - Esmeralda! Esmeralda!</p> | <p>Quasimodo, Frollo and Phoebus</p> <p>Day and night she is the only one in my sight I don't pray to Madonna, I only pray to her Wait Do not leave me A crazy dream! The beauty makes slaves of men</p> <p>And after death I will not dwell in peace I'd sell my soul to the devil for one night with you One night with you! One night with you!</p> |
|--|---|---|

Conclusion

The translation of lyrics is affected by many constraints that translators have to take into consideration, such as grammatical structure and the rhetorical devices of languages. In addition, the translators of *Notre-Dame de Paris* had to work within licensing rules that demanded some special measures be taken. Marta Mateo stated that the team of directors of the source production often took charge of their ‘exported’ show, as it happened in Spain: “The Spanish *Cabaret* used the same stage design as in Broadway, with Broadway directors travelling to Spain to supervise the whole project – now a common working pattern in the production of foreign musicals” (2008: 326). Regarding the translation of musical comedy, Johan Franzon commented that “the music is often played according to the score provided by the theatrical licensing agency” (2005: 268). As for the English version of the *Notre-Dame de Paris*, Tesseyre and Dezzani noted (“Hit ‘Notre-Dame’ Takes to Road”, 1999):

Now *Sony Music France's Columbia* label has licensed the album for the rest of the world, and the show--currently touring Canada--is being adapted into English. Lyricist Luc Plamondon and score writer Riccardo Cocciante are working with Will Jennings on translating the show's songs for a planned U.K. release in October.

The purpose of the comparative analysis of the present work is to explore *what* the author wanted to communicate and *how* it was conveyed in the translated version. The analysis shows that the English version preserved communicative clues and used vocabulary that remains close to the original. Thus, the images of the main characters (Quasimodo, Frollo, and Phoebus) are replicated from the original version. On a stylistic

level, the translation to a large extent retained the metaphoric expressions and rhetorical devices (apostrophe, allusion, and antithesis).

The Russian version is necessarily more “creative” in the sense that the translator was free to choose vocabulary to better develop the characters and to bring out their feelings. Therefore, characters are interpreted in a different way: Quasimodo has a more tragic image that is reinforced by lexical choice (*ugliness, rejected hunchback, a curse written on the brow, heavy burden*). Frollo is portrayed as a suffering human being, condemned to eternal torture for his love for Esmeralda. Almost all of the signs reminding the audience of his religious origin have disappeared from Russian version (appeals to God, to Notre-Dame, and Biblical allusions). Phoebus concentrates more on his own feelings of love as he sings about sinful passion and forbidden love that he cannot overcome.

4.8 Translation of Biblical Allusions in the Musical

The literary technique of allusion, particularly in reference to Biblical texts, is widely applied in modern song lyrics. The rock band U2, for example, has many songs (*I Will Follow, Stranger in a Strange Land, Tomorrow*, to name but a few) that include allusions to the Bible. For instance, the song *Fire* starts with: “The sun is burning black ... the moon is running red ... the stars are falling down,” which refers to Revelation 6:12-13, “...there was a great earthquake; the sun turned as black as dark sackcloth and the whole moon became like blood. The stars in the sky fell to the earth...”²⁶ Sting’s song *All*

²⁶ Pancella, Angela. “Bible references in U2 lyrics: Drawing Their Fish in the Sand.”. U2 Lyrics from @U2. Web. 20 November 2009. < <http://www.atu2.com/lyrics/>>.

This Time, dedicated to his late father, also borrows a key phrase from the Bible: “Blessed are the poor, for they shall inherit the Earth. /Better to be poor than be a fat man in the eye of a needle.” Yet another example is Leonard Cohen, who wrote songs such as *If It Be Your Will* and *Hallelujah* that are based on Biblical texts. A similar statement can be made about Elton John’s song *Original Sin*.

In Russia, religious themes began to be more widespread after the collapse of the communist regime. For example, the rock singer Kinchev, popular in the 1980s for his hard rock music (considered as a protest against the system), was baptized in the 1990s, at which point his songs were progressively filled with Christian sentiments. Consider, for instance, the lyrics to his song *My war*²⁷, which begin with the words, “If the light in me is darkness, then what is the darkness”²⁸, a clear reference to the Gospel of Saint Matthew (6: 23). Another instance of religious allegorical expressions can be found in the songs of the Russian rap group *Triad* with overtly religious references. Their song *My religion*²⁹ (2004) even presents an appeal to pray and repent because doomsday is near, or as the song puts it: “The truth is in the Bible.”³⁰

One of the difficulties in translation is that the translator must decide whether the target audience is familiar with the intended allusions to the point of understanding the original meaning. If not, the translator needs to find a way to recreate the same ideas in the target language. As Lefevere notes, the translator has to make a decision “whether to introduce the allusion (and possibly explain it at some length in a footnote), to omit it, or to replace it by an allusion endemic to their own culture and analogous to the allusion

²⁷ The original Russian title is *Моя война*.

²⁸ The original Russian text: “Если свет, который во мне, - есть тьма, то какова тогда тьма?”

²⁹ The original Russian title is *Моя религия*.

³⁰ The original Russian text: “Истина в Библии!”

found in the original” (1992: 22). Biblical allusions are incorporated throughout the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* to describe the traditions and customs of a medieval society in which religion played a significant role. For instance, as noted, the song *Belle* has a number of expressions that refer to specific Biblical stories that are quite familiar to audiences in Christian societies but would be draw a blank from Russian audiences, who have no knowledge of these stories. The following table presents the Biblical allusions used in the French source text and their English and Russian renditions in the song *Belle*:

| French Source Text | English Version | Russian Version |
|---|---|------------------------|
| Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre? | Who'd be the first to raise his hand and throw a stone? | Not translated |
| Elle porte en elle le péché originel. | The sin of Eve she has in her I know so well. | Not translated |
| Semble soudain porter la croix du genre humain? | And does she bear the cross of all our human sin? | Not translated |
| Sous peine d'être changé en statue de sel? | Not translated | Not translated |

Generally, the translation of Biblical allusions suggests an expectation that the audience has a good understanding of the evoked images, otherwise the effect is lost. Whereas the English translator tends to render equivalences of expressions, his Russian counterpart does not bring all of the Biblical references into the translation. In the

translation process, some losses may be insignificant. However, certain scholars such as Ritva Leppihalme believe that at times texts “tend to be impoverished if allusions are neglected” (1997: 23). It is certain that the Biblical references in the original version of the musical provide a clear message to its intended audience. In the song *Belle*, the allusions serve to illustrate the characters’ moral qualities. Spectators with the same cultural background as the source language audience would be aware of the images evoked by the Biblical references and their understanding of the musical’s characters would be enhanced.

The Russian translator, however, chose to omit or modify several of these Biblical references. Was this choice made due to musical constraints or was it due to other reasons? To answer this question, I searched for other translations that retained the original allusions yet provided a singable version.

When *Notre-Dame de Paris* opened on the Moscow stage, many professional and non-professional translators offered alternative translations of the musical. The website, dedicated to the French musical, contains fifteen versions of the song *Belle*³¹. Some of those versions provide accurate equivalents of the Biblical allusions:

³¹ Source: <http://frenchmusicals.ru/modules/news/article.php?storyid=83>

| French source text | Russian versions | English translation |
|---|---|--|
| <p>Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre? Celui-là ne mérite pas d'être sur Terre</p> | <p>Кто первым камень ей осмелится швырнуть Тот на земле закончит свой позорный путь. (Alexandre Serdechnyj)</p> | <p>He who dares cast the first stone at her Will end his shameful way on Earth.</p> |
| | <p>Кто судьей решится стать и бросит камень зла, Того подвергнул бы всем мукам я сполна. (Olga Morgunova)</p> | <p>He who dares become a judge and cast a stone of harm, would be subjected to all torments.</p> |
| | <p>Кто поднять бы руку с камнем на неё посмел, Тот от возмездия спастись бы не сумел. (Anna Balandina)</p> | <p>He who dares raise [his] hand with a stone at her, would not escape retribution.</p> |
| <p>Elle porte en elle le péché originel La désirer fait-il de moi un criminel?</p> | <p>Все в ней - соблазн, порок и первородный грех, И все ж она желанней всех, прекрасней всех. (Natalia Karpova)</p> | <p>All in her – temptation, vice and original sin, And yet she is the most desired, the most beautiful.</p> |
| | <p>Она несет в себе грехи земных людей. И я преступник, ведь она в душе моей. (Anastasya Leonova)</p> | <p>She bears the sins of all mortals And I am a criminal for she is in my soul.</p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| | <p>Несешь в себе ты первородный страшный грех Преступник я ль, желая от тебя утех? (Alexandre Serdechnyj)</p> | <p>You are carrying a terrible original sin Am I a criminal, wishing for pleasure with you?</p> |
| | <p>Грех первородный в ней заложен, знаю я. Во искушение, видно, черт послал тебя. (Olga Morgunova)</p> | <p>The original sin is rooted in her, I know. Apparently, the devil has sent you as a temptation.</p> |
| <p>Celle Qu'on prenait pour une fille de joie, une fille de rien Semble soudain porter la croix du genre humain?</p> | <p>Ты Цыганка, чья дурная слава будит страсть. Несешь ты крест всех прегрешений, не таясь. (Olga Morgunova)</p> | <p>You Gypsy whose evil repute awakens passion. You openly carry the cross for all sins.</p> |
| | <p>В обличье девочки веселой и простой Она одна несет свой крест за род людской. (Galina Ryshenkova)</p> | <p>In the guise of a fun and easy girl She [is] the one to carry her cross for the human race.</p> |
| | <p>Ее душа – свеча... Несет тяжелый крест чужих людских грехов... (Alexey Moskinov)</p> | <p>Her soul [is] a candle... Bears a heavy cross of the sins of others...</p> |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Quel Est l'homme qui détournerait son regard d'elle Sous peine d'être changé en statue de sel?</p> | <p>Belle! Никто не может отвести свой взор, все к ней Пред нею превращаюсь в статую... (Vladimir Shmelev)</p> | <p>Belle! Nobody can avert his eyes from her, everyone is drawn to her At the sight of her [I] turn into a statue ...</p> |
|--|---|---|

The above examples demonstrate the possibility of rendering the original Biblical allusions into Russian while also satisfying the requirements for singability and rhyming.

Alexey Moskinov, who gave his own version of the song, stated³²:

Well, first, there is a huge difference between theatrical translation and translations for needs of show business (and a musical is a part of it). It is not about “providing a beautiful translation” or “being faithful to the original”... It is all about money. It’s a commercial project. And whether the Biblical citations are translated or not is not relevant.

The Russian version is a very weak translation. Very much. It was done, probably, in haste.

A translator can offer several reasons why text that could be perfectly translated ... was translated strangely. The translator will say: “that is the way I see it”. Or: “my images suit the mentality of our society”. Or: “I tried to show tolerance to a nonreligious audience”. And so forth.

While Moskinov’s views regarding the objectives of the producers are debatable, he does have a valid point regarding the quality of the translation. In addition, he raises

³² Moskinov is a journalist and a copywriter. On his own initiative, he translated all fifty songs of the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* into Russian (<http://www.moskinov.ru/hobby/translate/>). He also wrote a satirical version of *Notre-Dame de Paris* for his own amateur theatre group (<http://nddp.musicals.ru/fun/index.html>). He responded to my message on translating Biblical references on September 20, 2010.

the issue of demonstrating tolerance to Russia's mostly atheist society. This observation was also confirmed by Irina Oleknova, translator, lyricist, and singer of French songs:³³

As you have correctly noted, Cyruk eliminated all religious references made by Quasimodo, and especially Frollo...I think you're right when you see the explanation in atheistic mass consciousness of people...The translator wanted a version that was simpler, and the closer to ordinary people...

A very likely reason to explain the omission of many of the Biblical allusions in the Russian version is a direct result of seven decades of atheist propaganda in Soviet society, which considerably affected social and cultural life. Harold Joseph Berman³⁴, who addressed the subject of belief-systems in Soviet Russia in his books, stated that Soviet society endured "a systematic campaign to remove traditional religious belief from public life and public discourse and to root it out of the minds of the Soviet people" (2000: 357).

Being religious in the Soviet Union carried a social stigma to the point that it could affect a person's potential career. Members of Communist Party who were attending church services were "subject to expulsion from the Party" (ibid. 359). Religious people were considered to be lacking in self-confidence. Soviet leaders downplayed the role of the church in order to reinforce their power over people's lives. In fact, Khrushchev, the leader of the Soviet Union during the Cold War, described the reasons for the antireligious campaign in a speech he made in 1960:

³³ Oleknova's personal site with the translation of her songs is: <http://www.olehova.com>. She responded to my message, sent via her guestbook, on September 23, 2010.

³⁴ Harold J. Berman (1917–2007) was Ames Professor of Law at Harvard Law School, the author of some 300 scholarly articles and 20 books, and a world authority on Western law, religion, legal history, and Russian Law.

Communist education presupposes emancipation from religious prejudices and superstitions, which hinder individual Soviet people from fully developing their creative powers. (qtd. in Thrower 1983: 142)

Among the consequences of this campaign, all college and university students attended Scientific Atheism courses which advocated disbelief in religion. Religious themes were not welcome in the arts either. Writers, poets, and artists created their works to suit the government's policy. It is not surprising, therefore, that the Russian translator chose to omit certain Biblical references which might be lost on the Russian audience.

On the other hand, the musical contains numerous references to religious notions, such as *God, soul, repentance, punishment, demon, paradise, sins, etc.*, that were kept in the Russian translation. The following table provides several examples from various songs in the musical where these notions were retained in both the English and Russian translations (the song titles are indicated in bold and my comments in italics):

| French Source Text | English Version | Russian Version |
|---|---|--|
| <p>Le temps des cathédrales</p> <p>C'est une histoire qui a pour lieu Paris la belle en <u>l'an de Dieu</u> Mil quatre cent quatre vingt deux Histoire d'amour et de désir</p> | <p>The Age of the Cathedrals</p> <p>This is a tale that takes its place. In Paris fair, <u>this year of grace</u>. Fourteen hundred eighty two. A tale of lust and love so true.</p> | <p>The Age of the Cathedrals</p> <p>Time has come, the hour has struck, We begin our story About life, death and love, How it was in our times</p> <p><i>(L'an de Dieu is not translated)</i></p> |
| <p>La Sorcière</p> <p>La religion de <u>Jésus-Christ</u> Et de sa sainte <u>Mère Marie</u></p> | <p>The Sorceress</p> <p>Our <u>Jesus Christ</u> will lead her on, and <u>Mother Mary</u> holy one.</p> | <p>The Sorceress</p> <p>And, maybe with time, <u>Madonna</u> will have pity on her.</p> <p><i>(Jesus Christ is not translated)</i></p> |
| <p>La Cour des Miracles</p> <p>Vous ne trouverez chez nous ni <u>le Ciel</u> ni <u>l'Enfer</u></p> | <p>The Court of the Miracles</p> <p>There's <u>no heaven</u> there's <u>no hell</u>.</p> | <p>The Court of the Miracles</p> <p>And we need <u>neither Hell</u> nor <u>paradise</u></p> |
| <p>Anarkia</p> <p>L'avez vous touchée Vassal de <u>Satan</u>?</p> | <p>Anarchy</p> <p>Did you touch the girl, you <u>creature of sin</u>?</p> | <p>Anarkia</p> <p>Did you <u>sin</u> with her And ruin your <u>soul</u></p> |
| <p>À boire!</p> <p>Priez pour lui, <u>pauvre pécheur</u> Ayez pitié de lui <u>Seigneur</u></p> | <p>Water Please</p> <p>Pray for his soul this <u>child of sin</u>. <u>God</u> in your mercy, take him in.</p> | <p>Water Please</p> <p>[You] could not overcome temptation Perhaps, <u>the Lord</u> forgives you</p> |

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| <p><i>L'ombre</i></p> <p>N'êtes vous pas <u>homme de Dieu</u> Pardieu!</p> | <p><i>The Shadow</i></p> <p>And are you not a <u>man of God</u>? By god!</p> | <p><i>The Shadow</i></p> <p>Whether you are a rabid dog Or <u>God's finger</u>...</p> |
| <p><i>Florence</i></p> <p>Les livres des écoles tueront les cathédrales <u>La Bible</u> tuera l'Église et l'homme tuera <u>Dieu</u></p> <p>Ceci tuera cela</p> <p>Luther va réécrire le <u>Nouveau Testament</u></p> | <p><i>Talk To Me Of Florence</i></p> <p>The books they read in school will kill cathedrals all. <u>The Bible</u> kills the church, and man will make <u>God</u> fall.</p> <p>The new will kill the old.</p> <p>Luther will give the world, the true <u>New Testament</u>.</p> | <p><i>Florence</i></p> <p>It is a new deluge of Doubtful ornate words where all will fail - temple, and <u>God</u>, and <u>cross</u></p> <p>And in our arrogance – and as we forget <u>God</u>, We will destroy the old temple – and we will make up a <u>new myth</u>.</p> <p>(<i>New Testament</i> is turned into a <i>new myth</i>)</p> |
| <p><i>Les oiseaux qu'on met en cage</i></p> <p>Serais-tu morte peut-être Sans <u>prière</u> et sans couronne? Ne laisse jamais un <u>prêtre</u> S'approcher de ta personne</p> | <p><i>The Birds They Put In Cages</i></p> <p>Have you died out in the small streets, with no <u>prayer</u> to get to heaven? There's a <u>priest</u> who counts your heartbeat, if he comes near you must run.</p> | <p><i>The Birds in Cages</i></p> <p><u>God</u> forbid that you died Without <u>cross</u> and <u>repentance</u> And no one to accompany a gipsy to your final journey</p> |

Two different reasons could be offered to account for keeping these religious notions in Russian version. The first reason is that maintaining these references helped portray the deeply religious spirit of the medieval society which serves as the background

to the musical. The second reason is that despite the atheist propaganda in the Russian society, this was previously a Christian society and religious concepts were still commonly understood. In fact, Russian literature of the 19th Century was filled with religious concepts (for example, works by Tolstoy and Dostoevsky.) These works are studied by high school students throughout Russia, such that the average Russian is well aware of many Christian notions and traditions, without necessarily being familiar with the Biblical stories.

4.9 Comparative Analysis of the Song *Les Cloches*

The song *Les Cloches (The Bells, Kolokola)*, performed by Quasimodo and the Choir of the Bells, is also interesting to examine.³⁵ This song was selected for analysis for two main reasons. First, it provides a perfect example of the rendition of syntactical figures and rhetorical devices – including anaphora, syntactic parallelism, antithesis, stylistic contrast, personification, and onomatopoeia – in the translated texts. Secondly, this song can be analyzed with respect to the translation of religious references raised in the previous chapter. This analysis reveals that the English translator renders all Greek and Latin common names of the Christian liturgy as prayers, whereas the Russian translator tends to neglect them.

In this song Quasimodo expresses his love for the cathedral. Sentenced to solitude by his ugliness, Quasimodo spent his life around the bells, the only witnesses of both his sad and joyful moments. One of the distinguishing features of the song is the

³⁵ The lyrics of the original French and Russian versions are provided in Appendix B.

stylistic devices through which the lyricist communicates important thoughts and feelings.

Meschonnic said: “Étudier le style d’un écrivain, c’est étudier un univers fermé-ouvert, langage à tous, langage unique” (1970: 11). This section starts with a translation analysis of the English version from a stylistic approach. The following stylistic and rhetorical devices are selected for the analysis: **anaphora, antithesis, syntactic parallelism, stylistic contrast, personification, and onomatopoeia.**

Anaphora (repetition of a word or phrase at the start of neighboring clauses), is commonly used in music lyrics. The anaphoric repetition *Celles* (*Bells* in the English translation) at the beginning of each sentence is used to introduce the audience to the world of Quasimodo. Anaphora is followed by the onomatopoeic verb *sonner, ring*, representing the sound of bells. The translated text in English, as shown in table 1, also preserves the original **syntactic parallelism and** further constitutes **stylistic contrast** (*on naît, on meurt, we’re born, we die*).

Table 1

| French Source Text | English Version |
|---|--|
| <p>Celles qui sonnent quand on naît Celles qui sonnent quand on meurt</p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Conjunction + Subject + Verb)</i></p> | <p>Bells that ring when we're born Bells that ring when we die</p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Conjunction + Subject + Verb)</i></p> |
| <p>Celles qui sonnent tous les jours toutes les nuits, toutes les heures</p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Noun Phrases)</i></p> | <p>Bells that ring every day, every night, every hour</p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Noun Phrases)</i></p> |

Syntactic parallelism is frequently used as a repetitive device in this song:

Table 2

| | |
|--|--|
| <p><u>Celles qui sonnent quand on prie</u> <u>Celles qui sonnent quand on pleure</u></p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Conjunction + Subject + Verb)</i></p> | <p><u>Bells that ring when we pray</u> <u>Bells that ring when we cry</u></p> <p><i>(Subject + Relative Pronoun + Verb + Conjunction. + Subject + Verb)</i></p> |
|--|--|

Acclamations such as *Kyrie Eleison* (borrowed from the Greek petition *Lord, have mercy*, and used in various offices of the Orthodox church, the Roman Catholic Church and the Anglican Church), *Dies Irae*, *Dies Illa* (a Latin hymn of the Day of Judgment, commonly sung in a Requiem mass) help to create an authentic liturgical spirit.

Table 3

| French Source Text | English Version |
|---|---|
| Toutes les cloches que je sonne <u>Kyrie Eleison</u> Hosanna Alléluia <u>Dies Irae, dies Illa</u> | All these bells that I sound <u>Kyrie Eleison</u> Hosanna Allelujah <u>Dies Irae, Dies Illa</u> |

Moreover, the texts are loaded with religious holidays and saint days: *feast of Rameaux, Annunciation, Resurrection, Good Friday, Christmas Day*, to name just a few. The translator has preserved all these notions in the English translation (see table 4).

Table 4

| French Source Text | English Version |
|---|---|
| Pour <u>la fête Rameaux</u> Pour la Quasimodo Pour <u>le jour de Noël</u> et le jour de la <u>Toussaint</u> | For the <u>feast of Rameaux</u> For the Quasimodo For a bright <u>Christmas Day</u> And for the day of <u>All Saints</u> |
| Pour <u>l'Annonciation</u> Pour <u>la Résurrection</u> Pour <u>la St-Valentin</u> et pour le <u>Vendredi Saint</u> | For <u>Annunciation</u> For the <u>Resurrection</u> For <u>St-Valentine's Day</u> and for the day of <u>All Saints</u> |

Personification expresses the idea that Quasimodo treats the bells as human beings by giving them names and calling them his “friends”:

Table 5

| French Source Text | English Version |
|---|---|
| <p>Mais celles que je préfère Parmi toutes ces femmes de fer Ce sont les trois <u>Maries</u> <u>Mes meilleures amies</u></p> | <p>The bells I hold most dear Of the beauties I have here, They are my <u>Marys three</u> <u>All best friends to me.</u></p> |

In the following verse, the author also uses **anaphora** (*Toutes, Bells*), followed by **antithesis** (*malheur, bonheur, mourn, laugh, sad, glad*). These stylistic figures create **personification** in the English version – *Bells that mourn, Bells that laugh* (see table 6).

Table 6

| French Source Text | English Version |
|--|--|
| <p><u>Toutes</u> ces cloches de <u>malheur</u> <u>Toutes</u> ces cloches de <u>bonheur</u> Toutes ces cloches qui n'ont jamais Encore sonné pour moi.</p> | <p><u>Bells that mourn</u> with the <u>sad</u> <u>Bells that laugh</u> with the <u>glad</u> All these bells that have never not Once rung out for me.</p> |

The use of repetitive elements (anaphora and parallel structures) and onomatopoeic verbs (sonner, ring) in this song serve to recall the bells' sound. The translator of the English text has kept the syntax and rhetorical elements of the original: anaphora, syntactic parallelism, stylistic contrast (antithesis), and personification.

In the Russian version completed by Yuliy Kim, the lexical choice differs from the original and the liberties taken are evident in the first verse of *Les Cloches/Kolokola*. In the Russian version, Notre-Dame has become a home for Quasimodo, whereas the original text does not convey that idea (table 7).

Table 7

| French Source Text | Russian Version |
|--|---|
| Les cloches que je sonne Sont mes amours, sont mes amantes Je veux qu'elles claironnent, Qu'elles tambourinent et qu'elles chantent | My home is Notre-Dame A big home – where My only road leads to you, My friends, the bells. |

The stylistic element **anaphora** (*Celles/At, and*) is partly rendered in some lines in the Russian version (table 8).

Table 8

| French Source Text | Russian Version |
|--|--|
| <u>Celles</u> qui sonnent quand on naît <u>Celles</u> qui sonnent quand on meurt <u>Celles</u> qui sonnent tous les jours toutes les nuits, toutes les heures | <u>At</u> a birth, (they) ring, <u>At</u> a baptism, (they) ring <u>And</u> in the morning, <u>and</u> in the night (they) constantly ring. |

In the original text, the bells are personified as friends; in the Russian version, the bells become wet nurses (table 9).

Table 9

| French Source Text | Russian Version |
|---|--|
| Mais celles que je préfère Parmi toutes ces femmes de fer Ce sont les trois Maries Qui sont mes meilleures amies | Here they (are), here they (are) – three of my favorites, My wet nurses – all called Mary |

It is important to note that the Greek and Latin phrases *Kyrie Eleison* and *Dies Irae, Dies Illa*, which might not be well known to the average Russian audience, have disappeared from the lyrics. Many of the religious holidays cited in the original are rendered according to traditions of the Eastern Orthodox Church, for instance: *Pentecost (Troitsa)*, *Easter (Paskha)*, *Christmas (Rozhdestvo)*, *Annunciation (Blagoveshchenie)*, and *Saint Valentine (Sviatoj Valentine)*:

Table 10

| French Source Text | Russian Version |
|---|---|
| Pour la fête de Rameaux Pour la Quasimodo Pour le jour de Noël et le jour de la Toussaint Pour l' Annunciation Pour la Résurrection Pour la St Valentin et pour le Vendredi saint | At a prayer call At a fight call And on holidays they) always relentlessly ring! And for the Pentecost (they) ring, and for Easter (they) peal Christmas, Annunciation, Saint Valentine. |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Pour les célébrations Et pour les processions La plus belle c'est celle qu'on appelle la Fête Dieu</p> <p>Jour de l'an, jour des rois Jour de Pâques, jour de joie Jour de la Pentecôte avec ses langues de feu</p> <p>Pour les confirmations Et pour les communions L'Angélus et le glas, Dies irae Dies illa</p> <p>Le jour de l'Ascension Le jour de l'Assomption Pour tous les hosannas et tous les alléluias</p> | <p>No rest, no dream – every day something: Either a funeral ceremony or a birthday dance!</p> <p>And when we get up, and when we go, And when we come, and when we leave –</p> <p>Bell copper continues to rattle, Fear the Lord, otherwise there is trouble!</p> <p>Even for those who have become deaf and whose souls have fallen ill And in an abyss of sin Submerged over their heads!</p> |
|---|---|

The following terms are not rendered into Russian by analogy with Greek and Latin words: *la fête de Rameaux, la Toussaint, la Résurrection, le Vendredi saint, la Fête Dieu, Jour de l'an, Jour des rois, les confirmations, les communions, l'Ascension, l'Assomption*. Even though some of those holidays are present in the Eastern Orthodox Church, the author did not translate them into Russian. The author of the Russian version, Yuliy Kim, reduced the number of terms related to religious holidays, replacing them with phrases of faith and morality: *Fear the Lord, otherwise it's a danger!* The omission of religious holidays can be explained similarly to the omission of Biblical allusions: the influence of a non-religious society on the translator's mindset. Even though both *Belle* and *Les Cloches* were translated into Russian by two different authors, a common attitude to the translation of religious terms is apparent.

CONCLUSION

As no translation can perfectly duplicate both the literary and musical nuances of a source text, musical translation is complex and challenging. In addition to conforming to the syntactic structure and rhetorical devices (metaphors, apostrophes, allusions) of the target language, the translator must adapt the text so that syllables match notes and verbal stress fits the musical accent. Dinda Gorlée states, “Vocal translation is an imaginative enterprise, yielding the temptation to bring out a translated symbiosis of poetic and musical texts” (1995: 8). The target text must work as a standalone work of art whose literary and musical attributes complement each other.

In this thesis, I compared the French, English, and Russian versions of the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* using comparative analysis to assess the effect of the translator’s choices on the musical’s plot and characterization. For instance, Section 3.8 demonstrates that the Russian translation deviated from the original text by ignoring social issues such as the treatment of refugees and xenophobia. These deviations affected the setting of the musical, its plot, and the portrayal of some of the main characters.

As my focus was on the methodology of analysis rather than the musical itself, I examined only two songs from the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*. An assessment of the three versions demonstrated that both translators had left the music unchanged, choosing to concentrate on fitting their text to the needs of the composer. In keeping with Johan Franzon’s statement that “if a song is to be performed in another language, the assignment calls for a ‘singable’ target text” (2008: 374), they strove primarily to produce a singable version intended for performance. The analysis of the English version

demonstrates that the translator took into account both the music and the original lyrics. The translation is in general an accurate representation of the original French production of *Notre-Dame de Paris*, with the majority of keywords, images, and dramatic elements preserved.

The Russian translators, while leaving the score untouched, took significant liberties with the source text. This loose interpretation of the original text affected the characterization of the main personages. Comparing the Russian text to the English and French illustrated that the Russian version modified much of the symbolism and metaphors, depicting a more introspective and self-pitying Quasimodo as well as a more humanized, less pious Frollo. Moreover, Susanna Cyruk tended to simplify sophisticated imagery, as best exemplified in the final part of the song *Belle*.

The thesis also explores the impact of social and political influences on translators. As mentioned in Sections 4.8 and 4.9, seven decades of atheist propaganda in Soviet society affected its culture. The Russian translators decided to limit the Biblical allusions and omit Greek and Latin liturgical phrases as well as some religious holidays from the translated lyrics. Christian allusions in *Notre-Dame de Paris* fall into two broad categories: specific biblical references and general theological concepts such as *God*, *Garden of Eden*, *Lord*, *heaven*, and *paradise*.

Section 4.9 showed that religious symbolism in the former category was not translated by the authors of the Russian version. However, the Russian translation maintained common Christian references that would be familiar even to a secular Russian audience, in order to better portray the devout society of medieval Paris. Due to these omissions, the Russian version is less overt than its English equivalent in the expression

of religious themes. If we consider other musicals performed on the Russian stage it soon becomes apparent that not many musicals were translated from English into Russian. Among those that were, *The Witches of Eastwick* (2003), *Cats* (2005), *Mamma Mia* (2006), and *The Producers* (2009), can be mentioned, although they were not oriented toward religious themes. One striking exception is the musical *Jesus Christ Superstar*, translated into Russian and staged in Moscow in 1990. The translation of this popular Christian musical was only possible after the fall of the Soviet regime. Loosely based on the Gospels, this musical is one of the longest-running shows – over twenty years and still going strong.

To sum up, although religious themes are apparent in popular culture, they are essentially marginal, especially in musicals. Or as Firuz Kazemzadeh³⁶ put it in a conference on *Religion in Russian Society*: “Religious freedom in Russia today is incomparably greater than in the Soviet era; yet, in comparison with the United States, it is severely limited” (Dresen 2006: 7). Future research could be conducted into the translation of Biblical references and the influence of religious belief in an atheistic environment, especially with respect to Russian society.

One of the factors that can explain the digression from the original text was mentioned in Section 4.2: Yuliy Kim, who translated most of the songs into Russian, does not speak or understand French, and he had to rely on the English translation together with a word-for-word translation from French into Russian. A translator who

³⁶ Firuz Kazemzadeh, Professor Emeritus of History, Yale University; former Vice Chairman, U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom.

does not understand the source language cannot emulate the nuances of the meaning in the original text.

It is important to note that this thesis does not discuss the literary merits of the different versions. The original and its various translations were written for a commercial purpose with the intention of producing a mass-market musical, and creating a literary masterpiece was not the objective. This opinion was also expressed by the author of the Russian satirical version, as mentioned in Section 4.8. The analysis of critical reception (Sections 3.6) shows that English translation was attacked for banal rhymes and unemotional language. Critics found fault with the Russian version for flaws in its lyrics translation along with its liberal interpretation of the source text. We can conclude that in both cases, translators did not meet the aesthetic values and expectations of critics.

The discussion of the role of the translator has already been raised in this thesis. Indeed, the personal responsibility of the translator is essential in the translation process. However, the accuracy of the translated text does not just consist in fidelity to the source text, since the commissioners of the project (the producers in this instance), and the target audience for whom the translation is destined, must also be considered. In consideration of these, often contradictory, demands the translators has to sacrifice certain textual details, in which case, they must try to figure out the specific cultural expectations and needs of the target audience, seek to retain the poetical quality of the original, and negotiate in good faith with the producers. If the content of the original can be effectively rendered in the target language then the task of the translator may be said to be accomplished. In our case, the popularity of the musical is evident from its sixteen-month

run in London, and its six-year run in Russia, which would seem to justify the efforts of the translator.

My research was based on the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris*, but my methods of analysis and conclusions are applicable to the translation of the musical genre in general. Discourse on the translation of musicals is a nascent branch in the field of translation studies that has not yet developed the theoretical base needed for future research. It is hoped that the linguistic approach to comparative analysis used in this thesis could serve as this groundwork.

Several factors determine the ideal strategy for translating a piece of musical theatre. Some approaches to translation create a final text that deviates considerably from the original - more adaptation than translation. In fact, McKelvey posits in his thesis that in music, theatre and film, “adaptation is the *norm* and translation is the exception” (2001: 82). Yet regardless of the approach to translation adopted, the international success of the musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* supports the effectiveness of translation as a medium for disseminating a work of art, even in a modified form, to a wider audience.

Appendix A

Song lyrics

Belle, Красавица.

| French Original Lyrics | Russian Lyrics |
|---|---|
| <p>QUASIMODO</p> <p>Belle C'est un mot qu'on dirait inventé pour elle Quand elle danse et qu'elle met son corps à jour Tel Un oiseau qui étend ses ailes pour s'envoler Alors je sens l'enfer s'ouvrir sous mes pieds J'ai posé mes yeux sous sa robe de gitane A quoi me sert encore de prier Notre-Dame?</p> <p>Quel Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre? Celui-là ne mérite pas d'être sur Terre</p> <p>Ô Lucifer! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Glisser mes doigts dans les cheveux d'Esmeralda</p> <p>FROLLO</p> <p>Belle Est-ce le diable qui s'est incarné en elle Pour détourner mes yeux du Dieu éternel?</p> | <p>КВАЗИМОДО</p> <p>Свет Озарил мою больную душу Нет, Твой покой я страстью не нарушу.</p> <p>Бред, Полночный бред терзает сердце мне опять, О, Эсмеральда, я посмел тебя желать! Мой тяжкий крест - уродства вечная печать Я состраданье за любовь Готов принять</p> <p>Нет! Горбун отверженный с проклятьем на челе Я никогда не буду счастлив на земле,</p> <p>И после смерти мне не обрести покой, Я душу дьяволу отдам за ночь с тобой.</p> <p>ФРОЛЛО</p> <p>Рай. Обещают рай твои объятья Дай мне надежду, О, мое проклятье</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Qui a mis dans mon être ce désir Charnel Pour m'empêcher de regarder vers le Ciel? Elle porte en elle le péché originel La désirer fait-il de moi un criminel? Celle Qu'on prenait pour une fille de joie, une fille de rien Semble soudain porter la croix du genre humain</p> <p>Ô Notre Dame! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Pousser la porte du jardin d'Esmeralda</p> <p>PHOEBUS</p> <p>Belle Malgré ses grands yeux noirs qui vous ensorcellent La demoiselle serait-elle encore pucelle? Quand ses mouvements me font voir monts et merveilles Sous son jupon aux couleurs de l'arc-en-ciel Ma dulcinée laissez-moi vous être infidèle Avant de vous avoir menée jusqu'à l'autel Quel Est l'homme qui détournerait son regard d'elle Sous peine d'être changé en statue de sel?</p> | <p>Знай греховных мыслей мне сладка слепая власть Безумец – прежде я не знал, что значит страсть. Распутной девкой, словно бесом одержим, Цыганка дерзкая мою сгубила жизнь Жаль Судьбы насмешкою я в рясу облачен, На муки адские навеки обречен</p> <p>И после смерти мне не обрести покой- Я душу дьяволу продам за ночь с тобой</p> <p>ФЕБ</p> <p>Сон Светлый, счастья сон мой, Эсмеральда Стон грешной страсти стон мой, Эсмеральда Он сорвался с губ и покатился камнем вниз Разбилось сердце белокурой Флёр-де-Лис Святая дева ты не в силах мне помочь Любви запретной не дано мне превозмочь Стой Не покидай меня безумная мечта В раба мужчину превращает красота И после смерти мне не обрести покой Я душу дьяволу продам за ночь с тобой</p> |
|--|---|

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>QUASIMODO, FROLLO et PHOEBUS</p> <p>J'ai posé mes yeux sous sa robe de gitane A quoi me sert encore de prier Notre-Dame?</p> <p>Quel Est celui qui lui jettera la première pierre? Celui-là ne mérite pas d'être sur Terre</p> <p>Ô Lucifer! Oh! laisse-moi rien qu'une fois Glisser mes doigts dans les cheveux d'Esmeralda</p> | <p>КВАЗИМОДО, ФРОЛЛО и ФЕБ</p> <p>И днем и ночью лишь она передо мною И не Мадонне я молюсь, а ей одной</p> <p>Стой. Не покидай меня безумная мечта В раба мужчину превращает красота</p> <p>И после смерти мне не обрести покой Я душу дьяволу продам за ночь с тобой</p> |
|---|--|

Appendix B

Song lyrics

Les Cloches, (Колокола)

| French Original Lyrics | Russian Lyrics |
|---|---|
| Les cloches que je sonne Sont mes amours, sont mes amantes Je veux qu'elles claironnent, Qu'elles tambourinent et qu'elles chantent | Мой дом - мой Нотр - Дам, Огромный дом - кому куда, А мне дорога к вам, Мои друзья, колокола. |
| Qu'il grêle ou qu'il tonne Ou qu'il pleuve ou qu'il vente Je veux qu'elles résonnent Dans la joie comme dans la tourmente | Всю жизнь - и пусть дождь, И пусть гром, и пусть град - Они всегда поют, Всегда звучат, всегда звонят. |
| Celles qui sonnent quand on naît Celles qui sonnent quand on meurt Celles qui sonnent tous les jours toutes les nuits, toutes les heures | На рождение звонят, на крещение звонят, И наутро, и на ночь постоянно звонят, |
| Celles qui sonnent quand on prie Celles qui sonnent quand on pleure Celles qui sonnent pour le peuple qui se lève de bonne heure | На молитву звонят и на битву звонят, А на праздники вовсе неустанно звонят! |
| Pour la fête de Rameaux Pour la Quasimodo Pour le jour de Noël et le jour de la Toussaint | И на Троицу звон, и на Пасху трезвон, Рождество, Благовещение, Святой Валентин |
| Pour l'Annonciation Pour la Résurrection Pour la St Valentin et pour le Vendredi saint | Ни устать, ни уснуть – каждый день что-нибудь: То обряд похорон, то хоровод именин! |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Pour les célébrations Et pour les processions La plus belle c'est celle qu'on appelle la Fête Dieu</p> <p>Jour de l'an, jour des rois Jour de Pâques, jour de joie Jour de la Pentecôte avec ses langues de feu</p> <p>Pour les confirmations Et pour les communions L'Angélus et le glas, Dies irae Dies illa</p> <p>Le jour de l'Ascension Le jour de l'Assomption Pour tous les hosannas et tous les alléluias</p> <p>Mais celles que je préfère Parmi toutes ces femmes de fer Ce sont les trois Maries Qui sont mes meilleures amies</p> <p>Il y a la petite Marie Pour les enfants qu'on met en terre Il y a la grande Marie Pour les marins qui partent en mer</p> <p>Mais quand je sonne la grosse Marie Pour les amants qui se marient C'est pas que j'ai le cœur à rire Je l'aurais plutôt à mourir</p> <p>De les voir si joyeux De les voir si heureux Moi qui qu'aucune femme de regardera jamais dans les yeux</p> <p>De les voir convoler De les voir s'envoler</p> | <p>И когда мы встаём, и когда мы идём, И когда мы приходим и уходим когда -</p> <p>Колокольная медь продолжает греметь, Чтобы помнили Бога, а иначе беда!</p> <p>Даже тем, кто оглох и душой занемог И в пучину порока с головой погружён,</p> <p>По велению Творца потрясают сердца Колокольные звоны, колокольный канон!</p> <p>Вот они, вот они – три любимицы мои, Кормилицы мои – всех зовут Мари.</p> <p>Вот малютка Мари – отпевает малышей, А большая Мари – их отцов и матерей.</p> <p>А вот толстуха Гросс - Мари - поздравляет молодых, И столько счастья в их глазах, А я не могу смотреть на них.</p> <p>Потому что они друг на друга глядят, Как никто в этом мире не глядел на меня!</p> <p>Потому что они обнимаются так,</p> |
|--|---|

| | |
|--|--|
| <p>Au milieu des étoiles sous la voûte des cieux</p> <p>Toutes les cloches que je sonne Kyrie Eleison Hosanna Alléluia dies irae dies illa</p> <p>Toutes ces cloches de malheur Toutes ces cloches de bonheur Toutes ces cloches qui n'ont jamais encore sonné pour moi</p> <p>Les cloches que je sonne Sont mes amies, sont mes amantes Je veux qu'elles claironnent Si Esmeralda est vivante Pour dire au monde que Quasimodo – aime Esmeralda</p> | <p>Как никто за всю жизнь ещё не обнял меня!</p> <p>Ну так спойте, друзья, не безмолвствуйте зря: Ну так, гряньте во имя своего звонаря,</p> <p>Чтобы, где бы теперь ни скрывали её, Эсмеральда услышала бы сердце моё!</p> <p>Звени - мой медный хор, По всей земле - труби во всю! Хочу, чтобы весь мир Узнал о том, как я люблю! Звени, мой хор, греми во все – колокола!</p> |
|--|--|

Works Cited

Primary sources

Alvarez, Antonia. "On Translating Metaphor." *Meta* 38.3 (1993): 479-490. Print.

Bosseaux, Charlotte. "Buffy the Vampire Slayer: Characterization in the Musical Episode of the TV Series." *The Translator: Translation and Music*. Ed. Şebnem Susam-Sarajeva. Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub., 14.2 (2008): 343-372. Print.

Finlay, Carolyn Roberts. "Operatic Translation and Šostakovič: The Nose." *Comparative Literature* 35.3 (1983): 195. Print.

Franzon, Johan. "Musical Comedy Translation: Fidelity and Format in the Scandinavian *My Fair Lady*." *Song and Significance. Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation*. Ed. Dinda L. Gorrée. Amsterdam & New York: Rodopi, 2005. 263-298. Print.

Franzon, Johan. "Choices in Song Translation. Singability in Print, Subtitles and Sung Performance." *The Translator: Translation and Music*. Ed. Şebnem Susam-Sarajeva. Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub., 14.2 (2008): 373-399. Print.

Gorrée, Dinda L., ed. *Song and Significance: Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005. Print.

Gorrée, Dinda L. "Jakobson and Peirce: Translational Intersemiosis and Symbiosis in Opera." *Sign Systems Studies* 36.2 (2008): 341-374. Print.

Grossman, Kathryn. "From Classic to Pop Icon: Popularizing Hugo." *The French Review* 74.3. (2001): 482-495. *American Association of Teachers of French, and Jstor*. Web. 29 Mar. 2009. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/399430>>

- Jakobson, Roman. *Language in Literature*. Ed. Krystyna Pomorska and Stephen Rudy. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 1987. *Google book Search*. Web. 8 Oct. 2010.
- Kaindl, Klaus. "The Plurisemiotics of Pop Song Translation: Words, Music, Voice and Image." *Song and Significance. Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation*. Ed. Dinda L. Gorrée. Amsterdam & New York: Rodopi, 2005. 235-262. Print.
- Lefevere, André. *Translating Literature: Practice and Theory in a Comparative Literature Context*. New York: Modern Language Association of America, 1992. Print.
- Leppihalme, Ritva. *Culture Bumps: An Empirical Approach to the Translation of Allusions*. 10 Vol. Clevedon U.K.; Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters, 1997. Print.
- Low, Peter. "The Pentathlon Approach to Translating Songs." *Song and Significance. Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation*. Ed. Dinda L. Gorrée. Amsterdam & New York: Rodopi, 2005. 185-212. Print.
- Low, Peter. "Translating Songs that Rhyme." *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology* 16.1 (2008): 1-20. Taylor & Francis. Web. 27 July 2009. <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13670050802364437>>
- Mateo, Marta. "Anglo-American Musicals in Spanish Theatres." *The Translator: Translation and Music*. Ed. Şebnem Susam-Sarajeva. Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub., 14.2 (2008): 319-342. Print.
- McKelvey, Myles. *Translating the Musical Les Misérables: A Polysystemic Approach*. Concordia University, 2001. Print.
- Meschonnic, Henri. *Pour La Poétique*. Paris: Gallimard, 1970. Print.

- Nida, Eugene Albert. *Toward a Science of Translating: With Special Reference to Principles and Procedures Involved in Bible Translating*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1964. Print.
- Nord, Christiane. *Text Analysis in Translation: Theory, Methodology, and Didactic Application of a Model for Translation-Oriented Text Analysis*. 94. Bd Vol. Amsterdam; Atlanta, GA: Rodopi, 1991. Print.
- Robb, Graham. *Victor Hugo*. New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1997. Print.
- Shestakov, Tatyana. *Translation, Politics, the Actor: Translation of the Musical "Cabaret."* Concordia University, 2005. Print.
- Susam-Sarajeva, Sebnem, ed. "Translation and Music." *The Translator* 14.2 (2008): 187-462. Manchester, U.K.: St. Jerome Pub. Print.

Secondary sources

- Beauvoyer, Jean and Beaulne, Jean. *René Angélil: the Making of Céline Dion: the Unauthorized Biography*. Trans. Wilson, John. Toronto, Ont.: Dundurn Group, 2004. *Google book Search*. Web. 20 May 2010.
- Benedict, David. "The Main Event – The Schlocky Horror Show." *The Independent* (London) 25 May 2000: 12. Print.
- Berman, Harold Joseph. *Faith and Order: The Reconciliation of Law and Religion*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2000. *Google book Search*. Web. 20 Sept. 2010.
- Beumers, Birgit, and Sergei Bodrov. *The Cinema of Russia and the Former Soviet Union*. London: Wallflower Press, 2007. Print.

- Blood, Brian. "Music Theory Online: Words & Music." *Dolmetsch online*. Lesson 32: The Words and Meaning. Dolmetsch Organisation. Web. 20 Apr. 2010. <<http://www.dolmetsch.com/musictheory32.htm>>
- Coveney, Michael. "For Quasimodo, there is nothing like this Dame; Michael Coveney at last night's first night." *Daily Mail* (London) 24 May 2000: 27. Print.
- Curtis, Nick. "It's a crock, monsieur; By comparison, Disney's film is a masterpiece of faithfulness." *The Evening Standard* (London) 24 May 2000 : 3. Print.
- DalGLISH, Darren. "Notre Dame de Paris at the Dominion Theatre." *London Theatre online*. 25 May 2000. Web. 15 July 2009. <<http://www.londontheatre.co.uk/londontheatre/reviews/notredameOO.htm>>
- Daughtry, James Martin. *The intonation of intimacy: Ethics, emotion, metaphor, and dialogue among contemporary Russian bards*. University of California. Los Angeles, 2006, 415 pages. *Proquest. Diss*. 20 Sept. 2010. <<http://0-proquest.umi.com.mercury.concordia.ca/>>
- Dostie, Bruno. « Un [Luc] Plamondon euphorique n'en revient pas du succès de « Starmania » à Moscou ». *La Presse* (Arts et Spectacles) 21 Apr. 1990: D3. Print.
- Dresen, Joseph, ed. *Religion in Russian Society: State Policy, Regional Challenges, and Individual Rights*. June 8-9, 2006. Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars. Washington, D.C. Web. 10 Dec. 2010. <<http://www.wilsoncenter.org/topics/pubs/OP298.pdf>>
- Egloff, Veronique. "Lorsque les vitraux de Notre-Dame éclairent les temps modernes." *Le Temps* 179 (1998). Culture: n.pag. Web. 20 Oct. 2006. <<http://0-www.biblio.eureka.cc.mercury.concordia.ca/>>

- Fihtengolts, Mikhail. "Musical and its chimeras." *Kultura Review* N 22 (30.05-05.06. 2002): 1. Print.
- Finn, Thomas P. "Incorporating the "Comédie-musicale" in the College French Classromm." *The French Review* 77.2 (Dec. 2003): 302-309. *American Association of Teachers of French*. Web. 20 Mar. 2009. <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3132777>>
- Freeman, Alan. "A complete crock, Monsieur" Notre Dame barely survives Channel crossing as acid-penned London critics all but burn the cathedral down." *The Globe and Mail* (Canada) 25 May 2000: R1. Print.
- Hagerty, Bill. "Notre-Dame de Paris." *News of the world*. Theatre Record Review. 20.11 (June 27, 2000): 665. Print.
- Hugo, Victor. *Notre-Dame De Paris, 1482*. 134 Vol. Paris: Garnier-Flammarion, 1967. Print.
- Kallmann, Helmut, et al. "Musical Theatre." *The Canadian Encyclopedia: The Encyclopedia of Music in Canada*. 2002 ed. *The Canadian Encyclopedia online*. Web. 20 Mar. 2009. <<http://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.com/>>
- Kaptainis, Arthur. "Latest *Starmania* puts the "opera in rock opera." *The Gazette*, Culture, Saturday, 7 Mar. 2009: E2. Print.
- Karpova, Natalia. "Belle." *French Musicals*. 29 Aug. 2004. Web. 20 Mar. 2009. <<http://frenchmusicals.ru/modules/news/article.php?storyid=85&page=32>>
- Kennedy, Dennis, and Oxford University Press. "Musical." *The Oxford Encyclopedia of Theatre and Performance*. E-reference ed. *Oxford Reference online*. 2003. Web. 20 Mar. 2009. <<http://0-www.oxfordreference.com.mercury.concordia.ca>>

- Khafizov, Oleg "From Kamchatka to Notre Dame." 02 Feb. 2006. *Molodoy kommunar* (Newspaper) Web. 20 Mar. 2009. <<http://apksp.narod.ru/kimstat101.html>>
- Knapp, Raymond. *The American Musical and the Formation of National Identity*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2005. Print.
- Korobova, Daria. "French Songs of the Slavs." *Nezavisimaja Gazeta* (Newspaper) N 99-100 24 May 2002: 8. Print.
- Laster, Arnaud. *Pleins Feux sur Victor Hugo*. Paris: Comédie-Française, 1981. Print.
- Lezard, Nick. "Comment – What is it with the French and suppositories?" *The Independent* (London) 26 May 2000: 4. Print.
- Macy, Robert. "French musical hit makes American debut on Vegas Strip." *Associated Press Newswires*. 21 Jan. 2000. Factiva database. Concordia University. Web. 20 Apr. 2009. <<http://O-global.factiva.com/mercury.concordia.ca/ha/default.aspx>>
- Martens, Britta. "The Victorian's View of France." *Literature Compass*. 3.3 (17 Mar. 2006): 562-571. Wiley Journals. Web. 15 July 2009.
<<http://0-www3.interscience.wiley.com/mercury.concordia.ca/>>
- Mates, Julian. *America's Musical Stage: Two Hundred Years of Musical Theatre*. 18 Vol. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985. Print.
- McLaren, Leah. "Not a fairy-tale success French-Canadian composer Luc Plamondon's career is like something out of a storybook..." *The Globe and Mail* (Canada) 2 Oct. 2002: R1. Print.
- Médioni, Gilles. "Interview Notre-Dame selon Luc." *L'Express* (France) 21 Jan. 1999. Web. 23 Feb. 2009.
<http://www.lexpress.fr/informations/notre-dame-selon-luc_632479.htm>

- Nuzov, Vladimir (Moscow–New Jersey). “Yuliy Kim: The time will come when Russia will become civilized.” *Vestnik: Russian-American Russian Language biweekly magazine*. Vestnik Information Agency. 23 (308) 13 Nov. 2002. Web. 20 March 2009. <<http://www.vestnik.com/issues/2002/1113/win/nuzov.htm>>
- Peyre, Henri, and Victor Hugo. *Hugo*. 1 éd. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1972. Print.
- “Pierre Cardin honorary member of Russian Academy of Arts.” *Agence France Presse* 27 Nov. 2008: n.pag. *Factiva Newspapers*. Web. 15 Dec. 2009. <<http://0-global.factiva.com/mercury.concordia.ca/>>
- Platt, Len. *Musical Comedy on the West End Stage, 1890-1939*. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004. Print.
- Rioux, Christian. “Plamondon s’attaque au père Hugo.” *Le DEVOIR* (Canada) 26 Sept. 1997: A1. Print.
- Robitaille, Louis-Bernard “Notre-Dame de Paris garde l’affiche pour une autre saison à Londres.” *La Presse* (Canada) 2 Sept. 2000 : D6. Print.
- Shimadina, Marina. “Parisian second hand Notre-Dame de Paris in Moscow.” *Kommersant* (Newspaper) N 86. 23 May 2002: 6. Print.
- Shuttleworth, Ian. “The Arts – There is just one word to describe this...MUSICAL – THEATRE.” *Financial Times* (London) 25 May 2000: 22. Print.
- Taylor, Richard. “Veselye Rebiata. The Happy Guys.” *The Cinema of Russia and the Former Soviet Union*. Ed. Beumers, Birgit. London: Wallflower Press, 2007. 79-87. Print.

- Rzhevsky, Nicholas. *The Modern Russian Theater: a Literary and Cultural History*. Armonk: M.E.Sharpe, 2008. *Google book Search*. Web. 20 May 2010.
- Scholl, Tim. *From Petipa to Balanchine: Classical Revival and the Modernization of Ballet*. London: Routledge, 1994. *Google book Search*. Web. 20 Sept. 2010.
- Shew, David. "Street fuelled hit; Notre-Dame de Paris single-handedly revived France's musical fortunes, helped largely by the government's clash with immigrants." *TODAY* (Singapore) 19 Oct. 2006. Web. 20 Apr. 2007.
<<http://www.channelnewsasia.com/stories/entertainment/view/236331/1/.html>>
- Thérien, Robert, Isabelle D'Amours, and Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture. "Plamondon, Luc." *Dictionnaire De La Musique Populaire Au Québec, 1955-1992*. Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture, 1992. Print.
- Thrower, James. *Marxist-Leninist "Scientific Atheism" and the Study of Religion and Atheism in the USSR*. Berlin, New York: Mouton, 1983. *Google book Search*. Web. 20 Sept. 2010.
- Tueva, Alla. "The Fashion Lawmaker." *Teatralnaja zhisnj*. (Review) N 5 (2005): 24-25. Print.
- "U.K. critics call Quebec musical a 'croque.'" *The Toronto Star* 25 May 2000: EN02. Print.
- Vaïs, Michel. «Les Entrées libres de Jeu. Le théâtre musical au Québec: quel avenir?». *Cahiers de Théâtre Jeu* 124 (2007): 110-119. Print.
- Volbach, Walther R. "Foreign Opera in English." *Educational Theatre Journal* 3.3 (Oct. 1953): 214. Print.

Vyle, Petr. "Premiere of the Musical *Notre-Dame de Paris* in Moscow." *Radio Svoboda*.
24 May 2002. Web. 15 Sept. 2009 <<http://apksp.narod.ru/kimstat81.html>>

Walsh, D. and Platt, L. *Musical Theater and American Culture*. Westport, Connecticut;
London: Praeger, 2003. Print.

Weatherford, Mike. "Notre Dame doomed by identity crisis." *The Las Vegas Review
Journal* 30 July 2000:1K. Factiva database. Concordia library. 21 Apr. 2009.
<<http://O-global.factiva.com/mercury.concordia.ca/>>

Weatherford, Mike. "Notre-Dame de Paris ending run." *The Las Vegas Review Journal*
26 July 2000: 5. Factiva database. Concordia library. 21 Apr. 2009.
<<http://O-global.factiva.com/mercury.concordia.ca/>>

Yampolskaya, Anna. "When you flip over your skirt..." *Mir Perevoda Review* 1.9
(2003): 45-56. Print.

E-mail:

Moskinov, Alexey. "Re: Notre-Dame." Message to the author. 20 Sept. 2010. E-mail.

Olekhova, Irina. "Notre-Dame" Message to the author via guestbook. 23 Sept. 2010.
<<http://www.olehova.com>>

Documentary:

East Side Story. Dir. Dana Ranga. Writers: Anrew Horn, Dana Ranga. Anda Film
(USA) 1997. Documentary.

Audio CD

Notre-Dame de Paris (English). Original Cast. Sony. English lyrics by Will Jennings.
Studio Artistic Palace, Boulogne, France. February 22, 2000.

DVD

Notre-Dame de Paris. Dir. Gilles Amado. Texte Luc Plamondon. Music Richard
Cocciantè. Enregistrement public au Palais des Congrès de Paris. Version
intégrale. Sony Music France, 1999. DVD.