



National Library  
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale  
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service    Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada  
K1A 0N4

## NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

## AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents

Case Study: Michel Foucault, Critical Modernism, and Writing  
on the Visual Arts in English Canada

Timothy D. Clark

A Thesis in  
the Department  
of  
Art History

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for the Degree of Master of Arts at  
Concordia University  
Montreal, Quebec, Canada

1991

Timothy D. Clark, 1991



National Library  
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale  
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service    Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada  
K1A 0N4

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN: 0-315-68761-4

Canada

## Abstract

Case Study: Michel Foucault, Critical Modernism, and Writing on the Visual Arts in English Canada.

During the late 1960's, and early 1970's translations of the work of a number of important 20th century French and German intellectual figures began to appear on the english speaking market. One of the most prominent of these figures was the French critical historian Michel Foucault. His work was to play, by the late 1970's and 1980's, both marginal and central roles within the production of a number of writers who began to write on the visual arts in English Canada.

A prominent sociological feature of this group of writers was the sense of frustration and exclusion that a high proportion of them felt, in regards to their respective interests, within a number of university art history departments in Canada. Given the fact that these departments did not offer the type of critical and analytical methodologies that this group wished to study, most of these writers were forced to look to the outside of their departments in an ad hoc search for alternatives. At least one of these alternatives was provided by the critical histories of Michel Foucault, whose production, in conjunction with the work of other French and German writers, would have a profound effect on writing on the visual arts by the 1980's.

This occurred because each writer could develop argumentative frameworks whereby they could autonomize their interests from the exclusionary art historical discourses that they had encountered in university. Furthermore, this group of writers produced writings on art history and criticism that merged aspects of descriptive modernism with

revised critical modernism.

Running virtually parrallel with the appearance of this group was the massive expansion and development of the institutional context that supported writing on the arts in Canada. This expansion, which was largely the product of post-war federal and provincial policies on arts funding, would also provide alternative institutional contexts that could support each writer's efforts to autonomize their respective interests.

### Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my advisor, Professor Johanne Lamoureux, for her careful assistance and Nathalie Henry for her great patience with my typing demands. There is also the time that Reesa Greenberg and Elizabeth Seaton gave as the readers of the thesis, something that I must thank them for. Finally, without Angela's support things would have been much tougher for me during the time that it took to write this thing.

Table of Contents

Introduction

Section One

Chapter 1 Michel Foucault, Critical Modernism,  
and Archaeology . . . . . 14

1.1 Michel Foucault's Framing of his  
Historical Context. . . . . 15-20

1.2 Critical Modernism and the "Battle of  
the Moderns and Ancients" . . . . . 21-29

1.3 The Transformation of the Rhetorical Genre  
of "ekphrasis". . . . . 30-35

1.4 Immanuel Kant's Critical Revision of History. . . . 36-42

1.5 The Critique of the Power of Judgement and the  
Emergence of "aestheticism" . . . . . 43-51

1.6 Friedrich Nietzsche and Critical Interventionism. . 52-55

1.7 The Archaeological-Genealogical Methodology and  
the Critique from Autonomy. . . . . 56-67

Section Two

Chapter 2 The Critique from Autonomy and Writing on the  
Visual Arts in English Canada . . . . . 68

2.1 The Battel of the Books . . . . . 69-73

2.2 "The Order of Words, The Order of Things:  
Deconstruction in Contemporary Art" by Walter  
Klepac, C Magazine, (Fall 1984), pp. 42-57. . . . . 74-82

2.3 Introduction and Dissemination: Foucault's  
Work and the Educational Context. . . . . 83-98

2.4 Writing, the Institutional Setting, and the  
Problematics of "Ekphrasis" . . . . . 99-107

2.5 Artworks, Foucault, and some Standard Patterns  
of Argumentative Activity . . . . . 108-131

Tables of Contents - cont'.

Conclusion: "the limits to human agency" . . . . . 132-136  
Endnotes . . . . . 137-147  
Bibliography: Michel Foucault and Critical Modernism . . . . 147-153  
Bibliography: Canadian Writing on the Visual Arts. . . . . 154-155



## Introduction

OUR AGE is the real age of criticism, to which everything must submit. Religion on account of its holiness, and law-giving on account of its majesty, try to escape this criticism. But they immediately awaken just suspicion, and cannot claim the unfeigned respect which reason accords only to that which is able to withstand its free and public examination.

Johann Georg Hamann, A Review of Kant's Critique of Pure Reason. [July 1, 1781.]

This thesis is the product of what was originally three quite separate interests: 1), the work of the French critical historian Michel Foucault; 2), the nature and history of modernism; and 3), the writing of art criticism in Canada. These interests started to come together to form the main research objectives of this thesis when I first came across Foucault's work used in some articles written in the early 1980's. While the objectives of my initial research was to establish the extent, and importance of Foucault's variant of critical modernism for the writing of art criticism in Canada, I eventually shifted away from these questions to the present goals. The objective of this thesis then is to examine the introduction, dissemination, and various functions of the work of Michel Foucault in writing on the visual arts in English Canada.

Part of the reason for the shift in objective was the realization that there was a lack of any sustained research on writing in general on the visual arts, and in lieu of my specific research interests, on two of the most significant sets of theoretical work produced this century that have had such a direct bearing on writing in Canada during the late 1970's and 1980's. I am speaking here of the corpus of work that emerged during the post-war period in France under the various, and often confusing titles of structuralism, phenomenology, critical feminism, marxism, and post-structuralism, and, earlier in Germany, of hermeneutic phenomenology and those writings that were produced partly as a consequence of the foundation, in 1923, of the Frankfurt School of Sociology.

I mention these two events because while my thesis, given it's

concentration on Foucault's work, cannot be concerned in any detail with them, it is, I would argue, not possible to exclude this work completely from my research. It is not without some interest to the historian that the most visible intellectual figures representative of history of the post-war period, as well as the numerous spin-off productions which followed their work, should all appear in the critical references of all 30 authors that I found to have had, at one time or another, deployed some aspect of Foucault's work. One has only to look at section three, and number one of sections five and six of the appendix to my thesis to realize the extent of this repetition.

Given the concentration of the thesis on the generic concept of "writing" on the visual arts, I commenced with the methodological assumption that this concept denoted a socially constituted practice. As such, my research was focused upon certain components that I believe form sets of necessary, though clearly not sufficient, minimum conditions for one to understand how writing develops and functions in given social contexts. Minimum because, at the level of the production of each of the author/writers on my list, these writings form a corpus that concern work(s) of art, theoretical and critical issues, and cultural problems that are not solely, or autonomously a function of the productive activity of each author. While this is trivially self-evident, it does underscore one salient point about these writings - their essentially public nature - given that this group of 30 authors is dependent upon an institutional network that produces and distributes, through publications or exhibitions, writings and works of art that are the product of the activities of other differing groups individuals. In

this situation, both groups would then function within a wider social and political context that would most directly be mediated through the various institutional venues in which they functioned. Consequently, institutions such as universities, museums, and periodicals would be dependent upon and the focus of various forms of economic, political, and discursive factors that have determining consequences for their productive activity. Furthermore, for anyone to carry out a practice like writing on the visual arts, they will themselves, as individuals who work within these given institutional settings, then be subject to similar consequences in as much as they are instantiated within the particular social roles and writing practices that are representative of these various settings. As examples of both a discursive, and institutional practice, these writings will then at the level of the narrative and argumentative structure, and the various ranges of discursive concepts deployed, reflect, to a certain degree, the reading patterns, educational backgrounds, and institutional locations in which each author will find themselves.

Within the framework of this explanatory model, the initial goal of this thesis was to determine the total number of authors who have used some aspect of Foucault's production; by which I mean that any use, however slight or marginal, was of interest to me since I was also concerned to establish if there were any invariant patterns to this usage. Once that search was completed, and from which I had generated a list of 30 authors, I then proceeded to put together a comprehensive listing of all their published work. From this I was able then, based upon the earliest dates that each writer went public, to outline an

initial, general historical time frame for the appearance of Foucault's work within a Canadian context. In section one, No. one of the appendix there is a list of these 30 authors with the dates of their first publication. In my letter to all 30 authors I asked each for permission to interview them and for a copy of their most recent curriculum vitae, of which 15 replied positively to my request. The asterisks beside each name on the list in the appendix denote these authors. It is this group of 15 authors that will form the core group for discussion in the thesis.

As to the actual scope of the types of writings to be examined, this thesis will not be concerned exclusively with art criticism. I mention this point because part of my research deals with critical modernism, as such there is the potential for the reader to identify the term "critical" solely with the practice of art criticism. The methodological and argumentative practice of a critique, as it functions in Foucault's work cannot, in principle, be restricted to just art criticism. The primary historical antecedent for Foucault's version of the critique resides in the publication in 1781, of Immanuel Kant's Critique of Pure Reason. As Foucault treats this concept it denotes a critical examination of the a priori "internal conditions for the possibility of experience"<sup>1</sup> of specific, contemporaneous historical situations, with the view to the collapsing of the supposedly autonomous truth claims that underwrite given institutional and discursive practices. Therefore, I made the heuristic assumption that for someone who has developed a concern for Foucault's work, that concern, in principle, cannot be predicated on the presupposition that the concept

critique is exclusively reducible to the practice of the criticism of visual art. Consequently, from the perspective of someone interested in writing on the visual arts, it is methodologically irrelevant whether they are writing art history or art criticism, insofar as a critique wishes to comprehend either the background conditions of the types of specific subject matter that each discipline examines, or, the apriori historical constraints of the disciplines themselves. I would like to underscore that this assumption was only a heuristic one because it is clearly possible that a number of writers could, in fact, identify "critical" analysis exclusively with art "criticism".

For my research I would then expect to find specific uses of Foucault's work in art history, art criticism, museology, archaeology, art therapy, and art education, which, in principle, meant that in determining the actual scope of the primary source material to be examined, I would have to look at an extensive range of serials, catalogues, and monographs that were published in Canada as of the 1970's. There were though certain prior restrictions placed on the scope of the material to be researched because I wished to concentrate on a certain range of visual arts, and disciplines, that reflected my specific research interests, and, secondly, to control what was potentially a huge mass of publications. I excluded the disciplines archaeology, art education, art therapy, museology, and, publications that dealt exclusively with the visual arts of film, video, and architecture. Though, if articles did appear within the scope of publications which I examined that covered these particular visual arts I did deal with them. The same also applies to all literature that only

occasionally published work on the visual arts, or, if not occasionally, those, in which this material would only form a very small percentage of the various types of articles published. In section four of the appendix there is, beside the name of specific serial publications, an asterisk which denotes the publications which I examined. In addition, I also analyzed all catalogues produced in Canada during the same time period.

There is another important factor that also controlled the scope of the primary source material that I examined. When I initially carried out my preliminary research to establish whether there was enough work of consequence that would warrant a thesis on the function of Foucault's production in Canadian writing I commenced by looking at primary source material produced in both French and English. In section one, No. one of the appendix there is a list of all those francophone writers that my initial research established who have used some aspect of Foucault's production.

One consequence of this research is that it can be clearly established that a small proportion of writers have published work in French and English. From the first group of 30 English writers only Philip Fry, James Patten, and Lesley Johnstone have actually worked, to a degree, within specific French social contexts, and published some material written first in French. On the other hand, a much higher percentage of French writers have written, and worked within specific English contexts, insofar as out of ten writers, Michele Theriault, Johanne Lamoureux, Theirry de Duve<sup>2</sup>, and Serge Berard have published some work in English. While these small numbers of crossover points are

of interest they also underscore a clear contextual differential between the two social groups. Moreover, these specific historical contexts point to differences that would have to be taken into account when researching material for the thesis. One of the first differences is that there is some evidence that Foucault's work was already in use within the francophone community earlier than it appeared in the work of anglophone writers. The only exception to this situation would be the work of Philip Fry, who is himself an exception within the anglophone community given his extensive studies during the middle 1960's in France, and his early working contact with francophone institutional contexts in Canada.<sup>3</sup> At least one reason for this differential in the initial reception of Foucault's work was the reliance of anglophone writers, like myself, on translations of his work. It was, in part, because of my initial suspicion concerning this dependency that it was decided to concentrate on the English community.

Another reason for this decision related to the type of research methodology I had adopted to establish the total number of writers who have used Foucault's work. It was pointed out to me by Johanne Lamoureux that francophone writers intentionally avoided the citation of authors for methodological and political reasons. As such, it would be more difficult to establish the actual scope of the presence of Foucault's work in the writings of francophones.

There were also certain other types of limitations that were a function of factors that I could not control since, in a number of cases, I examined publications like "Group K", which could be described as being representative of a certain type of artist produced



publication. It is logically possible that the persons, or person who produced them could have read and been affected by aspects of Foucault's work to the point of introducing either specific material, or, to the development of an overall approach that was a consequence of that reading. So while I did examine them, given the nature of these works it was virtually impossible to discern from the textual material alone whether this is the case. These types of published material largely, if not completely, jettison the usual narrative and argumentative practices of publications like Parachute or Arts Manitoba.

Clearly, given the publishing history of 103 serials, and the catalogue production of 410 institutions that I did examine, it was simply not feasible to actually read everything. To solve this problem I established a two part methodology whereby I could control my research: 1), I carried out a citation analysis of whatever footnotes appeared with each text; 2), I rapidly inspected each text to see if someone quoted from Foucault's work, mentioned his name, or used specific technical terms or phrases that were common to his work. Consequently, my list of 30 writers cannot be considered a fully comprehensive survey of all the potential writers, within the scope of the literature that I did examine, who may have used some aspect of Foucault's work. While I accept this limitation on my research I would argue that my thesis does provide a reasonable case study of what was occurring in particular types of writing in Canada from the mid 1970's on.

There is one important qualification here in regard to my initial time frame for the actual appearance of Foucault's work, and certain

other authors cited as critical references in the production of the 30 authors on my list. With the exception of Philip Fry and Walter Klepac, the actual time-frame for all the remaining authors is quite compact as it commences with 1977 and ends in 1990. As previously stated, the commencement date for my research was the beginning of the 1970's. Given the assumption that anglophone writers would have relied upon translations, the primary reason for selecting this timeframe was that the first translations of the most commonly cited French, and German authors first began to appear on the market at this time. [see section nine of the appendix.]

As for the structure of the thesis, it will be divided into two broad, complimentary sections. The first section, chapter one, will outline the historical development of certain specific historical features of philosophical and aesthetic modernity: 1), critical modernism as an overall, generic historical development; 2), the appearance, in relation to the emergence of modernist art history, of what will be referred to in this thesis as descriptive modernism; and 3), Foucault's historical relation to critical modernism.

Specifically, this chapter will begin by focusing upon Foucault's relation to four generic philosophical discourses that emerged with 17th century European modernism. This discussion is essential because critical modernism cannot be understood without examining the early moderns development of what Hegel would later name the critique of "self-limitation"<sup>4</sup> - the philosophical heart of what I refer to as the critique from autonomy. These four discourses are the concept of finite cognitive experience, the "priority of the first person"<sup>5</sup> argument,

philosophical skepticism, and the temporal [historical]-psychological form of critical analysis.

The other 17th century development to be examined, in relation to the critique of "self-limitation", is the transformation of the humanistic rhetorical genre of pictorial description, or "ekphrasis".<sup>6</sup> This is necessary in as much as it is essential for the understanding of aspects of early modernist art historical practices. Lastly, Immanuel Kant's revision of early critical modernism and the consequent emergence of the discourse of "aestheticism"<sup>7</sup> will be discussed. These will be dealt with because they are of primary importance for the explanation of Foucault's historical relation to Kant's critical project.

The second section, chapter two and the conclusion, will be primarily concerned with two generic developments that occurred during the 1970's, and 80's in writing on the visual arts in English Canada, that were in part a function of the introduction of Foucault's work. In order to address this objective the introduction and dissemination of Foucault's will be discussed initially. This is followed by an analysis of selected aspects of the university and publication contexts in which the 15 writers to be discussed in this chapter studied, and produced work for. Completing this series of discussions, aspects of the argumentative patterns of four of the 15 writers will be examined insofar as they pertain to standard usages of Foucault's work.

The objective of this series is the demonstration of the primary argument of this thesis that Foucault's variant of critical modernism performed at least two generic functions in regards to the work of the group of 15 writers. On the one hand, Foucault's production helped to

provide, along with translated work of other intellectual figures, argumentative frameworks whereby a percentage of the 15 writers could autonomize their respective interests from the exclusionary discourses that each had encountered in university. Once this process was set in motion it would facilitate each writers ability to enter the larger art world context of writing of the visual arts. On the other hand, this entire group merged aspects of Foucault's production with the work of other French and German writers to produce writings on the visual arts that possessed certain characteristics of revised critical modernism. Furthermore, these writings also merged with specific discursive and institutional features of descriptive modernism.

It will also, I hope, be concluded that this thesis has tentatively established certain other historical developments that facilitated both the introduction of Foucault's production, and the ability of the group of 15 writers to produce work on the visual arts. Given though the scope and objectives of the thesis, these developments cannot be more fully discussed.

Amongst these is the importance of Parachute and Vanguard magazines as the dominant serial publishers of the work of each of the writers. There is the role of federal-provincial public policy in regards to the rapid expansion of institutional venues for writing during the late 1960's, and 1970's. There is feminism, which plays a prominent role in the work of a number of writers. We also have a number of contacts that some anglophones had, within a few institutional settings, with the francophone community. Finally, a small group of the 15 writers expressed the view that there was a relationship between

their interest in the new critical material coming out in translation, and their interest in post-minimalist work.

In conclusion there are, in addition, other historical factors that the thesis points to that contribute to a more complete understanding of the historical context into which Foucault's production entered which will not be dealt with at all. Perhaps the most prominent are the nature and history of the development of art history departments, and the presence within their curriculums of Greenbergian critical modernism and the methodological practice of connoisseurship. The other context is the history of periodicals, the history of art criticism, and the nature of the relationship between the two.

## Section One

### Chapter One: Michel Foucault, Critical Modernism, and Archaeology

"We must try to trace the genealogy, not so much of the notion of modernity, as of modernity as a question. In any case, even if I take Kant's text as the point of emergence of this question, it is evident that this text itself forms part of a broader historical process that must be taken into account. It would no doubt be one of the interesting axes for a study of the eighteenth century in general, and of the 'Aufklärung' in particular, to consider the following fact: the 'Aufklärung' calls itself 'Aufklärung'. It is certainly a very singular cultural process that became aware of itself by naming itself, by situating itself in relation to its past and future, and by designating the operations that it must carry out within its own present.

After all, is not the 'Aufklärung' the first period that names itself and which instead of simply characterizing itself, according to an old habit, as a period of decline or prosperity, of splendor or misery, names itself through a certain event that belongs to a general history of thought, of reason, and of knowledge and within which it has itself played a part?

The 'Aufklärung' is a period, a period that formulates its own motto, its own precepts, and which says what it has to do, both in relation to the general history of thought and in relation to its present and to the forms of knowledge, ignorance, and illusion in which it is able to recognize its historical situation."

Michel Foucault, The Art of Telling the Truth.  
[1984]

### 1.1 Michel Foucault's Framing of his Historical Context.

Michel Foucault produced, for my purposes, two interesting texts: one, an introduction to the 1978 English translation of Georges Canguilhem's doctoral dissertation, "On the Normal and the Pathological"; the other, an interview conducted by Gerard Raulet, published in a 1983 edition of the journal Telos under the title "Structuralism and Post-Structuralism". The interview covers the topic of the post-war intellectual climate in France, with particular reference to the confusing see-saw adventures and conflicts between Phenomenology, Marxism, Freudianism, and, of course Structuralism and Semiology. The discussion of this topic is itself bracketed by further examination of formalism as a larger twentieth century phenomenon, and the use of the work of Friedrich Nietzsche to resolve theoretical problems that developed as the different post-war movements jostled each other. Foucault argued that from 1945 on Marxism, specifically the attempted synthesis of Husserl and Marx, by Sartre and Merleau-Ponty, had formed a boundary that presented itself as the only viable critical position philosophically. He goes on to mention one important historical event in particular that reflected a more widespread development that began to crack open these efforts: Merleau-Ponty's emerging concern with language and his own lectures on Saussure's work in linguistics.<sup>8</sup> Foucault's point was that  $\alpha$   $\times$  this issue of language, in particular structural semantics, arrived on the scene the Marxist-Phenomenological synthesis began to destabilize as a consequence of the ease with which structuralism was able to deal with the problem of meaning. This being the case, the phenomenological subject was directly threatened as an

explanatory entity that accounted for the production of meaning. This assault on the phenomenological subject ran parallel to another being developed out of Freudianism, and the various attempts made to link it up with Marxism and structuralism.

For a more specific understanding of Foucault's production there is his specification of his own membership in yet another movement within French intellectual practices that worked somewhat outside the confines of the prevailing trends, and, of the very early importance of Nietzsche's work for his own critical interests.

What I describe did undoubtedly take place and it involved a certain number of individuals; but there were also people who did not follow the movement. I am thinking of those who were interested in the history of science - an important tradition in France, probably since the time of Comte. Particularly around Canguilhem, an extremely influential figure in the French University - the young French University. Many of his students were neither Marxists nor Freudians, nor structuralists. And here I am speaking of myself.

G.R. You were one of those people, then?

FOUCAULT My first book was written towards the end of my student days. It was *Madness and Civilization*, written between '55 and '60. This book is neither Freudian nor Marxist nor structuralist. Now, as it happened, I had read Nietzsche in '53 and, curious as it may seem, from a perspective of inquiry into the history of knowledge - the history of reason: how does one elaborate a history of rationality?<sup>9</sup>

For me, the problem was framed in terms not unlike those we mentioned earlier. Is the phenomenological, transhistorical subject able to provide an account of the historicity of reason? Here, reading Nietzsche was the point of rupture for me.<sup>10</sup>

In his introduction to Canguilhem's text he outlines quite a different history of French intellectual developments than most English readers would normally be familiar with insofar as Foucault argues that there is a fundamental differential, within this history, between a



"philosophy of the concept... and a philosophy of experience"<sup>11</sup> that has its generic origins in the work of the 19th century philosopher of science Maine de Brian, and the social utopianism of Auguste Comte. Against the background of this history, and of more contemporary relevance is the work of Canguilhem, Gaston Bachelard, and the emergence of the post-war revival of Nietzsche's critique of the transhistorical subject. As Foucault notes, he had been working from 1955 to 1960 on his 1961 text Folie et deraison: Histoire de la folie a l'age classique, when he first made contact with Nietzsche's work. His statement though that it was his "first book" is interesting given that his first published works were his Maladie mentale et personnalite and his "Introduction" to Ludwig Binswager's Le reve et l'existence, both of which appeared in 1954. The curiousness of Foucault's statement may reside in the fact that he was, as he makes it clear in the preface to "Folie et deraison", working "under the sum of Nietzsche's great search".<sup>12</sup> His statement then regarding this work may reflect the historical importance of this text in relation to his later production. In the case of two 1954 works, these were largely produced from within a framework of phenomenological psychology that was in part derived from Binswager's own reading of Martin Heidegger's philosophy. Keith Hoeller argues in his introductory comments to the English translation of Foucault's and Binswager's 1954 texts, that by the time of the 2nd 1962 edition of Maladie mentale et personnalite, Foucault had rewritten parts of it in such a manner that it would reflect a shift from a phenomenological approach to one in which the problem of "madness" was now placed in a historical framework.<sup>13</sup> While Hoeller does not note the

reason for this shift, it is fairly clear from Foucault's remarks that sometime in 1953 Nietzsche was one point of "rupture" in his work that drove it towards history. The other important consideration with regards to Nietzsche was Heidegger's role in this "rupture", for Foucault had been reading Heidegger as early as 1951. In a much later 1984 interview Foucault spoke of the absolutely essential importance of his work; one consequence being that Foucault's early reading of Nietzsche took on a much greater degree of importance because of Heidegger.

In his interview of Foucault, Raulet asks for an elaboration on the precise relationship between "historians of science... a history of knowledge, a history of rationality and a history of reason". In answering, Foucault will provide that final point of reference that ties together the history of the "philosophy of the concept" that is represented by Canguilhem and Gaston Bachelard to Nietzsche and the problem of the subject.

FOUCAULT It is not very easy in an interview. I would say that the history of science has played an important role in philosophy in France. I would say that perhaps if modern philosophy (that of the 19th and 20th centuries) derives in great part from the Kantian question, "Was ist Aufklärung?" or, in other words, if we admit that one of the main functions of modern philosophy has been an inquiry into the historical point at which reason could appear in its "adult" form, "unchaperoned," then the function of 19th century philosophy consisted in asking, "What is this moment when reason accedes to autonomy? What is the meaning of a history of reason and what value can be ascribed to the ascendancy of reason in the modern world, through these three great forms: scientific thought, technical apparatus and political organization?"... To continue then... to pursue the Kantian question, "Was ist Aufklärung?" This reprise, this reiteration of the Kantian question in France assumed a precise and perhaps, moreover, an inadequate form: "What is the history of science?... Now in Germany this question "What is the history of reason, of rational forms

in Europe?" did not appear so much in the history of science but in the current of thought which runs from Max Weber to Critical Theory.<sup>14</sup>

There is nothing particularly unusual concerning Foucault's extensive genealogical interest in Kant's work, given that in a review of Ernst Cassirer's The Philosophy of the Enlightenment he stated that all modern thought is, to a degree, neo-kantian. It was Kant who, for Foucault, established some of the discursive conditions for the appearance of the philosophy of science of de Briand, Bachelard, and Canguilhem, and, in Germany, the Hegelian-Marxist dialectical positions, Weber's sociology, and the later Critical Theory of the Frankfurt School. Each critically facing off against a reason that has masked its dogmatic authority with its presupposition of autonomy. As Foucault stated, his goal was

to examine a reason, the autonomy of whose structures carries with it a history of dogmatism and despotism - a reason, consequently, which can have an effect of emancipation on condition that it manages to liberate itself from itself.<sup>15</sup>

The question which I won't succeed in answering here but have been asking myself from the beginning is roughly the following: "What is history, given there is continually being produced within it a separation of true and false?" By that I mean four things. Firstly, in what sense is the production and transformation of the true/false division characteristic and decisive for our historicity? Secondly, in what specific ways has this relation operated in "Western" societies which produce scientific knowledge whose forms are perpetually changing and whose values are posited as universal? Thirdly, what historical knowledge is possible of a history which itself produces the true/false distinction on which such knowledge depends? Fourthly, isn't the most general of political problems the problem of truth? How can one analyze the connection between ways of distinguishing true and false and ways of governing oneself and others? The search for a new foundation for each of these practices, in itself and relative to the other, the will to discover a different way of governing oneself through a different way of dividing up true and false - this

is what I would call "political spiritualite."<sup>16</sup>

Foucault was much closer intellectually to Canguilhem's project of the history of concepts, but it was Bachelard, Canguilhem's predecessor at the Institut des Sciences et des Techniques in Paris<sup>17</sup>, who would provide an early critical linkage between reason and history. For Bachelard had argued, in his 1933 publication l'histoire des sciences dans l'enseignement, that conceptual discursivity, and philosophy, were so interlocked that one can never give birth to the other, for "Rationalism is a philosophy that continues; it is never truly a philosophy that begins".<sup>18</sup>

## 1.2 Critical Modernism and the "Battle of the Moderns and Ancients".

The English philosopher Mary Tiles in her recent English language study of Bachelard's work, comments that when he first proposed a "non-Cartesian epistemology" he was not arguing for the rejection of Descartes' epistemology. Bachelard wished only to revise Descartes' program, through a critical review of it, in order to preserve Descartes' methodological linkage of discursiveness to epistemology. Tiles argues that Descartes founded two distinct epistemological traditions. On the one hand there is Descartes' methodology; a systematic sequence of steps that the epistemological subject must adhere to in order to achieve the goal of true and certain knowledge. Consequently, knowledge is achieved discursively through the reflective interaction between the subject and the method. The second epistemological tradition originates as Descartes' requirement that one of the necessary preconditions for the acquisition of knowledge was an "intuitive, as opposed to discursive, quasi perceptual cognition".<sup>19</sup>

As the founder of modern rationalism, Descartes proposed his formula of "cogito, ergo sum" in order to establish the epistemological foundations of knowledge in so far as there was for him an a priori identity between thinking, and the subject - this being the heart of the argument from "the priority of the first-person". This is the case because the subject can have intuitive knowledge of specific aspects of their cognitive experience insofar as "first-person" experiences rule out the possibility of further skeptical doubt. This use of skeptical arguments, or, as Richard Jones noted concerning Francis Bacon's own critical program, "the insistence upon the necessity of suspended

judgment, or a critical attitude"<sup>20</sup> formed part of the core of Descartes' program. Therefore, while the discursive procedure is one pre-condition, this cannot be enough, in that he proposed that there must be an additional act of skeptical reflection - "an awareness of the order"<sup>21</sup> - as we progress through the steps of the methodology. There has to be more than the mere process of the mechanical series of deductive steps, as this discursive process must be grounded when the subject skeptically reflects upon the operations of it's own activity of reasoning until it achieves a final intuitive grasping of the "clear and distinct ideas" that form the certain axioms from which we derive further conclusions. As John Locke noted, self-reflection "is that notice which the mind takes of it's own operations".<sup>22</sup> It is precisely here that Descartes' epochal contribution to modernism as a philosophical, social, political, and aesthetic movement is of such importance: the certainty of achieving true knowledge had to begin with the "first-person" experiences in so far as the logic of the methodology must be supplemented by an epistemological analysis since, as finite, humans can only have knowledge of their experiences. The requirement of this critical recognition is necessary because it is precisely in the act of critical/skeptical reflection that the prior subject may properly attempt to establish the clear and certain foundations of knowledge.

In this respect Cartesian epistemology is distanced from empirical psychology; Descartes does not start with the newborn child, but with himself as an adult already familiar with the world, already equipped with beliefs and opinions, but seeking knowledge. Reflective awareness, introspection, memory, may reveal how he has come by his beliefs and opinions, but only a critical reflection can reveal that the reasons which can be given for his having the beliefs and opinions he finds himself with are inadequate for grounding any claim to knowledge. It is only in his critical,

doubting reflection that he discovers what he does not know but would like to and can ask what would suffice for knowledge in such cases. It is in this frame of mind that he can ask what sort of evidence would be needed to acquire the sort of knowledge he wants, can ask what would constitute adequate evidence.<sup>23</sup>

It was this "'critical' spirit of philosophy" or -the "'priority of epistemology'" - which Hegel would name "self-limitation", and those who worked around Immanuel Kant would mean in part by the term "reflection".<sup>24</sup> By the 18th century the Enlightenment project that Descartes assisted in founding was subject to a series of philosophical crises that threatened its foundations. Kant, as a Modern, had inherited from that first great historical conflict of modernity, the "Battle of the Moderns and Ancients", the belief in the progressive enlightenment of humanity through the collective development of the natural reason of each individual. This conflict was largely fought against the background of arguments over the interlocked issues of the typological theory of the decay of nature, and the possibility of the revival of learning. The moderns premising their arguments for the revival of learning on a mix of typological arguments, comparative historical analysis, and philosophical arguments. With their eschatological sense of the coming Reformation, a term derived from the Latin verb "reformare" - meaning "the undoing of previous change" and "directedness towards the past" - this typological vision of a rectilinear and finite narrative sequence of events pointing eschatologically to the future, would, in the hands of the early moderns, become an extremely important ideological tool in the construction of 17th century modernist notions of autonomy.

The Moderns, who largely emerged out the literate urban classes,

championed, against Humanistic cultural practices and the scientific ideology of Aristotelianism, "the new learning" of the experimental sciences, and "the new philosophy" of Descartes and Francis Bacon. The supposed intellectual superiority of the Ancients was justified on the typological grounds that as a consequence of the fall of man, both humanity and nature have been in a perpetual state of "decay". The English cleric, Godfrey Goodman, who precipitated the "Battle" in England with the publication in 1616 of his work, The Fall of Man..., put forward precisely this argument.

For all Arts whatsoever, the best authors are the most ancient, even unto this day: I could instance in every one in particular, though wee building vpon their foundations, haue added some ornaments, yet such as are not necessarie to perfit the Art: and generally for the Ancients, whatsoever you shal obserue in practise amongst them, you shall finde that it stood with great wisdom and prouidence, if you please to haue relation to the times and occasions. And wherein they seeme to be defectiue, you may ascribe it to the happinesse of their times; for their plentie was such, as that they were not inforced to trie all conclusions in husbandrie, whereas our wants seeme to require our best inuentions.

Now since the fruitfulness, or barrenness of the earth, proceedes from the influence and disposition of the heuens; in the last place I dare accuse the materiall heuens, as being guiltie, conspiring, and together ioyntly tending to corruption; Scripture shall warrant me, the heuens shall waxe old as doth a garment, Psalme 102, vers. 26. Reason and all humane learning shall backe me, for certaine it is, that the Sunne hath descended much lower by many degrees, then he was in the time of King Ptolemie; the same Mathematicall instruments, which agree together in all other dimensions doe vndoubtedly proue the diuersitie; by vertue of perspectiue glasses, we haue lately discerned spots and shadowes in the Moone, and within our memorie, in the yeere 1572, a true Comet did appeare in the eighth Heauen, which as it had a time of beginning, so had it a period, and time of dissoluing. And thus being mortall of our selues, wee dwell in houses of clay, the rooffe of this world, as well as the foundations shall together be mooued; for wherefore serues the diuersitie of seasons, the day and the night succeeding each other, Summer and Winter, the



rising and setting of Starres, the different and contrarie motions, the various aspects and oppositions? but that in some sort they partake of our nature, and shall haue their part and portion with ours.<sup>25</sup>

This publication was followed 11 years later by the Moderns first response, George Hakewill's An Apologie on Declaration of the Power and Providence of God... which was issued in 1627.

But if wee conceive them [the ancients] to be Gyants, and ourselves Dwarfes, if we imagine all Sciences already to have received their utmost perfection, so as wee need not but translate and comment upon that which they have done... surely there is little hope that we should ever come neere them, much lesse match them.

Among other rare inventions, that of the Marriners Compage is most worthy of admiration. By meanes of it, was 'Navigation' perfected, the lives and goods of many thousand have bin, and daily are preserved... It points out the way to the skilful Marriner when all other helpes faile him, and that more certainly though it be without reason, sense, the Commodities of all Countries discover'd.<sup>26</sup>

Early moderns were to take over from the Humanists' their Aristotelian based theory of the scientific perfectibility of the arts. The major difference here between 17th century Moderns and their earlier counterparts, the Humanists, lay precisely in the revision of the concepts of science and "perfection" insofar as the Moderns began to displace these largely antique concepts with the newly emerging experimental methodologies and a secularized providential history. As Matei Calinescu points out in his seminal study of modernity, it was because of the Humanists efforts during the Italian Renaissance that we owe to them the initial historical comparison of the range of accomplishments of the Moderns and Ancients. Second only in importance to Francis Bacon's and Descartes' work, Hakewill's text is largely a catalogue of the scientific achievements and voyages of discovery of the

late middle ages and early modern period. It was because this work that the concept of scientific progress was yoked to the Humanists deictic, and comparative concept of "Modern". Of equal importance, later moderns would take his catalogue of achievements and marry it to that most radical version of providential [typological] history, millenarian eschatology. This development provided the necessary ideological support for the belief that Christian history was in a time of reversal for, as Francis Bacon would declare, "The Great Instuaration" [restoration, new beginning, or re-"edification of knowledge"] was in the very near future.

It is with Francis Bacon that we also find inaugurating a major revision, with his "temporal-psychological contrast"<sup>27</sup>, of the comparison of the "Gyants" and "Dwarfes"; a medieval simile that articulated a comparative, progressive or developmental relationship between the relative merits of past authority and those of us who reside in the present. Prior to the moderns of the 17th century the comparison was largely negative in so far as the moderns were viewed as being the "Dwarfes" and the ancients the "Gyants". With Bacon's comparative paradox of *Antiquitas saeculi, juvenus mundi* this comparison is clearly reversed, since the moderns were now in a superior position because they are the true ancients insofar as their accumulated knowledge base is considerably more developed than the Ancients, whose own development of true knowledge is "young and 'modern'".<sup>28</sup>

Like Descartes, Bacon locates modernity epistemologically in the psychological, perceptual consciousness of each individual. Grounded in his new methodology of a "natural and experimental history" of our

cognitive experience of nature, each person forms a skeptical, inductively experimental, and eschatological relationship to the external world, and traditional authority, in order to test its truth or falsity and, if need be, reject the past.

The Idols and false notions which are now in possession of the human understanding, and have taken deep root therein, not only so beset men's minds that truth can hardly find entrance, but even after entrance obtained, they will again in the very instauration of the sciences meet and trouble us, unless men being forewarned of the danger fortify themselves as far as may be against their assaults.

the entrance into the kingdom of man, founded on the sciences, being not much other than the entrance into the kingdom of heaven, whereinto none may enter except as a little child.<sup>29</sup>

As is well known, in both France and England the arguments from scientific progress, and the new epistemologies of Bacon and Descartes, were employed in aesthetic criticism to provide critical support for the Moderns' arguments concerning the question of the canonical superiority of ancient models. John Dryden, who translated Charles de Fresnoy's De Arte Graphica for English readers was, like his French counterpart Charles Perrault in his Parallele des Anciens et des Modernes, to apply the "new philosophy in aesthetic criticism.

[John Dryden] I hope I shall not be thought arrogant when I enquire into their errors [i.e., the errors of the ancients]. For we live in an age so sceptical, that as it determines little, so it takes nothing from antiquity on trust; and I profess to have no other ambition in this Essay, than that poetry may not go backward, when all other arts and sciences are advancing.

It is not evident, in these last hundred years (when the study of philosophy has been the business of all Virtuosi in Christendom), that almost a new Nature has been revealed to us? - that more errors of the school have been detected, more useful experiments in philosophy have been made, more noble secrets in optics, medicine, anatomy, astronomy, discovered, than in all those dotting ages from

Aristotle to us? - so true it is, that nothing spreads more fast than science, when rightly and generally cultivated.<sup>30</sup>

[Charles Perrault] So when I have made clear that Homer and Virgil made countless mistakes which the moderns no longer make, I think I have proved that the ancients did not have all our rules, since the natural effect of rules is to prevent one from making mistakes. So that if today heaven were disposed to bring forth a man who had a genius of the magnitude of Virgil's, it is certain that he would write a more beautiful poem than the Aeneid because he would have, in accordance with my supposition, as much genius as Virgil and at the same time a larger amount of precepts to guide him.<sup>31</sup>

Modernity, as a consequence, emerges during this period with one of its most canonical historical components: the Modern's new elaboration of the concept of autonomy, which may be broken down into two major interlocking discursive components that form a temporal [historical]-psychological structure. On the one hand we have either the empiricists', or rationalists', epistemological model of the individual consciousness establishing those necessary rational criteria upon which they could formulate a true, rational model of society, and establish their own individual autonomy - that is, the "priority of the first-person". On the other hand we find a temporal, or chronological component, where, in constructing self-identity out of contemporaneous experience, each individual must also be aware of the chronological contrast of both continuity and discontinuity with the past. In order for the Modern subject to excise from the present those "false idols" of the past, this individual must be aware comparatively of the past, versus the present, so that they may establish what are those changes within the present that differentiates it from the past. This process of self-elaboration taking, as Jurgen Habermas argues, its canonical historical form in the conflict over aesthetics during the Battle.

The problem of grounding modernity out of itself first comes to consciousness in the realm of aesthetic criticism. This becomes clear when one traces the history of the concept "modern." The process of detachment from the models of ancient art was set going in the early seventeenth century by the famous querelle des anciens et des modernes.<sup>15</sup> The party of the moderns rebelled against the self-understanding of French classicism by assimilating the aesthetic concept of perfection to that of progress as it was suggested by modern natural science. The "moderns," using historical-critical arguments, called into question the meaning of imitating the ancient models; in opposition to the norms of an apparently timeless and absolute beauty, they elaborated the criteria of a relative or time-conditioned beauty and thus articulated the self-understanding of the French Enlightenment as an epochal new beginning. Although the substantive modernitas, along with the pair of adjectival opposites, antiqui/moderni, had already been used since late antiquity in a chronological sense, in the European languages of the modern age the adjective "modern" only came to be used in a substantive form in the middle of the nineteenth century, once again at first in the realm of the fine arts. This explains why Moderne and Modernität, modernité and modernity have until our own day a core aesthetic meaning fashioned by the self-understanding of avant-garde art.<sup>32</sup>

### 1.3 The Transformation of the Rhetorical Genre of "ekphrasis".

The functioning of the temporal [historical]-psychological structure can be seen in the contrasting differences between the work of Franciscus Junius the Younger and George Turnbull. In 1638, Franciscus Junius the Younger published in Amsterdam his De pictura veterum, it appearing later in England under the title The Painting of the Ancients. Junius, the greatest humanist scholar of his time, and, librarian and curator to Thomas Howard, the second Earl of Arundel, produced his historico-philological work to outline a classical theory not only of the painting of antiquity, but of all painting and its related arts. Devoid of precisely the sort of "experimental" observations that Francis Bacon had called for, Junius' work relied upon a mode of reason and explanation that valued rhetorical practices, the canonical reading of the past, and an inherited concept of "theoria" that stressed a disinterested reasoning process. As Lawrence Lipking notes in his 1971 study of the appearance of modern art history in England

The structure is philosophical. No records and measurements, no chronology, no evaluations of existent pictures are allowed to intrude upon perfection. Instead, Junius compiles references made to the arts by the most unexceptionable texts of Greek and Latin literature, texts whose classical authority needs no corroboration and brooks no dissent.

The search for an ideal of painting is timeless. And The Painting of the Ancients is not a historical work.<sup>33</sup>

However critical Lipking is of Junius, his attitude changes when he examines George Turnbull's 1740 work, Treatise on Ancient Painting, noting that with this text we enter a different world from that of Junius'. Although Turnbull was a relatively minor figure of the Scottish Enlightenment, he was precisely that sort of representative of

modernity that Bacon had argued for. Working from the argument from "the priority of the first-person", Turnbull's goal, as Lipking points out, was to "edify" not learned humanists or aspiring painters versed in the learned arts, but "receptive audiences" for "paintings" that functioned "as if they were primers of morality". There is nothing particularly different about this goal of edification from a humanist perspective, what was different though was the methodology used, and the "audience" to whom Turnbull had directed his work. His method was to teach them via "the operations and appearance of things", and his audience was the newly emerging urban middle class "public" who possessed "a common language... common sense... and a common virtue". As Lipking is quick to show, what Turnbull did that Junius failed to do, was the placing before the eyes of the reader "50 engraving of classical paintings"<sup>34</sup> in order that this reader may "look away from perplexing words and mysteries" and turn "towards the human nature that everyone can recognize".

By 1740 critics and historians of art did not choose to follow Junius into his microcosmic spiritual world. Turnbull presents himself as a practical man who will be content only with the evidence of his senses. He had taken immense pains to reproduce ancient paintings in good style: the great collection of Richard Mead furnished archeological treasures, Camillo Paderni was commissioned to execute the drawings and J. Mynde the engravings, and the sizes of the originals and the places where they were found were described in long notes. 'Some may suspect, that Men of fine Imaginations have carry'd these Arts further in Speculation than they have ever been actually brought to, or than they can really be advanced... And in truth it is hardly possible to set their Power, Extent, and Merit in a better light, than by shewing what they have actually produced.' [George Turnbull]<sup>35</sup>

For Lipking Turnbull's work, no matter how faulty it is, still represents a great improvement insofar as Lipking argues, "mortal

painters need real objects to imitate, and connoisseurs real paintings to look at": "De pictura veterum" is a "timeless" work, a non-historical production because it provides "no records, measurements, no chronology", nor "evaluation of existent pictures". Of course, the kind of Modernist art history that Lipking calls for, and sees emerging out of works like Turnbull, was not the exclusive preserve of individuals like Turnbull given that it was the Humanists who first laid the groundwork for its appearance. As I have already mentioned, what differentiates early moderns' practices from the Humanists' work was, in Turnbull's case, his method and audience: a social group possessing a "common sense". The English and Scottish Empiricists' concept of a "common sense" was another explanatory term used in the "first person" argument insofar as it referred to the intrinsic, sensory and cognitive capacities of the epistemological subject. Furthermore, while Modernists like Descartes and Bacon formulated differing arguments concerning the nature of this "subject", both worked from a common critical dislike for the rhetorical and scholastic practices of Humanist culture, and late Medieval society.

Those who have the strongest powers of reasoning and most skilfully manage their thoughts in order to make them clear and intelligible, always most readily gain assent for what they advance, even if they speak only the language of Lower Brittany and have never learned rhetoric. [Rene Descartes]<sup>36</sup>

The images of men's wits and knowledges remain in books, exempted from the wrong of time and capable of perpetual renovation. Neither are they fitly to be called images, because they generate still, and cast their seeds in the minds of others, provoking and causing infinite actions and opinions in succeeding ages.

The mental operation which follows the act of sense I for the most part reject; and instead of it I open and lay out a new and certain path for the mind to proceed in,



starting directly from simple sensuous perception."  
[Francis Bacon]<sup>37</sup>

Turnbull was merely putting into practice what Bacon had called for, given that rhetorical "images" cannot be "fitly... called images". "Things" pictured, or "things" experienced in "simple sensuous perception", would always take epistemological precedence over words, which, if true, were mere conventional, referential names for the "things" seen. When Bacon speaks of "images" he is critiquing both the Renaissance psychology, and specific rhetorical practices. This psychology construed "images" as the products of "fantasia", a concept derived from antique sources, and, which by the 17th century, had come to refer to the faculty of artistic invention. In its generic Greek usage their term "phantasia" initially meant a "reflection of a thing", while by the appearance of Aristotle's work it referred to either the "calculative or sensitive imagination". It is only later with Hellenistic, and Roman rhetoricians like Quintilian, that "phantasia" was considered the prized product of "euphantasiotos", or the power "to imagine that we are travelling abroad, crossing the sea, fighting... and seems to ourselves not to be dreaming but acting".<sup>38</sup> As an all important rhetorical and literary skill it was directly related to the Greek, sophistic genre of "ekphrasis", or, in its latin translation, "descriptio". One of its essential components was the use of selected examples of paintings or sculpture as material for evoking descriptive "images". This genre of rhetoric though did not reflect, from a modernist perspective, any intrinsic interest in paintings, insofar as they were merely amongst the various devices developed by classical literary and rhetorical culture. With the revival of this culture by

the early Italian Humanist's this division between visual, and literary culture, continued as they adapted antique literary and rhetorical practices in their attempts to develop the first critical theories of painting and sculpture. As Michael Baxandall points out concerning the descriptions of the 14th century Humanist, Guarino of Verona, his "references to painting" reflected "not so much a visual experience of" works, but rather "as a literary experience of late Greek sophistic literature".<sup>39</sup>

Prioritizing rhetorical and literary practices has to be seen against the wider discursive context of the Classical and Renaissance veneration of language, or, more particularly, "logos", the Greek concept for "discourse" and "logic". For instance, in the case of Marsilio Ficino, "poetry is above painting... because only words could convey specific ideas born of the soul".<sup>40</sup> The veneration of language was itself inextricably bound up with a Medieval and Renaissance cosmological, and cognitive context that considered the universe as forming an interrelated hierarchy of qualitatively differentiated levels of meaningfulness that represented sets of ideas. A "prose of the world", as Foucault refers to it, that formed the framework in which works like Junius' still functioned.

Modernity was to shatter this cosmology with its atomistic view of a causal, and contingent universe subject to the possibility of empirical observation. The metaphysical priority given to the epistemological subject, and the methodological distinction between language, and "things" experienced comprised the major critical hammers used to break the back of the Humanist's veneration of antiquity and

language. Description, in this sense, was used to separate incorrect text from the true "thing" in order to make a chronological distinction between the past and the present. Consequently, in Turnbull's "History", which has some of its generic origins in Bacon's call for a "natural history", paintings are no longer rhetorical adjuncts that are discursively constituted in this "prose of the world", but rather discrete "things" subject to direct, inductive sensory experience. Hence the attraction of Turnbull's work for Modernists like Lipking, given his anachronistic endorsement of Turnbull's work, and his own appeal for "historical work". This "work", with its demand for empirical experience, the use of engraving as indexical references for "real paintings", and, the request for rudimentary quantitative procedures like chronological dating and "measurements" are all generic to the transformation, during the emergence of modernity, of rhetorical practices like "ekphrasis". The linkage of description, to history, was essential for Empiricists like John Locke, who had stressed that the arguments developed in his An Essay Concerning Humane Understanding represented an "Historical, plain method".<sup>41</sup> As Voltaire remarked concerning the importance of Locke's work in his lettres philosophiques

So many men of reason having made a romance of the soul, a sage has come who has modestly turned it into history [i.e., description]. Locke has revealed human reason in man, as an accomplished anatomist explains the springs of the human body.<sup>42</sup>

#### 1.4 Immanuel Kant's Critical Revision of History

However critical Kant was of the Empiricists, it is not to the rationalists that he first turns in the opening pages of his epochal Critique of Pure Reason, where his earlier, tentative proposal for a "new discipline" titled "general phenomenology"<sup>43</sup> would finally appear.

We are silent about ourselves. But in the matter we are about to undertake we wish to be taken not as a display of opinions but an honest effort to establish principles not of a sect or an ideology but of man's welfare and dignity... Ultimately, our 'instauratio' should awaken the gentle hope that it bespeaks not the endless and the superhuman but the appropriate end and the fitting limit of endless deception.<sup>44</sup>

This quotation, by Kant, from Bacon's "Instauratio Magna Scientiarum" marked his attempt to both continue Bacon's call for an instauration of the present, and resolve the problematics of the philosophical project that was initiated by Bacon and Descartes. Whatever the problematics of Kant's own solutions were, his revolutionary proposal concerning the ideality of time set the stage whereby "Historical" experience was to become both the phenomenological domain of human experience, and the area where freedom revealed itself in our practical affairs.

By his time the crisis that was to threaten the philosophical support of modernism came from a number of different sources of which one of the most important was Jean-Jacques Rousseau's critique of the Modernists belief in a rationalized, progressive development of humanity. In particular Rousseau contended that the dominant atomistic, and mechanistic program of science, which was extended to provide a systematic causal explanation of all phenomena in nature, including

humanity, could not account for the actual nature of human experience.

You will ask me again how I know there are spontaneous motions, I shall tell you that I know it because I sense it. I want (veux) to move my arm, and I move it without this movement having another immediate cause than my will. It would be in vain for someone to try to use reason to destroy this sentiment in me; it is stronger than all evidence; one might just as well try to prove to me that I do not exist.

All free action has two causes which combine to produce it: one is moral, namely the will which determines the act, the other is physical, namely the power which executes it. When I walk toward an object, it is first necessary that I want to get there, secondly that my feet carry me there.

To will is a purely spiritual act which the Laws of Mechanics explain nothing.<sup>45</sup>

This problem of the contradictory relationship between natural human freedom and causality [nature] will be recast by Kant, in his "Critique of Pure Reason", as the Third Antinomy of Pure Reason. In a letter to Christian Garve, a reviewer for The Gottinger Learned Messenger, Kant reformulates the dilemma that had held his attention since the time of his dissertation when he first attempted to come to grips with the consequences of Leibniz's principle of sufficient reason.

Not the investigation of the existence of God, of immortality, etc. but the antinomy of pure reason was the point from which I began: "The world has a beginning--: it has no beginning, etc., to the fourth [!?] There is freedom in human being,--against: there is no freedom and everything is natural necessity"; it was this that first woke me from my dogmatic slumber and drove me to the critique of reason itself to dissolve the scandal of the contradiction of reason with itself.<sup>46</sup>

To achieve a resolution he produced two broad, interlocking responses: 1) his methodological distinction between transcendental realism and idealism; 2) and the further distinction between homo phaenomenon [the phenomenological or historical subject], and homo noumenon [the "transcendental subject of the thought = x"]. The

methodological distinction represented the core of Kant's critique of previous moderns failure to understand the actual nature of finite cognitive experience. In his Critique of Pure Reason he argued that the failure occurs because they did not recognize that the [transcendental] "ideas" of [pure] reason were regulative in nature. As such, "ideas" do not transcendently refer to real entities. Any attempt to ignore this can only lead to a futile desire to breach the finite, or inherent limitations of cognitive experience.

Henry Allison, in his important recent study of Kant, Kant's Transcendental Idealism, has argued persuasively that the central core of the Critique of Pure Reason was the "great pitched battle between transcendental realism and transcendental idealism"<sup>47</sup> waged against the background of the Third Antinomy of Pure Reason. Kant, in formulating his metaphysical distinction, was particularly defensive concerning the critical confusion and attacks that were generated by the first publication of the critique. In particular, the confusion that revolved around Kant's use of the concept of idealism, and his non-traditional, innovative use of the medieval term transcendental. Kant's Prolegomena to any Future Metaphysics contains a number of defenses directed against the ascription of the charge by Christian Garve, that he was actually propounding a "higher idealism". Responding, Kant reformulated his use of the term idealism, proposing instead the terms "formal", or "critical", to distance himself especially from Descartes' "skeptical idealism", and the "visionary" or "empirical idealism" of Bishop Berkely.

48. By no means "higher". High towers and metaphysically great men resembling them, round both of

which there is commonly much wind, are not for me. My place is the fruitful bathos of experience; and the word "transcendental", the meaning of which is so often indicated by me but not once grasped by me reviewer (so carelessly has he regarded everything), does not signify something passing beyond all experience but something that indeed precedes it a priori, but that is intended simply to make cognition of experience possible.<sup>48</sup>

In one sense Kant's problems can be attributed to the very innovativeness, historically, of his proposals. Henry Allison argues, that previous to Kant, all theories of knowledge were "noncritical", or "theocentric" in nature: theocentric because in principle, it was assumed, prior to Kant, that reason had direct access to an external, absolute, non-temporal condition of cognition not limited by finite sets of given intellectual, or historical constraints. In contrast "critical" idealism considers the necessary conditional limitations required for the possibility of knowledge, not the real contents of the activity of cognition. The theocentric model was most obvious within the Rationalist's position, but could, as Allison notes, be found within the arguments of Empiricists like John Locke. Descartes, in attempting to argue for the foundational truth of his simple axiomatic ideas, had to resolve the problem of the actual correspondence of these "ideas" to the reality to which they presumably referred, in so far as the epistemological subject is limited in access to only their own thought process. Both Descartes and Locke proposed that God would not have been so malicious as to disallow humans the possibility of achieving knowledge. Consequently, [if] we were in the position of God, who is outside the constraints of time and history, then we would be in a position to verify the correspondence.

Interestingly enough, and in keeping with Allison's observations,

the American philosopher, Hilary Putman, argues that Kant was the first philosopher to propose, against all previous metaphysical, realist philosophical positions, the first non-correspondence, "internalist" theory of truth.<sup>49</sup> Roughly, the correspondence theory asserts that for any proposition to be true, there must be a referential relation or, as Locke would formulate it, a "similitude" between the proposition, and a given factual event, or sets of events, that is referred to by the proposition. To the Empiricist terms like "painting" are the product of the interrelation between subjective, secondary qualitative experiences and the primary, real quantitative properties of the physical object. Kant though, in lieu of Bishop Berkeley's critique of Locke's distinction between primary and secondary properties, had understood that this explanatory model assumes from the start a built in concept of similarity because anything at all, before we establish our criteria of predicative identity, is, as Putman points out, "similar to everything else in (infinitely) many respects".<sup>50</sup> Consequently talk of the minds passive, sense-data reception of givens like quantitative properties is absurd, since our criteria of similarity, (identity) and dissimilarity, [difference] is a function of an a priori interpretative conceptual framework. Gaston Bachelard, in his Essai sur la connaissance approchee, makes exactly the same observation concerning assumptions like "givens", and the doctrine of Realism.

The datum or given is relative to the culture, it is necessarily implied in a construction... A given has to be received. It will never be possible to dissociate completely the order of the given and the method of its description... Between these two terms - which represent for me the minimum opposition of the mind and the real - there are constant reactions which arouse reciprocal echoes.



Realism [is]... any doctrine that maintains the organization of impressions on the level of the impressions themselves, that places the general after the particular, as a simplification of the particular, that consequently believes in the prolix richness of the individual sensation and in the systematic impoverishment of abstractive thought.<sup>51</sup>

This issue of identity, that is circumscribed by the concepts "the same" and "similarity", is of particular importance to Foucault, as is his ruling out any solution to the problem founded upon the correspondence theory. While Foucault does not employ the specific term "correspondence", the issue of whether there is some form of relational correspondence between reality and discourse is discussed. In his The Archaeology of Knowledge Foucault makes it quite clear that "discourse is not a slender surface of contact... between a reality and a language", and, again, "any statement... is not confronted by a correlate"<sup>52</sup>. Rather, terms like "painting" are constituted by "practices"; by the "conditions which make them acceptable at a given moment... to an a priori not of truths... but the a priori of a history that is given..."<sup>53</sup> Consequently, the maintenance of the identity between sets of "statements", or their "positivity" as Foucault calls it, is determined by given "historical a priori".

The positivity of a discourse - like that of Natural History, political economy, or clinical medicine - characterizes its unity throughout time, and well beyond individual oeuvres, books, and texts. This unity certainly does not enable us to say of Linnaeus or Buffon, Quesnay or Turgot, Broussais or Bichat, who told the truth, who reasoned with rigour, who most conformed to his own postulates; nor does it enable us to say which of these oeuvres was closest to a primary, or ultimate, destination, which would formulate most radically the general project of a science. But what it does reveal is the extent to which Buffon and Linnaeus (or Turgot and Quesnay, Broussais and Bichat) were talking about "the same thing" by placing themselves at "the same level" or at "the same distance", by

deploying "the same conceptual field", by opposing one another on "the same field of battle"; and it reveals, on the other hand, why one cannot say that Darwin is talking about the same thing as Diderot, that Laennec continues the work of Van Swieten, or that Jevons answers the Physiocrats. It defines a limited space of communication.<sup>54</sup>

Kant, like Descartes accepted the constraints of self-consciousness and the act of critical evaluation, but devastated the argument from "the priority of the first person" that both John Locke and Descartes had accepted. As a direct consequence of Kant's critique, metaphysics will supercede epistemology since without the presence of an a priori metaphysics, individual epistemological experience would be incomprehensible. Foucault was of course fully aware of the emergence, with Kant's work, of this "enigmatic, metaphysical discourse".

Confronting Ideology, the Kantian critique, on the other hand, marks the threshold of our modernity; it questions representation, not in accordance with the endless movement that proceeds from the simple element to all its possible combinations, but on the basis of its rightful limits. Thus it sanctions for the first time that event in European culture which coincides with the end of the eighteenth century: the withdrawal of knowledge and thought outside the space of representation. That space is brought into question in its foundation, its origin, and its limits: and by this very fact, the unlimited field of representation, which Classical thought had established, which Ideology had attempted to scan in accordance with a step-by-step, discursive, scientific method, now appears as a metaphysics. But as a metaphysics that had never stepped outside itself, that had posited itself in an uninformed dogmatism, and that had never brought out into the light the question of its right. In this sense, Criticism brings out the metaphysical dimension that eighteenth-century philosophy had attempted to reduce solely by means of the analysis of representation.<sup>55</sup>

1.5 "The Critique of the Power of Judgment" and the Emergence of "aestheticism".

The final consequence of Kant's critical program is his elaboration of the fundamental question of modernity itself: if we are to construe that we are free, then where does it manifest itself? To which Kant responded - history and art. Lucien Goldman once argued that Kant's philosophy of history is historically the first proposal to take the early moderns eschatological millenarianism and propose that it represents a future [historical] possibility in which totality may be realized through our collective, free development. Kant's small set of essays on philosophy of history, were, along with his third, and last critique, The Critique of the Power of Judgment, attempts to resolve a fundamental lacuna within his program insofar as it was difficult, if not impossible to argue for a substantive relation between the transcendental idea of freedom, and our practical freedom.

In 1784 Kant published two essay essays in the periodical, Berlinische Monaschrift, one of the major institutional supporters of the German Enlightenment: one, under the title What is Enlightenment, the other with the title Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Interest. This latter essay proposed an historical explanation of the collective teleological development, by humanity, of a future "Kingdom of ends" where homo phaenomenon will be superceded by homo noumenon. This development was underwritten by the conceiving of nature as a purposive teleology in which humanity, as natural beings, achieve the teleological end of a "universal civic society". This historical process being regulated by the ideas of pure reason and

humanities instinct of "unsocial sociability". As a consequence, and in response to the question of how we may know, or achieve what only represents a future possibility, Kant responds that these questions can only be resolved through an act of creation.

## 2. HOW CAN WE KNOW IT?

As a divinatory historical narrative of things imminent in future time, consequently as a possible representation of a priori of events which are supposed to happen then. But how is a history a priori possible? Answer: if the diviner himself creates and contrives the events which he announces in advance.<sup>56</sup>

Kant's argument is that history, as an empirical practice, cannot develop an empirical, causal argument that would enable it to either explain, or predict future human moral and political achievements. To attempt to do so would reflect an uncritical desire to surmount, what critically we cannot transcend, the phenomenological limitations of consciousness. Therefore, history involves a component that cannot be empirically determined - the very freedom of the historian. Foucault, however critical he is of Kant, makes a similar point in his genealogical critique of Kant's anthropologism, The Order of Things. While this work is divided into three broad sections that outline three major regulative "epistemes", there is, I would argue, only one ethical division that describes that break in history when Kant's vision of modernity appears.

It is clear that the West has known only two ethical forms. The old one (in the form of stoicism or Epicureanism) was articulated upon the order of the world, and by discovering the law of that order it could deduce from it the principle of a code of wisdom or a conception of the city... The modern one, on the other hand, formulates no morality, since any imperative is lodged within thought and its movement towards the apprehension of the unthought; it is reflection, the act of consciousness, the elucidation of

what is silent... Modern thought has never in fact, been able to propose a morality. but the reason for this is not because it is pure speculation; on the contrary, modern thought, from its inception and in its very density, is a certain mode of action... it is no longer theoretical.<sup>57</sup>

Taking some years later a lead from his arguments found in his essay, Idea for a Universal History, Kant was to produce his final critique. Its objective was to present us with the argument that aesthetic and teleological assertions were members of a class of "reflective" judgments and, as such, were derivable from the transcendental ideas of pure reason. If we cannot experience phenomenally the transcendental ground of our practical freedom, then freedom may be construed as a subjective experience that manifests itself in the form of means/ends reasoning. The Critique of Judgments proposes that aesthetic experience, and the production of art, provides us with a regulatory, heuristic linkage between the external teleology of nature and the internal teleology of our actions through the purposive, ["intelligible"] causality inherent in judgments of taste. With his definition of Beauty as, "the form of the purposiveness of an object so far as this is perceived in it without any representation"<sup>58</sup>, Kant wished to expose us, if only formally, to the necessary general conditions for the generation of knowledge, and our mastery over nature through our subjective experience of disinterested aesthetic pleasure. An experience which, through the occurrence of the non-cognitive, "free play" of our cognitive powers, would provide all humans with a symbolic analogue to a purposiveness that lies, unrecognized, at the heart of our daily lives, and, in nature as a whole. For, at the moment of judgment, we are "unconstrained by nature's laws" and the objects of nature have

the subjective appearance of being "purposive for our faculties", in as much as it allows us to "view nature teleologically when we see it as if it were a work of art"<sup>59</sup>.

The immense historical importance of this vision of the didactic, social role which Kant assigned to aesthetics would prove propitious for Friedrich Schiller. Having little interest in Kant's theoretical problems, he produced, between 1794, and 1795, a series of letters that were later to become known as On the Aesthetic Education of Man in a Series of Letters. Schiller, with these letters, was to elevate Kant's remarks on aesthetic "free-play" to a central philosophical and political role through his definition of beauty as "freedom in appearance"<sup>60</sup>: a definition that attempted to present a more concrete moment of unity than Kant's formal and disjunctive formulation.

... only that is play which makes man complete and develops simultaneously his twofold nature... man is serious only with the agreeable, with the good, and with the perfect, but he plays with beauty... Reason also utters the decision that man shall only play with beauty. For, to speak out once for all, man only plays when in the full meaning of the word he is a man, and he is only completely a man when he plays<sup>61</sup>

But we are perhaps not arguing in a circle? Is theoretical culture to bring about practical culture, and yet the practical is to be the condition of the theoretical? All improvement in the political sphere is to proceed from the ennobling of the character - but how, under the influence of a barbarous constitution, can the character become ennobled? We should need, for this end, to seek out some instrument which the State does not afford us, and with it open up well-springs which will keep pure and clear throughout every political corruption.

I have now reached the point to which all the foregoing considerations have been directed. This instrument is the Fine Arts, and these well-springs are opened up in their immortal examples.<sup>62</sup>

Schiller's vision of aesthetic "play" adheres closely to Kant's

position given that it is one of "Schein"; of illusion and appearance. Consequently it does not represent any substantive revelation of truth since it is merely a regulative interlude that prepares us for the political experience of freedom and duty in the modern state. It was though this proposal concerning the ability of aesthetic experience to provide us with, during our daily lives, a sense of unity, that would lead later German Romantic idealists to collapse the distinction between appearance and reality. Those Romantics who gathered around the Schlegel brothers journal Inthenean, Hegel in his Earliest Systematic Program of German Idealism, and, of course, Friedrich Schelling's System of Transcendental Idealism, all pushed aesthetic experience from its regulative role into a truly substantive one. As Friedrich Schlegel would declare

All the holy games on art are but distant imitations of the infinite game of the world, the eternally self-forming work of art.

One's poetry is limited, just because it is one's own. Art aims for the last Messiah and so every artist is a mediator for all others<sup>63</sup>.

This rapid ascendancy of aesthetics may be attributed to it's providing an alternative to the exclusively rational solution to the antinomy of freedom and causality. If the first critique argued against both an empiricist and rationalist assumption of achieving a non-critical, unmediated form of autonomous cognitive experience, then this form of autonomy is illusionary. Attempts such as these to transcend the inherent limitations of consciousness will, Kant argues, be drawn into ever widening circles of a priori representative conceptual frameworks, none having achieved their original goal because

consciousness is, itself, a mode of discursive representation- something that Nietzsche also would later observe, and concur with.

We cease to think when we refuse to do so under the constraints of language... Rational thought is interpretative according to a scheme that we cannot throw off.<sup>64</sup>

'One would have to know what being is, in order to decide... what certainty is, what knowledge is, and the like'... 'since we do not know this, a critique of the faculty of knowledge is senseless: how should a tool be able to criticize itself when it can use only itself for the critique?'<sup>65</sup>

Consequently, could it not be critically asked of Kant, and of the whole modernist enterprise, that this goal of a (rational) determination of our nature and our freedom becomes, in the face of Kant's own program, potentially at least, impossible to realize in its present form? Hegel, in his critique of Kant's solution to the third Antinomy, had realized quite early that, given his absolute separation between the real and ideal realms, humanity in principle could not have substantive knowledge of the real ground of experience. The consequence of this would be the collapse of metaphysics, and, if this occurred, the resolution of the antinomy of freedom and causality would be impossible. It is certainly not without some sense of accuracy that the poet Heinrich Heine would note that Kant's critical program was an "anti-dogmatic terrorism"<sup>66</sup> of an even greater severity than that of Robespierre's.

Later Moderns in response to Kant's proposed solutions to this problem, will appeal to an explanatory concept of productive autonomy whereby the subject "x" becomes instantiated within various Marxist, Hegelian, and Romantic versions of the subject, in relation to an



object: history, nature, language, and reason. Therefore, Kant's "transcendental subject of the thoughts = x" was located in a functional interrelationship between "x" and explanatory entities like history, or language, that formed the non-circular elements in the arguments. Here, the explanatory force of productive freedom appears to be preserved insofar as the subject's freedom is either weakly, or strongly, an epiphenomenon of the autonomous, and supposedly non-circular ground of an explanatory entity like history, and/or language.

The groundwork for these later solutions was, in part, provided by Kant himself with his proposal that while our moral and political behavior is not causally determinable, perhaps, from a heuristic perspective, history may be construed as the teleological creation of human beings. If aesthetic experience and the production of art cannot be subsumed under a theoretical determination, but do still at least provide a symbolic link with the "subject... = x" and its' "idea" of freedom - the transcendental ground of our practical freedom - then could it not be concluded that it might provide another, more substantive solution to the third antinomy? Allan McGill has recently proposed that the Romantic Idealists produced a program whereby the distinction between "schein" and reality was overturned to be replaced with "aestheticism" which was set in motion by Kant's pivotal linkage of freedom and aesthetics.

As it is usually employed, the word aestheticism denotes an enclosure within a self-contained realm of aesthetic objects and sensations, and hence also denotes a separation from the "real world" of nonaesthetic objects. Here, however, I am using the word in a sense that is almost diametrically opposed to its usual sense. I am using it to refer not to the condition of being enclosed within the limited territory of the aesthetic, but rather to an attempt

to expand the aesthetic to embrace the whole of reality. To put it in another way, I am using it to refer to a tendency to see "art" or "language" or "discourse" or "text" as constituting the primary realm of human experience.<sup>67</sup>

Of equal importance to this emergence of aesthetics, and the process of "aestheticism", was the parallel transformation of traditional hermeneutics, the displacement of Kant's categorical grounding of the Faculty of Understanding, and what Manfred Frank, in his recent comparative study of the common historical roots of 20th-century French and German critical thought, has referred to as the "linguistic turn"<sup>68</sup> of Johann Gottfried Herder, Wilhelm von Humboldt, Friedrich Schlegel, and Friedrich Schleiermacher. In particular Herder, who was a student of Kant and one of his early Romantic critics, argued that language, not Kant's a priori categories of consciousness, is constitutive of human social actions. Consequently for Herder we know persons, not as Kant conceived of them as noumenal/phenomenal doublets, but rather as individuals who, in the context of their respective societies, are constituted by the language and culture of that society. Charles Taylor, in his study of Hegel, has argued that Herder, in keeping with the prevailing mood concerning the importance of autonomy and aesthetics, proposed the first "Expressivist" model of human action<sup>68</sup> which construes human actions as possessing the expressive unity of a work of art.

While Herder's critique of Kant is important, this "turn" is most forcibly expressed in the work of the Romantic theorist Friedrich Schleiermacher. Though Johann Martin Chladenius was the first to develop the concept of a perspectival interpretation and transform traditional biblical and legal hermeneutics, it is largely due to

Schlegel and Schleiermacher that hermeneutics takes on the characteristics of modern practice because of their attaching, to Kant's critical formulation of the conditional-structural nature of human understanding, of the important argument that our cognitive experience is grounded structurally in the linguistic competence of human beings. Thus hermeneutics becomes "concerned with illuminating the conditions for the possibility of understanding and its modes of interpretation".<sup>69</sup>

## 1.6 Friedrich Nietzsche and Critical Interventionism.

It is possible to argue that Friedrich Nietzsche is one of the most important historical beneficiaries of the "expressivist" revolution. While severely critical of the heavily sentimentalized and nationalistic Romanticism of the 1840's, he is, as Megill argues persuasively, directly linked to the first Romantics, and to Schiller's work. As Nietzsche declared in his The Birth of Tragedy.

it is only as an aesthetic phenomenon that existence and the world are eternally justified.

Only insofar as the genius in the act of artistic creation coalesces with the primordial artist of the world does he know anything of the eternal essence of art; for in this state he is, in a marvelous manner, like the weird image of the fairy tale which can turn its eyes at will and behold itself; he is at once subject and object, at once poet, actor, and spectator<sup>70</sup>.

Nietzsche's critical theory of perspectivism would complete the radicalization of Kant's program insofar as its goal was to undermine the objective grounds of theoretical knowledge, supposedly "timeless" concepts, and, provide a more "objective" awareness of our historically contingent identity so that we may make more informed choices concerning our freedom. For what we see and experience as the objective world is simply that world where both the discursive, and non-discursive interlock to form a particular, and "a very limited time-frame".

Henceforth, my dear philosophers, let us be on guard against the dangerous old conceptual fiction that posited a 'pure, will-less, painless, timeless knowing subject'; let us guard against the snares of such contradictory concepts as 'pure reason,' 'absolute spirituality,' 'knowledge in itself': these always demand that we should think of an eye that is completely unthinkable, an eye turned in no particular direction, in which the active and interpreting

forces, through which alone seeing becomes seeing something, are supposed to be lacking; these always demand of the eye an absurdity and a nonsense..<sup>4</sup>

Genealogical analysis asks the typically Kantian question concerning the "conditions and circumstances" in which moral "values"<sup>72</sup> developed, and methodologically it is a practice of a "good philology" that is counter-theoretical, anti-humanistic, and anti-psychological in its empiricist or 19th century positivist versions. Hence the historical material examined and used to build a psychological/historical critique was the "grey" of printed words - "For it is obvious which color is a hundred times more vital for the genealogist... Namely gray,... what is documented."<sup>73</sup> Its purpose is the critical descent into the past to recover that perspectival moment in history when those beliefs that we hold at present as true, and, objectively binding on all humanity, actually emerged to reveal their contingent, "species-specific" nature. This form of critique becomes, in Nietzsche's hands, the practice of what he refers to as "wirkliche historie", which may be translated as "real history" or "historical sense", but which is interestingly translated by Foucault as "effective history".<sup>74</sup> In a 1984 interview, that was published in Magazine Litteraire, Foucault was asked concerning Surveiller et punir, L'usage des plaisirs, and Le Souci de soi

F.E. Did you write these books for the liberation movement?

Foucault Not for, but in terms of, a contemporary situation.<sup>75</sup>

To understand fully what Nietzsche means when he argues that "historical philosophizing is henceforth necessary", is to confront what

Richard Schacht has recently described as an "interventionist" critical<sup>76</sup> practice that conceives of itself as social in scope. There is nothing necessarily new about Nietzsche's proposal given that with seventeenth modernism there was already in place a form of "interventionist" practice. This is the case in as much as the temporal-epistemological model of early modernity includes a conception of a social-historical scope of critical practice. Its fundamental formulation of an epistemological subject that places traditional authority under the double scrutiny of critical-skeptical doubt and a relative historical critique, initially establishes this form of philosophical critique as a social-historical practice.

It was Kant though who radicalizes modernist critical practices with his phenomenological limitation of knowledge, his argument that history is the domain of our practical freedom, and that society is the creation of autonomous subjects who historically develop their critical consciousness over time. In the 1784 essay What is Enlightenment, Kant generalizes an essentially philosophical argument concerning autonomy to all members of society. Making a contrast between the "private", and public, or "scholarly" use of reason, he argues that it is incumbent upon each member of society to assume the role of the "scholar" so that each could publicly exercise their critical reason whenever some aspect of society is in conflict with the intrinsic freedom of individuals. Once the conflict has been critically examined, the person who assumed the role of the "scholar" must again accept their role within society and exercise their "private reason". This occurs because each person will accept the constraints of society inasmuch as it is they who have

actually legislated the laws that govern society through the activity of critical reason.

1.7 The Archaeological-Genealogical Methodology and the Critique from Autonomy.

Genealogy only gradually takes on a more explicit methodological presence in Foucault's work, a process that was to culminate during the 1970's when he explicitly revived Nietzsche's "Genealogy of Morals". In so far as this is the case it can still be argued that a genealogical intent for archaeological analysis has always been implicit in his work from Folie et deraison on. By the publication in 1963 of his Naissance de la clinique: une archeologie du regard medical he speaks, in the preface, more explicitly of the importance of Nietzsche's genealogical critique. Like Deleuze, he sees Nietzsche as having radicalized Kant's critical program through his critique of scientific knowledge, and the grounding of this critique in the awareness of the constitutive role of language.

It may well be that we belong to an age of criticism whose lack of a primary philosophy reminds us at every moment of its reign and its fatality:... For Kant, the possibility and necessity of a critique were linked, through certain scientific contents, to the fact that there is such a thing as knowledge. In our time - and Nietzsche the philologist testifies to it - they are linked to the fact that language exists and that, in the innumerable words spoken by men - whether they are reasonable or senseless, demonstrative or poetic - a meaning has taken shape that hangs over us, leading us forward in our blindness... We are doomed historically to history, to the patient construction of discourses about discourses, and to the task of hearing what has already been said.<sup>77</sup>

It goes without saying the Nietzsche plays another important historical role inasmuch as Foucault's text The Order of Things represents both a genealogical critique of both the collapse of Kant's anthropologism, and a description of the appearance of the later post-Kantian interrelationship between "language" and "literature.



What relation is there between language and being, and is it really to being that language is always addressed - at least, language that speaks truly? What, then, is this language that says nothing, is never silent, and is called 'literature'?... "I know nothing about it. I would simply say this: in order to break with a certain number of myths, like the one of literature's expressive character, it has been very important to establish the great principle that literature is concerned only with itself. If it has anything to do with its author, it's according to a mode of death, silence."<sup>78</sup>

As part of the larger post-war debate over the political importance of the aesthetics of language, The Order of Things represented an historically typical attempt to join freedom to the dyad of language and literature. This larger post-war development presented itself as formulating a persuasive critique of a post-war modernism that yoked the concept of aesthetic autonomy to positivist, or existential understandings of the critical concepts of the book, the work, the meaning, the tradition, and, the author. As John Rajchman has recently pointed out concerning Foucault's aestheticism

The debate over *écriture* (writing) was thus a debate about the political culture of modernism. It was a debate about the vision of a nontechnocratic yet nonhumanistic culture that would celebrate our "decentered" relation to language...

Who was thus fighting for the privileges of a political culture by theorizing about writing? Surely Barthes and the whole *nouvelle critique*. Lacan (whose *Écrits* appeared in 1966) was a central figure; it was he who transformed psychoanalysis into the great theory of modernist culture. Derrida (whose *De la grammatologie* and *L'Écriture et la différence* appeared in 1967) was the philosopher... In addition there were Leiris, Blanchot, Bataille, and even Beckett and some of the *nouveaux romanciers*. And, of course, there was the now defunct journal *Tel Quel*. Julia Kristeva's *Revolution du langage poétique* may someday seem a great summation of the movement. The title captures its spirit - a revolution emerging from *avant-garde* writing.<sup>79</sup>

The difficulty of course is that Foucault's interest in language,

and his project, in particular The Order of Things, are constantly being confused with that other peculiar post-war phenomenon of linguistic structuralism and its historical partner, semiology. What does tie Foucault's efforts to this form of structuralism, apart from his modernist concern for language and critique of anthropologism, was the historical importance of the concept of discursiveness to the critical philosophy that Descartes founded and Kant reformulated. It is not an historical coincidence that Levi-Strauss characterized his own structural anthropology as "Kantianism without a transcendental subject".<sup>80</sup>

Foucault himself had, by the publication of his l'archeologie du savoir in 1969, begun to critique his own formalism and separate his work from the structuralism that was believed to be the critical core of his work. Foucault's attempts to disengage his earlier research efforts from its constant inclusion into certain versions of the structuralist project is partly a function of two issues. The first difficulty is that in early works like Naissance de la clinique Foucault was quite clear that "IT is a structural study that sets out to disentangle the conditions of its history from the density of discourse, as do others of my works."<sup>81</sup> The other problem relates to the difficulty of understanding the nature and actual scope of structuralist arguments. It is fairly clear that this practice has come to be largely aligned with the explanatory and ontological goals of linguistic structuralism: an identification that has usually led to the confusion of Foucault's "structural study" with structural semantics.

Foucault may be considered a structuralist if we do not confuse

his critical interests with this form of structuralism. This can occur if one ignores this narrowing of scope, and remembers that generically structuralism is a philosophical proposal concerning the nature of certain forms of rational explanation. Kant's arguments are a prime example of this type of structural explanation which was first initiated by the Pythagorean philosophers, inasmuch as he explicitly critiqued the inductive explanations proposed by the Empiricists. Inductive arguments commence from definably simple, and irreducibly discrete, atomistic units from which one then attempts to generate more complex unified units. The Pythagoreans, in contrast, founded a mode of analysis whereby one moves in precisely the opposite direction: a researcher works from the methodological assumption that one determines the constitutive form or structure. The goal of this analysis was the development of an interrelational and functional, not atomistic, explanation of the elements that comprised a given phenomenon under analysis. In Kant's case it can be argued that his work represents a critical-structural critique because he was the first to link generic structuralism to this concept of conditions, insofar as understanding [Verstand] reflected, for Kant, an underlying, a priori structural competence on the part of the subject. In Foucault's case, his "historical a priori" interlock to form a wide range of institutional, and discursive conditions. The other historical source that explains more narrowly Foucault's use of the term "structural" is the work of Georges Dumézil.

Je crois que je dois beaucoup à M. Dumézil... c'est lui qui m'a appris à analyser l'économie interne d'un discours tout autrement que par les méthodes de l'exégèse traditionnelle ou par celles du formalisme linguistique;

c'est lui qui m'a appris a reperer d'un discours a l'autre, par le jeu des comparaisons, le systeme des correlations fonctionnelles; c'est lui qui m'a appris comment decrire les transformations d'un discours et les rapports a l'institution.<sup>82</sup>

Whatever other difficulties that may attend to a more complete understanding and placement of his work within the history of critical modernism as Foucault practised it, there are certain consistent components to the enterprise of archaeological practice. In the May, 1968 issue of Esprit, Foucault published an excellent article under the title "Reponse a une Question"; a text that was later reprinted, under the English title "History, Discourse, and Discontinuity", in a 1972 edition of the journal Salmagundi.

But an archeology: that is to say, as its name indicates only too obviously, the description of the record. by this word, I do not mean the mass of texts which have been collected at a given period, or chanced to have survived oblivion from this period. I mean all the rules which at a given period and for a definite society defined:...

It is against this background that this analyses which I have begun are set; it is towards it that they are directed. I am writing, therefore, not a history of the mind, according to the succession of its forms or according to the thickness of its deposited meanings... Seek in the discourse not its laws of construction, as do the structural methods, but its conditions of existence.

There is no question of composing a global history- which would regroup all its elements around one principle or one unique form - , but rather of opening up the field of a general history in which one could describe the peculiarity of practices, the play of their relations, the form of their dependencies. And it is in the area of this general history that the historical analysis of discursive practices could be circumscribed as a discipline.<sup>83</sup>

While Foucault first used, very tentatively, the term "archaeology" in his Maladie mentale et personnalite, the actual source of the term is difficult to determine. As Gary Gutting points out in his recent study, Merleau-Ponty had used the term to describe the

practice of psychoanalysis, while Jean Cavailles used it to classify phenomenology.<sup>84</sup> Foucault was clearly familiar with both writers, and, it is possible, that Cavailles' usage influenced him, given that Foucault's concept of "savoir" is taken from Cavailles. Foucault himself has, only on one occasion, specified its actual genealogical source in Kant's proposal for a transcendental, not empirical history of philosophy.

the word 'archaeology'. That word ought to locate itself somewhere, thinks Mr. Steiner. Let's give it to Freud. Mr. Steiner does not know that Kant used this word in order to designate the history of that which renders necessary a certain form of thought... Certainly I would not presume that Mr. Steiner should read me. But he should leaf through Kant. I well know, however, that Kant is not as fashionable as Freud... Let him read "Fortschritte der Metaphysik"; he will find the word, the text and the meaning to which I refer;<sup>85</sup>

A "philosophical archaeology" that Kant had outlined in a section titled "On a Philosophizing History of Philosophy" located in the second Prussian academy edition,<sup>86</sup> of the posthumously published competition essay Welches sind die Wirklichen Fortschritte, die die Metaphysik seit Leibnizens und Wolfs Zeiten in Deutschland gemacht hat?

A philosophical history of philosophy is not itself historical, or empirical, but rational, i.e., a priori possible. For even if it, too, puts forth facts of reason, it does not borrow them from the narration of history, but derives them, as a philosophical archaeology, from the nature of human reason.<sup>87</sup>

In so far as reason is constrained for Kant by its own finitude, reason would have to confront its differential nature, because, as he argued, the noumenal and phenomenal domains form two isomorphic realms. This being the case it is incumbent upon reason to close this differential at some future, historical point in it's development or the

ground of knowledge will never be completely established. It comes of no surprise that Kant did in fact conclude his Critique of Pure Reason with his slight, tentative proposal, for a "philosophical historiography of philosophy" that would end "the system", in a section of the "Critique" titled "The History of Pure Reason". A project outlined in his later competition essay ... Fortschritte, die die Metaphysik..., that, as the Israeli philosopher Yirmiahu Yovel argues would "not... derive the historical states a priori, but... identify the developing pattern of reason (within) the diversity of empirical [historical] material,... the signs of what should have happened must be discovered in what did happen, without eliminating the latter, but without accepting it as (merely) contingent."<sup>88</sup> For Kant these merely contingent "elements" in the "historical material" are, in the end, screened out by the a priori categorical constraints of the faculty of understanding, whereas in Foucault's case these a priori constraints are now, themselves, merely the products of the contingences of history.

Paul Veyne, in his Comment on écrit l'histoire, argued concerning Foucault's revision of Kant's critical program, that he produces a nominalist critique formulated as an historical analysis which shows "that things are only objectifications of determined practices, the determinations of which need to be exposed, since consciousness has no conception of them..."<sup>89</sup>

The history of the objectification of those elements which historians consider as objectively given (if I dare put it thus: of the objectification of objectivities), this is the sort of circle I want to try and investigate... But if I am posing it as a problem within historical analysis, I'm not demanding that history answer it. I would just like to find out what effects the question produces within historical knowledge. Paul Veyne saw this very clearly (1):

it's a matter of the effect on historical knowledge of a nominalist critique formulated elsewhere by way of a historical analysis.<sup>90</sup>

If medieval nominalism is the doctrine that universals have no autonomous existence separate from the (consciousness that conceived) them because they are only names with nothing existent corresponding to them, then Foucault is not a nominalist in so far as from his perspective there is no consciousness that conceives anything. For the sake of argument take Veyne's phrase, "consciousness has no conception of them", and reinterpret the term "them" to denote the "nominalist names (formed) by consciousness", which produces "consciousness has no conception of (them) because there is no consciousness that forms names". Foucault is a nominalist though if "them" refers to whatever is taken to be real, such as "names", "propositions", "trees" or "rocks"; these concepts are understood as being real only because they are constituted by the practices offered to us by the a priori of a history that is given to "we". Furthermore, "we" are also as individualized as much as "rocks" since all these concepts cannot be interpreted as the "fictional" or "conventional" creations of consciousness. It is just this point that John Rajchman notes concerning Foucault's nominalism

In "Vocabulaire technique et critique de la philosophie", Henri Lant reports that already at the end of the nineteenth century a nominalisme scientifique held that science was not unified and that reality was whatever objective discourse refers to. This accords with Foucault's nominalist critique except that it is not simply a matter of "warranted assertability", since consciousness does not have a conception of what determines the reference to an object. Foucault's nominalism is in fact applied primarily to cases in which we ourselves are sorted into classes.<sup>91</sup>

The "archive", which regulates the rules of "savoir", functions unconsciously, but, as Foucault is at pains to demonstrate, his concept

of the unconscious is not modelled on Freudian psychologism, Marxist notions of false consciousness - unconscious real economic interests, or structuralist's concerns for "deep structures". On the contrary, archaeology is a practice that describes the "silent", or unconscious archival conceptual constraints that form "the a priori of a history that is given". This "autonomous domain that would be that of the unconscious... of knowledge [savior]"<sup>92</sup> that can only be exposed when it is "rediscovered... through the historian's retrospective interpretation", and a "nominalist critique" can only occur when it is "formulated" [else where] by [way] of an historical analysis". In his preface to The Birth of the Clinic he argued that it is only possible to analyse an archive when we are actually at a point in history when a given set of practices are subject to mutation. Foucault consequently uses the term "unconscious" only to retroactively describe, once a new archive emerges, the previous one that has been disengaged. Consequently there is no unconsciousness in so far as there are only different archives.

Yet it concerns one of those period that mark an ineradicable chronological threshold: the period in which illness, counter-nature, death, in short, the whole dark underside of disease came to light, at the same time illuminating and eliminating itself like night, in the deep, visible, solid, enclosed, but accessible space of the human body. What was fundamentally invisible is suddenly offered to the brightness of the gaze, in a movement of appearance so simple, so immediate that it seems to be the natural consequence of a more highly developed experience. It is as if for the first time for thousands of years, doctors, free at last of theories and shimeras, agreed to approach the object of their experience with the purity of an unprejudiced gaze. But the analysis must be turned around: it is the forms of visibility that have change.<sup>93</sup>

Modernity then in Foucault's case refers, not to the



unconditional, transhistorical autonomous freedom of the subject of Kant's anthropology, but rather to a thoroughly constituted subject whose autonomy functionally reflects the contingences of an historically constrained experience. As Rajchman pointed out, Foucault's nominalism is concerned with those "cases in which we ourselves are sorted into classes".

1. Modernity is often characterized in terms of consciousness of the discontinuity of time: a break with tradition, a feeling of novelty, of vertigo in the face of the passing moment. And this is indeed what Baudelaire seems to be saying when he defines modernity as "the ephemeral, the fleeting, the contingent."<sup>2</sup> But, for him, being modern does not lie in recognizing and accepting this perpetual movement; on the contrary, it lies in adopting a certain attitude with respect to this movement; and this deliberate, difficult attitude consists in recapturing something eternal that is not beyond the present instant, nor behind it, but within it.

3. However, modernity for Baudelaire is not simply a form of relationship to the present; it is also a mode of relationship that has to be established with oneself. The deliberate attitude of modernity is tied to an indispensable asceticism. To be modern is not to accept oneself as one is in the flux of the passing moments; it is to take oneself as object of a complex and difficult elaboration: what Baudelaire, in the vocabulary of his day, calls 'dandysme'.<sup>64</sup>

Works like his The Order of Things are themselves then interventionist [genealogical], and historically constrained nominalist histories that set out a retroactive archaeological description of unsuccessful programmes of the human sciences to surmount their own grounds, and of the emergence of our own "historical era". In short, what we are given is neither a traditional set of philosophical arguments against these programmes, nor a traditional historiographic description of them, but rather a critical description directed at freeing the historical subject. It is precisely this interest in our

"historical era" that points to Foucault's concern for history, and the historical nature of a great many of his arguments. In an interview with Bernard-Henri Levy conducted in 1977 Foucault stated that "contemporary philosophy is [entirely] political and [entirely] historical. It is the politics immanent in history and the history indispensable for politics."<sup>95</sup> Furthermore, we can easily understand Foucault's constant returning, throughout his career, to Kant's essay What is Enlightenment: a text that he argues must be set against a background of the three other critiques. Take careful notice of his singling out of the congruency between Kant's "critical reflection and reflection on history": a self-reflective process that occurs "from the inside" of present history. An interest that reflects Foucault's argument that our present form of critical modernism, which, as an aesthetics of historical contingency, takes as its goal a critique of "the undefined work of freedom" that commenced with Kant's question.

The hypothesis I should like to propose is that this little text is located in a sense at the [crossroads of critical reflection and reflection on history]. It is a reflection by Kant on the contemporary status of his own enterprise... But it seems to me that it is the first time that a philosopher has connected in this way, [closely and from the inside], the significance of his work with respect to knowledge, a reflection on history and a particular analysis of the specific moment at which he is writing and because of which he is writing.<sup>96</sup>

In that sense, this criticism is not transcendental, and its goal is not that of making a metaphysics possible: it is genealogical in its design and archaeological in its method. Archaeological - and not transcendental - in the sense that it will not seek to identify the universal structures of all knowledge or of all possible moral action, but will seek to treat the instances of discourse that articulate what we think, say, and do as so many historical events. And this critique will be genealogical in the sense that it will not deduce from the form of what we are what it is impossible for us to do and to know; but it will separate

out, from the contingency that has made us what we are, the possibility of no longer being, doing, or thinking what we are, do, or think. It is not seeking to make possible a metaphysics that has finally become a science; it is seeking to give new impetus, as far and wide as possible, to the undefined work of freedom.<sup>97</sup>

## Section Two

### Chapter Two: The Critique Autonomy and Writing on the Visual Arts in English Canada

To write this history does not retrieve a nineteenth century other, but it refuses the benevolence customarily accorded to Kane's work in Canadian art history.

Refusing that benevolence and analyzing the relations of power and knowledge in Kane's project is but one aspect of the area of enquiry and activism demanded by women at the Feminism and Art Symposium. That work, of changing social relations and changing knowledges, is crucial to the disruption and transformation of the concepts and the languages of racism in this culture. As the symposium recognised, such questions should not be seen as a healthy alternative that merely revitalizes art history. Rather, they are of central importance in art history as a political practice, as part of the transformation of knowledge and behaviours that is cultural politics.

Heather Dawkins, Paul Kane and the Eye of Power: Racism in Canadian Art History [1986]

## 2.1 The Battel of the Books

In 1704 Jonathen Swift brought out his early prose satire, The Battle of the Books, a work largely written to defend his friend Sir William Temple, spokesperson for ancient learning, and one of the most important participants in the quarrel over the recently founded Royal Society. One of the first clearly defined issues that framed the "Battle" over Modernity was the question of the relative, qualitative merits of Modern versus Ancient learning. Jones [1961], Webster [1976], Rykwert [1983], and Crow [1985], have shown that the correlative issues of education and learning represented major flash points during the quarrel. The conflict over these two issues raged within the institutional contexts of the newly established learned societies and academies of 17th century France, and England, as it did throughout the entire university system. As it will be seen in this chapter there occurs a similiar conflict that repeats itself within sections of the English Canadian university system.

It is not without some interest that Swift used the term "Books" in his title inasmuch as it, I would argue, denotes a fundamental institutional-material venue through which the various discourses concerning Modernity are instantiated, disseminated, and read within specific social contexts. Outside of the "verbal traces" that are enunciated by individuals functioning within given socio-institutional locations, discourses are also instantiated in such documents as "books", "journals", and "magazines". Consequently, if I were to propose that variants of descriptive and revised critical modernism that

have been discussed in chapter one do appear and play out their argumentative roles within the historical setting of writing on the visual arts in English Canada, then the questions to be answered are when, where, and how? More specifically, who, and how many used Foucault's work, where did their writings appear, and when did it first appear? Furthermore, where did these writers first hear, or read of Foucault's work, when did this occur, and under what circumstances did it occur? Once these questions are answered it will then be possible to answer, at least in part, the question of why use Foucault's work.

If the "writer" is context constrained, then both the "reader", and the "document", are also subject to the constraints of those determining conditions that are relative to the reading lists assigned in schools, the magazines or journals in which given texts are published and the problematics of the generic language in which work was first published. In the introductory chapter it was noted that both post-war French, and pre-war and post-war German material first began to be translated within roughly the same time-frame. If you turn to section eight of the appendix you will find a differential analysis between the first date of primary language publication versus secondary language translation covering all monographs and edited collections of translated essays and articles of selected authors. One of the assumptions I made was that while it is logically possible that a number of writers would have read the generic language source I doubted that this would be generally the case for most person's first contact with this material. This assumption was in part confirmed firstly by the fact that all of

the writers, with the exception of Philip Fry, checked the English translation only on the listing which I had sent to each writer of all the published works of Michel Foucault. Also, as previously mentioned, with the exception of three writers, the other 27 never published any material that was first written in French or German. Therefore, given the necessity of translations, and the fact that French and German material appeared in translation at approximately the same time, this would partly account for the fact that authors like Walter Benjamin and Theodor Adorno, who produced their major work some 20 to 30 years earlier than post-war authors like Jacques Derrida and Michel Foucault, only begin to be consistently cited in English language writing on the visual arts by the late 1970's. In section three, and no. one of sections five and six there is statistical breakdown of all the authors cited by Canadian writers, and an analysis of those authors who have most consistently cited.

From the research carried out it is clear that the dissemination of these translations produced a mutative effect upon a majority of the writers that were interviewed. As Philip Monk remarked during his interview concerning his experience of reading this material:

I was both the beneficiary and victim during the late 1970's when a lot of other work started to come forward in translation - so it was all this material being delivered all at once outside of its historical context. It was also a very fertile period when a lot of source material became available - it was not just the French work since it was also the German material of Adorno and that whole series of writers.<sup>98</sup>

There are two related questions that should be answered: 1) why the approximately 10 year differential between when English Canadian writers first began to read Foucault in translation and the time when

these translations first began to be published; and 2), what was the nature and consequence of this mutation. In order to address these questions the writers discussed in this chapter have been divided into two sub-groups. In the first group, selected texts produced by Walter Klepac, Philip Fry, Lesley Johnstone, and Heather Dawkins were examined because they are either of particular importance, or, the types of usages of Foucault's work that one finds in them are representative of certain common patterns of usage that are also operative within the other remaining 11 writers' production that forms the second sub-group. Furthermore, while no detailed analysis of the written production of the second sub-group will be carried out, since their usage of Foucault's works is similar in usage to those in the first sub-group, selected aspects of their interviews will be examined along with those of the first group. It should be clear concerning this issue of usage that as far as can be determined not one of the authors in this group works consistently from a critical or theoretical position exclusively informed by Foucault's critical methodologies of archaeological and genealogical analyses. In the case of two writers, aspects of his work do, on a more systemic basis, inform writings, though, in these and all cases, his work is combined with other theoretical stances. These writers are Philip Fry, and Heather Dawkins, and, of these two, only Philip Fry has, on one occasion in his 1978 catalogue essay Foundations: Notes on the Work of Charles Gagnon, produced a work that attempts to explicitly deploy, to a degree, aspects of Foucault's critical methodology of archaeology on a systemic basis. As for the majority where this systemic use does not exist, they use aspects of his



production only on an occasional basis; something that is partly underscored by the analysis that I carried in No. three of sections five and six of the appendix.

- 2.2 "The Order of Words, The Order of Things: Deconstruction in Contemporary Art" by Walter Klepac, C Magazine, (Fall 1984), pp. 42-57.

When art enters into the world in the radically direct way it had from the early 1960s to the mid 1970s it calls into play the attitudes and the concepts which one normally draws upon in dealing with the world. It is not so much that one totally loses sight of the fact that one is dealing with a work of art and not a real life situation; it is that the criteria for judging the appropriateness of our response to the work are to be found to a great extent in our everyday congress with the world. Twentieth century modernist art has always been a self-conscious enterprise in one way or another. Within the decade of the 1960s alone, however, the focus of this self-consciousness shifted significantly: what was once a matter of questioning a given work's status as an art object turned into a question about its status as an object in the world. That is, the art of the "anxious" or problematic art object gave way to an art in which the object was conceived of as a vehicle for investigating and revealing the fundamental episteme of the artist/viewer - the assumptions, cognitive habits and network of associations upon which the artist's and viewer's conception of the world is based.<sup>93</sup>

Here is a classic formulation of modernist historical experience, for one finds chronology mixing with the presence of our "everyday congress with the (real) world", to provide the temporal [historical] location for the "modernist... self-conscious enterprise" to experience the change from "a given work's status as an art object turned into a question about its status as an object in the world". Furthermore, there are the phrases and words "Order of Words", "Order of Things", and "Deconstruction", each situated in the "Contemporary" present of an art world transformed in such a manner that arts' role now resides in the "revealing" of "the fundamental 'episteme' of the artist/viewer". In response to this historical development Walter Klepac proposes both a critique of some of the argumentative premises of postmodernism, and

attempts to provide an alternative reading of the problematics surrounding the explanation of certain historical developments in modernity in general, and, more specifically, "late modernism" of the 1960s and early 1970s. What is interesting about these two objectives is that they are reflected, rather ironically, in the title of the article, which, in itself represents an ironic restatement of Michel Foucault's 1966 masterpiece, "Les mots et les choses".

The heart of his critique is directed, on the one hand, against the "post-modern" analysis of Rosalind Krauss, Douglas Crimp, and Craig Owens, which, for Klepac, is grounded theoretically on the critical project of French structuralism. On the other hand, he argues that their analysis of the historical situation during, and after "late modernism", relied too heavily upon the assumption that modernity was premised upon the "self-reflexive" nature of the autonomous art object, and, a medium "centeredness" that wishes to disassociate one medium's intrinsic nature from another: both premises formed the backbone of Clement Greenberg's form of critical modernism.

While this body of aesthetic and critical doctrine first gained prominence in the fields of literature and architecture, its prestige and influence in the area of contemporary visual art has become, since the mid 1970s, considerable and continues to grow. The concepts and key intellectual strategies which give postmodernism its strength and scope are rooted in the school of thought that has grown up around the writings of a group of predominantly French intellectuals referred to as the Structuralists.<sup>100</sup>

The radical innovations of the 1960s and 1970s had in effect transformed modernism: they altered its terms, direction and nature in a fundamental way, showing it to have evolved into something quite different than what it started as. So much so, that one could say the late modernist practice drastically exceeded the parameters of modernist theory. Indeed, there was considerable resistance on the part of most of the commonly accepted versions of

modernism to absorb this new direction, or to accept or even acknowledge its consequences. A good deal of this reluctance can be traced to the tendency within modernism to define art as an essentially self-reflexive concept or mode of discourse. That is to say, modernism was above all primarily concerned with the need to distinguish art from other forms of discourse and the "work of art" from ordinary "things".<sup>101</sup>

Turning to structuralism Klepac proposes that one of the essential structuralist's concepts that underwrites both the postmodernist's critique of Greenbergian aesthetics, and their historical explanation of the "innovations" of "late modernism", was the critical program of "deconstruction". Based upon a theory of language founded upon the "written and printed word", it argued that because it is constitutive of human cognitive experience, then the modernist idea that we have an unmediated experience of the "intrinsic nature, meaning or value" of an "object", or "image in the world" becomes untenable. As a consequent corollary to this argument, we, the viewer of the supposedly transparently experienced art objects, are converted into "readers" who are now thrown into a critical, deconstructive realization concerning the "rhetorical bias" of work experienced by this "reader".

For Klepac the overriding consequence of this reading was the critical detachment of both the art work and the experience of the viewer from the "real world" and the misrepresentation of the achievements of "late-modernism". While he fully endorses their critique of Greenberg's arguments, which for him is "the single most important issue broached by them",<sup>102</sup> their over-reliance and overextension of the whipping boy that is Greenberg's aesthetics actually blinds them to seeing the true historical consequences of "late modernism" and to the formation of an alternative, deconstructive theory

that neither jettisons the autonomy of the art object nor its analogical relation to the world of "ordinary 'things'". To counter this reading Klepac proposes that there is an "underlying continuity" between late-modernist work and the "innovative paradigms and the art that followed them": a continuity that is a function of two major developments that ran parallel to each other and which broke the back of Greenberg's modernism. In particular, conceptual art shifted the issue of content away from the arts' concentration upon the "status of the object", to a set of content interests that interrogated "the fundamental 'episteme' of the artist/viewer". This was followed, or, more accurately, ran in parallel with this new emerging "content", by the movement into a broad range of "formal innovations" relative to new "media... forms": the continuity being provided by the new "content" as this shift into new media occurred. Once these developments were initiated, it produced a consequent preemption of the "honorific" status of "painting" and "sculpture", which forced modernity to face two general options: 1), extend Greenberg's analysis, given modernism's "mandate to be about art", to these new media concerns; or 2), define this "mandate... anthropologically" in as much as art now concerns itself with the background "social and political systems"<sup>96</sup> that regulate the nature of art.

Klepac, in response to these options, proposes his own theory for resolving, what is for him the central paradoxical problem that resides at the core of these historical developments that were initiated by late modernism - the preserving of the autonomy of the art object while at the same time maintaining it's contact with the viewer's daily lives.

To do this, he yokes his own positive endorsement of the developments of this new "content", to the aesthetic theory developed by the contemporary American philosopher Arthur Danto. The prime consideration of Danto's work, and why Klepac finds it so preeminently attractive, was its attempt to resolve the paradox. Danto's solution is a classic, neo-kantian argument in which the art object, and our experience of it, provides a "free space" where the formal and material reductionism of "minimal and post-minimal" work engages the viewer's critical reflection upon the art object vis-a-vis our "everyday situations". This sets in motion a critical dialectic between the specific "form"-al and material characteristics of the medium, and the form of the viewer's normative life experiences that must be brought into play in order for the viewer to resolve the nature of the art work at hand.

The kinds of questions that occur to us spontaneously and naturally when we are confronted with some unfamiliar object in normal, everyday situations - such as, what material is it made of, how is it constructed or supported, what relation does it bear to its surroundings, etc. - are the very questions that lead to a total engagement with the work. As attention shifts to the material or medium itself, a detached, highly critical self-awareness becomes imperative on the part of both artist and spectator. Faced with the stark, unembellished substance that is the work, the observer is thrown back upon himself, as it were. One is forced by the nature of the work to deal only with what is there and yet, at the same time, one is drawn, inevitably, to relate this particular confrontation to one's experiences in the world in general. It is because of this that the best work is able to cut deeply into and reveal some original and acute insight into the structure of perception, thought or psychic processes.

Simply stated, Danto is attempting to formulate a conception of art that will successfully address the apparent tendency evident in early modern art, and dramatically accelerated in contemporary art, to eradicate the distinction between the objects, situations and events denoted as art and their counterparts in real life. Danto insists that there is a difference and advances the view

that art is a kind of free space which the culture allows for the artist and the spectator alike to confront and/or contemplate interests and concerns in a sustained and rigorously independent manner. Its being art seems, in this view, to guarantee that our attention will be focused intensely on that object of concern and will not be readily distracted by extraneous thoughts, associations or practical motives. What makes the work of art art and insures its integrity as art has to do with the form of the work's engagement with some aspect of the world.<sup>103</sup>

Walter Klepac started writing on art in 1971 in Toronto as the "art reviewer" for the "underground" newspaper "Guerrilla". In the interview that I conducted with Klepac he stated that two years previously he had been completing a B.A. at Wayne State University in Detroit, Michigan, where he worked on a double major in English literature and philosophy. While he had studied and wrote some literary criticism at university, he did not write professionally until his work for Guerrilla, which ended four years later in 1974. Writing for him had been "a way of pursuing those interests I had developed" in university in as much as "some of the philosophical issues dealt with in analytical philosophy seemed to be more fully engaged in the work of art, particularly the work I saw at the Carman Lamana Gallery which had just started up at that time". The art of this time, specifically the work of Ron Martin, the Rabinowitchs, and Michael Snow, who was with the Isaacs Gallery "dealt with those problems of epistemology and perception that seemed to parallel issues being raised in analytical philosophy". While Klepac stated, in his interview with me, that he was affected by "Foucault's concept of the episteme" because of the "challenge" it offered to "the basic working assumptions of the philosophy I grew up with", it was actually the nature of that "challenge" that was, by the middle 1980s, to become so problematic for him.<sup>104</sup>

Klepac though did not actually read Foucault's The Order of Things until he was preparing for his article, "The Order of Words...", which appeared in C magazine in 1984. Furthermore, while it takes to task the critical project at the "French structuralists" and their American counterparts, it is fair to say that this text was written with another group in mind - those Canadian writers on the visual arts who were supposedly busy working from the same set of structuralist premises as the Americans.

The article is a critique of the very rhetorical application of these theories, it is not necessarily a critique of Foucault or Derrida.

If you go through a lot of the writings, there are juxtapositions from the various structuralist writers that are simply not maintained.

What struck me was it was so anti-thetical to the most exciting Canadian art being done in Canada - all the key underlying principles of this work were being called into question.

It was so widespread in the mid 80s... this structuralist material was quite devastating to a number of artists, like Roland Poulin and Ron Martin, whom I talked to - they felt like the world had turned around.<sup>105</sup>

It should be noted that relative to the issue of chronology, that is, between the initial time period of the late 1960s, to the time when Klepac first read Foucault's work, we have approximately the time spread that brackets some of the most important changes in English Canadian writing on the visual arts in the post-war period. The date of publication of Klepac's article falls between 1977 and 1989, when 29 of the 30 authors who have used Foucault, as well as many other "structuralists" work, first began to write. More importantly, this article appeared in C Magazine, a later important partner to two of the most important serial publications to emerge during this period for both writing on the visual arts, and, the propagation of post-war



international and regionalized modernism in Canada. As the statistical analysis in section two has shown, Parachute, Vanguard, and C formed one of the major institutional roots whereby a major portion of writing that was underwritten by French or German critical and theoretical projects went "public". The connection between these three publications, and the writers who assisted in the promulgation of these projects is considerably more intimate than just providing a venue for articles to appear in. Bruce Grenville, Robert Graham, William Wood, Lesley Johnstone, Russell Keziere, and Philip Monk have all had some form of professional relationship, for example, as members of editorial boards, with at least one of the three periodicals. Furthermore, the appearance of these periodicals by the middle 1970's and early 1980's, merely reflect a much larger transformation of the institutional framework into which all 30 writers who used Foucault's work emerged. If you examine section four of the appendix you will note that from 1965, to 1990, there is a 90% increase in the number serials that provide publication venues for texts on the fine arts. The other main venue for the public dissemination of texts are the institutional contexts of the museum, gallery, or artists run space. Here again there was a increase in the number of spaces available that would provide support for the publication of catalogues. Diana Nemiroff, in her study on the emergence of artist run spaces in Canada, noted that the number of these spaces rose in 1967 from 1 to over 90 by 1985.<sup>106</sup> In the museum sector Max Brice, in his 1979 study of the post-war growth of Museums in Canada, noted that 45% appeared after 1967, and 11% between 1970-76.<sup>107</sup> Finally, as Joan Horseman noted, there is also a rapid expansion of

secondary and post-secondary education in the arts, which, as of 1965 onwards, can in large part be attributed to the "recommendations put forward in the Report of the Massey Commission".<sup>108</sup>

### 2.3 Introduction and Dissemination: Foucault's Work and the Educational Context.

To understand, in more detail, some of the more specific operative factors that brought about this "Battel", which emerges from within these expansions, it would, at this point, be useful to examine the educational context, first date of publication, and, when and under what circumstances each of the other 11 author's first read Foucault's work. This I believe will provide an explanation for the chronological differential between the first appearance, in translation, of Foucault's production, and the beginning of the time frame when this work is cited. This, in turn, will provide a clearer picture of the historical context in which Klepac's article was written.

Scott Watson finished his M.A. in art history in 1977, and, from 1976 to 1977 he was teaching part-time at University of British Columbia. This was followed by his working as a registrar at the Vancouver Art Gallery from 1978 to 1980. It was during his work at the gallery that the then director of the Vancouver Art Gallery Luc Rhombout encouraged him, in 1978, to write an exhibition catalogue essay for a forthcoming exhibition of a collection of minor French Impressionist paintings. Rhombout showed it to Russell Keziere who then encouraged Watson to submit it for publication in Vanquard, whose offices were housed, at that time, at the Vancouver Art Gallery.

Watson first read Foucault's The Order of Things in 1970, the context for this reading being his friendship with the Vancouver poet Robin Blazer who had introduced him to Foucault's work. Blazer's own introduction to Foucault was a function of his "concern with the state

of subjectivity in 20th century poetics... he wanted to get rid of this thing from the poetic project". The larger, background historical context that links Watson, to Blazer, to Foucault, was "The Black Mountain School" of poetics that "was very big in Vancouver insofar as all the members of the school, including, most prominently, Charles Olson, had all come out here in the 1960s". Blazer had been a friend of Olson's, and "his reading of Foucault was tempered by his relation to Olson".<sup>109</sup> Olson had formulated during the early 1950s a strikingly similar usage of the concept of archaeology, at least in its anti-humanistic aspects, to Foucault's own understanding of his archaeological project: work that was to figure very prominently in Scott Watson's 1982, Vanguard article "Naming the Piece: Geoff Smedley and the Post-modern"; an article in which Foucault's work was also to play a more marginal role.

For an investigation and a definition of post-modernism, one might do well to stay away from the art magazines - the discussion there is over-heated. Instead, I would like to use the work of the American poet, Charles Olson (1910-1970), who was rector of Black Mountain College in the early 1950s. In his writing, Olson articulated what seems to be, now, the current concerns and methods of post-modernism. His work demonstrates that a sensibility which includes a concern for history and language, and a concern for the subjective individual, is not necessarily at odds with itself.

Olson's project, summarized in his 1950 statement, "The Present is a Prologue," was nothing less than an appropriation of history:

'I am an archeologist of morning. And the writing and arts which I find bear on the present job ar (I) from Homer back, not forward; and (II) from Melville on, particularly himself, Dostoyevsky, Rimbaud, and Lawrence. These were the modern men who projected what we are and what we are in, who broke the spell. They put men forward into the post-modern, the post-humanist, the post-historic, the going live present, the 'Beautiful Thing'.<sup>110</sup>

Watson, like Klepac, did not start to deploy Foucault's work though in his own critical writings until 1983 when he began to search for a more theoretically informed historical analysis. As he stated to me, he had found his first 1978 catalogue essay "embarrassing" because of its reliance upon connoisseurship practices.

Robert Graham finished his B.A. at McGill in 1973 where he had studied some art history. He then entered the M.A. program in Communications, but had to leave before finishing, returning later to complete his M.A. in 1989. His first published text appeared in a 1980 edition of Parachute magazine. At this time he knew Angela Grauerholz who was then the graphic designer for Parachute, and, who was also working at the same time at the Yajima Gallery in Montreal, a gallery that Graham had frequented quite often. Grauerholz was the person who encouraged him to write his first article on a group exhibition of color photography that was being exhibited at the Gallery. His first contact with Foucault's work was when he read The Order of Things after his B.A. but before starting his M.A. It was during his M.A. though that his interest in Foucault's work increased. He had heard Foucault speak at McGill<sup>111</sup> during that time and had also taken a communications seminar on Foucault's work given by the American Foucault scholar Donald Bouchard. As for Graham's undergraduate period of study in art history at McGill, we can see, through his elaboration of his own experiences, a common pattern of development that emerges in a number of the other author's institutional histories.

While at McGill when I did take art history classes I attempted to introduce material from outside the discipline... they looked at me as if I had just pissed on the floor.

I did not spend a lot of time there, it was not my formative area... the communications department was most important... a department that was itself not as strongly developed... it could accept Foucault fairly easily and what Foucault was trying to do was considered acceptable and welcome.

Meanwhile I still had this art interest... I was learning from communications, including Foucault, and I continued to think and talk about art with those tools, and I brought them to the art world.

Now my experience was that this was welcome in the art world... I had a good reception with this material, I didn't have to do battle with anyone.<sup>112</sup>

Marnie Fleming completed her M.A. in Art History at the University of British Columbia in 1980, and while, in 1981, she was working at the Vancouver Art Gallery, Russell Keziere encouraged her to write her first article for Vanguard. Her first contact with Foucault's work occurred when she was studying with Professor David Solkin who was then teaching in the art history department at the time.

My interest in Foucault was generated by Professor David Solkin, then at the University of British Columbia. I was introduced to Foucault in 1978 when I was preparing my M.A. thesis on Canadian artist William G.R. Hind. Most of my other professors there at the time were connoisseurs that viewed art and politics as separate spheres with intentions that were diametrically opposed; art to them, transcended the matters of political debate. Foucault opened up doors for me. My interest in Foucault is not by any means extensive. What interests me now is to see how his writings can be applied to other disciplines outside art. Recently, I have been reading geographers who use Foucault extensively when dealing with dislocated, compressed and abstracted experiences of space and time. Foucault has helped make geography enter "the postmodern debate" and geographers like Edward Soja and David Harvey have expanded and brought together critical discourses about space, culture and esthetics within the framework of social theory - which in turn can be used by the art historian.<sup>113</sup>

Trevor Gould finished his M.A. in Canadian Studies at Carleton University in 1987, while his first published work appeared in 1981 in Parachute. Gould stated that, at the time, there was a shortage of

people writing on the visual arts in Ottawa, and Chantal Pontbriand of Parachute had asked him to write for her magazine. Philip Fry, who was teaching at the University of Ottawa at the same time as Trevor Gould, and, who was a consistent contributor to Parachute, had recommended him to Pontbriand as a possible person who might write for the magazine. It was also Philip Fry who really introduced Gould to Foucault's work for the first time, though Gould had heard Foucault's name mentioned previously while he was studying sociology in South Africa. Gould had read Foucault against the background of "my research in sociology", and had formed a critical approach to writing about art from a phenomenological and hermeneutic approach to that study of sociology.

Also I had recognized that traditional art history and aesthetics were very limiting... they never really supplied answers to crucial questions I had - I found their answers to reliant on a formalism that was typified by Michael Fried... I found my answers through social theory and literary criticism.<sup>114</sup>

Bruce Grenville completed his M.A. in art history at Queen's University in 1984, and his first article was published in 1982 in Vanguard magazine. His decision to start writing was based on the realization that there was no one writing contemporary art in the community of Kingston at the time. He first came across Foucault's The Order of Things when he was researching a catalogue essay on John Clark's work while he was still at Graduate school. At around this time he had first come in contact with French theory in general when he read Parachute magazine's 1981 publication "Performance Text(s) a Documents". Craig Owen's work "The Allegorical Impulse: Towards a Theory of Postmodernism", which was published in Parachute's text, proved to be "an eye opener and I read everything that was cited in the

bibliography". Grenville was looking to outside the department at Queen's because it was not providing the type of theoretical grounding he felt he required or dealing with the type of work that he wished to write about.

Queen's was very conservative... I was reading material in art magazines that was an entirely different way of writing about, say, Monet than the professors.

Art history there was founded on a type of connoisseurship that came out of the professors who were trained at the Courthould Institute.

It also had no interest in doing anything with contemporary art because it was not interested.<sup>115</sup>

William Wood completed his M.A. in Library Science at the University of Toronto in 1984. Earlier, during the time while he was studying for his B.A. in Literature at the University of British Columbia he was working in the Fine Arts library there. It was here that "he became interested in Fine Arts and where he started reading a great deal of art criticism"; a process that brought about his decision to write art criticism. His first actual piece of writing was in 1982 when he wrote a catalogue essay for a graduation exhibition of an M.F.A. student at the university. Scott Watson had read the essay and contacted Wood to encourage him to write more, which he started to do on a regular basis in 1984. While working on his M.A. he was reading, through his own initiative, "Marxist aesthetics, some French theory, and some Foucault on the side". He had first come in contact with this type of material when he was completing his B.A. in 1976 when it was just beginning to appear in the department. He started though reading Foucault's work in 1981 because his sister was working on an M.A. in History during which she was doing research in Medical History and, as part of that research, she had read Foucault's work.



Lesley Johnstone completed her M.A. in Art History at the Universite de Montreal in 1986 and her first published work appeared in 1985. Her contact with Foucault's work came in one of Philip Fry's classes, where she read the chapter on "Las Meninas" in The Order of Things, at the University of Ottawa where she did her B.A.

James Patton finished his M.A. in Art History at McGill University in 1990, and his first published article came out in 1988 in an edition of Etudes des Arts. He first read Foucault's work outside of his studies in undergraduate Art History at the University of Toronto. This interest was due in large part to his reaction to "conservative" nature of the art history being taught in the Department.

U.of T. was very conservative with a very traditional art historical formulation... it was a very self-reflexive methodology that tended to refer to an internal system within the evolution of art practices - paintings only refer back to other paintings.

At the same time as this I was influenced by some friends outside the university context who were reading other things - like Foucault.

I felt I had to incorporate this material into my writing about art because I was not entirely satisfied by traditional art historical practices... while I was being exposed to this kind of material, I was also reading Parachute at the time... I noticed in the footnotes that people were referring to various authors whose names were coming up... I mean I was not aware of them, but I noticed that similar names were coming up all the time.

In contrast to traditional art historical practices there were various other disciplines like English Literature and Music... it was fascinating how the margins of these disciplines were being pushed open... reading Foucault and other authors has allowed me to go into other areas of research... my main area of interest being Feminism.<sup>116</sup>

Carol Williams finished her M.A. in the Social History of Art at the University of Leeds in 1988, and her first published text appeared in 1987 in C magazine. Her completion of this degree was, in part, due to a long period of self-initiated research that began while she was in

the Winter Studio Program at the Banff Centre where she first heard Martha Rosler speak. It was this experience, plus her reading of Griselda Pollock's 1981 Block article, "Vision, Voice and Power" that "sparked" her desire to develop a research program into critical feminist writings; a project that was combined with her "grass roots involvement in the women's movement". After Banff she was later to continue this research when she attended the Fine Arts program at Simon Fraser University, though again, she had to carry on her research largely outside of the confines of that program. She did her readings into political-Feminist work while as an undergraduate because this material was not available in the school at the time. While there, some Marxist work was being read, but it was not the Marxist-Feminist arguments that she was interested in pursuing. She had, at the time, taken a seminar film studies with the American film theorist and feminist Kaja Silverman and the occasional course on women's studies that was made available in other departments.

... otherwise politically engaged material that I was interested in was suppressed in the school... issues concerning power, about the body, about knowledge and power.<sup>117</sup>

Her first contact with Foucault's work was his The Order of Things, this occurring because her partner Don Gill, who was studying in the Communications department at Simon Fraser University in 1982-83, was reading Foucault.

Russell Keziere did a B.A. in english literature at the University of Victoria, and the University of Massachusetts, completing it in 1976. This was followed by a one year period of independent studies in metaphysics at the Seminary of Christ the King in British Columbia. As

for his first published article, it appeared in a spring 1978 issue of Criteria magazine. In his university years, during which he had also completed minors in art history, and philosophy, he had become disenchanted with the distancing consequences of the nature of the intellectual practices as he experienced them.

I was in a Benedictine monastery for about a year after graduating from university where I was studying philosophy. I was dissatisfied with the philosophical rigor that I received at university and with the inability of people to take ideas and make them become real in some way. At that time I had been interested also in contemporary art which seemed to be a place where one could discuss ideas concerning spirituality and politics - it was a place where ideas could become real and that was probably the reason I became interested in art. It was in fact reading an article in Parachute No. 2 on Joseph Beuys. It made me interested in the artist and his mixture of politics, spirituality, and political interventionism. This experience, combined with my personal relations with artists, encouraged me to start writing about art.<sup>118</sup>

In regards to his first contact with Foucault's work, it occurred in the context of his editorship of Vanguard magazine.

I first thought met Foucault through my writers - that would have been very early on in my discussion with writers. Where people would bring in references and so I would pursue them on their readings. There was a number of people using Foucault at the time which would have been 1979-80-81.<sup>119</sup>

Philip Monk finished a B.A. at the University of Manitoba in 1972, after which he completed an M.A. in Art History at the University of Toronto in 1978. His first published work was an article on David Rabinowitch, that appeared in a 1977 issue of Parachute magazine. It was during his work to complete his M.A. that his dissatisfaction with the program and his interest in contemporary art merged.

Before I finished the M.A. I became dissatisfied with the conservative nature of the way art history was approached at the University. My interest at the time in contemporary art was always there - it was then that I

decided that I did not to continue on in art history and I started to write on art.

I was interested in contemporary art for a long time before grad school which had submerged that interest - there were no contemporary courses in any way there.

... at that time I just decided that I was most interested in writing. I saw writing - not necessarily criticism - or just another outcome of thinking about art. It was more a way to continue to think about art.<sup>120</sup>

Monk is not certain about the exact time when he first read Foucault's work since he had developed a general interest in structuralism when he left the University of Manitoba. While he may have read The Order of Things at this time, he was certain though about the context when Foucault's work started to play a clear role.

It emerged by 1977 in the context of my dissatisfaction with the University of Toronto, and in the context of the other critical theories being published or translated at the time.<sup>121</sup>

Cheryl Simon completed a B.A.A. in Photographic Arts - Media Studies at Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto in 1981. She then, in 1988, completed an M.F.A. in Photography at Concordia University. It was 1982 though when Katherine Tweedie, who was organizing a lecture series in Toronto, invited her to write a review article on the work of Brian Condron for Vanguard Magazine. Her first contact with Foucault's work was through the reading lists assigned in a seminar at Concordia, given by Tom Waugh on Sexuality in the Cinema.

Heather Dawkins completed her B.F.A. at NASCAD in 1980, which was followed by an M.A. in the Social History in Art from the University of Leeds in 1984. At present she is completing her Ph.d at Leeds in Art History. Her first published works appeared in a 1987 issue of Parachute magazine, and, in student art magazines and a local feminist

newspaper in Halifax titled Women's Words. In regards to her first contact with Foucault's production, it was at NASCAD where "most everyone was reading him". Her first actual interest in his work was a product of her involvement in producing a performance, in 1981-82, with another person on sexuality - "I was interested in Foucault because of Gay and Lesbian politics".<sup>122</sup> Part of the reason for the presence of critical works like those produced by Foucault can be attributed to the efforts of individuals like Benjamin Buchloch at NASCAD and a visiting artists program that brought in artists such as Mary Kelly and Martha Rosler.

If we separate out the question of when and why these individuals first read Foucault's work from when each writer first started to write outside of university, then, I would argue, the institutional context of university will supply at least one of the historical reasons why there is a differential between when Foucault's writing first began to appear in translation and when portions of these writings went public in writing on the visual arts. With the exception of Walter Klepac and Philip Fry, there are two important points in regards to the institutional contexts of the ten writers examined: 1, all obtained at least an M.A. in their areas of research; and 2, all started writing just after, or, as in the case of Robert Graham, Trevor Gould, Cheryl Simon, and Heather Dawkins between their B.A. and M.A. degrees. Given the fact that all of these writers went on to develop careers in some part of the institutional context of the art world in Canada after leaving university, we can assume that they went through their various university programs with a view to attempting to form some sort of art

career in the world. The exception to this is of course Robert Graham, who went on to work as an investment counsellor, though he still maintained a parallel career in the art, and Russell Keziere who, while he later moved into the art world, did his undergraduate work in a discipline that did not have a direct bearing on his later career. While these points may seem of trivial significance, it is still of some importance to note that the kinds of writing practices developed in university would be useful to their respective careers insofar as all were to move on to positions where the initial skills for research and academic writing might be of some use.

What I am arguing for here is not that there is a directly determinable pattern of causality, in an empirical sense, here between completing a degree and subsequent careers. Clearly this is not the case given that Bruce Grenville had, during school, made a clearly premeditated decision to establish a career, while Carol Williams' decision to initiate a reading program in critical feminism, which eventually led her to a teaching career, was, in part, a direct consequence of the fortuitously contingent event of hearing Martha Rosler speak at the Banff school. How any of these individuals actually place themselves within the art world would be a function of both this social context and the respective educational backgrounds and interests of each "writer". Therefore, relative to the question of when and why Foucault's work first started appearing in writing on the visual arts when it did, the first obvious answer is that given that these 12 individuals were all passing through university during the 1970s, and early 1980s, they were then, potentially at least, ready to start

writing near, or just after finishing school, the earliest one to complete university being Scott Watson who finished in 1977.

If we turn to the second reason for the time differential, and, excluding this time Philip Fry, Robert Graham, Trevor Gould, Lesley Johnstone, Scott Watson, Heather Dawkins, and Cheryl Simon for a moment, it should be noted that the rest of the writers all had been studying in art history departments where Foucault's work was not available and moreover, all expressed a consistent, and negative set of reactions to the art history programs that they were studying. This also applies in the case of Marnie Fleming, who did come in contact with Foucault's work through one of her professors, insofar as she still was isolated within her department. In William Wood's and Russell Keziere's case, they changed disciplines, but again, went outside of their chosen discipline to continue to develop their interest in art and research other forms theoretical and methodological frameworks.

Trevor Gould and Robert Graham were both working and studying in institutional contexts where they received support for their research interests. Robert Graham, Scott Watson, and Russell Keziere, like a number of other writers, had expressed similar negative reactions to their initial undergraduate art history experience. In Graham's case though he found support in the communications department at McGill and that part of the art world that was developing around Parachute magazine. Trevor Gould also expressed negative comments concerning art history and developed an approach to writing about art from within his studies in sociology. Carol Williams, like most of the other writers, had her first contact with Foucault's work, outside of her work at

university, through her partner's work in communications. In Keziere's case, his interest in art was fostered in a world of working studio artists.

One of the reasons for the importance of communications is that it was a discipline that took on, as one of its methodologies, a practice that stressed a broad critical, social, historical approach to cultural matters that tended to absorb a number of the post-war critical theories. As for literature departments, which play a more marginal role in the development of some of the writers, they, especially in the United States, played an extremely important role in the introduction and dissemination of post-war French critical theories into the English North American context. Rodolphe Gasche, one of the most preeminent North American scholars on the work of Jacques Derrida, has argued that the "comparative literature departments" have been largely "responsible for the introduction of 'French theory' into North America".<sup>123</sup>

Finally cinema, which is relevant to Cheryl Simon's case, is also another important institutional root for critical theories. Screen, the Journal of the Society for Education in Film and Television, was absolutely essential in England given that it was instrumental in introducing structuralism, semiology, Russian formalism, Althusserian marxism, and the work of Lacan.<sup>124</sup>

Clearly art history, with the exception of Heather Dawkins and Lesley Johnstone, plays a negative role here, and, without actually knowing the nature of the curriculum's of the different departments involved here, one must be careful about interpreting these negative responses. All I would say here is that in all probability Foucault's



work, and French and German critical theories in general, had not penetrated their way into curriculums to the point where more students would have the opportunity to at least consider this material as a recognized source for the providing of alternative art historical methodologies. Therefore, given that five of the writers examined have come through art history departments and three had negative reactions to their more narrow experience of art history, then difficulties experienced by our writers might also explain, in part, why Foucault's work does not come on line until it did. It probably takes time for any discipline to respond to major structural and ideological changes that begin to occur within it. If all the new theoretical material begins to appear in the English North American context during the mid to late 1960s it would be quite understandable that it would need a number of years for a discipline to begin to absorb that material. The situation changes though when that generation of art historians, like Carol Williams, begins to obtain teaching positions and begins to assign texts like Foucault's "History of Sexuality" as one of her readings for her students.

Lesley Johnstone's case also provides some support for my argument given that she started her work in art history at the University of Ottawa where Philip Fry, and Rene Payant teachers at the time. It was Fry who assigned Foucault's work to students since he has consistently assigned, for instance, the introduction from Foucault's The Archaeology of Knowledge in his aesthetics class since he started teaching there in the early 1970s. Furthermore, Ms. Johnstone had done her M.A. at the Universite de Montreal where, for instance, Foucault's chapter on "Las

"Meninas" was being consistently assigned in classes at that time. Of course, just because Lesley Johnstone was studying at both these universities it does not follow that she actually started writing any earlier than the rest of the group of writers, given that she started writing only in 1985. With the exception of Philip Fry, Walter Klepac, Scott Watson, Robert Graham, and Trevor Gould all the writers, including Johnstone, started their university education in the late 1970s, and early 1980s when they were in their early 20's. Thus age is another factor that controlled the introduction and dissemination of Foucault's work into writing on the visual arts.

#### 2.4 "Writing", the Institutional Setting and the Problematics of "Ekphrasis".

In the case of Philip Fry, we really have the only real exception to this picture for he represents, as far as I can discover, the earliest writer on the visual arts who produced work informed by Foucault's work. He completed his doctorate at the Universite de Paris (Sorbonne) in Philosophy of art under the direction of Jean Grenier in 1968. With a strong background in structural linguistics, Fry had attended such important seminars as those conducted by A.J. Greimas', which had included in that class, Julia Kristeva, Louis Marin, Phillippe Sollers, and Claude Chabrol. As Philip Fry stated to me in his interview, "the real issue for me was, from the beginning, the question as to whether it is possible to use semiotics in the visual arts as a critical tool".<sup>125</sup>

In 1976 Parachute magazine published Fry's article, "On Description: Notes on the installation of Stephan Cruise's 'Bits and Species'": a critical essay that examines both his role as the "guest curator", and, more generally, those prescriptive and descriptive methodological issues that a work like this installation presents to the curator. Arguing that as a consequence of its being an "installation-as-process", insofar as Cruise's piece was not a "pre-existent" piece that allowed the curator to easily "pre-select" from an already completed body of work, Fry is placed in the position of having to consider two sets of questions concerning curatorial activity. On the one hand, what occurs if one commenced from the standard methodological assumption that one must describe a body of work initially, before

making any curatorial decisions. Furthermore, would one, based upon the material provided by this description succumb to a "genetic fallacy" that the description, in supposedly providing an exhaustive outline of the work, tempt the curator to fully "explain" the work. After producing an initial set of "notes on description", he, after reflecting upon them, concludes that the "naive" assumption of generating specific curatorial decisions founded solely on "description" is failing when it comes work like this. What actually seems to be occurring is that his "notes" reflected a descriptive activity that is not "homogeneous" given that they actually point in three quite different curatorial directions. The problem, he concludes, is largely a function of the implicit "empiricist bias" of prioritizing descriptive activity, insofar as the supposedly "objective" descriptions actually represent a process of observation mediated by certain "structural conditions" - "my subjectivity, my body, my personal history, my society". Therefore, meaningfulness for the curator is a function of a descriptive process regulated by these factors, in conjunction with the nature of the structure of the work. If this is the case, then no work of art can be fully explained or described insofar as the curator is, in fact, a non-objective, creative participant in the work.

What is interesting about Fry's published article is that it provides, in certain ways, a typical example of writing on the visual arts: it possesses some of the central institutional, and discursive characteristics of both early modernist, and revised modernist writing. Moreover, these characteristics are common to a large proportion of the writings produced by the other 14 writers.

Of first importance there are descriptively discursive "evaluations of existant" art works, photographs performing their indexical function, and the chronological placement of works. There is also the revised, "conditional" epistemological subject - the curator/writer - carrying out a beautiful replica of a Cartesian interrogation of the artwork under description, his experience of the work, and the premises that underwrite the practice of curating/writing.

No matter how certain I might have been about the objective reality of the enclosure's physical structure, when I approached it as a work manifesting some kind of meaning, the structure lost its factual quality and became ambiguous, tentative, open to determinations for which I felt in some way responsible. The discrepancy perceived in this manner seems to arise from two closely related activities: the attempt to determine the units and relations that should be held as pertinent to the experience of meaning and the attribution of value to these structural components through a process of identification.

Once I had stepped up and proceeded part of the way along the board-walk, my attention began to shift from looking at things to what was happening to me. As I scanned the space which was now around me, one item or another would hold my attention, I would move toward it to get as better or closer view, perhaps lining it up with a shadow, perhaps trying to avoid some interruption to my vision. Though conscious of boundaries and distances from things that I would not be able to change, I was free to choose whatever viewpoints I wished and to change them at will by continuing on my way, by backtracking, by turning my back on one element to see another. Location was a function of my position - a variable - and could be expressed by "behind me" and "in front of me" as well as "to the left" and "to the right". Noticing the relationship between an element "in front of me" and an item "behind me" was strange indeed.

Attempting to reformulate the notes I jotted down as Stephen worked has served to bring one thing clearly to mind: if, at the outset, I rather naively proposed to observe and describe the installation of "Bitsandspecies", hoping to shed some light on the piece as a process. It is now apparent that the undertaking was on shaky footings, that my approach easily gives way to doubt. Looking back at the paragraphs just written I find that my descriptive activity has not been homogeneous, that the center of my

attention shifted quite perceptibly (at least in the text), that in fact I have produced three groups or series of observations by passing from relatively objective "findings" to subjective "impressions" and, finally, to intersubjective "exchange".

More likely than that, meanings would seem to appear as functions (or products) of the perceptual/cognitive exploration of the work's physical structure and should, perhaps, be approached as an event involving structural conditions of varying subjectivity (my body, my personal history, my society) rather than as one, fixed pattern of meaning. The discrepancy mentioned above between the internal physical structure and the perceptual/cognitive structure would seem particularly pertinent at this point.<sup>126</sup>

These quotations are from the text - that is, they are internal to the text. The article, titled "On Description: Notes on the Installation of Stephen Cruise's 'Bitsandspecies'", was published in issue No. 24, dated Autumn 1976, of Parachute magazine. Furthermore, this institutional venue for writing on the visual arts is layered upon another important, parallel institutional component - the museum and gallery system. Fry's article concerns a specific installation "Bitsandspecies", by a single individual named Stephen Cruise, located at the "Dalhousie Art Gallery" and the Vancouver Art Gallery from April 27, to May 23, 1976, and, from August 20 to September 26, 1976 respectively. Additionally, there are captioned photographs like, "View from entrance, photo: Dalhousie University Labs", that parallel the discursive descriptions, both establishing, indexically, a descriptive, chronological relationship to the art work. Consequently, the [discursive] text/photographs and [institutional] magazine/galleries form a broad two-part social framework in which the writer-viewer, in relation to the reader-viewer - a third dyadic role within writing- may determine the initial specific location, descriptive nature, and,

chronological context of the work under critical evaluation.

This overall framework is also not to be restricted to articles, given that a serials publication like Parachute is roughly divided into two broad sections, the first usually being composed of between four to eight articles, while the second "commentaires/reviews" section having between six to 15 "reviews". While articles can cover a broad range of subject matters, "reviews" usually have much more narrowed descriptive and evaluatory functions given their short length, and, more specific mandate to review particular exhibitions, or, in rarer cases, political-cultural issues and publications. What reviews do, from the perspective of the institutional-discursive framework, is highlight the components of this framework. In Fry's review, "Concerning the Wacousta Syndrome (more about What's Canadian in Canadian Art)", the reader-viewer knows that it will be written to evaluate, by usually one person, a specific publication, produced by one writer. In almost all cases of "reviews" are given dates and locations of the exhibition, or publication, are given along with one of the requisite captioned photographs and short sets of discursive descriptions. There is one difference inasmuch as there is usually little historical contextualizing of works and a greater stress on a detailed description of the work. Moreover the presence of "conditional" descriptions, or the extensive deployment of theoretically informed critical apparatuses, which, if present, are usually in a much more cursory form. A typical example is Scott Watson's "review", in a No. 6, 1985 issue of C Magazine, "Stan Douglas' Panoramic Rotunda", Or Gallery, Vancouver, March 19-28".

The panorama represented the most complete appropriation of nature by means of linear perspective since

it was developed in 15th century Italy. Stan Douglas' new work, Panoramic Rotunda, resurrects the format of the panorama with a photographic image. The image is the edge of a swamp. The artist constructed a platform in the middle of the pond and made a 360° image of the periphery. In his model, recently displayed at the Or Gallery, the photograph, in four sections, was mounted on wooden supports, each making a quarter circle support for the image. The sections were hinged, suggesting that although in this presentation the work was mounted on the wall as a half circle flanked by a quarter circle on each side - the piece could be used as a 360° installation. The armature for the panorama would then form a square.

Panoramic Rotunda is not a critique either, not an exposure of how linear perspective commodifies the world of nature; although this is knowledge we should probably bring to the piece. Here the panorama achieves an uncanny after-life, restored by the photographic techniques that replaced it, it becomes a ghost and a startling sign of the mechanism we used to call man, ringed by another we used to call nature. That both entitles are dissolving is everywhere apparent in the art, literature and science of our era - it is only in the social that both thrive, but perhaps as mere, gargantuan but gaudy, simulacra. The work would appear then, to have been made from a perspective which renders the linear perspective of humanism antique. The middle of a dark swamp (which was incidently, a childhood haunt of the artist, accounting for the enchantment and reverie he brings to the image) is a curious place. One thing the piece accomplishes is to bring forward, for a moment, our lost interiority, with a place and an image albeit in a menacing, ideologically saturated, fully revealed armature. It achieves this by having the viewer stand inside a model of the eye, asking us, to paraphrase Foucault, "who is seeing."<sup>127</sup>

Of course the lack of a more elaborate historical context within the reviews is made up, at least at a rudimentary descriptive level: there are dates, locations, photographs of "existant" objects, and the role of the critical witness, the writer, to the work(s) under "review".

In the case of catalogues, which form statistically the next largest institutional context for writing by all 30 writers we will find again a similar institutional-discursive framework in operation. There are though certain clear differences given that a museum, gallery, or



artist run centre would normally solicit writers, or use in house curators to write not "reviews", but historical, or, more rarely critical historical essays. Having said this, the distinction between catalogue essays and articles tends in some cases to collapse. While the difference between the two is maintained at the institutional level, at the level of the text produced they can, in fact, be identical, or similar. In the case of Philip Fry's 1978 catalogue essay "Foundations: Notes on the Work of Charles Gagnon", he uses a very similar critique of "self-limitation" to that in many of his articles. While in the case of Scott Watson's article "Naming the Piece: Geoff Smedley and the Post-modern", which was published in a 1982 issue of Vanguard, the text is virtually identical to the catalogue essay "Naming the Piece: Geoffrey Smedley and the Post-Modern Imagination" which was published in a 1982 catalogue published by The Vancouver Art Gallery. There are also other points when it comes to the internal aspects of all the writing of each writer. In Scott Watson's article on Geoff Smedley, Foucault appears in a positive, supportive role that lends a marginal, quotational support to Watson's endorsement of post-modernity, while, seven years later both Foucault and post-modernity are subjected to a tough reappraisal in his 1989 article "Signing Off".

Post or anti-humanism is, therefore, more than anything else, what post-modernism is all about. This is probably why it meets such resistance. Post-modernism, because it undermines the notion that there can be an object "man" which is available to the subject "man", has unpleasant news for psychology, anthropology, sociology (the human sciences) as well as the practitioners of lyricism of "self-expression" in all the arts. Man does not exist, "the species... is no more than an individual mythologized in a spirit of contemplation." "For Marxism there is no such thing as man; there are specific men and women, distributed as differentially functioning agents into specific

classes..." For non-Marxists, too, the concept of man is not only crumbling, it's obscuring the view. For Michel Foucault man "is neither the oldest nor the most constant problem that has been posed for human knowledge... man is an invention of recent date. And one perhaps nearing its end..." to be "... erased, like a face drawn in sand at the edge of the sea.

If man is not the measure of all things for the post-modernist, what is? For Foucault and his students it is language itself. "Ought we not rather to give up thinking of man, or to be more strict, to think of this disappearance of man and the ground of possibility of all the sciences of man - as closely as possible in correlation with our concern with language?" That is, language with a question mark. The reinvention of language is of prime concern for the post-modern.<sup>128</sup>

For marxist critics, like Sebastiano Timpanaro or Perry Anderson, the post-modern theory of the subject is crisis-ridden because of idealist contaminants in the theory. The origin of this contamination is to be found in Ferdinand de Saussure's theory of the sign from which structuralism and post-structuralism derive their basic concepts. It is, according to these critics, the anti-humanist bias of structuralism (and its successors) that makes it hostile to the imagination of a whole subject and therefore an inadequate tool for social change and an imperfect instrument for description. Structuralism is anti-humanist because it proposes the erasure of the subject, whose needs and desires are irrelevant to questions of method. "High structuralism was never more strident", writes Anderson, "than in its annunciation of the end of man. Foucault struck the characteristically prophetic note when he declared in 1966: 'Man is in the process of perishing as the being of language continues to shine ever more brightly on our horizon.'" Structuralism is further flawed as a descriptive tool because it begins from the outset with an interested view of reality.<sup>129</sup>

Two things though have not changed appreciably here in these two articles: 1, the broad institutional-discursive framework; and 2, a writing that combines a straightforward descriptive modernism with the wider argumentative structure that explicitly recognizes the conditional-unconditional grounds that regulates any description. The changes reside in the internal theoretical shifts, within the context of these broader grounds, between the two articles. In such earlier usages

as his 1982 article on Geoffrey Smedley, Watson was supportive of what he refers to as "post-modern" critical analysis. This was to change by 1989 when in his article "Signing Off", he produced a scathing critique of the anti-humanistic, and discursively grounded elements of this form of critical analysis.

## 2.5 Artworks, Foucault, and Some Standard Patterns of Argumentative Activity.

If Philip Fry brings out, sometimes rather rhetorically, some of the characteristics of both early, and revised modernity, then his work, along with the work of Heather Dawkins, Philip Monk, and Lesley Johnstone also exemplifies particularly common usages of Foucault's work found in the writings of the other 12 writers. In 1964 while studying in Paris, Philip Fry first concluded that "my central issue has always been and still remains to be the limits of rational thought and the function of poetic expression". Outside of the primary importance of the work in structural linguistics of Roman Jakobson to Fry's own project, another work of early significance was a text by John Cohen that examined the relation between linguistics and poetics; research that assisted Fry in coming to the conclusion that there was "no gap between poetic language and standard language".<sup>130</sup> The central problematic was to formalize a program of critical analysis that would allow reason to understand, or operate within, the limitations to its activities posed by "poetic expression". This is, of course, a familiar problematic of conditional-unconditional experience and the process of "aestheticism", for there can be no more typical example of it than the assertion that is "no gap between poetic... and standard language."

In his article "On Description" there is the reflexive subject, in this case Phillip Fry, as writer/curator, attempting to formulate an argumentative framework that accounts for freedom. In this case an understanding of freedom that forms itself around the experience of an heterogeneous meaningfulness that is a function of the activity of the

subject - the "my personal history" - and the wider social context of a "cultural field". Moreover, both components are clearly distinguishable from "natural reality". Inasmuch as Fry wished to produce a successful argumentative framework, his process of reasoning had to account for his freedom, and develop a set of explanatory concepts that could provide the non-circular ground for these arguments, which, in this case was the "formalization" of a "set of conditions".

Perhaps now, after setting aside my original questions about the installation to examine my approach to "Bitsandspecies" as an object of description, I will be able to return to them with some hope of finding more satisfactory answers. After all, what did I wish to denote when I began to talk about the installation as a process if it was not something closely bound up with the specific manner in which meaning is formulated by "Bitsandspecies"? Perhaps what I have called the "process" is nothing more than a particular case of what Michel Foucault calls "La fonction énonciative", but even if that is so, the attempt to ascertain the distinctive traits by which this function can be recognized must be extended to numerous particular cases besides the one at hand. Meanwhile, in order to establish some frame of reference I will take the chance of attempting a preliminary formulation: the "process" in question is the particular activity by which a work emerges as a location for the formulation of meaning or, saying it another way, the function by which the work manifests itself as endowed with a structure. If I follow the line of investigation suggested by this formulation, what basis will it provide for documentary activities and eventually, for analytic description?

An adequate exploration of this formulation's consequences will lead me far beyond the scope of this article, but a few clarifications nevertheless seem possible at this time. I don't think that the problem is one of attempting to prove that such a process exists, but rather one of finding a way to talk about it. As far as I can see, the conviction that there is a process by which a work "makes sense" is indissolubly bound up with the experience of meaning: from the outset "Bitsandspecies" has been approached as a 'marked' structure that is 'sustained' in its role as a localization of meaning by something that permitted me to distinguish it from the natural things I come across and from other works. By 'marked' I mean that some characteristic(s) or condition of the structure evokes

the cultural character of its production; by 'sustained' I'm referring to the fact that the meaning didn't happen at one point in time but that it continues to happen. This is no doubt why I have found the use of the word 'work' so appropriate - because it suggests that the producer and the situation of production have something to do with this process - and why trying to hold the object of description at a distance has been so difficult. If I try to doubt that my experience really reveals the existence of this process because I have been culturally conditioned, my doubt only serves to clarify the main issue: I am not striving to locate and identify any kind of natural reality (whatever that might be), but to indicate that there is a function that is determined by purely cultural conditions of existence. If my judgement about what these conditions are can be mistaken, the function itself is given as an aspect of meaning. As it is an irreducibly private event, perhaps the only means by which it can be approached in a description is by its formalization as a set of conditions that govern the manifestation or appearance of the work within a given cultural field.<sup>131</sup>

If Foucault's explanatory concept of "La fonction énonciative" appears within the standard discursive - institutional setting, then it also plays a standard argumentative role in a set of common discursive contexts. Working in conjunction with different fragments from other explanatory discourses, each of the four writers construct articles that place selected aspects of Foucault's work in argumentative discourses that may, or may not, have much to do with that work. In 1976, Philip Monk's article, "Structures for Behavior", was published in Parachute magazine: a critical review of the sculpture exhibition, Structures for Behavior, which was held at the Art Gallery of Ontario under the curatorial directorship of Roald Nasgaard. Monk singles out the work of Richard Serra and David Rabinowitch for critical praise, and the production of George Trakas and Robert Morris as exemplifying precisely those characteristics that he critiques so severely in the curatorial assumptions of Roald Nasgaard. Both Serra and Rabinowitch produced

efforts that, without any reliance upon "verbal" elements, provide specific situations for a given viewer to experience experimentally a "critical", interpretative awareness of their own productive interaction with each work. In each case the productions of the artist's do not promote a mode of "subjectivity" that is either a function of phenomenological premises, or do they, as Nasgaard would argue, release the viewer from "the continuous narrative of history" into an unmediated contact with the "natural world". It is precisely this endorsement of an anti-phenomenological stance that ties Serra's and Rabinowitch's work to what Monk considers as a proper, "critical" understanding of the viewers experience of the external world.

To quote from the catalogue preface "the exhibition is "thermatic" only insofar as it presents sculptures which demand a common order of perceiving actively and meaningfully engaging the spectator." The introduction states further that "the four artists do not form a necessarily cohesive group, but in their respective ways of making sculpture, they share a number of tendencies which point to a set of values held in common." These shared tendencies presumably are those that fit the characteristics of "natural art" and "existence art", terms borrowed from Edward Fry and Robert Morris respectively. "Natural art", according to Roald Nasgaard, the curator who organized the exhibition and wrote the catalogue, finds the central experience of the work in the natural world, and "existence art" in "the strong sense of lived experience, of being in immediate time and released from the sense of the continuous narrative of history.

Although Serra's work is experienced in a spatial-temporal duration, it does not promote this experience as subjectivity. While it allows this experience, it presents itself as something external to subjective experience, and verifiable in its externality, that is, as something knowable as external through its constructions which in themselves can be known to have meaning. The work is irreducible both to a priori conceptualization and to a subjective experiential essence.

Rabinowitch's sculpture is the least "natural" of all the works in the exhibition. While a "natural art" (that of

Trakas and Morris) promotes continual presence - work grounded in durational movement and experience-Rabinowitch's sculpture posits a nonhierarchical chain of events, and the construction and deconstruction of vision through discontinuous judgements. And he achieves this through attention to the constituent elements of the sculpture which are abstract and literal and which both construct the work and determine and affirm the separate judgements that the observer can make.<sup>132</sup>

Any "critical" understanding of that "'old paradigm: subjectivity/objectivity'" as it is instantiated in relationships between the "artist" and sculptural practice, and, the "spectator" and their "actual physical and perceptual engagement with the sculpture" must resolve itself around the realization of the constitutive, "constructed" dialectic between mind and nature. It is precisely the non-dialectical, a-historical nature of the incipient "positivistic" and phenomenological assumptions of the productions of Robert Morris and George Trakas that Monk takes to task. These particular assumptions are a direct function of the artist's presumption of both an apriori, phenomenologically grounded concept of the "centered self", and an "apriori... idea of an object... [as an]... a coordinated whole". Both assumptions produce arguments and works of art that lead one to the uncritical conclusion that one is freed from the actual historical ground of experience.

Only through something constructed - as opposed to that given in nature - can we believe or understand the assertion or existence of the external and objective. A "spatial art", which does not permit these judgements to arise, traps the spectator in subjectivity, as we shall see. The ramifications of the denial of individual interaction with the objective and material conditions of reality are far-ranging; for instance, they deny the possibility of changing the conditions of reality, that is political action. Yet these artists fall back on the assumed radical charge of art to change consciousness.



Yet, although it is there in the world for us, the work does not come into being through our vision. The reverse happens: real art (that is, an art of the real) brings consciousness into being. This is a dialectical not metaphysical, process where cognition develops in interaction with the material.

Different judgements and constructions are made by the spectator in this work. Judgements made apart from the work's constructions, such as the notion of triangularity and the judged centre point, are rendered invalid and obviated by experience. Knowledge, then, is not given directly in experience - whether that experience is a present or a duration, but it cannot be known apart from experience; it cannot be a priori. Knowledge arises in the dialectical interaction of matter, structure and consciousness. At the same time it is not our consciousness that determines meaning - it interprets, or brings the work onto being for us, but the work still remains external to our perception. The work is constructed by the artist, but the experience is not totally determined. And the meaning that is constructed in the work is not the same as in nature, although we experience the work in the natural field of phenomenal existence. An art object in the world can be known to have meaning, whereas nature cannot. Our experience of the work is real, but do we call it a metaphor or a paradigm of cognition?<sup>133</sup>

Philip Monk cites, in his discussion of Rabinowitch's work, a quotation from Foucault's text The Order of Things insofar as he provides authorial, and argumentative support for Monk's own critique of phenomenological arguments.

Why engage in an anti-phenomenological enterprise, especially when phenomenological processes must be used to deconstruct themselves? Because of the limitations and questionability of phenomenology some of the problems of which Michel Foucault has outlined:

If there is one approach that I do reject, however, it is that (one might call it, broadly speaking, the phenomenological approach) which gives absolute priority to the observing subject, which attributes a constituent role to an act, which places its own point of view at the origin of all historicity - which, in short, leads to a transcendental consciousness.<sup>134</sup>

In Heather Dawkins 1986 article, "Paul Kane and the Eye of Power: Racism in Canadian Art History", we have a critical examination of

selected aspects of Paul Kane's work that is actually designed to critique the present institutional and ideological context of Canadian art history. A function of her experience as a participant in two succeeding conferences held in 1985, the "Feminism and Art Symposium" held in Toronto and the Conference of the University Art Association of Canada, her article argues that issues of racism and cultural imperialism could not be dealt with adequately, if at all, until the current institutional framework for the training of art historians and the methodological norms that underwrite that training are changed.

In what was, at times, a heated exchange, women artists, critics, and art historians argued various strategies of anti-racist work in the arts, especially concerning art history. Whether the call was for an art history of black artists along the lines of existing histories, or for an art history that sought to write a radically different art history and in doing so critique and undermine the existing conventions of the discourse, questions were being raised that were outside the usual limits of art history with its universalizing, ahistorical, conflict-free, and object-privileging assumptions. These were questions of the relation of art and art history to colonialism, to imperialism, to racism.<sup>135</sup>

Commencing her critique was a classic critical, comparative examination of Paul Kane's visual production to his written observations contained in his 1851 text, "Wandering of an Artist Among the Indians of North America", Dawkins argues that while he may talk of presenting Indians in their "original state", this goal is actually a function of an ongoing 18th and 19th European "imperialist expansion" that is masked by two typical methodological assumptions that underwrite Kane's project.

Much of this travel and exploration writing represents the native people in a kind of timeless suspension, even while the protagonist's adventure is narrated temporally. Kane's representations of beliefs, customs, and habits are

no exception and take two basic forms. One is the explanation of some otherwise inexplicable behaviour as the product of a ridiculous and superstitious belief. The other is the account of habits as they relate to mundane activities - how a fish was cooked or caught, how utensils or canoes were made, and so on. In these accounts the experiencing and perceiving author is completely suppressed, the information appears to have no social and historical condition of production, and the activity is often described in a suspended tense.

During the season the Chinooks are engaged in gathering camas and fishing, they live in lodges constructed by means of a few poles covered with mats made of rushes, which can be easily moved from place to place, but in the villages they build permanent huts of split cedar boards. Having selected a dry place for the hut, a hole is dug about three feet deep, and about twenty feet square. Around the sides square cedar boards are sunk and fastened together with cords and twisted roots, rising about four feet above the outer level: two posts are sunk at the middle of each end with a crotch at the top, on which the ridge pole is laid, and boards are laid from thence to the top of the upright boards fastened in the same manner. Round the interior are erected sleeping places, one above another, something like the berths in a vessel, but larger. In the centre of this lodge the fire is made, and the smoke escapes through a hole left in the roof for that purpose.

This passage is typical in the way that it describes an activity in which a human presence is minimalised: 'a hole is dug, boards are sunk, the ridge pole is laid'. The information is also stripped of its context of production, the wandering artist is scarcely visible: the language of information is self-effacing. Only rarely is Kane the object of curiosity and attention in this text.<sup>136</sup>

Noting that while it has been the explanatory norm of art historical research on Kane's work in portraiture to consider them as typical "romantic idealizations of Indian life", it would be more accurate to regard Kane's sketches and text as being representative of an "imperialist indictment of Indian culture" that operates from within a Victorian context of the fearful depiction of the "working class, the poor and the floating population".<sup>137</sup> The normative art historical methodologies simply fail to provide the necessary argumentative framework to get at the sort of reading that would place his work in a

wider social context. Consequently, this leads to a situation where the historian fails to understand the constitutive relation between sketch, text, and, its specific historical context, and thus, as in the case of Ramsey Cook, falls into the typical situation in Canadian art history where he describes, and praises Kane's sketches for their "ethnological accuracy and aesthetic appeal".

Clearly Paul Kane's work cannot be understood on a formal or biographical level without completely obscuring its part in an imperialist and racist discourse. The paintings and sketches have been the privileged objects of art historical attention, but this valorising of the visual fails to recognise the written text of which these were an integral part, and in which his work had its widest circulation.

Cook's reference to ethnological accuracy connotes scientific status for the art objects, but neglects to acknowledge that the emergence of ethnology itself depended on the manners and customs literature to which Kane contributed. Ramsay Cook's view, that the works made during the trip sketch life as it was really lived, is a notion that is consistently negotiated throughout the journal itself. The status of these sketches and likenesses as accurate is secured in the text by the representation of an Indian's awe for the likeness, and consequently the attribution of magical properties either to the likeness (the second self) or to Kane. The gap between the referent (which is, after all, only known through its representation) and the representation is closed via the subject's own excessive verification. Truth, accuracy, realism: all are thus produced in the written text for the visual.<sup>138</sup>

Foucault's work is cited, and deployed extensively, when Heather Dawkins remarks that the "archive" that is represented by Kane's visual and written production forms neither a "document" nor a subjective perception of Indian culture in as much as they are "implicated in, and constitutive of power". His work can be better understood against the historical background of the shift in power relations that commenced during the early 18th century when "monarchic power" gave way to a

highly decentralized, rationalized form of instantiated power relations within the discursive and institutional practices of "surveillance, discipline and the production of knowledge". A process, that, as Dawkins paraphrases Foucault's arguments, develops and functions at the "local" level of manipulatory control insofar as it proceeds according to the emergence of the types of "local urgencies and conditions". Kane provides a prime example where, at his level, "technologies of observation, classification", and "investigation" are brought productively to bear upon Indian Culture.<sup>139</sup>

The critical heart of Dawkin's article resides in a methodologically typical observation concerning the nature, and goals of her critical history of Paul Kane's work.

To write this history does not retrieve a nineteenth century other, but it refuses the benevolence customarily accorded to Kane's work in Canadian art history.

Refusing that benevolence and analyzing the relations of power and knowledge in Kane's project is but one aspect of the area of enquiry and activism demanded by women at the Feminism and Art Symposium. That work, of changing social relations and changing knowledges, is crucial to the disruption and transformation of the concepts and the languages of racism in this culture. As the symposium recognised, such questions should not be seen as a healthy alternative that merely revitalizes art history. Rather, they are of central importance in art history as a political practice, as part of the transformation of knowledge and behaviours that is cultural politics.<sup>140</sup>

Lesley Johnstone, in her 1988 Vanguard article, "Allegories of Abandonment: Martha Fleming and Lyne Lapointe", argues that these artist's three installations provides a cumulative "critical interrogation" of those ideological and institutional practices that have set about to construct, from the vantage point of dominance, groups of socially "marginalized individuals... women, lesbians, the insane,

criminals, artists". Each project has been situated within specific architectural locations that, as "ideologically charged architectures", both reflect, and, are a function of the particular cultural/political fabric of issues that are representative of the communities in which they are located and of the given "socio-economic conditions" that actually foster the production of these "disenfranchised communities".<sup>141</sup> Moreover, these artists decision to work from selected site-specific locations is not determined by any desire to find some sort of quasi exhibition space, insofar as they critically reject the normative exhibition practices of supposedly "autonomous" museums.

Ultimately, both in form and methodology, all three projects represent a rejection of authority. As feminists and lesbians, the artists are searching for alternatives to the patriarchal construction of society and their art reflects this quest. As collaborations, the projects undermine the idea of the individual creative genius; a position which corresponds to their conception of the involvement of the audience. As inhabitations of abandoned buildings they reject the authority of established art structures based on a valorization of the autonomous art object. And, finally, each project involves a critical examination of systems which control and determine the lives of its subjects; systems which necessarily reflect a position of authority.

However, there is a progression within the three projects in their articulation of this 'rejection'. Three fragments of a single, artistic, and feminist enterprise, *La Donna*, *Le Musee*, and *Project Building* must be perceived as three distinct reflections on an interrelated series of social, artistic, and historical conditions.

The myth of the 'culture-hero', the role architecture plays in the isolation of individuals from society, and the relationship between a specific community and society at large in *Project Building* were central to each of the subsequent projects. Its form, and the structure of the artists' interventions are closely related to *La Donna*.<sup>142</sup>

Johnstone argues that their 1984 project, "*Le Musee des Sciences*", was a more significant and "didactic" because it created a specific situation in which the "viewing public" could form a "deconstruction" of

the "apparent objectivity of science and medicine as it has been applied to the lives of women". Critically "parodying" the "history of science", their project allowed the "subject/author/viewer" as a constructive participants, to determine the nature of the "vested interests of the enlightenment split between art and science".<sup>143</sup> This collaborative "deconstruction" is grounded upon a set of "allegorical procedures" that allow for the disruption of the ideologically masked unity of the "sign". The "viewer", as they negotiate the installation complete the project because they are the "subject", not the "object" of the piece. As such they develop their own "readings" of the "dialectical juxtaposition of extracted "fragments" of the "dominant codes".

In *Le Musee des Sciences*, two anatomical drawings of women appropriated from old medical textbooks are anamorphically transferred onto the floor - the distorted images are then 'corrected' in a vertical cylindrical mirror. The juxtaposition of the images initially alludes to the scientific representation of the female body as an amalgamation of parts as opposed to the implicitly unified whole of the male body. Lapointe and Fleming's appropriation, distortion, and then correction of the scientific images by a sophisticated artistic device also declares their methodology. Through a collage of scientific, medical, and artistic facts presented in a museum-parody, the artists record some of the distortions practiced historically (particularly on women) and then reflect them in a revised perspective. The device is thus employed both on a formal as well as allegorical level.

Anamorphoses are in fact described as analogical equivalents to allegorical devices in literature. The discordant interrelation of the signifier and the signified finds a functional analogy in the deviation of direct significance required by the lateral vision in the perception of anamorphosis:

Allegories-anamorphoses, anamorphoses-allegories, les deux demarches opposees d'un meme raisonnement se heurtent et refluent.

[Allegories-anamorphoses, anamorphoses-allegories, two opposing devices which within a single rationality collide

and surge.]

Benjamin Buchloh, grounding himself in the writing of Walter Benjamin, described allegorical procedures as the 'appropriation and depletion of meaning, fragmentation and dialectical juxtaposition of fragments, and separation of signifier and signified'. Lapointe and Fleming's construction of meaning through a montage of fragments from various discourses of power clearly locates the work within this context. As a formal negation of the possibility of unified totality and a declaration that only incomplete and fragmentary visions are possible, anamorphoses are particularly appropriate.<sup>144</sup>

Finally, Johnstone deploys, from Foucault's text "The Subject and Power",<sup>145</sup> the explanatory concept of the "mode of objectification" that describes various institutional, and discursive practices, that objectify humans to compliment her explanatory use of Buchloh's "allegorical procedures". These modes provide a set of explanatory concepts that allow her to outline the progressive critical levels through which each installation develops insofar as each project demonstrates and examines a specific "mode of objectivation".

Michel Foucault's categorization of the modes by which human beings are made subjects provides a means of differentiating the strategies employed in each of the three projects. The first "mode of objectification", called "dividing practices", involved the imposed isolation, confinement, and normalization of individuals: it may be applied to all three projects. The second, "scientific classification", refers more specifically to Le Musee while La Donna represents the third and most complex mode, "subjectification", or "the way the human being turns him- or herself into a subject". The sense of progression felt within the three projects may, to a certain degree, be attributed to the way the artists explore each mode.<sup>146</sup>

At this point, I would like to return to Walter Klepac's article because it contains a number of features that are also common to the work of the other 14 writers, and, certain problematics concerning use of portions of Foucault's work. This will help to bring out the nature of particular types of usages of his work that are common to the work of



the other 10 writers, as well as the 4 writer's work just discussed. Firstly, I suppose that if there is one common adversary that these writers might agree upon, then it is modernity, at least in its post-war Greenbergian, positivist, and expressionist forms.

A good deal of this reluctance can be traced to the tendency within modernism to define art as an essentially self-reflexive concept or mode of discourse. That is to say, modernism was above all primarily concerned with the need to distinguish art from other forms of discourse and the "work of art" from ordinary "things". In his updating of modernism, Clement Greenberg insisted on interpreting the radical formal developments from Cezanne and Cubism onwards in terms of attempting to purify art of all elements or references that were extraneous to that which was essential to a work's being art.

... Dan Graham, "decenter" the art object and expand the field of reference of sculpture. As a result, the long standing assumption about the physical integrity (internal unity) and discreteness, the fundamental independence and autonomy of the work of art are all called into question.

Another point of general agreement among postmodernists is the view that the developments in sculpture and installation art from Serra and Smithson to Acconci and Oppenheim to Graham and Asher is, in effect, a direct assault on the supposed late modernist view that advanced contemporary art has to be medium-oriented.<sup>147</sup>

In Philip Fry's 1980 article "Robin Collyer: Event, Description, Narrative", he argues that he wishes to avoid "falling into the modernist trap". Therefore one must "search for established relationships, not only among works of specific types showing the connections between say, a painting and other paintings... but also between... certain paintings and photographs or works of visual art and literature".<sup>148</sup> In my interview with Fry he stressed the importance of Foucault's work in teaching early structuralism how to resituate semiological/structural analysis.

We were stuck in first generation structuralism - a

plodding, mechanical type. We had to find a way of carrying on with a rational investigation of sign - systems, but be able to do it in such a way that we would seat it somewhere other than for example in the problematics of the double articulation. Then Foucault comes out with a way of reading different disciplines and their manner of functioning and the text.

The Archaeology of Knowledge", it was something that fit because it helped me to assess one of the main problematics for me - the problem of space - why spaces have values. I was more and more convinced that objects and space relate to each other - they generate their own shapes in regard to each other.<sup>149</sup>

For Lesley Johnstone, we have, in relation to how Lyne Lapointe and Martha Fleming perceive their production, a rejection of "the authority of established art structures based on a valorization of the autonomous art object" that, "to be perceived", must belong to the cultural life of the "viewer/author/subject." Philip Monk severely critiques George Trakas' "subject" who "once again becomes centered in himself",<sup>150</sup> or, in the case of Roald Nasgaard, his argument that "natural" or "existence art" releases the "subject" into the "immediate time... and from the sense of the continuous narrative of history". Finally we have Heather Dawkins critique of art history's "universalizing, a historical, conflict free and object-privileging assumptions".

Another feature is the various versions of the "subject = x", which, in the case of Walter Klepac's article appears as the "strictly disinterested, fully conscious, critical-minded observer"<sup>151</sup> in his neo-Kantian, or, more accurately, neo-Cartesian version of a Kantian response to Greenberg's aesthetics. In Heather Dawkin's case "x" is her own critical self-consciousness insofar as she wishes to critique Canadian art history from the present of her own experience as a

feminist art historian in Canada. She does not want "to retrieve a 19th century other, but... refuses the benevolence customarily accorded to Kane's work", in as much as she does not wish to preserve the "a historical" autonomy of Canadian art history. Rather, her critique, or, more correctly, critical history, is an inherently "political" one that functions conditionally within the horizon of her own discipline. Dawkins in response to my question concerning her use of the concept "archive" and how she understood to term "historiography", pointed to the importance of Foucault's work.

The use of the concept of "archive" functions somewhere between Foucault, Spivak, and my own concepts. In terms of Spivak's usage one looks at archives in terms of power formations - the way that power can form an archive. Spivak's concepts on power and the archive come partly from Foucault. She talks about the conditions of power that would allow women to occasionally appear in archives."

By historiography I mean Foucault's, and the Marxist tradition of historiography. Also women's history though this is not highly developed by me yet.<sup>152</sup>

With Philip Monk there is his positive recognition of the efforts of Serra and Rabinowitch given that "their demand for judgment is not positivistic; it allows the subjective but only insofar as the subjective determines our structures of judgment in relation to the external world".<sup>153</sup> In Lesley Johnstone's article we read of the collaborative efforts of the two artists to implicate specific audiences: "... the spectator's... participation, in the allegorical work, the reader, or viewer is the subject - her or his role in the construction of meaning completes the piece",<sup>154</sup> and with Philip Fry we have his critique of his own curatorial role.

Finally, there is "structuralism", that curious and problematic feature that presents an issue where the difficulties of locating

Foucault's critical historiography become acute. In Klepac's case, there is his stunning claim that Michael Snow's "Rameau's Nephew functions... is a heuristic... critical way rather than in the 'archaeological' or purely structural approaches advocated by.. postmodernists". Klepac argues, concerning structuralism, that it is grounded methodologically upon "precedents of modern linguistics and recent literary theory which "employs the written and printed word for it's model of language".

It would have been more prudent if Klepac had made an initial distinction between "linguistic", "psychological", and, critical structuralism. While Klepac's inclusion of Foucault's archaeological analysis within the context of structuralism is, with reference to the issues of philosophical structuralism and discursivity, correct, the concept of structural conditions can hardly be identified exclusively with "precedents in modern linguistics and recent literary theory". The concept of conditions need not only prioritize discursivity insofar as history, for example, can play an associative role: for as Heather Dawkins argues".

History indicates that what is now, was once very different and the assumption of a common experience glosses over a multitude of possible differences in women's experiences, both historical and contemporaneous. In addition, this way of discussing representations, an evaluation based on our own subjective identification with the picture, fails to acknowledge that what is being examined is not a woman or a person but a representation; not a subjectivity but a sign.

This written and photographic archive represents what is conventionally suppressed and invisible both in the politics of visibility within the bourgeois household and in the representations of the bourgeois family of the 19th century. The representations go beyond Hannah Cullwick in the sense that they are in part the product of changes in

certain social relations of representation... I refer to the newly affordable photographic practices... but they are also the product of the social relations of which Hannah Cullwick is a locus... conditions of existence, that is, social relations and other representations which make... existence possible.<sup>155</sup>

Unlike Klepac, Foucault's work played an ongoing role in Philip Fry's writings from early on in his career. Having said this, Fry's version of archaeology is just as problematic when it comes to the question of structuralism. There is a common bond between Fry, and Foucault, over their critique of the "discrete" autonomy of the "author", or the "work", given Fry's acceptance of a conditional, structural analysis of these theoretical entities, there are also major differences. While Heather Dawkins, who is closer to Foucault's work because she develops a critical historical analysis that examines broad sets of "social relations" that include discursive, institutional, and psycho-social factors, Fry restricts his analysis to a linguistically grounded structural investigation that attempts to relate medium to medium, object to object, and "producer" to "production". It is not so much that his judicious extension of elements of structural semantics actually attempts to read the work of art as if it were literally a sentence, it is rather that he transfers both the concept of structure and sets of explanatory and descriptive concepts from structural semantics to his work on the visual arts. This allows him for example in the case of Robin Collyer's works, "Work Expands..." and "New Belief Systems", to extend concepts from both Saussure's and Jakobson's work when discussing these two pieces.

The spatial structure of Work Expands... is generated by the interaction of its literal and pictorial planes. Among the factors involved are the transitive use of the

photographic medium, the reflexive value of some aspects of the subject matter, and the mixed status of the work which arises from the use and placement of text in relationship to image.

If, in this context, the literal plane of the work corresponds quite well to Saussure's "signifies", that is, the material, perceptible, face of the sign-object, the pictorial plane constitutes only one component of the "signified", the mental or semantic world generated through the use of the signifier. As well as exercising an iconic function, by which the pictorial plane is produced through visual analogy, the sign-object also functions as an index of production and relies to some extent on symbolic conventions.

The temporal structure of New Belief Systems is the product of an interplay between the literal, present state of affairs observed by the viewer and the statement of its possible future transformation made in the text. In the literal "now" of the viewer, the scientific, represented by the fan turning the windmill, is actually in disjunction with belief, represented by the cross turned by its own motor. The fictitious causal connection between the movements is subsumed and displaced to the domain of future possibility as the "new system". The agents of change, those charged with effecting the transformation, are identified as an inclusive "we": the astronaut, the artist, and the viewer each having a distinct subjective position, are assigned roles in a program through which a fiction can become reality. But there is no indication that these roles are being played. They remain potential, the causal linkage, the "building" of the "new system", has not been completed. Can we treat this programmatic arrangement of subject matter as a particular type of narrative or would it not be better understood as an example of what Jakobson calls connative expression?<sup>156</sup>

Again, there is a common linkage historically between Foucault, and Fry, over the centrality of discursivity to their respective critical theories. There is though one major difference given Foucault's historical understanding of linguistic competency.

It is quite common to find selected aspects of Foucault's work being used strategically in articles that will also draw upon other sets of conditional and/or discursive components that may at one general

archival-conceptual level of discourse have something in common with his work, but which, at a more narrowed level of discourse have little to do with Foucault's proposals. Lesley Johnstone uses Foucault's discursive, and institutional concept of the "mode of objectification", in conjunction with Benjamin Buchloch's "allegorical procedures" to account for different aspects of the installations. In Philip Monk's article, "Structures for Behavior", we have a selected quotation from Foucault's The Order of Things that is used to underwrite Monk's own "anti-phenomenological" arguments. Here, the common point of attack between these two writers is their critique of the problematic nature of a transhistorical subject. While the common conditional components of their arguments are the prioritizing of history and discursivity. In Monk's case we find marxist history joined to Derrida's discursively grounded critique of the ontology of presence. Both Marxist history, and Derrida's theory of discursivity, have little to do with Foucault's own arguments, though a great deal to do with the conditionality of experience.

My specific use of his work was minor and it fitted within a much broader context of interests.

I was interested in some of his comments on phenomenology - his anti-phenomenological stance. I was interested in it in relation to Adorno's work on phenomenology in relation to Derrida's project. It would have been one thing from Foucault reinforcing something from another author that I wanted to apply in a very specific way in an art critical context.<sup>157</sup>

What is interesting concerning Monk's quotation is that it does not necessarily have to reflect an extensive background of reading and research on Foucault's work. Once an individual becomes familiar with a particular form of critical discourse then it is fairly easy to single

out segments of Foucault's work like the "mode of objectivation", the "archive", or his critique of phenomenology, and build them into argumentative positions that, at one level agree with Foucault's own work, but at another more general level are in opposition to positions that he has taken over the years.

There is though another perspective from which we can understand Monk's citation of Foucault's work, insofar as we have only considered his writing from the position of the theoretical, and argumentative aspects of given critical discourses. Monk, like all the other writers, emerged out of the university system in Canada. As we are all familiar, the use of selected quotations to bolster arguments is a typical practice of academic writing where the citation of sources, and the use of supportive material like direct quotes is an accepted methodological and argumentative component of the writing of research papers. Therefore Monk's quotation from, and citation of Foucault's work, actually has as much to do with the academic practice of writing as it does with the research activity that is represented by Foucault's own critical writing. A more simplified example of this citation procedure is the situation where only the author's name, and specific text is cited. A typical example is Scott Watson's reply, titled "From Scott Watson", to Rob Linsley in a 1984 example of "Issue" magazine.

What is different is that in the mass media treatment of these topics the subject is always mediated. That is it is always contained in therapy, "counselling", psychology and psychiatry on the one hand and fantasy and false morality on the other (i.e. "And what do you think of homosexuality, Mrs. Jones?"). I would refer to Michel Foucault's History of Sexuality and Deleuze and Guattari's Anti-Oedipus for a full discussion of the supposed openness and seeming lack of restraint and freedom our society has arrived at in discussing sexual matters.<sup>158</sup>



This of course merely reflects the deeper institutional-discursive practice of reasoned argumentation where one draws upon, critiques, rereads, reworks sections from other discourses as one constructs arguments. My point here is not a critical one insofar as I am not saying that because of the academic nature of this quotation, then this citation no longer functions critically. It would be more accurate to argue that writing on the visual arts is formed and determined by various institutional, and discursive practices. If one examines a great deal of the usages of Foucault's work in the production of the 30 writers, I would argue that this would provide another historical factor for the appearance of Foucault's work in the writing on the visual arts in Canada. In regards to the more marginal, cursory usages there is an additional reason for their presence. During my interviews I inquired about the extent of each writer's knowledge of both the historical context of Foucault's work and the internal development over the years of that production. All the writers, with a few exceptions, responded that they were not that familiar with either aspect.

Although both Lesley Johnstone and Philip Monk demonstrate common affinities in their usage of Foucault's work, there is one major difference between them. When one examines all of Johnstone's production one finds no overall corresponding theoretical approach in her work that would account for her usage of Foucault's work other than the fact that her production, and Foucault's both can be considered as representative of different forms of modernism. What is clear is that in her article on Lyne Lapointe, and Martha Fleming, her usage of Foucault's work is largely a function of the critical activity of these

two artists. When I asked Johnstone about her methodology when she prepares to write on a given work, or set of works, she responded that her preparatory "reading is directed by specific interests in particular works" and that she had "no strong overriding theoretical interests", inasmuch as she has a "strong interest in locating the work, or artist within the context of their production and history of their practice—mainly formal analysis".<sup>159</sup> In the case of Philip Monk, when one examines large portions of his production one finds a fairly consistent approach in his writing on the visual arts that does reflect an ongoing deployment of different critical, and theoretical positions that form more narrowed common points with Foucault's work. Consequently, these two different criteria for the presence of Foucault's work in the production of the two writers leads to two other factors for the presence of his work in Canadian writing. On the one hand there is the willingness of some writers to deploy certain theoretical and methodological stances that form some common linkages with Foucault's work throughout their production. While on the other hand, some writer's criteria for the usage of Foucault's work is determined by the perceived nature of the work(s) of art under critical examination. In actuality though it is difficult to draw a hard and fast line between the two criteria given that in a large number of cases a particular usage of Foucault's production is always tied to some aspect of the artwork under discussion. There are also examples of usage that fall exactly in the middle of these two criteria. In William Wood's 1988 catalogue essay, "The Difference of Times", he draws a direct relation between Roy Arden's critical usage of historical photographic

documentation, and Foucault's arguments concerning his concept of the "archive".

The analysis of the archive, then, involves a privileged region: at once close to us, and different from our present existence, it is the border of time that surrounds our presence, which overhangs it, and which indicates it in its otherness; it is that which outside ourselves, delimits us. The description of the archive deploys its possibilities (and the mastery of its possibilities) on the basis of the very discourses that have just ceased to be ours... In this sense, the diagnosis does not establish the fact of our identity by the play of distinctions. It establishes that we are difference, that our reason is the difference of discourses, our history the difference of times, our selves the difference of masks. That difference, far from being the forgotten and recovered origin, is this dispersion that we are and make.

Here Michel Foucault redefines the term archive; from a collection of public records and documents he extends its regime to encompass "the general system of the formation and transformation of statements".<sup>1</sup> His philological elegance disrupts the archive, making it become active as a series of traces still to be acknowledged and followed, changing its function from representing the backward-looking embodiment of power's actions to becoming a participant in the power relations of the present. To that extent, this passage describes the practical conditions of the archival works of Roy Arden - they issue from archival records and constitute reformations of historical imagery with attention to the relations that form and contain the potential to transform imagery. Each of Foucault's adumbrations leads to Arden's series.<sup>160</sup>

Conclusion: "... the limits to human agency"

My sexual politics, or my series of resistances, or my historical practices around resistances are very definitely formed in relation to Foucault.

Heather Dawkins, interview, 1991.

I was looking for a community where people believed what they said seriously enough for it to change their lives. There was something about their model of life - the way an artist does, or the way a poet does - of integrity. I just didn't see it in the people that were teaching philosophy and art history at school. Foucault's work is to engage - he follows in that existentialist model of J.-P. Sartre - the political French intellectual. This was something that I did not have at university. This being the role model of the integrated intellectual.

Russell Keziere, interview, 1991.

While 12 of the 14 writers entered the public context of writing from the late 1970's onward, and the remaining two at the beginning of the 1970's, it is clear that all of them did so at a time when the art world saw an unprecedented expansion of its institutional venues. Running parallel with these developments was a burgeoning academic environment of the university system from which, with the exception of Walter Klepac and Philip Fry, these writers had emerged. It is within this system that a number of them first encountered difficulties surrounding the types of interests that each was developing. Heather Dawkins, in her interview, spoke of "my resistances", while in her article on Paul Kane, she pointed to the relation between the correlative issues of "power", "sexual politics", gender, and an art historical practice that is both exclusive, and exclusionary. This "a historical" methodological exclusiveness, which in not acknowledging the political nature of its sense of autonomy, establishes a set of argumentative grounds that excludes issues of cultural imperialism, sexism, and racism that play out their unrecognized roles within art history. Foucault's production forms a significant part of Dawkin's critical feminim; a program that plays different roles in the work of Cheryl Simon, Carol Williams, Lesley Johnstone, James Patten, and Marnie Fleming, and which supplies another major historical factor for the presence of Foucault's writing, however marginal at times the usages of that work may be, in writing on the visual arts. As Irene Diamond and Lee Quinby argued concerning the relationship between an "analysis" that "exposes the effects of normalizing power" and the development of "possible paths of resistance" 161

Feminist analysis clearly illuminates the seeming ubiquitousness of masculinist power over women. Foucaultian analysis exposes the effects of normalizing power in the production of human subjects. Both are necessary for a fuller understanding of power and possible paths of resistance. Another mutually, corrective tension resides in the space between feminism's tendency towards utopianism and essentialism (through claims for a higher truth derived from women's experience) and Foucault's scepticism about emancipatory politics and inclination towards relativism. We would suggest that within these tensions one finds the potential for an ethics of activism that is particularly appropriate for challenging the Faustian impulses of the contemporary era: one that fosters a mode of empowerment that is at the same time infused with an awareness of the limits to human agency.<sup>162</sup>

The problematics of the educational context may also be extended to include the work of Marnie Fleming, Russell Keziere, Robert Graham, Philip Monk, James Patten, Carol Williams, and Bruce Grenville insofar as at some point, and in some form, each had encountered an exclusionary studio, or art historical discourse. James Patten used the term "liberating" to describe his first reaction to reading Foucault inasmuch as it made him realize that there were alternative ways of thinking, and writing about art history, other than those presented at the University of Toronto. As for Philip Fry, Scott Watson, and William Wood, it is true that they did not experience, or, in the case of Watson and Wood, express during their interviews any negative reactions to their time in university. Having said this though, it is also the case that each, at some point, were receptive to using Foucault's work. Scott Watson turned, during the early 1980's, to politically informed critical theories both as a reaction to the connoisseurship practices that backgrounded his first, early writing, and out of a desire to invest his work with a more politically constituted practice of writing. On the other hand, Philip Fry stated that from 1964 on "my issue always has

been... the limits of rational thought and function of poetic expression". These issues being directly tied to his conflict with "ecclesiastical authority" when he was a priest.

I ran into the problem of ecclesiastical authority directly head on, as being the official interpretation of a certain kind of work, that work is poetic in my mind - it led me to believe that biblical texts are poetical texts.<sup>163</sup>

While Diamond and Quinby do not explicitly link the issues of "power" and "resistance" to the critical "awareness of the limits to human agency", this linkage is central to the history of critical modernism. Both Bacon and Descartes had constructed critical programs precisely upon the awareness of the finite, or "fitting limit of endless deception". Human cognitive, ethical, and political activity would only be comprehensible when the problematics of the inherent limitations of that activity were recognized and addressed. Once recognized though these same limitations would perhaps be able to provide the grounds for the reform of ethical and political activity through the critical awareness of their conditional limitations. Kant attempted to spell out the consequences of ignoring the conditionality of human experience in his Critique of Pure Reason, where he warned future readers against taking the fatal step of treating the "ideas" of [pure] reason as if they transcendentally referred to real entities. For Nietzsche, Foucault, and later critical feminists, "resistance" formed itself around the realization concerning the consequent loss of freedom when humans suffer the tyranny of reified concepts as they normatively regulate our lives. Foucault's production, in conjunction with the work of many other individuals whose writings appeared during the late 1960's, and 1970's, helped to provide argumentative frameworks whereby each writer could

begin to transform their particular sense of exclusion. With a critical "awareness of the limits to human agency", each, in relation to their respective socio-institutional location, could autonomize their interests from the determining conditions of the exclusionary discourses that each encountered. Possessing this possibility, each could insert themselves, as "integrated intellectuals", within chosen institutional settings.

This issue of alternative arguments though only provides a portion of the explanation for the emergence of Foucault's work into writing on the visual arts. For virtually at the same time as the translations of French, and German material began to appear as of the middle, to late 1960's, there occurs the corresponding expansion of these institutional settings.<sup>164</sup> Consequently, when each writer left school there was either already in place, or in the process of being developed, a number of alternative, or revised institutional venues.



## Endnotes

<sup>1</sup>Michel Foucault, "The Discourse of History", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-84), ed. Sylvere Lotringer (New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1984), p. 30.

<sup>2</sup>While this thesis is not examining the work of the francophone writer Thierry de Duve it must be pointed out that he is the most prominent Foucaultian of the entire group of 40 writers.

<sup>3</sup>For, instance, Fry taught at the Université d'Ottawa from the early 1970's to the present. Along with Laurentian University, both schools are the only officially bilingual universities in Canada.

<sup>4</sup>Robert B. Pippin, Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfaction of Self-Consciousness (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 67.

<sup>5</sup>Roger Scruton, From Descartes to Wittgenstein (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 1981), 33.

<sup>6</sup>Michael Baxandall, Giotto and the Orators (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971), 90.

<sup>7</sup>Allan Megill, Prophets of Extremity: Nietzsche, Heidegger, Foucault, Derrida (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), 2.

<sup>8</sup>Michel Foucault, "Critical Theory/Intellectual History", Michel Foucault: Politics, Philosophy, Culture, Interviews and Other Writings 1977-1984, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman (London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, Inc., 1988), 21.

<sup>9</sup>Ibid., 22.

<sup>10</sup>Ibid., 23.

<sup>11</sup>Gary Gutting, Michel Foucault's Archaeology of Scientific Reason (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 9.

<sup>12</sup>Alan Sheridan, cited in Michel Foucault: The Will to Truth (London: Tavistock Publications, 1980), 12.

<sup>13</sup>Michel Foucault and Ludwig Binswanger, Dream & Existence Ed. Keith Hoeller (Seattle: Review of Existential Psychology & Psychiatry, 1986), 10.

<sup>14</sup>Michel Foucault, "Critical Theory/Intellectual History", 29.

<sup>15</sup>Colin Gordon, "Question, Ethos, Event: Foucault on Kant and Enlightenment", Economy and Society Vol. 15, No. 1 (Feb. 1986), 72.

<sup>16</sup>Michelle Perrot, "Questions of Method: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Ideology and Consciousness, No. 8 (1981), 4.

<sup>17</sup>Gary Gutting, Michel Foucault's Archaeology of Scientific Reason, 52.

<sup>18</sup>Dominique Lecourt, Marxism and Epistemology: Bachelard, Canguilhem and Foucault, 120. Trans, Ben Brewster (London: NLB, 1975), 120.

<sup>19</sup>Mary Tiles, Bachelard: Science and Objectivity (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 28.

<sup>20</sup>Richard Foster Jones, Ancients and Moderns: A Study of the Scientific Movement in the Seventeenth Century (St. Louis: Washington University Press, 1961), 52.

<sup>21</sup>Mary Tiles, Bachelard: Science and Objectivity, 29.

<sup>22</sup>Robert B. Pippin, Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfactions of Self-Consciousness, 67.

<sup>23</sup>Mary Tiles, Bachelard: Science and Objectivity, 34.

<sup>24</sup>Robert B. Pippin, Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfactions of Self-Consciousness, 62.

<sup>25</sup>Richard Foster Jones, cited in Ancients and Moderns: A Study of the Scientific Movement in the Seventeenth Century, 76.

<sup>26</sup>Richard Foster Jones, cited in "The Background of the Battle of the Books", The Seventeenth Century, ed. Richard Foster Jones (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1951), 26-27.

<sup>27</sup>Matai Calinescu, Faces of Modernity: Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977), 29.

<sup>28</sup>Ibid., 24.

<sup>29</sup>Charles Whitney, cited in Francis Bacon and Modernity (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 93.

<sup>30</sup>Richard Foster Jones, cited in "Science and Criticism in the Neo-Classical Age of English Literature", The Seventeenth Century, ed. Richard Foster Jones (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1951), 51.

<sup>31</sup>Matai Calinescu, Faces of Modernity: Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch, 29-30.

<sup>32</sup>Jurgen Habermas, The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity: Twelve Lectures (Cambridge Mass.: MIT Press, 1987), 8.

<sup>33</sup>Lawrence Lipking, The Ordering of the Arts in Eighteenth-Century England (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1970), 24-25.

<sup>34</sup>There is, as Johanne Lamoureux pointed out to me, something peculiar about Lipking's criticism of Junius' lack of the use of engravings of antique paintings. The peculiarity resides in the fact that there was no remaining examples of this painting in existence at the time, something that Lipking fails to mention or discuss.

<sup>35</sup>Lawrence Lipking, The Ordering of the Arts in Eighteenth-Century England, 30, 32.

<sup>36</sup>Hans Aarsleff, cited in "Leibniz and Locke on Language", From Locke to Saussure, ed. Hans Aarsleff (London: Athlone Press Ltd., 1982), 44.

<sup>37</sup>Cited in Charles Whitney, Francis Bacon and Whitney, 102.

<sup>38</sup>David Summers, cited in Michelangelo and the Language of Art (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981), 105.

<sup>39</sup>Michael Baxandall, Giatto and the Orators, 90.

<sup>40</sup>Cited in Gerard Le Coat, The Rhetoric of the Arts, 1550-1650 (Bern, Switzerland: Herbert Lang & Co. Ltd., 1975), 32.

<sup>41</sup>Cited in Hans Aarsleff, "Leibniz and Locke on Language", 54.

<sup>42</sup>Cited in Hans Aarsleff, "Leibniz and Locke on Language", 49.

<sup>43</sup>Arsenij Gulyga, Immanuel Kant: His Life and Thought (Boston: Birkhauser Boston Inc., 1987) 72.

<sup>44</sup>Cited in Gulyga Arsenij, Immanuel Kant: His Life and Thought, 87.

<sup>45</sup>James Miller, cited in Rousseau: Dreamer of Democracy (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984) 120.

<sup>46</sup>Michael Gillespie, cited in Hegel, Heidegger and the Ground of History (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), 30-31.

<sup>47</sup>Henry E. Allison, Kant's Transcendental Idealism: An Interpretation and Defense, 35, 322.

<sup>48</sup>Immanuel Kant, Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics. Trans. L.W. Beck (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Co. Inc., 1957), 149-150.

<sup>49</sup>Hilary Putman, Reason, Truth and History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 70.

<sup>50</sup>*Ibid.*, 74.

<sup>51</sup>Dominique Lecourt, cited in Marxism and Epistemology: Bachelard, Canguilhem and Foucault, 80.

<sup>52</sup>Michel Foucault, The Archaeology of Knowledge (Bristol: Tavinstock Publication Ltd., 1982), 116.

<sup>53</sup>Ibid., 127.

<sup>54</sup>Ibid., 130.

<sup>55</sup>Michel Foucault, The Order of Things, 242-243.

<sup>56</sup>Immanuel Kant, "An Old Question Raised Again: Is the Human Race Constantly Progressing", Kant on History, ed. Lewis W. Beck (New York: Bobbs-Merrill Educational Publishing, 1963), 137.

<sup>57</sup>Michel Foucault, The Order of Things, 232.

<sup>58</sup>Immanuel Kant, Critique of Judgement Trans. T.H. Bernard (New York: Hafner Press, 1951), 64.

<sup>59</sup>Martin Jay, Marxism & Totality (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984), 48.

<sup>60</sup>Dieter Henrich, "Beauty and Freedom: Schillers Struggle with Kant's Aesthetics", Essays in Kant's Aesthetics, eds. Ted Cohen & Paul Guyer 237-257, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 44.

<sup>61</sup>Freidrich Schiller, On the Aesthetic Education of Man in a Series of Letters (New York: Ungar, 1966), 74.

<sup>62</sup>Ibid., 64.

<sup>63</sup>Jack Forstman, A Romantic Triangle: Schleiermacher and Early German Romanticism (Missoula, Montana: University of Montana, 1977), 96.

<sup>64</sup>Alexander Nehamas, Nietzsche: Life & Literature (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1985), 130.

<sup>65</sup>Richard Schacht, Nietzsche (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983), 56.

<sup>66</sup>Martin Jay, Marxism and Totality, 47.

<sup>67</sup>Allan Megill, Prophets of Extremity: Nietzsche, Heidegger, Foucault, Derrida, 2.

<sup>68</sup>Manfred Frank, What is Neostructuralism? (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984), 7.

<sup>69</sup>Charles Taylor, Hegel (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975), 15.

<sup>70</sup>Alexander Nehamas, Nietzsche: Life and Literature, 26.

<sup>71</sup>Richard Schacht, Nietzsche, 9.

<sup>72</sup>Friedrich Nietzsche, On the Genealogy of Morals, Trans. Walter Kaufman (New York: Vintage Press, 1966), 5.

<sup>73</sup>Alexander Nehamas, Nietzsche: Life and Literature, 70.

<sup>74</sup>Michel Foucault, "Nietzsche, Genealogy, History", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 139-164, (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986), 152.

<sup>75</sup>Michel Foucault, "The Concern for Truth", Michel Foucault: Politics, Philosophy, Culture, Interviews and Other Writings 1977-1984, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman (London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, Inc., 1988), 269.

<sup>76</sup>Richard Schacht, Nietzsche, 15.

<sup>77</sup>Michel Foucault, The British of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception, Trans. A. Sheridan Smith (New York: Vintage/Random House, 1980), xv-xvi.

<sup>78</sup>Michel Foucault, The Order of Things, 300.

<sup>79</sup>John Rajchman, Michel Foucault: The Freedom of Philosophy, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1985), 11.

<sup>80</sup>Tracy B. Strong, Friedrich Nietzsche and the Politics of Transfiguration, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 32.

<sup>81</sup>Michel Foucault, The Birth of the Clinic, xix.

<sup>82</sup>Michel Foucault, L'ordre du discours, (Paris: Editions Gallimard, 1971), 73.

<sup>83</sup>Michel Foucault, "History, Discourse and Discontinuity", Trans. Anthony Nazzaro, Salmagundi Vol. 20 (Summer-Fall 1972), 225-248, 217-218, 219.

<sup>84</sup>Gary Gutting, Michel Foucault's Archaeology of Scientific Reason, 5.

<sup>85</sup>Michel Foucault, "Monstrosities in Criticism", Diacritics I, (Fall, 1971), 57-60, 60.

<sup>86</sup>Yirmiahu Yovel, Kant and the Philosophy of History, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980), 110.

- <sup>87</sup>Ibid., 112.
- <sup>88</sup>Ibid., 110.
- <sup>89</sup>John Rajchman, Michel Foucault: The Freedom of Philosophy, 74.
- <sup>90</sup>Michelle Perrot, "Questions of Method: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Ideology and Consciousness, No. 8 (1981), 14.
- <sup>91</sup>John Rajchman, Michel Foucault: The Freedom of Philosophy, 74.
- <sup>92</sup>Michel Foucault, "Critical Theory/Intellectual History", 33.
- <sup>93</sup>Michel Foucault, The Birth of the Clinic, 195.
- <sup>94</sup>Michel Foucault, "What is Enlightenment", The Foucault Reader, Paul Rabinow, 22-50 (New York: Pantheon Books, 1984), 39-41.
- <sup>95</sup>Bernard-Henri Levy, "Power and Sex: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Telos, Vol. 32 (1977), 154.
- <sup>96</sup>Michel Foucault, "What is Enlightenment", 38.
- <sup>97</sup>Ibid., 46.
- <sup>98</sup>Interview with Philip Monk by Tim Clark, 1991.
- <sup>99</sup>Walter Klepac, "The Order of Words The Order of Things: Deconstruction in Contemporary Art", C Magazine, (Fall 1984), 44.
- <sup>100</sup>Ibid., 43.
- <sup>101</sup>Ibid., 42.
- <sup>102</sup>Ibid., 43.
- <sup>103</sup>Ibid., 44.
- <sup>104</sup>Interview with Walter Klepac by Tim Clark, 1990.
- <sup>105</sup>Ibid.
- <sup>106</sup>Diana P.C. Nemiroff, A History of Artist-Run Spaces in Canada, With Particular Reference to Vehicule, A Space and the Western Front, (Montreal: Concordia University, 1985), 6.
- <sup>107</sup>Max O. Brice, A Profile of the Museum Sector in Canada, (Ottawa: Research and Statistics Directorate, Arts and Culture Branch, Secretary of State, 1979), 9.
- <sup>108</sup>Diana Nemiroff, A History of Artist-Run Spaces in Canada, 86-87.

- 109 Interview with Scott Watson by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 110 Scott Watson, "Naming the Piece: Geoff Smedley and the Post-Modern", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 1, (February), 10-16, 10.
- 111 In actual fact McGill had picked up Foucault from the Universite de Montreal who were the first to invite him to Montreal.
- 112 Interview with Robert Graham by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 113 Interview with Marnie Fleming by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 114 Interview with Trevor Gould by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 115 Interview with Bruce Grenville by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 116 Interview with James Patten by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 117 Interview with Carol Williams by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 118 Interview with Russell Keziere by Tim Clark, 1991.
- 119 Ibid.
- 120 Interview with Philip Monk by Tim Clark, 1991.
- 121 Ibid.
- 122 Interview with Heather Dawkins by Tim Clark, 1991.
- 123 Mark Lewis, "Concerning the Question of the Post-Cultural", C Magazine, (Fall 1985), 61.
- 124 David Macey, Lacan Contexts, (London: Verno, 1988), 15-16.
- 125 Interview with Philip Fry by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 126 Philip Fry, "On Description (Notes on the Installation of Stephen Cruise's 'Bitsandspecies')", Parachute (Canada), Vol. 4, (Autumn 1976), 219-220.
- 127 Scott Watson, "The Afterlife of Interiority (Stan Douglas)", C Magazine, Vol. 6, (Summer 1985), 23.
- 128 Scott Watson, "Naming the Piece: Geoff Smedley and the Post-Modern", 10-11.
- 129 Scott Watson, "Signing OFF", Vanguard, Vol. 18, No. 2, (April/May 1989), 20-25, 21.
- 130 Interview with Philip Fry by Tim Clark, 1990.

- 131 Philip Fry, 20.
- 132 Philip Monk, "Structures for Behavior", Parachute, Vol. 12, (Autumn 1978), 21, 24.
- 133 Ibid., 21, 22, 23.
- 134 Ibid., 25.
- 135 Heather Dawkins, "Paul Kane and the Eye of Power: Racism in Canadian Art History", Vanguard, Vol. 15, No. 4, (Sept. 1986), 24-27, 24.
- 136 Ibid., 25, 26.
- 137 Ibid., 26.
- 138 Ibid., 27.
- 139 Ibid., 27.
- 140 Ibid., 27.
- 141 Lesley Johnstone, "Allegories of Abandonment: Martha Fleming and Lynne Lapointe", Vanguard, Vol. 17, No. 9, (November 1988), 22-27, 22.
- 142 Ibid., 26.
- 143 Ibid., 23.
- 144 Ibid., 25-26.
- 145 It is of some importance that the textural source of the citation is typical of 13, of the 14 writers, insofar as they cite articles produced by Foucault that have appeared in the three standard, edited collections of his work. These being put together by 1) Donald Bouchard, 2) Paul Rabinow, and 3) Colin Gordon. As Johanne Lamoureux remarked, the French context did not have any equivalent collections available to them. This would leave open the possibility of Foucault being read in certain determinate manners by readers in the English context.
- 146 Lesley Johnstone, "Allegories of Abandonment", 27.
- 147 Walter Klepac, "The Order of Things The Order of Words", 42-43.
- 148 Philip Fry, "Robin Collyer: Event, Description, Narrative", Parachute, Vol. 20, (Autumn 1980), 36-45, 41.
- 149 Interview with Philip Fry, 1990.



- 150 Philip Monk, "Structures for Behavior", 24.
- 151 Walter Klepac, "The Order of Things The Order of Words", 46.
- 152 Interview with Heather Dawkins by Tim Clark, 1991.
- 153 Philip Monk, "Structures for Behavior", 21.
- 154 Lesley Johnstone, "Allegories of Abandonment", 26.
- 155 Heather Dawkins, "Politics of Visibility, Domestic Labour and Representation: The Diaries and Photographs of Hannah Cullwick (1853-74)", Parallelogramme, Vol. 4, No. 4, (April/May 1985), 47, 50.
- 156 Philip Fry, "Robin Collyer: Event, Description, Narrative", 37, 44, 45.
- 157 Interview with Philip Monk by Tim Clark, 1991.
- 158 Scott Watson, "From Scott Watson", Issue, Vol. 5, (March/April 1984), 10.
- 159 Interview with Lesley Johnstone, 1990.
- 160 William Wood, "The Difference of Times", Catalogue, (West, Artspeak Gallery, Vancouver, 1988), 7.
- 161 The resistance of gays to the repressive application of the norms of heterosexual sexual relations also accounts for the presence of Foucault's work in the production of some writers. As Russell Keziere stated in his interview in regards to some of the reasons for the appearance of Foucault's work in the submissions for publication in Vanguard. The 2nd Foucault would be someone who was quoted for purposes of moral authority - for the sake of buttressing an argument or a number of different agendas. One of these would be to protect a homo-erotic orientation and to find a political way of preventing that position from being repressed.
- 162 Roy Boyne, Cited in Foucault and Derrida: The Other Side of Reason, (London: University Hyman Ltd., 1990), 162.
- 163 Interview with Philip Fry by Tim Clark, 1990.
- 164 While it cannot be dealt with in this thesis, there is one additional factor that does play another role, in setting up historical conditions for the appearance of Foucault's work in writing on the visual arts, that parallels this expansion. As Monk noted in his interview with me concerning both the timing, and relation between material like Foucault's, and post-minimalist art

It also has to be recognized that I was coming out of the context where there was all that

writing concerning post-minimalism and so it was a conjunction between this material and all that new material from the French and German contexts.

Moreover, there is clear evidence that this correlation, at least in some form, is also of importance for Russell Keziere, Philip Fry, Bruce Grenville, Lesley Johnstone, Walter Klepac, and Marnie Fleming.

BIBLIOGRAPHY: Michel Foucault and Critical Modernism

- Allison, Henry E. Kant's Transcendental Idealism: An Interpretation and Defense. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983.
- Aarsleff, Hans. "leibniz and Locke on Language", From Locke to Saussure, ed, Hans Aarsleff. London: Athlone Press Ltd., 1982.
- Baxandall, Michael. Giotto and the Orators: Humanist Observers of Painting in Italy and the Discovery of Pictorial Composition. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971.
- Boyer, Roy. Foucault and Derrida: The Other Side of Reason. London: Urwin Hyman, 1990.
- Bove, Paul A. Intellectuals in Power: A Genealogy of Critical Humanisms. New York: Columbia University Press, 1986.
- Calinescu, Matei. Faces of Modernity: Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977.
- Canguilhem, Georges. On the Normal and the Pathological. Introduction by Michel Foucault, Trans. by C.R. Fawcett, Dordrecht, Holland: D. Reidel Publishing Company, 1978.
- Caws, Peter. Structuralism: The Art of the Intelligible. Atlantic Highlands: Humanities Press International, Inc., 1988.
- Cohen, Ted. "Why Beauty is a Symbol of Morality", Essays in Kant's Aesthetics, eds. Ted Cohen & Paul Guyer, 221-236. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Cohn, Norman. The Pursuit of the Millennium: Revolutionary Millenarians and Mystical Anarchists of the Middle Ages. London: Maurice Temp Smith Ltd., 1970.
- Crow, Thomas. Painters and Public Life in Eighteenth-century Paris. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985.
- Curtius, Ernst Robert. European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages. New York: Harper & Row, 1963.
- Forstman, Jack. A Romantic Triangle: Schleiermacher and Early German Romanticism. Missoula, Montana: University of Montana, 1977.
- Foucault, Michel. "A Preface to Transgression", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 29-52. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- . Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison. Trans. A. Sheridan. New York: Vintage/Random House, 1979.

- . "Georges Canguilhem: Philosopher of Error", Ideology and Consciousness, no. 7, (1980), pp. 52-59.
- . "History, Discourse and Discontinuity". Trans. Anthony Nazzaro. Salmagundi 20 (Summer-Fall 1972), pp. 225-248.
- . "Language to Infinity", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 52-67. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- . Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason. Trans. R. Howard. New York: Vintage/Random House, 1969.
- . "Monstrosities in Criticism", Diacritics 1 (Fall, 1971), pp. 57-60.
- . "Nietzsche, Genealogy, History", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 139-164. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- . "Theatrum Philosophicum", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 165-196. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- . The Archaeology of Knowledge. Bristol: Tavistock Publication Ltd., 1982.
- . "The Art of Telling the Truth", Michel Foucault: Politics, Philosophy, Culture, Interviews and Other Writings 1977-1984, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman. London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, Inc., 1988.
- . The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception. Trans. A. Sheridan Smith. New York: Vintage/Random House, 1980.
- . The History of Sexuality. Volume I: An Introduction. Trans. R. Husley. New York: Vintage/Random House, 1980.
- . The Order of Things. London: Pantheon, 1970.
- . "What Is an Author", Language, Counter-Memory, Practice, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, 113-138. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- . "What is Enlightenment", The Foucault Reader, ed. Paul Rabinow, 22-50. New York: Pantheon Books, 1984.
- . "On Literature", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-84), ed. Sylvere Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1984.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "Truth and Power", The Foucault Reader, ed. Paul Rabinow. New York: Pantheon Books, 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Order of Things", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-84), ed. Sylvere Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Discourse of History", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-1984), ed. Sylvere Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Foucault Responds to Sartre", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-84), ed. Sylvere Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Archaeology of Knowledge", Foucault Live (Interviews, 1966-84), ed. Sylvere Lotringer. New York: Semiotext(e) Foreign Agent Series, 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. L'ordre du discours: Leçon inaugurale au Collège de France prononcée le 2 décembre 1970. Paris: Editions Gallimard, 1971.
- Foucault, Michel and Ludwig Binswanger. Dream & Existence. Edited by Keith Hoeller. Seattle: Review of Existential Psychology & Psychiatry, 1986.
- Frank, Manfred. What is Neostructuralism? Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984.
- Gillespie, Michael A. Hegel, Heidegger, and the Ground of History. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984.
- Gordon, Colin. "Question, Ethos, Event: Foucault on Kant and Enlightenment", Economy and Society 15, 1 (Feb. 1986), pp. 88-96.
- Gulyga, Arsenij. Immanuel Kant: His Life and Thought. Boston: Birkhauser Boston Inc., 1987.
- Gutting, Gary, Michel Foucault's Archaeology of Scientific Reason. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- Habermas, Jurgen. The Philosophical Discourse of Modernity: Twelve Lectures. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1987.
- Henrich, Dieter. Beauty and Freedom: Schillers Struggle with Kant's Aesthetics", Essays in Kant's Aesthetics, eds. Ted Cohen & Paul Guyer, 237-257. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Holstun, James. A Rational Millennium: Puritan Utopias of Seventeenth-Century England and America. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987.

- Jay, Martin. Marxism & Totality: The Adventures of a Concept From Lukais to Habermas. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984.
- Jones, Richard Foster. "Science and Criticism in the Neo-Classical Age of English Literature", The Seventeenth Century: Studies in the History of English Thought and Literature from Bacon to Pope. ed. Richard Foster Jones. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1951.
- Jones, Richard Foster. "The Background of the Battel of the Books", The Seventeenth Century: Studies in the History of English Thought from Bacon to Pope, ed. Richard Foster Jones. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1951.
- . Ancients and Moderns: A Study of the Rise of the Scientific Movement in the Seventeenth Century. St. Louis: Washington University Press, 1961.
- Kant, Immanuel. Critique of Pure Reason. Trans. L.W. Beck. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1956.
- . "An Old Question Raised Again: Is the Human Race Constantly Progressing", Kant on History, ed. Lewis W. Beck. New York: Bobbs-Merrill Educational Publishing, 1963.
- . Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics. Trans. L.W. Beck. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Co. Inc., 1957.
- . "What is Enlightenment", On History, ed. Lewis White Beck, 3-10. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Co. Inc., 1963.
- . What Real Progress Has Metaphysics Made in Germany Since the Time of Leibniz and Wolff? Trans. Ted Humphrey. New York: Abraris Books Inc., 1983.
- . Critique of Judgment. Trans. J.H. Bernard. New York: Hafner Press, 1951.
- . "Idea for a Universal History from a Cosmopolitan Point of View", Kant on History, ed. Lewis W. Beck. New York: Bobbs-Merrill Educational Publishing, 1963.
- . Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View. Trans. Victor L. Dowdell. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1978.
- Kellner, Douglas. Critical Theory, Marxism and Modernity. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1989.
- Kemal, Salins. Kant and Fine Art: An Essay on Kant and the Philosophy of Fine Art and Culture. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986.

- Knox, Israel. The Aesthetic Theories of Kant, Hegel, and Schopenhauer. New York: The Humanities Press, 1958.
- Korshin, Paul, J. "The Development of Abstracted Typology in England, 1650-1820", in Literary Uses of Typology From the Middle Ages to the Present, ed. Earl Miner, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1971.
- Ladner, Gerhart B. The Idea of Reform: Its Impact on Christian Thought and Action in the Age of the Fathers. New York: Harper and Row, 1967.
- LeCoat, Gerard. The Rhetoric of the Arts, 1550-1650. Bern, Switzerland: Herbert Lang & Co. Ltd., 1975.
- Lecourt, Dominique. Marxism and Epistemology: Bachelard, Canguilhem and Foucault. Trans. Ben Brewster. London: NLB, 1975.
- Levy, Bernard-Henri. "Power and Sex: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Telos, 32 (1977), pp. 152-161.
- Lipking, Lawrence. The Ordering of the Arts in Eighteenth Century England. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1970.
- Macey, David. Lacan in Contexts. London: Verso, 1988.
- Megill, Allan. Prophets of Extremity: Nietzsche, Heidegger, Foucault, Derrida. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985.
- Miller, James. Rousseau: Dreamer of Democracy. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984.
- Mueller-Vollmer, Kurt, ed. The Hermeneutics Reader. New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1988.
- Nehamas, Alexander. Nietzsche: Life as Literature. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1985.
- Nietzsche, Friedrich. On the Uses and Disadvantages of History for Life, Untimely Meditations. Trans. R.J. Hollingdale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- . Beyond Good and Evil. Trans. Walter Kaufman. New York: Vintage Press, 1966.
- . The Birth of Tragedy. Trans. Walter Kaufman. New York: Vintage Press, 1966.
- . On the Genealogy of Morals. Trans. Walter Kaufman. New York: Vintage Press, 1968.

- . The Will to Power. Trans. Walter Kaufman and R.J. Hollingdale. New York: Vintage, 1968.
- Perrot, Michelle. "Questions of Method: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Ideology and Consciousness, no. 8 (1981), pp. 3-14.
- Pippin, Robert B. Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfactions of Self-Consciousness. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- Putman, Hilary. Reason, Truth and History. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Rajchman, John. Michel Foucault: The Freedom of Philosophy. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985.
- Raulet, Gerard. "Critical Theory/Intellectual History: An Interview with Michel Foucault", Michel Foucault: Politics, Philosophy, Culture, Interviews and Other Writings 1977-1984, ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman. London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, Inc., 1988.
- Roberts, Julian. German Philosophy: An Introduction. Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Humanities Press International, Inc., 1988.
- Schacht, Richard. Nietzsche. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983.
- Schiller, Friedrich. On The Aesthetic Education of Man in a Series of Letters. New York: Ungar, 1966.
- Scruton, Roger. From Descartes to Wittgenstein: A Short History of Modern Philosophy. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., 1981.
- Seung, T.K. Structuralism & Hermeneutics. New York: Columbia University Press, 1982.
- Sheridan, Alan. Michel Foucault: The Will to Truth. London: Tavistock Publications, 1980.
- Strong, Tracy B. Friedrich Nietzsche and the Politics of Transfiguration. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.
- Summer, David. Michelangelo and the Language of Art. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981.
- Taylor, Charles. Hegel. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975.
- Tiles, Mary. Bachelard: Science and Objectivity. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Tuveson, Ernest Lee. The Imagination as a Means of Grace: Locke and the Aesthetics of Romanticism. New York: Gordian Press, 1974.



- Toews, John Edward. Hegelianism: The Path Toward Dialectical Humanism, 1805-1841. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980.
- Webster, Charles. The Great Instauration: Science, Medicine, and Reform, 1626-1660. New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, 1976.
- Whitney, Charles. Francis Bacon and Modernity. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986
- Yovel, Yirmiahu. Kant and the Philosophy of History. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980.

BIBLIOGRAPHY: Canadian Writing on the Visual Arts

- Brice, Max O. A Profile of the Museum Sector in Canada. Ottawa: Research and Statistics Directorate, Arts and Culture Branch, Secretary of State, 1979.
- Dawkins, Heather. "Paul Kane and the Eye of Power: Racism in Canadian Art History", Vanguard, Vol. 15, No. 4, (Sept. 1986), pp. 24-27.
- Dawkins, Heather. "Politics of Visibility, Domestic Labour and Representation: The Diaries and Photographs of Hannah Cullwick (1858-74)". Parallelogramme, Vol. No. 4, (April/May 1985), pp. 47-50.
- Fleming, Marnie. "Curator's Statement". Catalogue. Jeunes Contemporaries. London Life. Young Contemporaries. London Regional Art Gallery, London, Ontario, 1987, pp. 7-12.
- Fry, Philip. "On Description (Notes on the Installation of Stephen Cruise's 'Bitsandspecies')". Parachute (Canada), Vol. 4, (Autumn 1976), pp. 16-20.
- Fry, Philip. "Robin Collyer: Event, Description, Narrative". Parachute (Canada), Vol. 20, (Autumn 1980), pp. 36-45.
- Gould, Trevor. "Building Sculpture: Michel Goulet". Vanguard, Vol. 15, No. 1 (1986), pp. 27-30.
- Graham, Robert. "Tom Gibson - Among the Naturalists". Parachute (Canada), Vol. 22, (Spring 1981), pp. 26-29.
- Herbert, Walter. The Current State of the Arts in the University. Toronto: The Canada Foundation, 1967.
- Horsman, Joan. The Arts and Education. Toronto: The Canadian Conference of the Arts, 1975.
- Johnstone, Lesley. "Allegories of Abandonment: Martha Fleming and Lyne Lapointe". Vanguard, Vol. 17, No. 5 (November 1988), pp. 22-27.
- Klepac, Walter. "The Order of Words The Order of Things: Deconstruction in Contemporary Art". C Magazine (Canada), (Fall 1984), pp. 42-51.
- Lewis, Mark. "Concerning The Question of the Post-Cultural". C Magazine, pp. 42-51.
- Marks, Laura U. "Adrian Piper: Reflections 1967-87, The Power Plant, Toronto May 4 - June 10, 1990". Fuse Magazine, Vol. 14, No. 1 & 2, (Fall 1990), pp. 40-42.

- Monk, Philip. "Museums by Artists". Parachute (Quebec), Vol. 32, (Sept./Nov. 1983), pp. 44-45.
- Monk, Philip. "Staging Language and Representing History: Ian Carr-Harris, September, 1973". Vanguard, Vol. 12, No. 9, (November 1983), pp. 18-21.
- Monk, Philip. "Structures for Behavior". Parachute (Quebec), Vol. 12, (Autumn 1978), pp. 21-27.
- Nemiroff, Diana P.C. A History of Artist-Run Spaces in Canada, With Particular Reference to Vehicule, A Space and the Western Front. Montreal: Concordia University, 1985.
- Patten, James. "Representation and Displacement: Leonardo Twice Removed". Perspectives, Vol. 6, (Winter 1989), pp. 24-26.
- Statistics Canada. Facilities for the Study of the Arts in Canada. Ottawa: Information Canada, 1972.
- Watson, Scott. "Bill Bissett: Fires in the Tempul". Catalogue. Bill Bissett: Fires in the Tempul. Vancouver Art Gallery, Vancouver, 1984, pp. 1-5.
- Watson, Scott. "From Scott Watson". Issue, Vol. 5, (March/April 1984), pp. 9-10.
- Watson, Scott. "Naming the Piece: Geoff Smedley and the Post-Modern". Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 1, (February 1982), pp. 10-16.
- Watson, Scott. "Signing OFF". Vanguard, Vol. 18, No. 2, (April/May 1989), pp. 20-25.
- Watson, Scott. "The Afterlife of Interiority (Stan Douglas)". C Magazine, Vol. 6, (Summer 1985), pp. 23.
- Williams, Carol. "Sites of Intervention: Visual Evidence". Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 4, (Sept./Oct. 1987), pp. 14-16.
- Wood, William. "The Difference of Times". Catalogue. West, Artspeak Gallery, Vancouver, 1988, pp. 7-17.
- Wood, William. "The Irony of Power (Robert Wiens)", C Magazine, Vol. 2, (Summer 1984), pp. 16-17.

APPENDIX TO THESIS

Michel Foucault, Critical Modernism, and Writing  
on the Visual Arts in English Canada

Timothy D. Clark

## Table of Contents

Section One:	Authors Who Have Used Foucault's Work . . . . .	pp. 1 - 2
Section Two:	Statistical Breakdown of the Periodical and Institutional Location Where Texts Were Published . . . . .	pp. 3 - 5
Section Three:	Statistical Analysis of "Critical Ref." by author . . . . .	pp. 6 - 7
Section Four:	Starting Dates for all Serials Dealing with Arts in Canada Since 1940 . . . . .	pp. 8 - 11
Section Five:	Preliminary Analysis of those Author's Published Work not Dealt with in the Main Body of the Thesis . . .	pp. 12 - 31
Section Six:	Preliminary Analysis of those Author's Published Work Dealt with in the Main Body of the Thesis . . .	pp. 32 - 83
Section Seven:	Publication and/or Exhibition History of those Author's Dealt with in the Main Body of the Thesis . . .	pp. 84 - 129
Section Eight:	Differential analysis of the first date of publication of primary language edition to secondary language edition . .	pp. 130 - 132
Section Nine:	Questionnaire responses - Bibliography of all of Foucault's published work and all.	pp. 133 - 170

Please note: It should be noted while this thesis uses quantitative methods to determine whether there are any common sets of historical patterns in the material I have researched, the information extracted represents conditional, not unconditional historical material.

SECTION ONE

Authors Who Have Used Foucault's Work

Part One: Francophone

Name

- |                      |                            |
|----------------------|----------------------------|
| 1) Michele Theriault | 6) Christine Dubois        |
| 2) Alain Laframboise | 7) Guy Durand              |
| 3) Rene Payant       | 8) Thierry de Duve         |
| 4) Pascale Beaudet   | 9) Nicole Dubreuil-Blondin |
| 5) Johanne Lamoureux | 10) Serge Berard           |

Part Two: Anglophone

<u>Name</u>	<u>Date of First Publication</u> [Note: asterisks denote all those authors dealt with in Chapter Two]	<u>Date of Entrance into University, until their Completion of Post-Graduate Degree and Date of birth in brackets</u>
* 1) Philip Fry	1968	1962 to 1970 [1940]
* 2) Walter Klepac	1972	1967 to 1971 [1943]
* 3) Philip Monk	1977	
* 4) Russell Keziere	1978	
5) David Clarkson	1979	
6) Anna Groneau	1979	
* 7) Scott Watson	1978	1971 to 1977 [1950]
8) Peter Wollheim	1979	
9) Graham Asmundson	1980	
*10) Robert Graham	1980	1969-1973, 1986-1989 [1950]
*11) Marnie Fleming	1981	1974 to 1980 [1955]
*12) Trevor Gould	1981	1971 to 1987 [1951]
13) Lorne Falk	1982	
*14) Bruce Grenville	1982	1976 to 1984 [1956]
15) Jo-Anna Isaak	1982	
*16) William Wood	1982	1977 to 1984 [ ]

*17)	Heather Dawkins	1984	1976 to 1990	[ ]
18)	Tom Folland	1984		
19)	Geoff Miles	1984		
20)	Dot Tuer	1984		
21)	Christos Dikeakos	1985		
*22)	Lesley Johnstone	1985	1978 to 1986	[1958]
*23)	Cheryl Simon	1985	1977-1981, 1983-1988	[1955]
24)	Barbara Fischer	1987		
25)	Vera Gartly	1987		
*26)	James Patten	1987	1982 to 1990	[1961]
27)	Kim Sawchuk	1987		
*28)	Carol Williams	1987	1980 to 1988	[1956]
29)	Earl Miller	1988		
30)	Asheleigh Moorhouse	1989		

SECTION TWO

Statistical Breakdown of the Periodical and Institutional Location  
Where Texts Were Published

---

1)

<u>Periodicals</u>	<u>Number</u>
1. Vanguard	141
2. Parachute	100
3. C	40
4. Artscanada	13
5. Canadian Art	12
6. Photo Communiqué	11
7. Parralélogramme	6
8. Canadian Forum	4
9. Impulse	3
10. Art Express	3
11. Border/lines	3
12. Artscribe [Australia]	3
13. Views	3
14. Wolkenkratzer Art Journal	3
15. American Ceramics	3
16. Provincial Essays	2
17. Perspectives	2
18. Beaux Arts (Paris)	2
19. Public	2
20. Black Flash	2
21. Art History [English]	2
21. ETC	2
22. Revue d'Esthétique [France]	2
23. Criteria	1
24. Only Paper Today	1
25. File	1
26. Fuse	1
27. Art Views	1
28. Harbour	1
29. ZG (English)	1
30. Art Forum (American)	1
31. Vie Des Arts	1
32. Exchange	1
33. Arts Atlantic	1
34. Spirale	1
35. Etudes des Arts	1
36. Artists Review	1
37. The Funnel Newsletter	1
38. Modern Drama	1
39. Art Magazine	1
40. Queen's Quarterly	1



41.	CarFac News	1
42.	Nigeria demain [France]	1
43.	New Art Examiner	1
44.	Canadian Art Magazine	1
45.	Contact Magazine	1
46.	High Performance	1
47.	American Craft Magazine	1
48.	Ceramics Monthly	1
49.	Artists Review	1
50.	Canadian Women's Studies Journal	1
51.	Visual Arts Newsletter	1
52.	Objects et Mondes [France]	1

Total Texts Published 390

Percentage of the total that appeared in Vanguard, Parachute, and C.  
281, or 75%

2)

<u>Institutions</u>	<u>Number</u>
1. Vancouver Art Gallery	15
2. Walter Phillips Gallery	13
3. Southern Alberta College Art Gallery	11
4. Art Gallery of Ontario	8
5. YYZ	8
6. The Winnipeg Art Gallery	8
7. London Regional Art Gallery	7
8. Mendel Art Gallery	6
9. The Power Plant	6
10. The Agnes Etherington Art Centre	4
11. Optica	4
12. Artspeak Gallery	4
13. The 49th Parrallel	3
14. Mount Saint Vincent University Art Gallery	3
15. S.L. Simpson Gallery	3
16. Canadian Museum of Contemporary Photography	2
17. Macdonald Stewart Art Centre	2
18. Western Front Society	2
19. P.S.I., (New York)	2
20. Art Gallery of Hamilton	2
21. Fine Arts Gallery, University of British Columbia	2
22. Mercer Union	2
23. The Dunlop Art Gallery	1
24. Montreal Museum of Fine Arts	1
25. Saidye Bronfman Centre	1
26. Galerie Christiane Chassay	1
27. Contemporary Art Gallery	1
28. Surrey Art Gallery	1

29.	Canada House (London)	1
30.	Vancouver Artists League	1
31.	Kuenstlerhaus Bethanien [Germany]	1
32.	Nikolas Sonne Galerie [Berlin]	1
33.	Kunsthhaus [Hamburg]	1
34.	Akademie Scholss Solitude [Stuttgart]	1
35.	The Art Gallery of Greater Victoria	1
36.	The National Gallery of Canada	1
37.	Artculture Resource Centre	1
38.	Camden Arts Center [London, England]	1
39.	Musee de L'Homme [Paris]	1
40.	Le Musee Moderne du Ville de Paris	1
41.	Concordia University	1
42.	Rochester Institute of Technology	1
43.	Editions Artextes	1
44.	Presentation House	1
45.	Artists Cooperative	1
46.	Centre Culturel Canadian, Paris	1
47.	A Space	1
48.	Documenta, Kassel (Germany)	1
49.	Or Gallery	1
50.	Chromazone	1
51.	Art Gallery of Stratford	1
52.	Centre international d'art contemporain de Montreal	1
53.	Laurentian University Museum and Arts Centre	1
54.	Musee d'art contemporain de Montreal	1
55.	Wurttembergischer Kunstverein (Germany)	1

Total Texts Published

166

SECTION THREE

Statistical Analysis of "Critical Ref." and "Canadian Authors Cited".

A) Analysis of All "Critical Ref." That Have Been Cited Ten or More Times.

1)	Michel Foucault	71
2)	Roland Barthes	58
3)	Walter Benjamin	52
4)	Jacques Derrida	34
5)	Jean Baudrillard	31
6)	Rosalind Krauss	25
7)	Jacques Lacan	25
8)	Jean-Francois Lyotard	19
9)	Douglas Crimp	18
10)	Benjamin Buchloh	16
11)	Gilles Deleuze	16
12)	Julia Kristeva	16
13)	Theodor Adorno	14
14)	Felix Guattari	13
15)	Roman Jakobson	13
16)	Karl Marx	11
17)	Georges Bataille	10
	Total	442

B) Total Number of "Critical Ref." That Have Been Cited Nine or Less Times

Total                      371

[Please note: If you wish the specific names of these references please see No. one of sections Four and Five]

C) Total Number of Citations.

Total                      813

A-1) Analysis of All "Canadian Authors Cited" That Have Been Cited Five or More Times.

1)	Philip Monk	15
2)	Ian Wallace	14
3)	Rene Payant	13
4)	Roald Nasgaard	9
5)	Ian Carr-Harris	8
6)	Amerigo Marras	6

7)	Diana Nemiroff	6
8)	Chantel Pontbriand	6
9)	Tom Sherman	6
10)	Jeff Wall	6
11)	Peggy Gale	5
12)	General Idea	5
13)	Johanne Lamoureux	5
14)	John B. Mays	5
15)	Clive Robertson	5
	Total	114

B-1) Total Number of "Canadian Authors Cited" That Have Been Cited Four or Less Times.

Total 281

C-1) Total Number of Citations.

Total 395

D) Numerical Breakdown of "Critical Authors", Cited One Time Only by All Canadian Authors Who Have Cited Foucault's Work.

[Note: This analysis covers only "Critical Ref." that have been cited by more than 75% of the Canadian authors.]

<u>"Critical Ref."</u>	<u>Total No. of Authors Who Have Cited Foucault's Work</u>	<u>Total No. of Authors Who Have Cited An Author's Work</u>
1)	Michel Foucault	30
2)	Roland Barthes	18
3)	Walter Benjamin	17
4)	Jacques Derrida	15
5)	Jean Baudrillard	12
6)	Rosalind Krauss	12
7)	Jacques Lacan	12
8)	Benjamin Buchloh	8
9)	Jean-Francois Lyotard	8
10)	Theodor Adorno	8
11)	Julia Kristeva	8

SECTION FOUR

Starting Dates for all Serials Dealing with the Arts in Canada Since 1940. Note: In some cases a given serial started earlier than 1940 and will stop publication after 1940, in which case I will mark an "S" next to the serial's date of termination.

[Please note: This section is only interested in establishing if there is any point in time from the 1940's on when there is a significant change in publishing activity. Insofar as this is the case the only principle that determines how these dates and names of the publications listed below are organized is the actual two time frames of 1940 to 1965, and 1965 to 1990, that I found in my research which reflected this change.]

1) 1940 to 1965

S 1949	Here and Now	* 1974	Journal of Canadian
1948	Canadian Review of Music and Other Arts		Art History/Annales d'histoire de l'art canadien
* 1943	Arts Canada		
S 1943	Maritime Art	* 1970	Le Magazine OVO
S 1945	Preview	1975	Maintenant
S 1949	Paysanna	1971	Mediart
S 1941	Relations	1973	Mix Magazine
1955	Sequences	1976	May Day
S 1955	Arts et Pensee	1978	Missing in Action
S 1950	Aujourd'hui; Le digeste français	1978	Musicworks
		1974	Northward Journal
S 1955	Carnets victoriens	1970	O; Publication of the Arts
1958	Canada Artistique et litteraire	S 1966	Terroir; Revue mensuelle illustre
S 1950	Digeste français	S 1969	Technique; revue industrielle
1950	Liaison; Revue de litterature et d'art		
S 1956	New Frontiers	1966	Twenty Cents Magazine
S 1954	Qui? Art, musique, litterature	1966	Voix nationale
S 1960	Revue moderne; litteraire, politique, arts	1967	Doings
		1966	Briefly
* 1960	The Structurist	* 1975	Artswest
S 1963	Revue populaire	* 1979	Arts Atlantic
S 1963	Samedi; journal hebdomadaire	1979	Archivaria
* 1956	Vie des arts	* 1975	Art Views
1963	Front	* 1977	Artist's Review
S 1963	Highlights	1976	Art Communication Edition
S 1964	Documentaire		
1961	Region	* 1977	Border Crossings
		* 1972	Beaux-Arts
		1976	Bridge City Review
2) <u>1965 to 1990</u>		1970	Communique

	1966	Causeway		1974	Canadian Indian Artcrafts
	1969	Canadian Art News	*	1974	Criteria
	1966	Culture Vivante	*	1976	Centerfold
	1968	Dimensions	*	1979	Cahiers des arts visuels au Quebec
	1969	Five Cent Review			
*	1969	Art Magazine	S	1970	Culture
*S	1966	Canadian Art		1972	Canada Cinema
	1966	Canadian Collector		1971	Cinema Quebec
S	1963	Gambit		1973	Da Vinci
*	1967	Image		1978	Slap
*	1969	Image Nation		1971	Les herbes Rouges
S	1965	Manitoba Art Review	*	1972	The Capilano Review
	1969	Modicum		1975	Chroniques
*	1969	Rochdale Image Nation	*	1973	Protee
	1970	Echo		1971	Cine Tracts
*	1977	Fuse		1985	Agenda
*	1972	File		1987	Artery
*	1970	Impressions	*	1984	Borderlines
*	1979	Inter	*	1986	CV
*	1971	Impulse	*	1984	C Magazine
*	1973	Interface	*	1987	Crossroads
	1975	Images and Information	*	1984	Canadian Art
	1977	Imprint		1985	Discussion
	1981	Arts in Formation	*	1982	Espace
*	1989	Plug In, Inc	*	1990	Harbour
*	1989	Gasp		1990	L'Incontournable
	1985	Info Culture		1990	Gallerie: Women's Art
*	1983	L'Apropos	*	1982	Provincial Essays
*	1980	La Chambre blanche	*	1987	Poolside
	1988	L'Oeuvre; Revue d'art de Lanaudiere	*	1987	Perspectives
*	1989	Ideas and Debates	*	1988	Public
*	1986	Le Sabard	*	1981	Rampike
	1986	Le Bulletin du race	*	1987	Saw News
*	1983	Last Issue		1986	Stampaxe
*	1983	Last Post	*	1983	The Art Post
	1982	Midcontinental	*	1985	Trois
	1983	Numero	*	1983	Views
*	1973	Only Paper Today	*	1983	Vice Versa
	1975	Onion; The Independent Paper on the Arts		1987	Wadrihnea
*	1976	Parallelogramme		1980	Museo-Vision
*	1979	Photo Communique		1986	Art Actuel
*	1979	Propos d'art	*	1984	Esse
	1974	Parachute (Ontario)	*	1983	Issue
	1972	Muskeg Review		1982	Trafics
*	1973	Proof Only		1985	Xero
	1973	Pulp Content/3 Pulp	*	1982	Xceteras
*	1975	Parachute (Quebec)		1981	Circuits
	1977	Popular Illusion		1981	Identity
S	1970	Quartier Latin		1983	Hyprofile
			*	1983	Incite
			*	1980	K Journal

1973	Queen Street Magazine	1985	Cartouche
* 1974	Racar; Canadian Art Review/Revue d'art canadien	1986	Le Collectionneur
		1988	Conceit
		1988	Forces
1973	Revue annuelle de photographie de l'Universite Laval	* 1982	Arts Manitoba
		1984	Galerie
		1988	Inuit Art Quarterly
1978	Rude	1989	Mr. Magnanimous
* 1979	Spirale	1985	Nex Nouvelles
1976	Strike	1981	Expressions
1970	Twelve Mile Creek	* 1984	Nexpress
1973	Tilt	1985	L'Oeil rechargeable
1978	Video Guide	1988	Pop Tart
1979	Vox Magazine	1982	Re-Flex
1975	Voicepondence	1980	Remote Control
1977	Video Magazine	1980	Sagamie
* 1977	Virus	1981	Slate
* 1972	Vanguard	1980	Release
1971	White Pelican	1985	Cine Action

3) Periodicals Where Commencement Date Could Not be Determined

Art Times	Goose and Duck
Art Gallery Journal	* Art Action
Art Bulletin	* Art Connection
* Baldwin Street Gallery Newsletter	Copie Zero
Front	Inter Sections
Prairie Fire	Studio Magazine
Survival Newsletter	Take One
Wagon	Alphabet

4) Museum, Association, and, Gallery Bulletins and Newsletters

1963	National Gallery of Canada/Galerie nationale due Canada, <u>Bulletin</u>
1953	Northern Ontario Art Association, <u>Bulletin</u>
1960	St. Catharines and District Arts Council, <u>Bulletin</u>
1975	Glenhyrst Arts Council, <u>Newsletter</u>
1973	The Pacific Women's Graphic Arts Co-Operative Association, <u>Makara</u>
1967	Society of Canadian Artists, <u>Journal</u>
* 1970	Hamilton and Regional Arts Council, <u>Art-i-Fact</u>
* 1975	<u>Arts Victoria</u> , Art Gallery of Greater Victoria
1975	Kingston Art Council, <u>Articulator</u>
1974	Royal Canadian Academy of Arts, <u>L'Academie/The Academy</u>
1973	The Arts Council of the Nanaimo Regional District, <u>The Arts</u>

Counsellor

- 1966 Burlington Fine Arts Association, Newsletter  
1965 Maritime Art Association News  
\* 1970 Beaverbrook Art Gallery  
S 1968 New Brunswick Museum, Art Bulletin  
1966 Art Gallery of Ontario, News and Notes  
\* 1969 Art Gallery of Ontario, Coming Events  
\* 1979 Art Gallery of Ontario, The Gallery  
\* 1985 Art Gallery of Ontario, AGO News  
S 1971 Norman MacKenzie Art Gallery, Newsletter  
1968 Royal Ontario Museum, Rotunda  
\* 1969 M; a quarterly review of the Montreal Museum of Fine Arts/M;  
une revue trimestrielle du musee des beaux-arts de Montreal  
\* 1969 New Brunswick Museum, Museum Memo  
\* 1972 Musee d'art contemporain, Ateliers  
\* 1976 Confederation Centre Art Gallery and Museum, Museum Bulletin  
\* 1976 Peter Whyte Foundation, Banff, Cairn  
\* 1977 New Brunswick Museum, Journal  
\* 1977 Confederation Centre Art Gallery and Museum, Arts Atlantic  
\* 1971 The Winnipeg Art Gallery  
\* 1975 Canadian Artists Representation/Le Front des artists  
canadiens, Car/Fac News  
1974 Canadian Artists Representation Ontario, Carot  
1976 Canadian Artists' Representation Ontario, Touch/Touche  
\* 1978 Powerhouse Gallery, Powerhouse  
\* 1987 L'Association des galeries d'art contemporain de Montreal,  
ETC  
\* 1983 Art Gallery of Nova Scotia Journal Calendar  
\* 1981 Musee des Beaux-Arts de Montreal/Montreal Museum of Fine  
Arts, Collage  
\* 1981 The Photographers Gallery  
\* 1984 The Photographers Gallery, Exchange  
\* 1986 The Photographers Gallery, Black Flash  
1982 Toronto Photographers Workshop, Views  
\* 1983 Group K, Non-Profit art society  
1990 Manitoba Artists For Women's Art, Read My Lips  
\* 1981 Artists' Film Centre, The Funnel  
\* 1986 Presentation House, Photo perspectives

- 5) a) Total number of Periodicals that commenced or ended  
between 1940 and 1990 240  
b) Total number between 1940 and 1964 25  
c) Total number between 1965 and 1990 215



## SECTION FIVE

### Preliminary Analysis of those Author's Published Work not Dealt with in the Main Body of This Thesis

#### Interpretation of Abbreviations for Sections Four and Five

- 1) Critical Ref. - Any author cited whose work is representative of the following theoretical positions; Structuralism, Semiology, Marxism, Hermeneutics, Existential Phenomenology, Hermeneutic Phenomenology, Critical Post-Structuralism, Critical Feminism, Critical Art History, Critical Archaeology/Genealogy, and Lacanian Critical Freudianism.
- 2) Canadian Authors Cited - These include all references drawn from different disciplines such as Art History, History, and Political Science.

[Please note: the numbers beside each author denotes the number of times that an author has been cited by a Canadian writer.]

Asmundson, Graham

1. Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

- 1) Roland Barthes            2
- 2) Michel Foucault        1

2. Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

2/1 Foucault

3. Periodicals Published In

- 1) Parachute                    1
- 2) Parrallelegramme        1

Clarkson, David

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

- |                            |   |
|----------------------------|---|
| 1) Jean <u>Baudrillard</u> | 2 |
| 2) Michel <u>Foucault</u>  | 2 |
| 3) Roland <u>Barthes</u>   | 1 |
| 4) Eugene Donato           | 1 |
| 5) Frederic <u>Jameson</u> | 1 |

2) Canadian Authors Cited

- |                    |   |
|--------------------|---|
| 1) Bruce Grenville | 1 |
|--------------------|---|

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

5/2 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

- |                     |   |
|---------------------|---|
| 1) Photo Communique | 1 |
| 2) Parachute        | 1 |
| 3) C                | 1 |
| 4) Impulse          | 1 |
| 5) Artists Review   | 1 |

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 1) Laurentian University Museum<br>and Arts Centre | 1 |
| 2) Southern Alberta Art Gallery                    | 1 |

Dikeakos, Christos

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

- |    |                        |   |
|----|------------------------|---|
| 1) | Benjamin H.D. Buchloch | 1 |
| 2) | Michel <u>Foucault</u> | 1 |

2) Canadian Authors Cited

- |    |               |   |
|----|---------------|---|
| 1) | Ian Wallace   | 8 |
| 2) | Eric Cameron  | 1 |
| 3) | Jeff Wall     | 1 |
| 4) | Denis Wheeler | 1 |

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

2/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

- |    |          |   |
|----|----------|---|
| 1) | Vanguard | 1 |
|----|----------|---|

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |    |                       |   |
|----|-----------------------|---|
| 1) | Vancouver Art Gallery | 1 |
|----|-----------------------|---|

Falk, Lorne

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Emily Hicks	4
2) Hal Foster	3
3) Jean-Francois Lyotard	3
4) Jean Baudrillard	2
5) Jacques Derrida	2
6) Michel Foucault	2
7) Teresa de Laurentis	2
8) Michael Baxandall	1
9) Norman Bryson	1
10) Walter Benjamin	1
11) Victor Burgin	1
12) Gilles Deleuze	1
13) John Fekete	1
14) Friedrich Nietzsche	1
15) Martha Rosler	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Vikky Alexander	1
2) Manon Blanchette	1
3) Michael Dorland	1
4) Barbara Fischer	1
5) Claire Foster	1
6) Jacqueline Fry	1
7) Hubert Hohn	1
8) Carroll Moppett	1
9) Ron Moppett	1
10) Mireille Perron	1
11) Clive Robertson	1
12) Martha Townsend	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

18/2 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	4
2) C	3
3) Vie Des Arts	1
4) Exchange - The Photographer's Almanac	1

5)	New Art Examiner	1
6)	Canadian Art Magazine	1
7)	Contact Magazine	1
8)	High Performance	1
9)	American Craft Magazine	1
10)	American Ceramics	2
11)	Ceramics Monthly	1
12)	Visual Arts Newsletter, Alberta Cultural Magazine	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1)	Walter Phillips Gallery	9
2)	Le Musee Moderne du Ville de Paris	1
3)	Concordia University	1
4)	Optica Gallery	1
5)	Southern Alberta Gallery	1

Fischer, Barbara

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

- |    |                         |   |
|----|-------------------------|---|
| 1) | Walter <u>Benjamin</u>  | 2 |
| 2) | Michel <u>Foucault</u>  | 2 |
| 3) | Roland <u>Barthes</u>   | 1 |
| 4) | Jean <u>Baudrillard</u> | 1 |

2) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

2/2 Foucault

3) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |    |                        |   |
|----|------------------------|---|
| 1) | Art Gallery of Ontario | 2 |
|----|------------------------|---|

Folland, Tom

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Frederic Jameson	7	21) Guy Debord	1
2) Douglas Crimp	5	22) Eugene Donato	1
3) Roland Barthes	3	23) Umberto Eco	1
4) Walter Benjamin	3	24) Hal Foster	1
5) Theodor Adorno	2	25) Martin Heidegger	1
6) Louis Althusser	2	26) Roman Jakobson	1
7) Benjamin Buchloh	2	27) Alice Jardine	1
8) Terry Eagleton	2	28) Julia Kristeva	1
9) Frederick Engels	2	29) Thomas Lawson	1
10) Michel Foucault	2	30) Herbert Marcuse	1
11) Rosalind Krauss	2	31) Laura Mulvey	1
12) Karl Marx	2	32) C.S. Pierce	1
13) Jean Baudrillard	1	33) Martha Rosler	1
14) Jean-Louis Baudry	1	34) Michael Ryan	1
15) Peter Burger	1	35) Allan Sekula	1
16) Victor Burgin	1	36) Michael Shapiro	1
17) Steve Burniston	1	37) John Tagg	1
18) Michel de Certeau	1	38) Paul Tiefler	1
19) Noam Chomsky	1	39) Chris Weedon	1
20) Thomas Crow	1	40) Janet Wolff	1
		41) Peter Wollen	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) John Bentley Mays	2	10) Bruce Grenville	1
2) Karl Beveridge	1	11) Richard Gruneau	1
3) Joan Borsa	1	12) Jeanne Randolph	1
4) Carole Conde	1	13) Michael Ruse	1
5) Peter Carlson	1	14) Rick Salutin	1
6) Andy Fabo	1	15) Jerome Sams	1
7) Andrew Forster	1	16) Margaret Somerville	1
8) Leslie J. de Freitas	1	17) Jeff Wall	1
9) Monika Gagnon	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

11/3 Foucault



4) Periodicals Published In

- 1) Parachute 4
- 2) Vanguard 1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- 1) The Power Plant 5
- 2) Art Culture Resource Centre 1

Gartly, Vera

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

- |    |                         |   |
|----|-------------------------|---|
| 1) | Roland <u>Barthes</u>   | 1 |
| 2) | Jean <u>Baudrillard</u> | 1 |
| 3) | Yves-Alain Blois        | 1 |
| 4) | Benjamin H.D. Buchloch  | 1 |
| 5) | Michel <u>Foucault</u>  | 1 |
| 6) | Friedrich Nietzsche     | 1 |

2) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

2/1 Foucault

3) Periodicals Published In

- |    |                   |   |
|----|-------------------|---|
| 1) | American Ceramics | 1 |
|----|-------------------|---|

4) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |    |                                      |   |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1) | Southern Alberta College Art Gallery | 1 |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|

Groneau, Anna

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	3	11) Jane Gallop	1
2) Laura Mulvey	3	12) Christine Gledhill	1
3) Kaja Silverman	3	13) Luce Irigaray	1
4) Stephen Heath	2	14) Frederic Jameson	1
5) Jacques Lacan	2	15) Teresa de Laurentis	1
6) Judith Barry	1	16) Bill Nichols	1
7) Jean-Louis Baudry	1	17) Alan Sheridan	1
8) Pam Cook	1	18) Linda Williams	1
9) Marcy Doane	1	19) Peter Wollen	1
10) Sandy Flitterman	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Sara Diamond 1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	1
2) Parallelogramme	3
3) The Funnel Newsletter	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Walter Phillips Gallery

6) Other Publishing Sources

1) Douglas and McIntyre

Isaak, Jo-Anna

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Julia Kristeva	9	21) Terry Eagleton	1
2) Roman Jakobson	8	22) Umberto Eco	1
3) Roland Barthes	7	23) John Ellis	1
4) Jacques Lacan	4	24) Jerry Fodor	1
5) Jacques Derrida	3	25) Pierce Guiraud	1
6) Frederic Jameson	3	26) Roman Ingarden	1
7) Walter Benjamin	2	27) Jerrold Kat	1
8) Helene Cixous	2	28) Mary Kelly	1
9) Michel Foucault	2	29) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
10) Luce Irigaray	2	30) Laura Mulvey	1
11) Tzvetan Todorov	2	31) C.S. Pierce	1
12) Theodor Adorno	1	32) Joseph Riddell	1
13) Mikhail Bakhtin	1	33) Moustapha Safouan	1
14) John Berger	1	34) Edward Sapir	1
15) Wayne Booth	1	35) Ferdinand de Saussure	1
16) Norman Bryson	1	36) Robert Scholes	1
17) Noam Chomsky	1	37) Lev S. Vygotsky	1
18) Joan Copjec	1	38) Ludwig Wittgenstein	1
19) Rosalind Coward	1	39) Benjamin Whorf	1
20) Jonathan Culler	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Nicole Jolicoeur	2	3) Dorothy Smith	1
2) Northrop Fry	1	4) Nell Tenhaaf	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

5/2 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Parachute	2
2) Vanguard	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Walter Phillips Gallery	1
----------------------------	---

6) Publisher of Monograph

1) U.M.I. Research Press 1

Miller, Earl

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Frederic Jameson	2	5) Michel Foucault	1
2) Walter Benjamin	1	6) Rosalind Krauss	1
3) Jacques Derrida	1	7) Thomas Lawson	1
4) Hal Foster	1	8) Craig Owens	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Ian Wallace	1
----------------	---

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

1) 7 written	2) 1 Foucault
--------------	---------------

4) Periodicals Published In

1) C	4
2) Vanguard	3

Miles, Geoff

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	3	5) Victor Burgin	1
2) Gaston Bachelard	1	6) Jacques Lacan	1
3) Jean Baudrillard	1	7) Raymond Williams	1
4) Ann Bermingham	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Dennis Read	2	5) Bart Robinson	1
2) A. Birrell	1	6) Stanley Trigg	1
3) Patrick Dunae	1	7) A.O. Wheeler	1
4) E.J. Hart	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

3/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Borderlines	2
2) Provincial Essays	1

Moorhouse, Asheleigh

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Roland Barthes	7	7) Michel Foucault	2
2) Maurice Merleau-Ponty	4	8) Vincent Leitch	2
3) Rene Girard	3	9) Jean-Paul Sartre	2
4) Julia Kristeva	3	10) Luce Irigaray	1
5) Jacques Lacan	3	11) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
6) Jacques Derrida	2	12) Ferdinand de Saussure	1

2) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

1/1 Foucault

3) Publisher of Monograph

1) Penumbra Press



Sawchuk, Kim

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Jacques Derrida	1	4) Martha Rosler	1
2) Michel Foucault	1	5) Francois Roustang	1
3) Trin T. Minh	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Mark Duncan	1	5) Myrna Kostash	1
2) Suzanne Gauthier	1	6) Arthur Kroker	1
3) Tom Hill	1	7) Paul Phillips	1
4) Kenneth Hughes	1	8) Henry Veltmeyer	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

2/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Border/lines	1
2) Provincial Essays	1

Tuer, Dot

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Jean Baudrillard	4	13) Atina Grossman	1
2) Stephen Heath	3	14) Rosalind Krauss	1
3) Walter Benjamin	2	15) Julia Kristeva	1
4) Jacques Lacan	2	16) Teresa De Laurentis	1
5) Roland Barthes	1	17) Kate Linker	1
6) Georges Bataille	1	18) Laura Mulvey	1
7) Bertold Brecht	1	19) Friedrich Nietzsche	1
8) Victor Burgin	1	20) Adrienne Rich	1
9) Nancy Chodorow	1	21) Jan Swidzinski	1
10) Herve Fischer	1	22) J. Weinstock	1
11) Michel Foucault	1	23) Peter Wollen	1
12) Jane Gallop	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Amerigo Marras	6	15) Anna Groneau	1
2) John Porter	5	16) General Idea	1
3) Philip Monk	2	17) Arther Kroker	1
4) Marusia Bociurkilw	1	18) Beth Learn	1
5) Diane Broadway	1	19) John Massey	1
6) Susan Crean	1	20) Michaelle McLean	1
7) Judith Doyle	1	21) Christian Morrison	1
8) Peter Dudar	1	22) Marlene Philips	1
9) Bruce Elder	1	23) Peter Rist	1
10) Bruce Eves	1	24) Clive Robertson	1
11) Andy Fabo	1	25) Jay Scott	1
12) Martha Fleming	1	26) Lisa Steale	1
13) Fred Forest	1	27) Carolyn White	1
14) Northrop Fry	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

28/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	12
2) C	7
3) Parachute	6
4) Canadian Art	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- 1) A Space 1
- 2) Walter Phillips Gallery 1

Wollheim, Peter

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Walter Benjamin	10	11) Jack Burnham	1
2) Susan Sontag	6	12) Michel Foucault	1
3) Roland Barthes	4	13) Jean-Francois Lyotard	1
4) John Berger	3	14) Karl Marx	1
5) Douglas Crimp	2	15) Philip Pettit	1
6) Arnold Hauser	2	16) Martha Rosler	1
7) Herbert Marcuse	2	17) Leroy Searll	1
8) Allan Sekula	2	18) Leon Trotsky	1
9) Lew Thomas	2	19) Anthonly Wildon	1
10) Benjamin Buchloh	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) James Borcoman	2	9) Dan Macgillivray	1
2) Marshall McLuhan	2	10) Hugh MacLennan	1
3) Eric Cameron	1	11) Cheryl Simon	1
4) Victor Coleman	1	12) Dallas Smythe	1
5) Kenneth Fletcher	1	13) Anthonly Sutcliffe	1
6) Gaile Fisher-Taylor	1	14) Ian Wallace	1
7) Ralph Greenhill	1	15) Robert Wilkie	1
8) William Ivins	1	16) Paul Wong	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

30/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	20
2) Photo Communiqué	8
3) C	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Optica	1
-----------	---

SECTION SIX

Preliminary Analysis of Those Authors Published Work  
Dealt With in the Main Body of the Thesis

Dawkins, Heather

A) Present Position Feminist Art Historian

B) University Education

- 1987 to 1991            The University of Leeds, England
- Currently completing doctoral research on questions of sexuality and representation in France, circa 1860-90. Expect to finish August 1991.
  - Funding from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, Doctoral Fellowships.
- 1984                    M.A. with Distinction in the Social History of Art  
The University of Leeds, England
- 1977-1980              B.F.A., Nova Scotia College of Art and Design,  
Halifax, N.S., Transferred from Red Deer College,  
1975-77.

C) Professional Activities

[Teaching Experience]

- 1988                    Lecturer in Art History, Nova Scotia College of Art  
and Design, Summer Session
- Taught a lecture course based on my Ph.D. research called, 'Social Histories of Art and the Modern Eye/I'.
- 1986-1987              Sessional Lecturer in Nineteenth Century Art  
History, University of British Columbia
- Taught a fourth year seminar, 'Sexuality and Urban Life, 1840-80', a third year lecture course, 'The Emergence of Modern Art', and a second year lecture course on painting, sculpture and architecture, 1700 to the present.

1981-1985 Nova Scotia College of Art and Design, Seminar Course, 1984-85; Instructor, 1981-83.

[Exhibitions and Related Work]

1985-1986 While Exhibitions Officer at Mount Saint Vincent University Art Gallery, (Halifax, Nova Scotia. July '85-June '86) I curated an exhibition of work by Rose Adams and Ingrid Koenig and another of the photographs of Hannah Cullwick. The latter, Purloined Portraits, has been exhibited in Halifax, Vancouver, Winnipeg, and Calgary, and by the Art Gallery of Ontario Extension Services, in Hamilton, Cornwall, Thunder Bay and North Bay.

[Conferences and Panels]

- 1990 Speaker: 'Imag(in)ing Women', The University of Alberta, Edmonton, April 5-7.
- 1989 Speaker: 'Images of Women', The Tate Gallery, Liverpool, October 20-21.
- 1988 Attended: 'AIDS: The Cultural Agenda', Institute for Contemporary Arts, London, March 5-6.
- 1987 Moderator: 'Canada Day', The University of Leeds Fine Art Department, December 8.
- Attended: 'Racism and Cultural Struggle', The University of Leeds, November 21.
- Moderator and Speaker: 'Mining the Archive: Pictures from Everyday Life', (Panel), Talking Pictures, A Conference on Art and Photography, Toronto, October 15-18.
- 1986 Moderator: 'Marxism and Sociology', (Panel), Art History in Canada, Young Scholars Colloquium, Concordia University, Montreal, April 25, 26.
- Attended: 'Resistance, Rebellion and Revolt', The Socialist Scholars Conference, City University of New York, New York, April 18-20.
- Coordinator: 'A Continuing Dialogue, The Art and the Politics of Making Time for Making Art', Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, N.S., February 15.

1985

Coordinator: 'Time and Motion Study', Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, N.S., October 4.

—

Speaker and Participant: 'Feminism and Art, A Symposium', Toronto, February 22-24.

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	4	19) Sigmund Freud	1
2) Griselda Pollock	4	20) Mary Gerrard	1
3) John Tagg	3	21) Catherine Hall	1
4) Elizabeth Cowie	2	22) Pamela Horn	1
5) Rosalind Coward	2	23) Rosemary Jackson	1
6) Leonore Davidoff	2	24) Garth Steedman Jones	1
7) John Ellis	2	25) Gertrud Lenzer	1
8) Paul Hirst	2	26) Karl Marx	1
9) Eunice Lipton	2	27) Rozsika Parker	1
10) Juliet Mitchell	2	28) Karen Peterson	1
11) Penny Wooley	2	29) Mary Louise Pratt	1
12) Victor Burgin	1	30) Jacqueline Rose	1
13) Carol Armstrong	1	31) Martha Rosler	1
14) Charles Bernheimer	1	32) Jean-Paul Sartre	1
15) Sandra Burman	1	33) Richard Schoenwald	1
16) Deborah Cherry	1	34) Liz Stanley	1
17) James Clifford	1	35) Susan Suleiman	1
18) Carol Duncan	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Ramsay Cook	1
2) Paul Kane	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

10/4 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Art History	2
2) Vanguard	5
3) Parachute	2
4) Parrallelogramme	1
5) Arts Atlantic	1
6) American Ceramics	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues (Essays)

1) Mount Saint Vincent University Art Gallery 2

6) Publisher of Monograph

1) Pandora Press 1

2) Rochester Institute of Technology 1



Fleming, Marnie

A) Present Position Curator, London Regional Art Gallery

B) University Education

1980 M.A., University of British Columbia Graduate  
School of Fine Arts, Vancouver, B.C.

— Thesis; William G.R. Hind in British Columbia

1977 Honours Bachelor of Arts, University of Windsor,  
Windsor, Ontario

— Major, Art History

C) Professional Activities

May 1986 - present Curator of Contemporary Art, London Regional Art  
Gallery

Dec. 1981- Education Officer, Vancouver Art Gallery  
May 1986

Aug. 1982- Researcher, Vancouver Art Gallery  
May 1983

Sept. 1980- Extension Officer, Vancouver Art Gallery  
Dec. 1981

1980 Research Curator, U.B.C. Fine Arts Gallery,  
University of British Columbia

1979-1980 Teaching Assistant, Department of Fine Arts,  
University of British Columbia

1978-1979 Intern, U.B.C. Museum of Anthropology (under Dr.  
Alan Sawyer)

1976 Intern, Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit,  
Michigan (under Curator of Decorative Arts, Dr.  
Sheila Tabakoff)

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Roland Barthes	1	8) Antonio Gramsci	1
2) Jean Baudrillard	1	9) Andreas Huyssen	1
3) Walter Benjamin	1	10) Jacques Lacan	1
4) Jack Burnham	1	11) Griselda Pollack	1
5) James Clifford	1	12) Edward Said	1
6) Jacques Derrida	1	13) Gayatri Spivak	1
7) Michel Foucault	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) J. Russell Harper	2	5) James Morton	1
2) Henry Hind	1	6) Richard Prince	1
3) F.W. Howay	1	7) T.A. Richard	1
4) Peter MacNair	1	8) Daisy (My-yah-newh) Sewid-Smith	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

12/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	4
-------------	---

5) Institution that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) London Regional Art Gallery	5
2) Hamilton Art Gallery	1
3) Vancouver Art Gallery	1
4) Legislative Offices at Queen's Park	1

Fry, Philip Frederick

A) Present Position Professor, Department of Visual Arts,  
University of Ottawa

B) University Education

1962-1965 Licence de l'Ecole des Sciences Religieuses of the  
University of Louvain, Belgium

1965-1968 Doctorat d'Universite, Universite de Paris  
(Sorbonne), Philosophy of Art under the direction  
of M. Jean Grenier

October 1970 Diplome de l'Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes

C) Professional Activities

October 1969 Participation in the group study program at the  
Musee de l'Homme. Presentation of the results of  
this research project at the Internation Congress  
of African Studies at Montreal.

March 1969 Exhibition "Structures et polychromes", Galerie de  
la Cathedrale, Fribourg, Suisse.

June-July 1969 Exhibition "Propositions", Galerie du Passeur,  
Paris.

1969 Collaboration in the meetings of the film committee  
of the Panafrican Cultural Festival, Algiers.

1969 Criticism and selection of the works for the  
exhibition "Contemporary African Art", London,  
Camden Arts Centre (in collaboration with  
Jacqueline Delange)

1970 Project and realisation of the exhibition "Oeuvres  
Africaines Nouvelles", Musee de l'Homme, Paris (in  
collaboration with Jacqueline Delange)

July-Sept. 1970 Collaboration in the exhibition "Arts Africains vu  
par les jeunes", Musee de l'Homme; presentation of  
the results at a program involving the use of  
museum collections in both elementary and high  
school art courses.

- Travelling exhibition "African Art" for U.N.E.S.C.O. (in collaboration with Jacqueline Delange and M. Bekambo)
- Nov. 1970-  
June 1973 Curator of Contemporary Art at the Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- 1973 President of the Canadian Section of the International Art Critics Association.
- July 1973-  
May 1975 Program Officer, Visual Arts Section, Canada Council
- Oct. 1973-  
1976 Member of the Consultative Committee of the Aug. National Museums Policy, National Museums Corporation.
- July 1975-  
present Professor, Visual Arts Department, University of Ottawa.
- August 1985-  
present Environmental Landscape Work in Progress (The Old Field Garden) at R.R. 1, Oxford Mills, Ontario.

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	3	7) Gerard Genette	1
2) Ferdinand de Saussure	2	8) A.J. Greimas	1
3) Emile Benveniste	1	9) Roman Jakobson	1
4) Thierry de Duve	1	10) Ladislav Matejka	1
5) Umberto Eco	1	11) Charles S. Pierce	1
6) Herve Fischer	1	12) Irwin R. Titunik	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Ron Martin	2	8) Gaile McGregor	1
2) Anne Brodzky	1	9) Philip Monk	1
3) Gary M. Dault	1	10) Bruce Parsons	1
4) Max Dean	1	11) David Rabinowitch	1
5) Terry Fenton	1	12) Brydon Smith	1
6) Charles Gagnon	1	13) Ross Woodman	1
7) William Ivins Jr.	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

46/6 Foucault

Date of Publication of First Text - 1968

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Revue d'Esthetique	2	5) Parachute	11
2) Nigeria demain	1	6) CarFac News	1
3) Objects et Mondes	1	7) ETC	2
4) Artscanada	4	8) Ottawa Citizen	3

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues (essays)

1) Camden Arts Center [London, England]	1
2) Musee de l'Homme [Paris]	1
3) The Winnipeg Art Gallery	8
4) The Dunlop Art Gallery	1
5) Montreal Museum of Fine Arts	1
6) The Walter Phillips Gallery	1
7) National Gallery of Canada	1
8) London Regional Art Gallery	1
9) Agnes Etherington Art Centre	1
10) Saidye Bronfman Centre	1

Graham, Robert

A) Present Position Investment Councilor, Montreal

B) University Education

.1973 Bachelor of Arts (cum laude), McGill University

1989 Master of Arts (Dean's Honour List) in  
Communication Studies, McGill University. Thesis  
title: Understanding artscanada: History,  
Practice and Idea.

C) Professional Activities

Vice-president and a director, Parachute magazine.  
Member of the editorial board, Parachute magazine.  
Secretary-Treasurer and a director, Sumarria Inc.

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Walter Benjamin	3	15) Edmund Husserl	1
2) Roland Barthes	2	16) Lewid Hyde	1
3) Hans-Georg Gadamer	2	17) Mary Kelly	1
4) Paul Ricoeur	2	18) Rosalind Krauss	1
5) John Tagg	2	19) Jacques Lacan	1
6) Theodor Adorno	1	20) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
7) Jean Baudrillard	1	21) Alasdair MacIntyre	1
8) Howard Becker	1	22) Christian Metz	1
9) John Berger	1	23) Graig Owens	1
10) Ernst Cassirer	1	24) Martha Rosler	1
11) Michel Foucault	1	25) Jo Spence	1
12) Clifford Geertz	1	26) Hayden White	1
13) Anthony Giddons	1	27) Anthony Wildon	1
14) Jurgen Habermas	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) David Barbour	1	8) D.B. Jones	1
2) Jean Boggs	1	9) Z. Kashmeri	1
3) Pierre Dansereau	1	10) Johanne Lamoureux	1
4) Andrew Danson	1	11) Martha Langford	1
5) Ron Graham	1	12) Charles Levin	1
6) Hugh Hugh	1	13) Diana Nemiroff	1
7) Harold Innes	1	14) Peter Newman	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

19/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

- |    |           |    |
|----|-----------|----|
| 1) | Parachute | 13 |
| 2) | Vanguard  | 1  |
| 3) | C         | 1  |

5) Institution that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |    |   |   |
|----|---|---|
| 1) | Canadian Museum of Contemporary Photography | 2 |
| 2) | Musee d'art contemporain de Montreal        | 1 |

Grenville, Bruce

A) Present Position Curator, The Mendel Art Gallery, Saskatoon

B) University Education

1984 International Institute of Semiotic and Structural Studies, University of Toronto.

1984 M.A. (Art History), School of Graduate Studies, Queen's University at Kingston, 1980-1983.

1983 Matisse in America, 1900-1955: A Study of the Dissemination of His Art and Ideas in the United States with Particular Reference to His Influence on Abstract Expressionist Painting in New York.  
M.A. Thesis, Queen's University at Kingston.

1980 B.A. Honours (Art History), Queen's University at Kingston, 1976-1980.

C) Professional Activities

[General Experience]

1989 Curator, The Mendel Art Gallery, Saskatoon

1986-1990 Series Editor, YYZ Critical Works, YYZ Books, Toronto

1985-1988 Toronto Editor, Parachute magazine

1985-1988 Member of Editorial Board for Parachute

1987 Co-ordinator, 'Talking Pictures: A Conference on Art and Photography', Toronto

Fall 1986 Co-ordinator, YYZ Fall Lecture Series, Toronto

May 12, 1985 Co-ordinator, 'Artists/Critics', YYZ Conference, Toronto

1982-1984 Member of the Board of Directors, Kingston Artist's Association Inc.



[Teaching Experience]

- 1988-1989            Lecturer, ('Developments in 20th Century Art'), The Ontario College of Art, Toronto
- 1988                 Lecturer, ('Necessary Conditions'), O.C.A.
- 1988                 Moderator, (The Liberal Arts Seminar: 'On Representation'), O.C.A.
- 1987                 Lecturer, ('Contemporary Canadian Art'), O.C.A., Toronto
- 1987                 Lecturer, ('The Post-modern Condition'), O.C.A., Toronto
- 1980-1983           Teaching Assistant, Department of Art, Queen's University at Kingston

[Guest Lecturer/Panelist]

- 1990                 University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon; AKA Gallery, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
- 1989                 The Alberta College of Art, Calgary; The National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa
- 1988                 The University of Toronto, Toronto; The Ontario Association of Art Galleries, Toronto; The Windsor Art Gallery, Windsor; The University of Windsor, Windsor
- 1987                 Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec; 'Talking Pictures' Photo-Communique Conference, Toronto; The University of Toronto, Toronto
- 1986                 The University of Toronto, Toronto; The Mendel Art Gallery, Saskatoon; The Ontario College of Art, Toronto; York University, Toronto; Koffler Art Centre, Toronto
- 1985                 'Artists/Critics' YZ Conference, Toronto; UAAC Conference, Ottawa; Grimsby Public Art Gallery, Grimsby; St. Lawrence College, Kingston; Queen's University, Kingston

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	12	15) Thierry de Duve	1
2) Gilles Deleuze	7	16) Joel Fineman	1
3) Walter Benjamin	5	17) Sigmund Freud	1
4) Roland Barthes	4	18) Jane Gallop	1
5) Jean Baudrillard	4	19) Martin Heidegger	1
6) Filex Guattari	4	20) Luce Irigranay	1
7) Jacques Lacan	4	21) Fredric Jameson	1
8) Benjamin Buchloh	2	22) Rosalind Krauss	1
9) Jacques Derrida	2	23) Julia Kristeva	1
10) Jean-Francois Lyotard	2	24) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
11) Paul Ricoeur	2	25) Paul de Man	1
12) Jean-Paul Sartre	2	26) Frederic Nietzsche	1
13) Douglas Crimp	1	27) Paul Virilio	1
14) Jonathan Culler	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Philip Monk	8	11) Trevor Gould	1
2) John Clark	3	12) Renee Van Halm	1
3) Louise Noguchi	2	13) Lynn Hughes	1
4) Brain Boigon	1	14) Paul Knotter	1
5) Gary M. Dault	1	15) Sam Mallin	1
6) Louise Dompierre	1	16) Allan McCollum	1
7) Judith Doyle	1	17) Jerry McGarth	1
8) Vera Frenkel	1	18) Jeanne Randolph	1
9) Philip Fry	1	19) Michael Snow	1
10) Eldon Garnet	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

71/12 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Canadian Art	5	5) Artviews	1
2) Parachute	22	6) C	2
3) Vanguard	5	7) Queen's Quarterly	1
4) Artscribe	1	8) Art Magazine	1

5)	<u>Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]</u>	
1)	Mendel Art Gallery	5
2)	S.L. Simpson Gallery	4
3)	Southern Alberta Art Gallery	4
4)	YYZ Artist's Outlet	7
5)	The 49th Parrallel	2
6)	The Power Plant	1
7)	Mount St. Vincent University Art Gallery	1
8)	The Art Gallery of Greater Victoria	1
9)	The MacDonald-Steward Art Gallery	1
10)	The National Gallery of Canada	1
11)	The Agnes Etherington Art Centre	3
12)	Institute for Art and Urban Resources, P.S.I., New York	1
13)	Mercer Union	1

Gould, Trevor

A) Present Position Faculty member, Concordia University, Faculty of Fine Arts

B) University Education

- 1987 M.A. thesis accepted. Institute of Canadian Studies, Carleton University, Ottawa, Ontario.  
Thesis: Standing on the Corner: Issues in Contemporary Canadian Sculpture.
- 1976-1979 Bachelor of Arts, University of South Africa  
Major: Psychology, Sociology
- 1971-1974 Four year Fine Art Teachers Diploma (National Art Teachers Diploma)  
Major: Printmaking and Sculpture, Johannesburg College of Art
- 1969 Matriculated from the High School of Art Music and Ballet, Johannesburg

C) Professional Activities

[Conferences]

- 1990 Invitation to participate in the Banff "Summer Studio"; Theme "Border Cultures"
- October 1989 Slide presentation on my work. State Academy of Art Poznan, Poland; BWA Gallery Zielona Gora, Poland
- May 1989 Present my work as well as slide/lecture: "Disjointed Narratives: Sculpture in Montreal". State Academy of Fine Art, Poznan
- May 1989 Present my work as well as lecture: "Disjointed Narratives: Sculpture in Montreal". Hochschule Fur Gestaltung, Offenbach am Main, Germany
- March 1988 Slide lecture, Dalhousie Art Gallery, Halifax; Studio Visit, N.A.S.C.D. Halifax
- 1987 Present paper, "Object and Image in Canadian Sculpture" Sculpture Symposium, National Gallery Ottawa, Network of Sculptors

- 1987 University Art Association Conference, Victoria, B.C. Panel - "Installation Art of the 80's. Present paper Sitting the Object: The Question of the Object's Domain
- 1986 Visiting Artist-Lecture. Aspects of Contemporary Sculpture, University of Victoria, B.C.

[Committees]

1982-1984 Board member S.A.W. Gallery Ottawa, Ontario

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Louis Marin	2	10) Michel Foucault	1
2) Thomas Luckmann	2	11) Jurgen Harten	1
3) Alfred Schutz	2	12) Andreas Huyssen	1
4) Roland Barthes	1	13) Rosalind Krauss	1
5) Peter Burger	1	14) R.D. Laing	1
6) Thomas Crow	1	15) J.G. Merquior	1
7) Jacques Derrida	1	16) Madan Sarup	1
8) Terry Eagleton	1	17) Richard Scholes	1
9) Umberto Eco	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Mowry Baden	1
2) Andrew Dutkewych	1
3) Tom Sherman	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

24/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	6
2) Parachute	9
3) C	4
4) Beaux Arts (Paris)	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- 1) Art Gallery of Hamilton 1
- 2) Galerie Christiane Chassay 3

Johnstone, Lesley

A) Present Position Publications Coordinator, Artexpte Information Centre, Montreal

B) University Education

1983-1986 M.A. in Art History, Universite de Montreal, Montreal, Quebec  
Thesis: The Concept of Installation in Contemporary Artistic Discourse. Thesis Director: Rene Payant

1978-1982 B.A. in Visual Arts (Honours - Art History), University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario

C) Professional Activities

1989-1990 Part-time professor, Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec. Course: Issues in the Montreal Art Milieu

May 1989- Publications co-ordinator, Artexpte Information Centre, present Montreal, Quebec

1987- Quebec Editor, Vanguard Magazine, Vancouver, July 1989 B.C.

1987- President - Board of Directors, Artexpte present Information Centre, Montreal, Quebec

1985 Assistant editor, Aurora Borealis catalogue, Centre international d'art contemporain, Montreal, Quebec

1983-1984 Organizing Committee, Montreal-Tout-Terrain exhibition, Montreal, Quebec

1982- Coordinatrice, Artexpte Information Centre, 1989 May, Montreal, Quebec

Summer 1981 Coordinatrice of exhibition program, Saw Gallery, Ottawa, Ontario

1979-1981 Visual Arts and Geography Slide Libraries, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Rosalind Krauss	8	10) Thierry de Duve	1
2) Douglas Crimp	4	11) Hal Foster	1
3) Walter Benjamin	3	12) Michel Foucault	1
4) Benjamin Buchloh	3	13) Sigmund Freud	1
5) Annette Michelson	3	14) Martin Heidegger	1
6) Craig Owens	3	15) Mary Kelly	1
7) Victor Burgin	2	16) Maurice Merleau-Ponty	1
8) Jean-Francois Lyotart	2	17) Martha Rosler	1
9) Jack Burnham	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Rene Payant	13	19) Jessica Bradley	1
2) Diana Nemiroff	4	20) Michele Deschatelets	1
3) Chantel Pontbriand	4	21) Anne-Marie Duguet	1
4) Christine Ross	4	22) Jacqueline Fry	1
5) Martha Fleming	3	23) Claude Gosselin	1
6) Philip Fry	3	24) Trevor Gould	1
7) Johanne Lamoureux	3	25) Bruce Grenville	1
8) Philip Monk	3	26) Ian-Carr Harris	1
9) Eric Cameron	2	27) Lise Lamarche	1
10) Bruce Ferguson	2	28) Roald Nasgaard	1
11) Peggy Gale	2	29) Marie Perrault	1
12) Alain Laframboise	2	30) Louis Poissant	1
13) Robert Racine	2	31) Yolande Racine	1
14) Jeanne Randolph	2	32) Brydon Smith	1
15) Richard Rhodes	2	33) Normand Theriault	1
16) Bruce Barber	1	34) David Tomas	1
17) Jean Belisle	1	35) Elke Town	1
18) Chantel Boulanger	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

13/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	7
2) Spirale	1



5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |    |   |   |
|----|---|---|
| 1) | Centre international d'art contemporain de Montreal | 1 |
| 2) | Optica  | 1 |
| 3) | Southern Alberta Art Gallery                        | 1 |
| 4) | Editions Artexes                                    | 1 |

Keziere, Russell

A) Present Position Managing Director Canada Bestinfo Inc.

B) University Education

1975 B.A. (Hons.) English Literature, University of  
Victoria; University of Massachusetts, Amherst

1976 Independent Studies in Metaphysics, Seminary of  
Christ the King Mission, B.C.

C) Professional Activities

1990 Managing Director Canada Bestinfo, Inc.

1988-1989 President, Cordova Systems

1978-1988 Editor/Publisher, Vanguard

1977-1978 Associate Editor, Criteria

1976-1984 CBC Freelance Broadcaster, Contributed over 300  
reviews, interviews and documentaries, nationally  
and regionally

1983-1984 Editorial Board, Visions: Contemporary Canadian  
Art

1983-1984 Founding Director, Vancouver Artists League

1984-1987 Computer columnist, Equity magazine

1976-1978 Producer, Vancouver City Digest weekly radio show  
and cassette tape magazine for the blind

[Selected Lectures]

(at least once at each of the following)

Banff Centre

Carnegie Mellon University

Contemporary Art Gallery, Vancouver

Emily Carr College of Art & Design

Glenbow Museum

Humanities Institute, Vancouver

Kooteney School of Writing, Vancouver

Mendel Art Gallery

Mountain Lake Symposium, West Virginia

Nova Scotia College of Art & Design

Optica/Powerhouse/Articule, Montreal

Rutgers University, School of Visual Art

Seattle Art Museum

Simon Fraser University

Society for Photographic Educators

Southern Alberta Art Gallery

University of British Columbia  
 University of Lethbridge  
 University of Ottawa  
 University of Saskatoon  
 University of Victoria  
 University of Western Ontario  
 Windsor Art Gallery

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	2	10) G.W.F. Hegel	1
2) Martin Jay	2	11) Peter Hohendahl	1
3) Theodor Adorno	1	12) Lewis Hyde	1
4) Georges Bataille	1	13) Mieczylaw Krapiec	1
5) Bertolt Brecht	1	14) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
6) Jacques Derrida	1	15) Emmanuel Levinas	1
7) Terry Eagleton	1	16) Leon Trotsky	1
8) Hans Georg Gadamer	1	17) Hayden White	1
9) Jurgen Habermas	1	18) Janet Wolff	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Dian Cohn	1	4) Andy Patton	1
2) Ian Carr-Harris	1	5) Kristin Shannon	1
3) Bill Jones	1		

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

31/2 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	25
2) Criteria	1
3) Black Flash	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Contemporary Art Gallery	1
2) Southern Alberta Art Gallery	1
3) Hamilton Street	1
4) Presentation House	1

Klepac, Walter

A) Present Position Art Critic, Toronto, Ontario

B) University Education

— Studied Aesthetics, Theory of Criticism and Art History at Wayne State University, Detroit, Michigan  
B.A. - Double Major in English Literature and Philosophy

C) Professional Activities

1977-1978 Taught a course on the Development of Modernism and Modern Art at the New School of Art, Toronto, Ontario

1977-present A member of the Canadian section of the International Association of Art Critics (AICA)

February 1975 "Sculpture Today". Paper and panel discussion at the Canadian University Art Association meeting in Toronto

October 1975 "The Radical Denials of David Hume". Lecture, Ontario College of Art

February 1976 "The Unexpected Relevance of Kant's Concept of Imagination to Contemporary Art". Lecture, Ontario College of Art

October 1976 "Some Contemporary Canadian Sculptors". Lecture, University of Ottawa

February 1977 "The Material Base of Painting". Paper and panel discussion at the Canadian University Art Association annual meeting in Montreal

March 1977 Canadian Art Magazine Conference. Panelist, seminar at Hart House, University of Toronto

March 1977 "The Critic's Job of Work". Lecture, Ontario College of Art

December 1977 "Contemporary Art Publications". Chair, panel at the Canadian Section of the International Association of Art Critics (AICA) meeting in Toronto. Panel members included Michael Greenwood, Chantal

Ponbriand, and Rosalind Krauss

- March 1978 "Critics on Criticism". Panelist, Ontario College of Art Seminar, Toronto
- June 1980-  
February 1981 Served with seven other critics as a consultant and co-author (with Philip Monk and Richard Rhodes) the original draft proposal for a grant assistance program for visual art critics at the Ontario Arts Council. The program was subsequently adopted by the Council
- November 1, 1982 "Art in Life/Life in Art". Lecture (opposite Thomas Lawson), A Critical Structuring, sponsored by YVZ Artists' Outlet, Toronto
- February 2, 1985 International Symposium on the New Sculpture. Panelist, Norman Mackenzie Art Gallery, Regina, Saskatchewan. Other panelists included: Bill Woodrow, Bertrand Lavier, Roland Brenner, Tony Brown, Bruce Ferguson, and Sandy Nairn
- "Postmodernism as Privileged Discourse of the Visual Arts in the 1980's. Lectures on related topics at the following institutions:
- September 25, 1985 University of Ottawa
- December 2, 1985 Trent University, Peter Robinson College
- February 17, 1986 University of Western Ontario
- November 3, 1986 Ontario College of Art
- January 1988 Juror, Art and Interdisciplinary Periodicals, Canada Council
- February 26, 1989 "Concept/Process". Paper and panel discussion, Dundas Valley School of Art Seminar, sponsored by the Ontario Arts Council
- "Ron Martin: The Language of the Black Paintings". A series of lectures given in conjunction with the Art Gallery of Ontario exhibition, Ron Martin, 1971-1981 at the following institutions:
- March 5, 1989 Art Gallery of Ontario, Jackman Hall
- March 29, 1989 University of Guelph
- February 18, 1990 National Gallery of Canada

- March 22, 1989 "The Options After Postmodernism". Lecture, Ontario College of Art, Stewart Building
- June 1989 Authored draft of "Impact and Opportunities: The Visual Art Critics Program of the Ontario Arts Council" on behalf of the Coalition of Writers for the Visual Arts. This program has since been reinstated
- September 17, 1989 "Guido Molinari, 1951-1961: The Black and White Paintings". Panelist, Art Gallery of Windsor, Windsor, Ontario. Other panelist were Guido Molinari and Matthew Teirelbaum (moderator)
- November 14, 1989 "The Persistence of Late Modernism". Lecture, Ontario College of Art
- April 29, 1990 "Contextuality and Disappearance of the Art Object". Panelist, C Magazine Roundtable Discussion, YZ Artists' Outlet, Toronto. Other panelists included were Bruce Ferguson, Janice Gurney, Carol Laing, Joyce Mason, Richard Rhodes and Brydon Smith. (Transcription published, C Magazine, 27, Fall 1990.)
- August 27, 1990 "Is Too Much, Too Much? Data Overload in the 90s". Paper and panel discussion, XXIVth Annual Congress of the International Art Critics Association (AICA) Toronto
- October 11, 1990 "The Recent Colour Paintings of Ron Martin". A discussion with the artist, Forest City Gallery, London, Ontario

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Rosalind Krauss	4	9) Hal Foster	1
2) Douglas Crimp	2	10) Michel Foucault	1
3) Annette Michelson	2	11) Mary Kelly	1
4) Roland Barthes	1	12) Jacques Lacan	1
5) Walter Benjamin	1	13) Kate Linker	1
6) T.J. Clarke	1	14) Craig Owen	1
7) Arthur Danto	1	15) Ferdinand de Saussure	1
8) Jacques Derrida	1	16) John Sturrock	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Ron Martin	4	8) Johanne Lamoureux	1
2) Roald Nasgaard	3	9) Robin Mackenzie	1
3) Judith Allsopp	1	10) Chantel Pontbrian	1
4) Karl Beveridge	1	11) Reinhard Reitzenstein	1
5) Carol Conde	1	12) Michael Snow	1
6) Charles Dawson	1	13) Pierre Theberge	1
7) Murray Favro	1	14) Jeff Wall	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

20/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Arts Canada	9
2) Vanguard	4
3) Parachute	2
4) C	2
5) Canadian Forum	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Southern Alberta Art Gallery	1
2) Macdonald Steward Art Centre	1
3) Art Gallery of Ontario	1

Monk, Philip

A) Present Position Curator, Contemporary Art, Art Gallery of Ontario

B) University Education

1968-1969 Environmental Studies, Faculty of Architecture, University of Manitoba

1972 Bachelor of Arts, University of Manitoba, Dean's Honour List

1978 Master of Arts (History of Art), University of Toronto, University of Toronto Master's Fellowship

C) Professional Activities

[Teaching]

1977-1978 Victoria College, University of Toronto, (Vic 312 Surrealism)

1979 School of Art, University of Manitoba, January-April, (54.376 History of Canadian Art II)

1976-1978 Department of Fine Arts, University of Toronto, (Teaching Assistant in Art History for four courses)

1989 Atkinson College, York University, Summer, (AK/VISA 4450.03 Studies in Canadian Art)

[Boards]

1980-1982 A Space, Toronto, President of Board

1984-1985 Parachute, Montreal, Editorial Board and Toronto Editor

— 49th Parallel Advisory Board

[Curating]

1981-1982 "Language and Representation", A Space, Toronto (five exhibitions, two screenings and performance), November-February, Catalogue: Language and Representation, Toronto: A Space



- 1983 "From Object to Reference", Carmen Lamanna Gallery, Toronto, June
- 1984 "The Practice of Pictures", YYZ, Toronto, (a one day conference of lectures and panels), February 12
- "Subjects in Pictures", YYZ, Toronto, September 24 - October 13; 49th Parallel, New York, October 27-November 24; Catalogue: Subjects in Pictures, Toronto, YYZ
- 1985-1986 "Object and Reference", Art Gallery of Ontario, November 9, '85 - February 12, '86
- "Bernie Miller", Art Gallery of Ontario, June 14-August 24; Catalogue: Bernie Miller (with Barbara Fischer), Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- "Liz Magor", Art Gallery of Ontario, September 6-November 9; Catalogue: Liz Magor, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1987 "Joyce Wieland", Art Gallery of Ontario, April 16-June 28, Catalogue coordination: Joyce Wieland, Toronto: Key Porter and Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1987-1988 "Rodney Graham", Art Gallery of Ontario, November 28, '87 - January 31, '88; Artists' Book co-publication: The System of Landor's Cottage, Brussels: Yves Gevaert and the Art Gallery of Ontario
- "Shirley Wiitasalo", Art Gallery of Ontario, December 18, '87 - February 28, '88; Catalogue: Shirley Wiitasalo, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- "Paterson Ewen: Phenomena, Paintings 1971-1987", Art Gallery of Ontario, January 22 - April 3; Catalogue: Paterson Ewen: Phenomena, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1988-1989 "Ian Carr-Harris: 1971-1977", Art Gallery of Ontario, November 12, '88 - February 5, '89; Catalogue: Ian Carr-Harris: 1971-1977, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- "Ron Martin", Art Gallery of Ontario, February 10-May 14; Catalogue coordination: Ron Martin, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- "Gordon Lebrecht: The Everyday Use of the Word", Art Gallery of Ontario, April 15 - July 30

1989-1990 "4 hours and 38 minutes" the videotapes of Lisa Steele and Kim Tomczak", Art Gallery of Ontario, November 10, '89 - January 10, '90; Catalogue: 4 hours and 38 minutes, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario

1990 "Photographis Inscription: Kunst aus Toronto", Forum fur Kulturaustausch, Stuttgart, August 28-October 14; Catalogue: Photographic Inscription: Kunst aus Toronto, Stuttgart: Forum fur kulturaustausch

[Visiting Lecturer]

1980 Department of Visual Arts, University of Ottawa, February

— School of Art, University of Manitoba, March

1981 Nova Scotia College of Art and Design, May

1983 Emily Carr College of Art, October

[Symposium Lectures]

1980 "Performance et multidisciplinarite: Post-modernism", Montreal, October, (Lecture published in Performance, Montreal: Parachute, 1981)

— "Colloque sur la Theatralite", University of Toronto, November, (Lecture published in English in Modern Drama (March 1982) and in French in Theatralite, ecriture et mise en scene, Montreal: Hurtubise HMH, 1985)

1983 "Art, Technology and Mass Culture", Montreal, April (panel); "International Exposure", Toronto, may (panel)

1984 College Art Association, Toronto, February (panel); "The Practice of Pictures", Toronto, February (lecture and panels)

— "Discussion: art and criticism in the eighties", Toronto, March (panels)

1985 "Centre-Periphery", Alma, Quebec, June (panel)

— "Points de vue, points de fuite", Montreal, October (panel)

- 1989 "Made in Canada/Fait au Canada", University of Regina, March (panel)
- "What Constitutes Sculpture", Koffler Gallery, Toronto, June (panel)
- [Lectures]
- 1977 Art Gallery of Ontario, Education Services, June
- 1978 Victoria College, University of Toronto, February
- Innis College, University of Toronto, March
- 1979 School of Architecture, University of Toronto, March
- Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, (panels), December
- 1981 Department of Visual Arts, York University, July
- Department of Fine Arts, University of Toronto, July
- Department of Visual Arts, University of Western Ontario, October
- 1982 School of Architecture, University of Waterloo, November
- YYZ, Toronto, ("A Critical Structuring"), November
- 1983 A Space, Toronto, ("Talking, A Habit"), January
- Open Space, Victoria, March
- Simon Fraser University, March
- Simon Fraser University, October
- 1984 Ontario College of Art, Toronto, January
- Ontario College of Art, Toronto, October
- Norman MacKenzie Art Gallery, Regina, November
- Department of Fine Arts, University of Regina, November
- 1985 Woodsworth College, University of Toronto, March

- 1986 Ontario Association of Art Galleries, Art Gallery of Ontario, (panel), March
- Department of Visual Arts, York University, March
- Ontario College of Art, Toronto, March
- Ontario College of Art, (panel), March
- Harbourfront Art Gallery, Toronto, (panel), April
- 1987 Rodman Hall Arts Centre, St. Catharines, March
- Art Gallery of Windsor, Windsor, March
- The Robert McLaughlin Gallery, Oshawa, April
- Visual Arts Ontario, October
- York University, Toronto, November
- 1988 Graduate Department, School of Fine Arts, York University, March
- Canadian Museum Association, St. John, (panel), June
- 1989 Public Access, Toronto, November
- Ontario College of Art, Toronto, January
- National Gallery of Canada, Ottawa, November

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Jacques Derrida	15	26) Roman Jakobson	2
2) Roland Barthes	14	27) Jean-Paul Sartre	2
3) Georges Bataille	7	28) Perry Anderson	1
4) Gilles Deleuze	7	29) Mikhail Bakhtin	1
5) Felix Guattari	7	30) Pierre Bourdieu	1
6) Georg Lukacs	7	31) Jack Burnham	1
7) Jean Baudrillard	6	32) Noam Chomsky	1
8) Jean-Francois Lyotard	6	33) Arthur Danto	1
9) Michel Foucault	5	34) Mary Douglas	1
10) Jacques Lacan	5	35) Bernard Edelman	1
11) Rosalind Krauss	4	36) Marvin Farber	1
12) Karl Marx	4	37) Sigmund Freud	1
13) Walter Benjamin	3	38) Hans-Georg Gadamer	1
14) Bertolt Brecht	3	39) Rene Girard	1

15)	Benjamin Buchloh	3	40)	Luce Irigaray	1
16)	Claude Levi-Strauss	3	41)	Immanuel Kant	1
17)	Annette Michelson	3	42)	Mary Kelly	1
18)	Friedrich Nietzsche	3	43)	Alexander Kojève	1
19)	Theodor Adorno	2	44)	Marcel Mauss	1
20)	Louis Althusser	2	45)	Maurice Merleau-Ponty	1
21)	J.L. Austin	2	46)	Charles Pierce	1
22)	Maurice Blanchot	2	47)	Ferdinand de Saussure	1
23)	Douglas Crimp	2	48)	John Searle	1
24)	G.W.F. Hegel	2	49)	Thomas Sebeok	1
25)	Max Horkheimer	2	50)	Allen Sekula	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1)	Ian Carr-Harris	5	14)	Jo-Anne Tessaak	1
2)	Tom Sherman	5	15)	Geoffrey James	1
3)	General Idea	4	16)	Marshall McLuhan	1
4)	Roald Nasgaard	4	17)	Bernie Miller	1
5)	A.A. Bronson	3	18)	France Morin	1
6)	Liz Magor	3	19)	John Murchie	1
7)	Clive Robertson	3	20)	Andy Patton	1
8)	Bruce Barber	2	21)	Dorothy Shadbolt	1
9)	Peggy Gale	2	22)	Jeffrey Simpson	1
10)	David Rabinowitch	2	23)	Matthew Teitelbaum	1
11)	Judith Doyle	1	24)	Elke Town	1
12)	Paterson Ewen	1	25)	George Trakas	1
13)	Tim Guest	1	26)	Krzysztof Wodiczko	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

68/5 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1)	Parachute	23	9)	Parrallogramme	1
2)	Only Paper Today	1	10)	Fuse	1
3)	Impulse	2	11)	C	1
4)	Modern Drama	1	12)	Art Forum	1
5)	Canadian Forum	3	13)	Art Views	1
6)	File	1	14)	Art Express	3
7)	ZG	1	15)	Public	1
8)	Vanguard	13	16)	Artists Review	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1)	London Regional Art Gallery	1
2)	Artists Cooperative Toronto	1
3)	Mendel Art Gallery	1
4)	P.S.I., (New York)	1
5)	Wurttembergischer Kunstverein	1
6)	Centre Culturel Canadian, Paris	1
7)	A Space	1
8)	YYZ, Toronto	1
9)	Art Gallery of Ontario	5
10)	Documenta, Kassel	1

6) Publisher of Monograph

- 1) Rumour

Patten, James

A) Present Position Gallery Assistant, Art 45, Montreal

B) University Education

1990 M.A. - Art History, (completed, all but degree),  
McGill University, Montreal

1986 B.A. (specialist program in Art History),  
University of Toronto

C) Professional Activities

1989-present Assistant to the Director, Galerie Art 45 Inc.,  
Montreal, Quebec

1986-1989 Teaching Assistant, Department of Art History,  
McGill University, Montreal

1986 Curatorial Assistant, The Power Plant, Contemporary  
Art at Harbourfront, Toronto, Ontario

1985 Curatorial Internship, Department of Prints and  
Photographs, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New  
York, New York

1984 Acting Assistant Curator, Department of Prints and  
Drawings, The Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto

1983 Research Assistant, Department of Art History,  
University of Toronto, Toronto

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Walter Benjamin	4	3) Michel Foucault	3
2) Martin Heidegger	4	4) Albert Boime	2

2) Number of Text Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that  
Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

4/2 Foucault

3) Periodicals Published In

- |                    |   |
|--------------------|---|
| 1) Perspectives    | 2 |
| 2) Etudes des Arts | 1 |



Simon, Cheryl

A) Present Position Freelance Writer

B) University Education

1977-1981 B.A.A. - Photographic Arts/Media Studies, Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto

1983-1988 M.F.A. - Studio Arts/Photography, Concordia University, Montreal

C) Professional Activities

[Curatorial Experience]

1988 "Towards the Photograph as a Vulgar Document", 15th Anniversary Exhibition, Book and Symposium Optica, Montreal (co-curated)

1989 "The Zone of Conventional Practice and Other Real Stories", Travelling exhibition and book Optica, Montreal

[Teaching Experience]

1985 Continuing Education/Photography Instructor, The Protestant School Board of Greater Montreal

Photography Instructor/Summer Series, Cinema and Photography Department, Concordia University, Montreal

1985-1986 Substitute Photography Instructor, Creative Arts Department, Champlain College, Longueuil, Quebec

1986-1988 Photography Lecturer/Part-time, Dawson College, Montreal, "The New School"

1988 Sessional Lecturer, Nova Scotia College of Art and Design

1990 Sessional Appointment, Assistant Professor, Nova Scotia College of Art and Design

[Media Interviews]

1980 "9 & 5 Lectures and Workshops on Photography", C.J.R.T., Toronto, Arts and Culture

- 1985 "Feminism and Photography", C.B.C., "Brave New Waves", Montreal
- 1986 "Post-modern Photography", C.B.C., "Brave New Waves", Montreal
- 1989 "Art on Air" on "Impulse", C.K.L.N.

[Public Presentations - Lectures/Gallery Talks/Symposia]

- 1984 "Canadian Topographical Photography", Champlain College, Longueuil, Quebec
- 1985 "Themes in Contemporary Photography", Dawson College, Montreal/"The New School"
- 1986 "Post-modern Photography", Powerhouse, Montreal
- "Image and Text in Photography", Concordia University, Montreal
- 1987 "Post-modern Photography", Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto
- "Narrative Photography", Emily Carr College of Art and Design, Vancouver
- 1988 Presentation on my own work, Dazibao, Montreal
- 1989 Presentation on my own work, The Toronto Photographer's Workshop, Toronto
- "The Zone of Conventional Practice..", University of Ottawa
- 1990 Presentation on my own work, The Banff Centre, Banff, Alberta
- "The Zone of Conventional Practice and Other Real Stories", Presentation House, Vancouver
- "Reading and Writing Female: Autobiography and Photography", The Nova Scotia College of Art and Design
- Panel member "Mutating Strategies: (Re)inventing the Documentary", The Photographer's Gallery, Saskatoon
- Gallery talk on "The Zone of Conventional Practice", The Mendel Art Gallery, Saskatoon
- Co-chair and presentation at "Voices/Voix", a

symposium on photography and language, The Banff Centre, Banff, Alberta

[Associations]

- 1980- Associate Member - Toronto Photographer's Workshop, Toronto
- 1986-1990 Member of the Board of Directors-Optica, Montreal, A.N.N.P.A.C., rep./President 1986-1989
- 1990 Associate member, Vu, Quebec, Quebec

[Special Activities]

- 1979-1980 Co-ordination of workshops in association with Ryerson Polytechnical Institute with visiting artists: Emmet Gowin, Berenice Abbott, Walter & Naomi Rosenblum
- 1981-1982 Programme co-ordination for "9 & 5" Lectures and Workshops on Contemporary Photography in collaboration with Photo Communique magazine
- 1987 Symposium co-ordination for Optica's 15th anniversary project "Towards the Photography as a Vulgar Document"
- 1989 Consultant for "Voices/Voix", symposium on Photography and Language for the Banff Centre

[Related Work Experience]

- 1976-1978 Photographer/Darkroom Technician, Dominion Wide Photography, Ottawa
- 1980 Assisted with re-organization of photography collections at Ryerson Polytechnical Institute; Photographic Arts Resource Centre & The National Gallery of Canada (volunteer)
- Slide Librarian, Visual Communication Slide Library, Canadian Government Office of Tourism
- 1981 Slide Library Clerk, Faculty of Fine Arts, Slide Library, York University
- 1982-1983 Library Assistant, CISTI, National Research Council, Ottawa

- 1983-1985            Photographer/Technician, Part-time, Art History Department, Slide Library, Concordia University, Montreal
- 1984-1985            Concordia University, Montreal; National Gallery of Canada - Teaching Slide Production Project
- 1986-1988            Photography Technician, Part-time, Creative Arts Department, Vanier College, St-Laurent, Quebec

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Roland Barthes	3	15) Fredric Jameson	1
2) Jacques Derrida	2	16) Alice Jardine	1
3) Terry Eagleton	2	17) Rosalind Krauss	1
4) Luce Irigaray	2	18) Julia Kristeva	1
5) Teresa De Laurentis	2	19) Claude Levi-Strauss	1
6) Jean-Francois Lyotard	2	20) Laura Mulvey	1
7) Chris Weeden	2	21) Vladimir Propp	1
8) Hazard Adams	1	22) Martha Rosler	1
9) Jean Baudrillard	1	23) Edward Said	1
10) Walter Benjamin	1	24) Ferdinand de Saussure	1
11) Richard Bolton	1	25) Alan Sekula	1
12) Douglas Crimp	1	26) Susan Sontag	1
13) Umberto Eco	1	27) Jack Zipes	1
14) Michel Foucault	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Josee Belisle	1	5) Joy Zeme Long	1
2) Angela Grauerholz	1	6) Chantel Ponthriand	1
3) Monica Haim	1	7) Elizabeth Seaton	1
4) Nina Levitt	1	8) Keith Wallace	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

19/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) C	2
2) Vanguard	10
3) Views	3
4) Black Flash	1
5) Photo Communique	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- 1) Mercer Union 1
- 2) Optica 1

Watson, Scott

A) Present Position Curator, Fine Arts Gallery, University of British Columbia

B) University Education

1975 B.A., University of British Columbia

1977 M.A., University of British Columbia

Department of Fine Arts Thesis: Jean Leon Gerome and Photographic Practice

C) Professional Activities

1976-1977 Teaching Assistant, Department of Fine Arts, University of British Columbia

1977-1978 Sessional Instructor, Department of Fine Arts, University of British Columbia

1978-1980 Registrar, Vancouver Art Gallery

1980 Curator, Surrey Art Gallery

1980-1987 Curator, Vancouver Art Gallery

1988-1989 Sessional Instructor, Department of Fine Arts, University of British Columbia

1989 Curator, Fine Arts Gallery, University of British Columbia

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Michel Foucault	7	17) Gilles Deleuze	1
2) Theodor Adorno	4	18) Rene Girard	1
3) Walter Benjamin	4	19) Filix Guattari	1
4) Roland Barthes	3	20) Arnold Hauser	1
5) Herbert Marcuse	3	21) Pierre Klossowski	1
6) Gaston Bachelard	2	22) Rosalind Krauss	1
7) Jean Baudrillard	2	23) Jacques Lacan	1
8) Benjamin Buchloh	2	24) Georg Lukacs	1
9) Jacques Derrida	2	25) Karl Marx	1
10) Jean-Francois Lyotard	2	26) Maurice Merleau-Ponty	1

11)	Perry Anderson	1	27)	Annette Michelson	1
12)	John Berger	1	28)	Craig Owens	1
13)	Maurice Blanchot	1	29)	Ferdinand de Saussure	1
14)	Albert Boime	1	30)	Susan Sontag	1
15)	Douglas Crimp	1	31)	Sebastiano Timpanara	1
16)	Guy Debord	1			

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1)	Jack Shadbolt	9	26)	R.H. Hubbard	1
2)	Fred Amess	2	27)	William Ivins	1
3)	Lawren Harris	2	28)	Anthony Jackson	1
4)	Joan Lowndes	2	29)	John Korner	1
5)	John Bentley Mays	2	30)	Robert Kroetsch	1
6)	Jerry Pethick	2	31)	Rob Linsley	1
7)	Walter Abell	1	32)	Liz Magor	1
8)	Kim Adams	1	33)	Steve McCaffery	1
9)	Mowry Baden	1	34)	Al McWilliams	1
10)	B.C. Binning	1	35)	Guido Molinari	1
11)	Bill Bissett	1	36)	Roald Nasgaard	1
12)	Robin Blaser	1	37)	Marguerite Pinney	1
13)	Roland Brener	1	38)	Denis Reid	1
14)	Donald W. Buchanan	1	39)	Luke Rombout	1
15)	James Campbell	1	40)	Ann Rosenberg	1
16)	Barry Cogswell	1	41)	Charles Scott	1
17)	Virginai Le Comer	1	42)	Douglas Shadbolt	1
18)	Jo-Anne Birnie Dansker	1	43)	Richard Simmons	1
19)	Christos Dikeakos	1	44)	Ruby Sutherland	1
20)	Anthony Emery	1	45)	Dorothea Sweeney	1
21)	Gathie Falk	1	46)	Jeff Wall	1
22)	Peggy Gale	1	47)	Ian Wallace	1
23)	John Goss	1	48)	Robert Welsh	1
24)	John Greyson	1	49)	William Wood	1
25)	Stephen Horne	1			

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

62/7 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1)	Vanguard	20	5)	Parachute	2
2)	C	3	6)	Wolkenkratzer Art Journal	3
3)	ArtCom	1	7)	Artscribe	2
4)	Canadian Art	5	8)	The Capilano Review	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

1) Surrey Art Gallery	1
2) Canada House [London]	1
3) Canadian Cultural Centre	1
4) Vancouver Art Gallery	13
5) Fine Arts Gallery, University of British Columbia	2
6) Vancouver Artist's League	1
7) Kuenstlerhaus Bethanien	1
8) Nikolas Sonne Galerie, Berlin	1
9) Kunsthaus Hamburg	1
10) Western Front Gallery	1
11) Artspeak	1
12) Akademie Schloss Solitude, Stuttgart	1

6) Publisher of Monograph

- 1) Douglas & McIntyre, Publishers



Williams, Carol

A) Present Position Teacher at Emily Carr College of Art and Design

B) University Education

Jan. 1991-  
Apr. 1991 Foucault and Feminism, A graduation studies seminar in Comparative Literature, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

June 1990-  
July 1990 Visual Arts Intensive with Mary Kelly, Constance Penley and Andrew Ross at Simon Fraser University, The School for the Contemporary Arts, Vancouver, Canada

July 1990-  
August 1990 Conversation French Intensive, University of British Columbia summer language programs, Vancouver, Canada

Sept. 1987-  
Sept. 1988 MA in the Social History of Art from the University of Leeds Department of Fine Arts in Great Britain. This program is headed by Professor Griselda Pollock and tutor, Fred Orton.

-- MA Thesis Abstract: My thesis investigates the historical context and conditions of a photographic archive entitled Femmes D'Orient signed by La Comtesse de Croix Mesnil. This folio is located in the photographic holdings of the Victoria and Albert Museum in London.

May-Aug. 1985 Feminism and Film Theory with Kaja Silverman, Women's Studies, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, Canada

April 1985 Fine and Performing Arts Degree, with a Major in Interdisciplinary Studies and Visual Arts. Centre for the Arts, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada V5A 1S6

1981-1982 Fine Arts, completed 2nd year, University of Victoria, Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

1980-1981 Winter Studio Program, Banff Centre of Fine Arts, Banff, Alberta, Canada T0I 0C0

C) Professional Activities

[Selected Professional Experience as an Art Historian]

- Sept. 1990-  
Dec. 1990                    Temporary faculty (semester replacement for Marion Penner Bancroft)
- "Dialogues with Photography"; Photography Department, Emily Carr College of Art, 1399 Johnston Street, Granville Island, Vancouver, British Columbia; Dean of Photography: Jim Breukelman
- May 1990-  
Aug. 1990                    Sessional Instructor
- "The Social I/eye—Women and Art 1750-1950", Women's Studies Department, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada V5A 1S6
- May 1989-  
May 1990                    Sessional Instructor
- "Arts in Context - Romanticism"; "Issues in Fine and Performing Arts"; "Contemporary Issues in Visual Arts - 1968-1988"; "The History of Photography 1839-1949", The School for the Contemporary Arts, Visual Arts and Interdisciplinary Sections, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada V5A 1S6
- Sept. 1988-  
April 1989                    Sessional Lecturer
- "Nineteenth Century Survey in Art History"; History of Photography Seminar"; "Dismantling Orientalism: the production of the other in 19th C French and British Orientalism", Art History Division, Nova Scotia College of Art and Design, 5163 Duke Street, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada B3J 3J6

[Other Professional Experience]

- Dec. 1989-  
ongoing                    Committee member, Acquisitions and Exhibitions Committee
- Burnaby Art Gallery, Deer Lake Park, Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

Feb. 1987-  
June 1987

Curator and organizer along with Lorna Brown

British Columbia Coalition of the Disabled Art Auction held at Emily Carr College of Art, Vancouver, Canada

This was a three day silent auction fund raising event on behalf of BCCD with over 120 Canadian artists (native and non-native; abled and disabled) participating: Laiwan, David MacWilliam, Elizabeth MacKenzie, Elspeth Pratt, Wendy Dobreiner, Tony Onley, Chris Dikeakos, Allyson Clay, Paul Wong, Marion Penner Bancroft, Tom Graff, Gathie Falk, Sara Diamond and many, many others. Lorna Brown and myself co-ordinated the event, which included: publicity, artist liaison, installation, documentation, insurance, transportation etc. The British Columbia Coalition of the Disabled considered the event to be a grand success both financially and in terms of an expanded community liaison. We were invited back to organize a second auction the year following but we both had other previous obligations.

July 1987-  
ongoing

I act as one of twelve artists of the Board of Directors and curators on the rotating curatorial committee for the non-profit Association for Non Commercial Culture which provided on-going three week installation space for artists. The Window for Non Commercial Culture was located at Macleans bookstore storefront on Pender Street in downtown Vancouver. Exhibits included Ian Wallace, Arni Runar Haraldsson, Carel Moseiwitsch, Jil Weaving, and many others over its full year of operation. I temporarily resigned my position from the board from 1987-1989 due to my departure overseas. My position on this board has been re-activated as of December 1989. As of 1990, The Association for Non Commercial Culture has received core funding from the Visual Arts Section of the Canada Council.

Jan.-July 1986

Worked as a director on the Board of Vancouver Artists League assisting in the organization of the 1986 ANNPAC conference in Vancouver called Strategies for Survival.

Dec. 1985-  
Dec. 1986

I joined Kati Campbell, Warren Murfitt and Don Gill to operate collectively (N) On Commercial Gallery, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada. The gallery schedule was extensive and included organization of a 22 artist exchange exhibition with the artists of artist-run centre YYZ in Toronto. This exchange

took place in Toronto in October, 1986, and in Vancouver in November, 1986.

Dec. 1985- Simultaneous to work at (N) Commercial Lorna Brown,  
Dec. 1986 Margot Butler and I formed an artist-run collective called Worksite Feminist Artist's Collective, which, funded by a \$10,000 Explorations grant from Canada Council, produced three major multi-media events involving more than 40 women artists.

This included a two day performance, film and dance event called Two Nights Working; a video production shown on local Cable Ten television; and a radio show broadcast on CFRO Vancouver. I worked as co-organizer, co-fund raiser, public relations, stage manager and artist liaison.

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Judith Barry	1	6) Sherry Ortner	1
2) Simone de Beauvoir	1	7) Griselda Pollock	1
3) Sandra Flitterman	1	8) Martha Rosler	1
4) Michel Foucault	1	9) Kaja Silverman	1
5) Thelma McCormack	1		

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Wilma Needham	2
2) Mary MacCausland	1
3) Lisa Rochon	1

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

6/1 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Vanguard	2
2) Parachute	1
3) Harbour	1
4) Canadian Women's Studies Journal	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- 1) Artspeak Gallery 1

Wood, William

A) Present Position Regional Editor for Parachute magazine in Vancouver, B.C.

B) University Education

1984 Master of Library Science, University of Toronto

1981 B.A., English Literature Major, University of British Columbia

C) Professional Activities

[Employment]

1988-1989 Acting Editor, Vanguard, Vancouver, B.C.

1988 Sessional Instructor, Emily Carr College of Art and Design, Vancouver, B.C.

1987-1988 Associate Editor, Vanguard, Vancouver, B.C.

1984-1987 Assistant Editor, C magazine, Toronto, Ontario

[Additional Activities]

1989 Seminars for: Simon Fraser Centre for the Arts. Third Year Fine Arts Studio; University of BC Fourth Year Fine Arts Studio; Emily Carr College of Art and Design Photography Studio, Vancouver, B.C.

1988 Lecture and seminar, University of Victoria, Victoria, B.C.

1987 "The Subverting Eye: Critics/Curators", panel discussion with Ann Rosenberg and Elizabeth Godley, presented by Simon Fraser University

Contributing Editor, Public

1986 "La Jeune Fille en Feu", seminar for the Ontario College of Art, Toronto, organized by Ian Carr-Harris

"Artists/Critics", panel discussion with Andy Patton and Joanne Tod, sponsored by Visual Arts Ontario, Toronto

1) Non-Canadian Authors Cited

[Critical Ref.]

1) Walter Benjamin	6	14) Guy Debord	1
2) Jean Baudrillard	4	15) Terry Eagleton	1
3) Theodor Adorno	3	16) Lewis Hyde	1
4) Michel Foucault	3	17) Roman Jakobson	1
5) Roland Barthes	2	18) Berkley Kaite	1
6) Victor Burgin	2	19) Jacques Lacan	1
7) T.J. Clark	2	20) Kate Linker	1
8) Sigmund Freud	2	21) Sylvere Lotringer	1
9) Fredric Jameson	2	22) Jean-Francois Lyotard	1
10) Karl Marx	2	23) Laura Mulvey	1
11) Georges Bataille	1	24) Griselda Pollock	1
12) Norman Bryson	1	25) Naomi Schor	1
13) Benjamin Buchloh	1	26) Paul Virilio	1

2) Canadian Authors Cited

1) Ian Wallace	4	14) Tim Guest	1
2) Tim Guest	2	15) Keith Higgins	1
3) Jeff Wall	2	16) Annette Hurtig	1
4) Jessica Bradley	1	17) Karen Knights	1
5) Ian Carr-Harris	1	18) Gordon Lebrecht	1
6) Barbara Fischer	1	19) Donna Lypchuk	1
7) Robin Fisher	1	20) John B. Mays	1
8) Robert Fones	1	21) Jerry McGarth	1
9) Vera Fraenkel	1	22) Philip Monk	1
10) Northrop Frye	1	23) Diana Nemiroff	1
11) Sandy Gow	1	24) Scott Watson	1
12) Bruce Grenville	1	25) Carol Williams	1
13) John Greyson	1	26) Krzysztof Wodiczko	?

3) Number of Texts Produced Relative to the Number of Texts that Clearly Cite, or Use an Aspect of Foucault's Work

37/3 Foucault

4) Periodicals Published In

1) Parachute	1
2) Vanguard	13
3) C	12
4) Canadian Art	1
5) Public	1

5) Institutions that Produced Catalogues [Essays]

- |                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| 1) Walter Phillips Gallery      | 1 |
| 2) Or Gallery                   | 1 |
| 3) Southern Alberta Art Gallery | 1 |
| 4) Artspeak Gallery             | 2 |
| 5) The 49th Parrallel           | 1 |
| 6) Chromazone                   | 1 |
| 7) Art Gallery of Stratford     | 1 |
| 8) Western Front Society        | 1 |



## SECTION SEVEN

Publication and/or Exhibition History of those Author's Dealt with in the Main Body of the Thesis. Please note: You will note that the format for the restructuring of each history changes from author to author. The reason for this is that in retyping them for the appendix, I have duplicated the author's own format.

Dawkins, Heather

### Bibliography Publications and Papers

[Published Papers or Reviews]

- 1989 'Managing Degas', Vanguard, Vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 16-21
- 1987 'The Diaries and Photographs of Hannah Cullwick', Art History, Vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 154-187
- 1986 'Paul Kane and the Eye of Power; Racism in Canadian Art History', Vanguard, Vol. 15, no. 4
- 'Challenging Formalism', Architecture and the Vessel, Rochester Institute of Technology
- Grand History/Local Herstories, (Exhibition Catalogue) Mount Saint Vincent University Art Gallery, Halifax, N.S.
- 1985-1986 "Barbara Louder", (Review) Vanguard, Vol. 14, no. 10, pp. 39-40
- 1986 Purloined Portraits, (Exhibition Catalogue) Mount Saint Vincent University Art Gallery, Halifax
- 1985 'Cultural Politics, Social History and Embroidery', Vanguard, Vol. 14, no. 7, pp. 10-12
- 'Ingrid Koenig', (Review) Vanguard, Vol. 14, no. 5/6, p. 43
- 'Re-Visions', (Review) Arts Atlantic 22, Vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 20-21

- 'Politics of Visibility, Domestic Labour and Representation; The Diaries and Photographs (1853-74) or Hannah Cullwick', Parallelogramme, Vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 61-65
- 'La Politique De La Visibilite, Du Travail Domestique Et De La Representaion; Le Journal Et Les Photographies, 1953-74 De Hannah Cullwick', Traduction par Michelle Robidoux, Parallelogramme, Vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 61-65
- 1984 'From the Ground of Daily Experience', American Ceramics, Vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 32-35
- 1983 'Appropriation/Expropriation', (Review) Parachute 31, pp. 47-48
- 'Mirrorings', (Review) Parachute 29, p. 33. (Co-authored with Vivian Cameron and Susan McEachern.)
- [Papers]
- 1990 'Stealing a Look and Avenging Her Literacy; Modelling for Degas According to Alice'. (The University of Alberta, 'Imag(in)ing Women' conference, April 5, and at Leeds University, May 24
- 1989 'Frogs, Monkeys and Women; A History of Identifications Across a Phantastic Body'. (The Tate Gallery, Liverpool, 'Degas: Images of Women' conference, October 20-21
- 1987 'The Archive, Power and Resistance'. (Toronto, 'Talking Pictures' conference, October 15
- 1986 'Reading 'Racism' in Canadian Art History'. (Emily Carr College of Art, Vancouver, B.C., April 4
- 'The Hannah Cullwich Archive and Feminist Theory'. (The State University of New York at Binghamton, New York, April 21; Simon Fraser University, Vancouver, B.C., April 3; The University of British Columbia, Vancouver, P.C., April 2; Emily Carr College of Art, Vancouver, B.C., April 1; Distance University Education via Television, Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, N.S., March 20
- 'Challenging Formalism'. (Rochester Institute of Technology, Rochester, N.S., April 2

- 'Speaking the War Room'. (Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, Halifax, N.S., March 5)
- 'Social Dimensions of Art and Art Education'. (Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, Halifax, N.S., February 19)
- 'Moving Beyond the Impasse; Part II'. (The University of Manitoba, January 25)
- 'Underpinnings'. (Eye Level Gallery, Halifax, N.S., January 16)
- 1985 'Moving Beyond the Impasse: The Premises, Limits and Implications of the Art/Craft Debate, Part I'. (University of Manitoba, January 24, '86; Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, Halifax, N.S., June 4, '85)
- 'Photographic Representation and Social History'. (Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, Halifax, N.S., November 20)
- 'Questions of Class and Representation'. (New Research on Women Artists Panel, Universities Art Association of Canada, Ottawa, November 15)
- 'Politics of Visibility, Domestic Labour and Representation; The Diaries and Photographs (1853-74) of Hannah Cullwick'. (Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, N.S., October 4; Eye Level Gallery, Halifax, N.S., March 26; Feminism and Art, A Symposium, Toronto, February 22)
- 'Who's Making What for Where? Amateurs, Professionals, Women in the Arts and Questions of History'. (Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, N.S., October 4)
- 'Realism, Fantasy and Closure: Reading a Nineteenth Century Archive'. (Nova Scotia College of Art & Design, Halifax, N.S., June 4)
- 'Beyond From the Ground of Daily Experience'. (Alfred University, Alfred, New York, February 25, 26)
- 1983 'Against Formalism'. (Sheridan College of Applied Art and Technology, Mississauga, Ontario, February; University of Regina, March; The Banff School of Fine Art, Banff, Alberta, March; John Abbott College, Montreal, Quebec, March)

— 'Images of Women'. (University of Waterloo,  
Ontario, February; Nova Scotia College of Art &  
Design, Halifax, N.S., March

Fleming, Marnie

Exhibitions Curated

- 1990        London Regional    Attila Richard Lukacs  
             Art Gallery
- 1989        London Regional    - Alfredo Jaar  
             Art Gallery        - Ed Zelenak: Finding a Place  
                             - Selections from Labatt's photography  
                             Collection  
                             - Stephen Andrews  
                             - Ted Goodden: Book of Hours  
                             - Jean Spence: Teotihuacan Place of the  
                             Gods  
                             - Jean Hay: Observations from Ellesmere  
                             Island
- 1988        London Regional    - David Merritt: The Magic Voice and  
                             Art Gallery Solids  
                             - Sylvie Belanger: Triptych  
                             - Studio Watch
- 1987        London Regional    - London Life Young Contemporaries  
             Art Gallery        - Ian Carr-Harris: Reconstruction of a view  
                             from his room, 1956  
                             - Nick Johnson - drawings, feathers and  
                             stones: A Port Bruce Codex
- 1986        London Regional    - Encounters and Inquiries  
             Art Gallery        - Charles Rea: Recent Watercolours  
                             - Doug Mitchell: The Night Sky, Part I,  
                             Monkey-In-The-Middle
- 1985        Vancouver Art        A City Seen
- 1981                                - Colourfast  
                              - Stolen Moments  
                              - Interiors  
                              - A Time of Plenty

Exhibitions Co-ordinated

- Upcoming 1991                        - John Boyle Retrospective  
   - Memory Works
- Upcoming 1990                        London Life Young Contemporaries
- 1989                                - Celine Baril: Barcelone, Nickle Arts  
   Museum

- Gifts of War, Art Gallery of Windsor
- 1988
  - Thelma Rosner: Mandelbrot's Garden
  - World's Apart: The Symbolic Landscape of Tony Urquhart, Art Gallery of Windsor
  - Shirley Wiitasalo, Art Gallery of Ontario
  - Visual AIDS, University of Western Ontario
  - Paterson Ewen: The Montreal Years, Mendel Gallery, Saskatoon
- 1987
  - Homage to Marcel Duchamp On the Occasion of the 100th Anniversary of His Birth, Forest City Art Gallery, McIntosh Gallery and London Regional Art Gallery
  - Resistance or Submission: Snatches of a Christian Conversation, Walter Phillips Gallery, Banff
- 1986
  - Vancouver Now, Walter Phillips Gallery, Banff

Publications

- Fleming, Marnie. Mappings. Brochure. Toronto, Queen's Park, March 1990.
- Fleming, Marnie. Alfredo Jaar: Ils l'ont tant aimee, la revolution/They loved it so much, the revolution. Brochure. London, January 1990.
- Fleming, Marnie. Ed Zelenak - Finding a Place: selected work 1976 - 1988. Catalogue. London, June 1989.
- Fleming, Marnie. Selections from the Labatt's Photography Collection. Brochure. London, June 1989.
- Fleming, Marnie. Jean Spence: Teotihuacan Place of the Gods. Brochure. London, December 1988.
- Fleming, Marnie. Jean Hay: Observations from Ellesmere Island. Brochure. London, October 1988.
- Fleming, Marnie. David Merritt: The Magic Voice and Geometric Solids. Catalogue. London, May 1988.
- Fleming, Marnie. Sylvie Belanger: Triptich. Catalogue. London, April 1988.
- Fleming, Marnie. Studio Watch. Brochure. London, January 1988.

- Fleming, Marnie. London Life Young Contemporaries.  
Catalogue. London, December 1987.
- Fleming, Marnie. Nick Johnson, drawings, feathers and  
stones: A Port Bruce Codex. Catalogue. London, May  
1987.
- Fleming Marnie. "Gary Dennis at the University of British  
Columbia, A.M.S. Gallery", Vanguard, November 1985.
- Hamilton Art Gallery. Richard Prince - Natural Phenomenon.  
Catalogue Marnie Fleming. Hamilton, November 1984.
- Vancouver Art Gallery. The Praxis Collection. Catalogue  
essays: Marnie Fleming, Peter Blackman, Ann Morrison,  
Vancouver, Summer 1984.
- Fleming, Marnie. "A response to Bill Reid", Vanguard,  
October - November 1982.
- Fleming, Marnie. "Patrimony and Patronage: The Legacy",  
Vanguard, Summer 1982.
- Fleming, Marnie. "Labour, Gold and Art - William G.R. Hind",  
Vanguard, Summer 1981.

#### Other

- 1990 Curated an exhibition titled Mappings in the Legislative  
Office at Queen's Park, for the Premiere of Ontario, the  
Honourable David Peterson. March - October 1990.
- 1989 Public art advisor for Wellington Street Art Task Force  
(City of London).
- 1988 Art advisor and member of the London Regional Cancer  
Centre Art Acquisition Committee.
- Public art advisor for the courtyard programme of Twigg  
Management Company, Ltd., One Financial Place Development,  
Toronto, Ontario.

#### Professional Experience

- May 1986- Curator of Contemporary Art, London Regional Art Gallery  
present
- Duties involve the research and initiation of contemporary  
exhibitions which compliment the exhibition programme of  
the institution; the co-ordination of exhibitions and all  
stages of planning, budget preparation, catalogue

production, proofreading and editing of gallery publications. The Curator of Contemporary Art is also responsible for the building of the Contemporary Collection and serves on the Acquisitions and Exhibitions Committees in an ex-officio capacity. Another aspect of the position involves visits to artists' studios, private collectors, commercial and public galleries in order to stay informed.

Dec. 1981-  
May 1986

Education Officer, Vancouver Art Gallery

Duties involve the education and information services of the gallery. This includes the conducting of tours, formal and informal discussions of exhibitions with the public, lectures for school groups and assisting in the training of the gallery's volunteer docents. Public tours of exhibitions are presented daily in the gallery with specialized "noon-hour" lectures in which individual works of art themes are discussed. This position also includes writing and research for information sheets and catalogues. A sound knowledge of historical and contemporary art history is required.

Aug. 1982-  
May 1983

Researcher, Vancouver Art Gallery

Duties involve full time extensive research for the catalogue of the Vancouver Art Gallery's Inaugural Exhibition. The result of this large-scale research project is the 439 page publication Vancouver: Art and Artists 1931 - 1983.

Sept. 1980-  
Dec. 1981

Extension Officer, Vancouver Art Gallery

This position involves curating exhibitions and travelling with them to 75 communities in the province. It also involves installing the shows in the community and narrating them either in formal or informal format. Another aspect of the position requires the amateur to assemble exhibitions for shipment to other galleries and to create exhibitions tailored for a specific community.

1980

Research Curator, U.B.C. Fine Arts Gallery, University of British Columbia

Duties require developing proposals for funds and grant applications, installing exhibitions, writing an exhibition catalogue, public relations and administrative matters.

1979-1980

Teaching Assistant, Department of Fine Arts, University of British Columbia



Responsibilities: the instruction of first year university students in the history of art. Duties include the teaching of seminar groups and the preparation and evaluation of examinations and term papers.

1978-1979  
Sawyer)

Intern, U.B.C. Museum of Anthropology, (under Dr. Alan

Research, selection, and installation of an exhibition entitled Kwakiutl Transformation Masks. Preparation and scriptwriting for accompanying video production.

1976

Intern, Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit, Michigan, (under Curator of Decorative Arts, Dr. Sheila Tabakoff)

Preparation and editing of catalogue and bibliography for major exhibition catalogue, Arts and Crafts in Detroit, 1906 - 1976.

Fry, Philip

Catalogues and Articles

- Oct.-Dec. 1969 "Arts indiens et esquimaux du Canada" in Revue d'Esthetique, Tome XXII, fasc. IV
- Jan.-Mar. 1970 "Pour decoloniser l'art negre: un essai d'analyse de l'imaginaire plastique" in Revue d'Esthetique, Tome XXIII. Written in collaboration with the team of the Musee de l'Homme.

(Unless otherwise mentioned, entries listed here as "catalogues" also imply curatorship of the exhibition in question, that is, negotiations with the artists, selection of works, monitoring budgets and technical arrangements and overseeing the installation of works.)

- 1969 "Contemporary African Art": Catalogue for the exhibition. Introduction written in collaboration with Jacqueline Delange; London, England: Camden Arts Center.
- 1970 "Oeuvres Africaines Nouvelles": catalogue of the exhibition. Introduction and notices. Paris: Musee de l'Homme. The ext is republished in Nigeria demain, No. 5, May - June, 1970.
- Spring, 1970 "Essai sur la statuaire mumuye" in Objets et Mondes; Tome X, fasc. 1.
- "Art africain" in the new Encyclopedie Larousse.
- 1970 "Recent Winnipeg Prints, The Screen Shop". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- Dec. 1971 - Jan. 1972 "Making the Point" in Artscanada, No. 162/163.
- Jan. 1972 "Lochhead '72". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- Feb.-Mar. 1972 "Tony Tascona" in Artscanada, No. 164/165.
- 1972 - 1973 "Manitoba Mainstream", Catalogue. The National Gallery of Canada.
- April 1972 "Esther Warkov, The Recent Years". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.

- June 1972 "The Temptation of Aquarius". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery. (Catalogue design winner of the Printing Industries of American's "Graphic Arts Award", 1973).
- August 1972 "The Legend of Asessippi". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- Summer, 1972 "Prairie Space Drawings" in ArtsCanada, Prairie Special.
- Summer 1972 "The Grand Western Canadian Screen Shop", in ArtsCanada, Prairie Special.
- April 1973 "Bruce Head: Painted Objects and Graphics". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- June 1973 "Joe Fafard's Pensees". Catalogue. The Winnipeg Art Gallery.
- Winter 1975-1976 "Ron Martin: In regard to the Black Paintings (Text and Pretext)" in Parachute No. 2, pp. 13-19.
- Apr., May, June "Henry Saxe in Conversation (about the instrument series)", in Parachute No. 3, pp. 64.
- Autumn, 1976 "On Description" in Parachute No. 4.
- Dec. 1976 "Henry Saxe: Two Works". Catalogue. The Dunlop Art Gallery, pp. 64.
- Spring, 1977 "For Jan Swidinski and Herve Fischer, Le potage outaouais, a contextual prescription" in Parachute No. 6.
- Fall, 1977 "Charles Gagnon: Making and Taking" in Parachute No. 8.
- 1977 "Steranko: Graphic Narrative". Catalogue prepared with T. Poulos. The Winnipeg Art Gallery, pp. 108.
- 1978 "Charles Gagnon". Catalogue. Montreal Museum of Fine Arts, pp. 239.
- Spring, 1979 "Max Dean, Three Projects and the Theory of Open Art" in Parachute No. 14, pp. 16-23.
- Summer, 1979 "Sylvain Cousineau" in Parachute No. 15, pp. 56-57.
- Spring, 1980 "John Hall, paintings and auxiliary works, 1969-1978" in Parachute No. 18, pp. 9-11.

- 1980 "Sylvain P. Cousineau, Photographs and Paintings". Catalogue. Dunop Art Gallery, Regina, and The Walter Phillips Gallery, Banff, pp. 64.
- March 1980 "Priorities and Perspectives: Canada Council, National Gallery and National Museums". Interview in CARFAC News, Vol. 5, No. 2, pp. 2-3.
- July-Sept. 1980 Guest curator of exhibition "Pluralities/1980/Pluralites at the National Gallery of Canada. Entries for Stephen Cruise, Joe Fafard, Don Proch, David Thanberger and Alex Wyse in the exhibition catalogue "Pluralities/1980/Pluralites published by the National Gallery of Canada, National Museums of Canada, Ottawa, 1980.
- Autumn 1980 "Robin Collyer: Event, Description, Narrative" in Parachute No. 20, pp. 36-45.
- 1981 "The Mac-Paps at the Forks of the Thames". An interview with Bob Bozak. Catalogue (with no curatorial in-put of the writer). London Regional Art Gallery, London, Ontario.
- 1982 "Robin Collyer". Catalogue. Agnes Etherington Art Center, Kingston, pp. 95. June, July, Aug., "Concerning the Wacousta Syndrom" (more about what's Canadian 1986 in Canadian Art), in Parachute No. 43.
- Sept., Oct., Nov., 1986 "Chronicle of a New Landscape Garden" in Parachute No. 44, pp. 16-21.
- Dec. 16-Jan. 12 "Bruce Parsons: Installation and Painting" Catalogue for the 1986 - 1987 exhibition "United Technologie and Garden"; Introduction and Dialogue. Saidye Bronfman Centre, pp. 55.

### Exhibitions

- Jan. 20 - Feb. 6, 1988 "From the Old Field Garden, Ufundi Gallery, (Solo).
- September 1988 "Artscape", Ufundi Gallery, (Group).
- May 1989 "Gardens", Artscourt, and installation of Columbine Red/Auge bleue, an on-going landscape garden.
- September 1989 "Blueberry Patch with Seventh Fable", a landscape installation in the East Court of the Regional

Government Complex, Ottawa, and on-going.

Reviews

- January 21, 1988      Baele, Nancy: Review in the Ottawa Citizen, p. F8.
- July 30, 1988        Elliott, Julia: "Art Professor Paints Landscape with Canadian Wildflowers", Ottawa Citizen, p. D1.
- September 20, 1988    Rambites, G1. "Trash fertile ground for group's art" in the Ottawa Citizen, p. B10.
- Summer, 1989         Regimbald, M. "Jardins et poubelles" in Etc., No. 8.

Lectures, Conferences, Panel Discussions

- April 13, 1988        L'art et le territoire, Universite du Quebec a Hull.
- March 22, 1989        "Jardins et Poubelles", Galerie Skoll, Montreal.
- Autumn 1989          "Public and Private Alternatives" in Etc., No. 9.
- November 4, 1989     "Collapsing the Metaphor" (on ecological gardening), U.A.S.C. Conference, Winnipeg.

Graham, Robert

Publications

Reviews

- 1980 Colour Works in Parachute No. 18, Spring 1980.
- 1981 Points of View: Photographs of Architecture, in Parachute, No. 23, Summer 1981.
- 1982 The battle of the buildings continues, review of books on Canadian Architects and on Arthur Erickson, in The Gazette, March 6, 1982.
- 1983 Sorel Cohen in Vanguard, Vol. 12, No. 4, May 1983.
- 1984 David Bolduc/E(x)changes/Chromazone in Parachute, No. 35, June/July/August 1984.
- 1984 Reflections: Contemporary Art Since 1964 at the National Gallery of Canada in Parachute, No. 36, September/October/November 1984.
- 1985 Aurora Borealis in C, No. 7, Fall 1985.
- 1986 Contemporary Canadian Photography in Parachute, No. 42, March/April/May 1986.
- 1988 Bill C-54 in Parachute, No. 50, March/April/May 1988.

Articles

- 1981 Tom Gibson - Among the Naturalists in Parachute, No. 22, Spring 1981.
- 1984 Donigan Cumming: undoing documentary in Parachute, No. 34, March/April/May 1984.
- 1984 Ceci Tuera Cela: The Fate of a Notion in Parachute, No. 36, September/October/November 1984.
- 1985 Ritual and Camera in Parachute, No. 39, June/July/August 1985.

- 1985 Fashion, Envy & the Gift in Parachute, No. 40, September/October/November 1985.
- 1986 Observations of (and from) Contemporary Landscape in Parachute, No. 44, September/October/November 1986.
- 1989 The Canadian Centre for Architecture: Phyllis Lambert's magnum opus: expanding categories, moving boundaries in Parachute, No. 54, March/April/May/June 1989.

Catalogue Essays

- 1986 Documentary and the Powers of Description in Donigan Cumming, Reality and Motive in Documentary Photography, Canadian Museum of Contemporary Photography.
- 1986 Veiled Relations: The Fabric of Sorel Cohen's Work in Sorel Cohen, ...et les ateliers de femmes (ou se jouent les regards), Musee d'art contemporain de Montreal.

Anthology Essays

- 1990 Here's Me! or the Subject in the Picture in 13 Essays on Photography, Canadian Museum of Contemporary Photography.

Grenville, Bruce

Curatorial Experience

- 1990 - Issues in Contemporary Video (Part One), Mendel Art Gallery
- Toward a History of the Found Object, Mendel Art Gallery
- 1989 - The Anit-Graceful, S.L. Simpson Gallery
- Scrutiny, YVZ Artist's Outlet, Toronto
- Mary Scott, The Southern Alberta Art Gallery, Lethbridge (travelling to Toronto, Montreal, Windsor, Calgary, and Vancouver)
- 1988 - Active Surplus, The 49th Parallel, New York
- 1987 - Active Surplus: The Economy of the Object, The Power Plant, Toronto
- At the Threshold: Representation and Identity, The S.L. Simpson Gallery, Toronto
- Arlene Stamp: The Gladys M. Johnston Series, The Southern Alberta Gallery
- 1986 - Mapping the Surface: The Process of Recent Toronto Sculpture, The Mendel Art Gallery
- 1985 - Territories, Eye Level Gallery, Halifax
- The Allegorical Image in Recent Canadian Painting, The Agnes Etherington Art Centre, Kingston
- 1983 - Terry Pfliger: Still-Life, Agnes Etherington Art Centre
- John Clark: The Gray Paintings, 1978-1983, Agnes Etherington Art Centre

Publications

[Review and Articles]

- Summer 1990 - "Ian Carr-Harris" Canadian Art
- Spring 1990 - "Robin Collyer" Canadian Art
- Summer 1989 - "Douglas Walker" Canadian Art
- Summer 1989 - "Bernie Miller" Canadian Art
- Spring 1989 - "Robert Fones" Canadian Art
- Winter 1988 - "Claude Mongrain" Parachute, No. 53, p. 44
- Fall 1988 - "Renee Van Halm" Parachute, No. 52, pp. 63-64



- Sept./Oct. 1988 - - "Robin Collyer" Artscribe, No. 71, pp. 90-91
- Sept./Oct. 1987 - - "Douglas Walker" Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 4, pp. 34-35
- Sept./Oct. 1987 - - "Robert Flack" Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 4, p. 35
- Fall 1987 - - "Toronto: A Play of History" Parachute, No. 48, pp. 61-62
- Summer 1987 - - "Mapping the Surface: The Process of Recent Toronto Sculpture" Parachute, No. 47, pp. 22-27, (French translation by Serge Berard, pp. 53-55)
- Summer 1987 - - "Lee Dickson" Parachute, No. 47, pp. 41-42
- Fall 1986 - - "Art Criticism in Canada" Artviews, p. 15
- Winter 1986 - - "Ultrasurd" Parachute, No. 45, pp. 39-40
- Fall 1986 - - "Arlene Stamp" Parachute, No. 44, pp. 63-64
- Summer 1986 - - "Object and Reference" Parachute, No. 43, pp. 33-34
- Spring 1986 - - "Eldon Garnet" Parachute, No. 42, pp. 42-43
- Winter 1985 - - "Louise Noguchi" Parachute, No. 41, p. 34
- Fall 1985 - - "The Republic" Parachute, No. 40, pp. 38-39
- Summer 1985 - - "David Clarkson" Parachute, No. 39, pp. 68-69
- Spring 1985 - - "Museum of the Imagination" C Magazine, No. 5, pp. 58-59
- Summer 1985 - - "Brian Boigon: ...a spectacle of demolition" Parachute, No. 39, pp. 39-41, 48-49
- Spring 1985 - - "Shelagh Alexander" Parachute, No. 38, p. 49
- Fall 1984 - - "Vera Frenkel" Parachute, No. 36, pp. 57-58
- Winter 1984 - - "How New York Stole the Idea of Modern Art" (book review), Queen's Quarterly, Vol. 91, No. 4, pp. 1000-1002
- Fall 1984 - - "Elizabeth Mackenzie: The Mapping of Desire" C Magazine, No. 3, pp. 52-53
- Spring 1984 - - "Michael Snow" Parachute, No. 35, pp. 36-37
- Winter 1983 - - "Stephen Horne" Parachute, No. 33, pp. 46-47
- Fall 1983 - - "John Clark: Style, Narrative, and the Object" Parachute, No. 32, pp. 24-29
- Winter 1983 - - "Melvin Charney" Parachute, No. 33, pp. 36-37
- Spring 1983 - - "Brian Scott" Parachute, No. 30, pp. 57-59
- Fall 1982 - - "Peter Johnston" Art Magazine, Vol. 60, pp. 43-44
- Fall 1982 - - "Robin Collyer" Parachute, No. 28, pp. 39-40
- Summer 1982 - - "Vera Frenkel" Parachute, No. 27, pp. 44-45
- April 1982 - - "Kingston Anomalies" Vanguard, Vol. 11, pp. 34-35
- April 1982 - - "Terry Pfliger" Vanguard, Vol. 11, p. 27
- March 1982 - - "Mia Westerlund" Vanguard, Vol. 11, p. 40

[Catalogues]

- 1990
- Anne Ramsden: Urban Geography, Mendel Art Gallery
  - Issues in Contemporary Video, Mendel Art Gallery
  - "The Construction of the Social: Speculations on Postmodernism in Toronto, 1980-1990" S.L. Simpson Gallery
  - Lee Dickson, Southern Albert Art Gallery, Lethbridge
  - Toward a History of the Found Object, The Mendel Art Gallery, Saskatoon
- 1989
- Honor Kever: Stations Along the Way, The Mendel Art Gallery
  - The Anti-Graceful, S.L. Simpson Gallery, Toronto
  - Scrutiny, YYZ Artist's Outlet, Toronto
  - Mary Scott, The Southern Alberta Art Gallery, Lethbridge
- 1988
- Brian Boigon & Douglas Walker, The 49th Parallel, New York
  - Active Surplus, The 49th Parallel, New York
- 1987
- Active Surplus: The Economy of the Object, The Power Plant, Toronto
  - At the Threshold: Representation and Identity, The S.L. Simpson Gallery, Toronto
  - Arlene Stamp: The Galdys M. Johnston Series, The Southern Alberta Art Gallery
- 1986
- Mapping the Surface: The Process of Recent Toronto Sculpture, The Mendel Art Gallery
  - Janice Gurney: For the Audience, Mount St. Vincent University Art Gallery, Halifax
  - Renee van Halm: <l'eau a la bouche>, The Art Gallery of Greater Victoria, Victoria
- 1985
- Joanne Tod, The Southern Alberta Art Gallery, Lethbridge
  - Territories, YYZ Artist's Outlet, Toronto & Eye Level Gallery, Halifax
  - Vincent Tangredi: Fresco Paintings and Sculpture, The MacDonald-Steward Art Gallery
  - Vera Frenkel: The Video Tapes, The National Gallery of Art, Ottawa
  - The Allegorical Image in Recent Canadian Painting, The Agnes Etherington Art Centre
  - Terry Pfliger: Still-Life, Agnes Etherington Art Centre, Kingston

- 1984 - The New City of Sculpture, YYZ Toronto, published in C Magazine, No. 3
- 1983 - John Clark: The Gray Paintings, 1978-1983, The Agnes Etherington Art Centre, Kingston
- Renee van Halm: Anticipating the Eventual Emergence of Form, Institute for Art and Urban Resources, P.S.I., New York, N.Y.

Other Publications

- 1985 "Representations of the Now" Artists/Critics. YYZ Artist's Outlet, Toronto

Editor

- 1990 Jeanne Randolph, Collected Critical Writings, YYZ Books, Toronto, (forthcoming)
- 1988 Philip Monk, Struggles With the Image: Essays in Art Criticism, YYZ Books, Toronto
- 1987 Andre Jodoin, Mowery Baden, (Mercer Union, Toronto)
- Toronto editor, Parachute magazine

Gould, Trevor

Solo Exhibitions

- 1990 YYZ Artist's Outlet, Toronto, New Sculpture
- 1989 - Galerie Christiane Chassay, Montreal. Sculpture and Drawings  
- Piwna Gallery, Wrazsawa, Poland. Sculpture  
- Akumulatory Gallery 2, Poznan, Poland. Sculpture
- 1988 - Ufundi Gallery, Ottawa. Drawings  
- Galerie Christiane Chassay, Montreal. New Sculpture
- 1987 Ufundi Gallery, Ottawa. Drawings
- 1986 - A.R.C. Gallery, Toronto. Sculpture and Drawings  
- Galerie Christiane Chassay, Montreal. New Sculpture
- 1984 Drawings, It's not what it is that is important, but what you call it. Axe-Neo 7, Hull
- 1980 Boundaries. York Gallery, Ottawa

Group Exhibitions

- 1990 Galerie Christiane Chassay, (with Michel Goulet, Andrew Dutkewych)
- 1988 - The Snake in the Garden. Festival of the Arts Ottawa  
- Le dessin errant: The Ninth Dalhousie Drawing Exhibition, Halifax. Travelling to Concordia University Art Gallery, Musee du Quebec (cat). Curated by Claude Mongrain
- 1987 Galerie Christiane Chassay, Montreal, Quebec
- 1986 Blindforlds/Les yeux bandes. Axe-Neo 7, Hull, Quebec
- 1985 Art in Situ. Fire Hall #3, Ontario (cat)

- 1981 - Ideas in Progress. Gallery Ottawa, Ontario  
 - Monuments. Off Centre Centre Gallery, Calgary (cat)

Public Works

- 1989 Awarded public sculpture for headquarters for Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton, Ottawa

Critical Mention

- Fall 1990 - Gary Michael-Dault, "Manifold with Monument", C Magazine, No. 27, pp. 24-27
- 1990 - Alan Pringle, "Trevor Gould La sculpture et sa muse", Vie des Arts
- 1990 - Louis Cummins, "Trevor Gould", Parachute, No. 58, pp. 38-39, April/May/June
- March 16, 1989 Nancy Beale, "Intellectual Play", The Ottawa Citizen
- December 1988 - Marie Delagrave, "Le Dessin actuel, source de remarquables <errances>", Le Soleil, p. E-16
- June 1988 - Claire Gravel, "Quelques errances contemporaines", Le Devoir, p. C-10
- Aug. 19-25, 1988 - Judith Belanger, "Le Dessin Errant: Traite d'esprits", Voir
- December 1988 - Claire Gravel, Le Devoir, p. C-8
- Feb. 17, 1988 - Elissa Barnard, "Drawings that leave a mark", The Mail, Montreal
- May 13-26, 1988 - Melanie Reinblatt, "Sketchy Question", Montreal Mirror, p. 22
- June 1988 - Henry Lehmann, "Sketches of Inspiration", Montreal Daily News, p. 29
- Fall 1988 - Robert Pope, "Le Dessin Errant: The Ninth Dalhousie Drawing Exhibition", Arts Atlantic Magazine, p. 15
- December 1988 - Sylvie Olivier, "Trevor Gould", Parachute, No. 53, pp. 34-35
- Sept. 17, 1988 - Nancy Beale, "Arts festival puts on best show ever", The Ottawa Citizen
- Sept. 17, 1988 - Claire Gravel, "Cinq galeries: des morceaux de chaos, des lievres, un ours, du neo-kitch et des anges de pierre", Le Devoir, Montreal
- June 4, 1988 - Jean Dumont, "L'art au quotidien", La Presse, Montreal
- June 4, 1988 - Claire Gravel, "Quelques errances contemporaines", Le Devoir, Montreal
- 1988 - Nancy Beale, "African Born Artist Becomes Cooler", The Ottawa Citizen

- April 1987 - Rene Payant, "Une orientation audacieuse", Spirale
- 1987 - Philip Fry, "Concerning The Wacousta Syndrome: More About What's Canadian in Canadian Art", Parachute, No. 43
- - Nancy Beale, The Ottawa Citizen
- - Helene Taillefer, "Trevor Gould", Parachute, No. 46, pp. 119-120, Montreal
- 1987 - Earl Miller, "Trevor Gould: Installation and Drawings", C Magazine, No. 12
  
- Nov. 27, 1986 - Jocelyne Lepage, "Signes de piste rue Saint-Laurent", La Presse, Montreal
- Nov. 15, 1986 - Gilles Daigneault, Le Devoir, Montreal
- Spring 1986 - Rene Blouin, "Art in Situ", Canadian Art
- Feb/Mar. 1986 - Marie-Jeanne Musiol, "Art in Situ", Vanguard, Vancouver
  
- 1985 - Pierre-Paul Cormier, "Le Festival des arts et Art in Situ", Le Droit, Ottawa
- Nancy Beale, "Ottawa Artists set works 'in situ' in Old Firehall for Festival of Arts", Ottawa Citizen
  
- Oct. 26, 1984 - Nancy Beale, "Gould's violent art shows power abuses", Ottawa Citizen, p. D-27

Publication

[Catalogues, Essays]

- May 1989 - Jaroslav Kozlowski. Unpublished interview, Poznan, Poland
- 1989 - With an Ear to the Ground. Catalogue text on the recent work of Andrew Dutkewych. Art Gallery of Hamilton
  
- 1988 - Sites and Shadows. (on Wolfgang Luy) Galerie Christiane Chassay, (catalogue)
- 1988 - Ludger Gerdes. Beaux Arts Paris, No. 63
- 1988 - Unusual Alliances. (on Michel Goulet) Galerie Christiane Chassay, (catalogue)
- 1988 - With an Ear to the Ground. (on Andrew Dutkewych) Galerie Christiane Chassay, (catalogue)
  
- 1987 - Ludger Gerdes. Parachute 47, (Interview)
- 1987 - Mowry Baden: A Question of Context. Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 2

- 1986 - Building Sculpture: The Work of Michel Goulet. Vanguard, Vol. 15, No. 1
- 1986 - Validating the Object: Recent work by Roland Brener. C Magazine, No. 09
- 1985 Object and Image: Some remarks on the work of Jean-Luc Vilmoth. Parachute, 38

[Exhibition reviews]

- 1990 - "Claude Van Lingen". Comissioned, unpublished review at Vera Engelhorn Gallery, New York
- "Jocelyne Alloucherie". Parachute, No. 58, pp. 43-44
- 1989 "Bi-National: American and German Art of the Eighties". Parachute, No. 54
- 1988 "Gilles Mihalcean". Vanguard, Vol. 17, No. 1
- 1987-1988 "Pierre Granche". Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 6
- 1987 - "Claude Mongrain". C Magazine, No. 14
- "Eva Brandl". C Magazine, No. 13
- "Robert McNealy". C Magazine, No. 12
- "Six Projects for Surrey". Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 1
- 1984-1985 "Sylvain Cousineau". Vanguard, Vol. 14, No. 8
- 1983 - "Roland Brener, Bill Woodrow". Parachute, No. 35
- "Tom Sherman". Parachute, No. 32
- 1982 "The Long Way Round: Richard Long". Parachute, No. 30
- 1981 - "Clarissa Inglis". Parachute, No. 27
- "Books By Artists". Parachute, No. 26

Johnstone, Lesley

Catalogues

- 1985 "Installation: The invention of context" in Aurora Borealis; Centre international d'art contemporain de Montreal; Montreal, Quebec
- 1986 - City Detour: M. MacPhee, V. Marshall, C. Wainio, S. Wiitasalo; Optica Gallery; Montreal, Quebec
- "Building Images into Houses" in Michel Saulnier; Souther Alberta Art Gallery; Lethbridge, Alberta

Magazines

- December 1985 "Jeux de spirale; Waterdampstrukturen - Alain Paiement", Spirale, No. 57, p. 6
- Dec./Jan. "La bete noire - Celine Baril", Vanguard, p. 29
- 1986/1987
- Sept./Oct. 1987 "Paysages", Vanguard, p. 39
- November 1987 "Carol Wainio", Vanguard, p. 41
- Feb./Mar. 1988 "Polders - Alain Paiement", Vanguard, p. 31
- Apr./May 1988 "Oscillations: Francois Girard and Laurie Walker", Vanguard
- Sept./Oct. 1988 "No Man's Land - Les temps chaud", Vanguard, p. 42
- November 1988 "Allegories of Abandonment: Martha Fleming and Lyne Lapointe", Vanguard, pp. 22-27



Keziere, Russell

Vanguard Articles - excludes reviews & editorials

- April 1988 "Testosterone Abuse", Vol. 17, no. 2
- December 1987 "A Man of Thebes: Ian Carr-Harris", Vol. 16, no. 6  
Summer 1987 "Hermes in the Agora: Joey Morgan & Alan Storey",  
Vol. 16, no. 3
- February 1987 "Ich Bin Ein woodcutter: Kanada/Europa/Amerika",  
Vol. 16, no. 1
- Summer 1984 "The Paintings of Allyson Clay", Vol. 14, no. 6
- September 1983 "Tiresius Unbound", Vol. 13, no. 7
- March 1981 "Project for the Affirmation of the New", Vol. 10,  
no. 2
- September 1980 "Ambivalence, Ambition and Administration", Vol. 9,  
no. 7
- Summer 1979 "Beyond Detene: Dialogue with U.S.S.R.", Vol. 8,  
no. 6

Selected Publications

- 1983 "Emily Carr: New World Culture and Old World  
Contradiction", OKanada
- 1980 Share Corsaut, catalogue article, Southern Alberta  
Art Gallery
- 1983 "What Price Art? Jeff Wall, Joey Morgan, Al  
McWilliam", Vancouver Magazine, July
- 1986 "Michael Snow" (review), Maclean's, vol. 99, no.  
18, May 5
- 1983 October Show (catalogue essay)

Other articles have appeared in Criteria, Artes  
Visuales and Art Monthly, and forthcoming in Art in  
America.

Selected Unpublished Papers

- 1984 "Reason and the Non-Pragmatic: Culture Criticism  
in Canada

- 1983 "Kasimir Malevich and the Wisdom of the State"  
-- "Aesthetic Imperialism"  
1982 "Politics of Art Criticism in Canada"  
1981 "Performance Art: Art for Peoples' Sake"

Monk, Philip

Articles

- Autumn 1977 "David Rabinowitch: Recent Sculpture", Parachute, No. 8, pp. 22-24
- Autumn 1978 "Structures for Behaviour", Parachute, No. 12, pp. 20-27
- Autumn 1979 "The Death of Structure", Parachute, No. 16, pp. 32-35
- October 1979 "Theoretical Dance: This Body is in Creation", Only Paper Today (Toronto) 6:8, p. 18
- Spring 1980 "Stanley Brown and the Zero Machine", Parachute, No. 18, pp. 18-20
- Summer 1980 "Exits", Impulse, 8:3, pp. 29-31
- Autumn 1980 "Violence and Representation", Impulse, 8:4, pp. 34-35. Reprinted in ZG, No. 2 (1981), p.3
- May 1981 "Television by Artists", Canadian Forum, 61:709, pp. 37-38, 40
- March 1982 "Common Carrier" (1980), Modern Drama, 25:1, pp. 162-169
- March 1982 "Arresting Figures" (1980), Vanguard, 11:2, pp. 18-21
- Spring 1982 "Breach of Promise", File, 5:3, pp. 36-37
- 1982 "Notes on the Sumptuary Destruction of Leaders", ZG, No. 8, n.p.
- February 1983 "Naming and Comparing: Robin Collyer", Vanguard, 12:1, pp. 13-16
- Mar./May 1983 "Tom Sherman Presenting Text", Parachute, No. 30, pp. 26-32
- Apr./May 1983 "Arguments within the Toronto 'Avant-Garde'", Parallelogramme, 8:4, pp. 30-36; French translation, pp. 61-67
- June 1983 "Colony, Commodity, Copyright: Reference and Self-Reference in Canadian Art", Vanguard, 12:5/6, pp. 14-17
- November 1983 "Staging Language, Presenting Events, Representing History: Ian Carr-Harris, September 1973", Vanguard, 12:9, pp. 18-21
- December 1983 - "Editorials: General idea and the Myth of  
November 1984 Inhabitation", Parachute, No. 33, pp. 12-23
- Winter 1983 - "Image of the Leader, Function of the Widow", C Magazine, No. 1984 1, pp. 40-45; extensive 'erratum', No. 2 (Summer 1984), p. 59

- Spring 1984 "Archives, Editors and Activists: What's Wrong with this Photograph(er)?", Fuse, 7:6, pp. 292-296
- May 1984 "Axes of Difference", Vanguard, 13:4, pp. 10-14
- Aug./Sept. 1984 "Queen Street", Canadian Forum, 64:741, pp. 33-35
- December 1984 - February 1985 "Subjects in Pictures", Parachute, No. 37, pp. 14-23
- March - May 1987 "In Retrospect: Presenting Events", Parachute, No. 46, pp. 11-13
- Fall 1987 "Presentations", Artviews, 13:4, pp. 20-26
- 1990 "Decapitation, Criticism, and Terror", Public, pp. 15-29

#### Book Essays

- 1979 "Terminal Gallery/Peripheral Drift", Spaces by Artists/Places des artistes, Toronto: ANNPAC, pp. 32-35
- 1981 "Coming to Speech", Performance, Montreal: Parachute, pp. 145-148
- 1985 "Vehicule commun: artistes en performance", Theatralite, ecriture et mise en scene, Montreal: Hurtubise HMH, pp. 113-123. (Translation of "Common Carrier".)

#### Pamphlets

- 1979 Peripheral Drift: a Vocabulary of Theoretical Criticism, Toronto: Rumour

#### Catalogue Essays

- 1978 - Colette Whiten, London: London Regional Art Gallery
- Richard Evans, John Howlin, Robert MacNealy, Sam Perepelkin, Toronto: Artists Cooperative Toronto
- 1981 - Ed Zelenak, Saskatoon: Mendel Art Gallery
- George Legrady, New York: F.S.1
- 1983 "A Space in Toronto: a History", Kunstler aus Kanada, Stuttgart: Wurttembergischer

Kunstverein, pp. 119-120; German translation, pp. 116-117

- 1985 "The Somnambulist", in Artistes canadiennes/Canadian Women Artists, Paris: Centre Culturel Canadien
- 1987 "Robin Collyer" and "Liz Magor", documenta 8, Kassel: Weber and Weidemeyer, vol. 2, pp. 50, 156. (German translation)
- 1989 "Shelagh Alexander: Photomontages", Shelagh Alexander: Photomontages, London: Institute of Contemporary Arts

#### Catalogues

- 1982 - Language and Representation, Toronto: A Space
- 1984 - Subjects in Pictures, Toronto: YYZ
- 1985 - Bernie Miller, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario. (With Barbara Fischer)  
- Liz Magor, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1987 - Shirley Wiitasalo, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario  
- Paterson Ewen: Phenomena, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1988 - Ian Carr-Harris: 1971-1977, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1989 - 4 hours and 38 minutes, Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario
- 1990 - Photographic Inscription: Kunst aus Toronto, Stuttgart: Forum fur Kulturaustausch

#### Reviews

- 1978 Numerous reviews and editorials in Artists Review (Toronto)
- Autumn 1979 - "Yves Gaucher: Eyesight and Temporality", Parachute, No. 16, pp. 47-48  
- "Reading and Representation in Political Art", Parachute, No. 16, pp. 49-50

- 1980 Maclean's (Toronto)  
 93:14 (April 7), p. 62  
 93:16 (April 21), pp. 52-53  
 93:22 (June 2), pp. 50-52  
 93:23 (June 9), pp. 62-63  
 93:30 (July 28), pp. 50-51  
 93:39 (September 29), pp. 61-62
- Autumn 1980 "Pluralities: Experiment or Excuse", Parachute, No. 20, pp. 48-49
- 1981 Maclean's (Toronto)  
 94:17 (April 27), pp. 56-57
- Spring 1981 - "Gerry Schum Tapes", Parachute, No. 22, pp. 46-47  
 - "German Video and Performance", Parachute, No. 22, pp. 49-50
- May 1981 - "John Scott", Art Express (New York), 1:1, p. 81  
 - "Janice Curney", Art Express, 1:1, p. 81
- Sept.-Oct. 1981 "Michael Snow: Presents", Art Express, 1:2, p. 65
- Autumn 1981 "Hurlbut/Martin/Massey/Singleton", Parachute, No. 24, pp. 52-53
- December 1981 "Violent Lens: Roland Barthes, Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography", Canadian Forum, 61:714, pp. 36-37
- March 1981 "Robin Collyer", Artforum, 20:7, pp. 77
- Sept.-Nov. 1982 - "Fiction", Parachute, No. 28, pp. 41-42  
 - "Agit-Prop", Parachute, No. 28, pp. 42-44
- Sept.-Nov. 1981 "Shelagh Alexander: Hero", Parachute, No. 28, p. 42
- June-August 1983 "Kunstler aus Kanada", Parachute, No. 31, pp. 46-47
- Sept.-Nov. 1983 - "Krzysztof Wodiczko", Parachute, No. 32, pp. 45-46  
 - "Museums by Artists", Parachute, No. 32, pp. 44-45
- December 1983-  
 January 1984 - "David Clarkson", Vanguard, 12:10, pp. 34-35  
 - "Symposium on Photographic Theory", Vanguard, 12:10, p. 49

- February 1984 - "Locations (Toronto)", Vanguard, 13:1, pp. 22-23
- "Production/ReProduction", Vanguard, 13:1, pp. 53-54
- "Ben Smit", Vanguard, 13:1, p. 46
- March 1984 "Marc de Guerre", Vanguard, 13:2, pp. 40-41
- March-May 1984 "Tony Brown", Parachute, No. 34, p. 51. Reprinted in Tony Brown, New York: 49th Parallel, 1984
- May 1984 "Liz Magor: Four Notable Bakers", Vanguard, 13:3, p. 30
- June-August 1984 "The Revolutionary Power of Women's Laughter", Parachute, No. 35, pp. 37-38
- Summer 1984 "Oliver Girling", Vanguard, 13:5/6, pp. 41-42
- June-August 1985 "Ian Carr-Harris", Parachute, No. 39, pp. 68-69
- December 1987- - "Lothar Baumgarten", Parachute, No. 49, pp. 30-31
- February 1988 - "Material Fictions/Ideological Facts", Parachute, No. 49, p. 55
- Books
- 1988 - Struggles with the Image: Essays in Art Criticism, Toronto, YYZ Books
- 1979 - Peripheral Drift: a Vocabulary of Theoretical Criticism, Toronto: Rumour

Patten, James

Publications

- 1987 "Heidegger, Benjamin, Foucault and the Role of the Viewer in the History of Western Art." Etudes des Arts 1.1, pp. 34-39
- 1989 - "Edouard Manet and the Execution of Maximilian: An Allegory of Contemporary History." Perspectives 5, pp. 26-33
- "Representation and Displacement: Leonardo Twice Removed." Perspectives 6, pp. 24-26



Simon, Cheryl

Solo Exhibitions

- 1980 Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto; "A Family" & "Models" (slide/tape programmes)
- 1988 - Dazibao, Montreal; "Impulse"  
- Centre de l'exposition de Mont Laurier, Mont Laurier, Quebec; "Impulse"
- 1989 - Gallery TFW, Toronto, Ontario; "Impulse"  
- Galerie III, Montreal, Quebec; "Queens & Subjects"
- 1990 - Nova Scotia Photo Co-op; "Gravity"  
- The Photography Gallery, Harbourfront, Toronto; "Echo" (installation)

Group Exhibitions

- 1981 Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto; "Landscapes"
- 1982 The Photography Gallery, Harbourfront, Toronto; "Ryerson Alumni Exhibition"
- 1985 - Galerie Bourget, Montreal; "Photographers/Photographes"  
- Dazibao, Montreal; "The Nude and Sexuality"  
- Optica, Montreal; "Overture"  
- Galerie Sequence, Jonquiere, Quebec; "The Nude and Sexuality"
- 1986 - 5354 Sherbrooke Ouest, Montreal; "Bonanza IV"  
- Liberty Factory, Brossard
- 1988 Liberty Factory, Candiac
- 1989 - Les Cours Mont-Royal, Montreal; "Plural"  
- Articule, Montreal; "Photomaton"
- 1990 - Dazibao, Montreal; Auction (by invitation) with Kitty Scott  
- "Streetsmart"--an installation/public access project in Halifax, "Six Stories in the Presence of an Absence" produced with Maja Swannie

### Film Stills

- 1983 For Scissere, a film by Peter Mettler; Mannheim Winter Festival, Mannheim, Germany; Montreal Student Film Festival, (Norman McLaren Award)

### Reviews and Publications

- 1985
- "La vision moderne d'une tradition" by Louis-Marie Lapointe, Progress-Dimanche, November 25, 1985
  - "Representation narrative et mythologie personnelle a l'edifice Cooper" by Jocelyn Lupien, Spirale, December 1985
  - Parallelogramme, photo reproduced, Fall 1985
  - C Magazine, photo project with Reesa Greenberg—Issue No. 8, Winter
- 1989
- "Impulse" by Peter Wollheim, Views, Vol. 6, No. 2
  - "Le Mois de la Photo: Les trafiquants d'images ont aussi leur place" by Claire Gravel, Le Devoir, 27 septembre, 1989
  - "Les pieges de la modernite" by Claire Gravel, Le Devoir, 31 novembre, 1989
  - "Claire de femme" by Francois Dion, Voir, 19-25 octobre, 1989
- 1990
- Canadian Journal of Women's Studies, Summer artist's page work
  - "Healing Hands: For the Women" by Allison Lewis, Fuse, Summer 1990, p. 43

### Curatorial Experience

- 1988 "Towards the Photographs as a Vulgar Document", 15th Anniversary Exhibition, Book and Symposium, Optica, Montreal (co-curated)
- 1989 "The Zone of Conventional Practice and Other Real Stories", Travelling exhibition and book, Optica, Montreal

### Critical Writing

- 1982
- Fern Helfand (review) Artmagazine, 60, Sept./Oct.
  - Brian Condron (review) Vanguard, Summer

- 1984
- Jayce Salloum (review) Vanguard, February
  - "Images Fabrique" (review) Vanguard, March
  - Robert Boffa (review) Vanguard, April
  - Sherrie Levine (review) Vanguard, September
- 1985
- Serge Tousignant (review) Vanguard, January
  - Barbara Kruger (review) Vanguard, February
  - Robert Mapplethorpe (review) Vanguard, March
  - Holly King (review) Vanguard, April
  - George Legrady (review) Vanguard, Summer
- 1986
- "The Deja vu of Angela Grauerholz", Vanguard, April
- 1987
- "One Against the Other", C, 13
  - Gilbert Boyer/Louise Viger (review) C, 13
  - "Telling Stories: Raymonde April's Chansons Formidables", Photo Communique, Summer
  - Randy Saharuni (review) Views, Vol. 3, No. 3
- 1988
- "Portraits of the Human Spirit: the photographs of Shelia Spence and Angela Grauerholz", Blackflash, April 1988
  - "Dichotomies and Doublings—Desirs Ideas", catalogue essay on John Di Stefano for the Canadian Cultural Centre in Rome
  - "Occupied Territory by Lynn Cohen" (book review) Views, Vol. 5, No. 4, November 1988
- 1989
- The Zone of Conventional Practice and Other Real Stories, editor. Optica, Montreal
  - "Le Mois de la Photo", Views, Vol. 6, No. 8
- 1990
- "The Liantamer", Mirabile visu, Vu, Quebec
  - "Signifying Nothing", Angela Grauerholz, Mercer, Toronto
- 1991
- "A Proposition to End the War: Recent Photographic Work" by Line Bloin and Monique Regimbald-Zeiber, Etc, March 1991

Watson, Donald Scott

Exhibitions

- May 14 - June 7, 1981 Catharine MacTavish, Surrey Art Gallery. Catalogue essay, "Catherine MacTavish", 16 pp.
- 1983 Jerry Pethick: Traces of Discovery, Canadian Cultural Centre, Paris. Catalogue essay, "Boccioni's Smile: Jerry Pethick's Traces of Discovery", (Published as a handout by the C.C.C., and as a catalogue by the Vancouver Art Gallery, 20 pp.)
- June 27 - Sept. 7, 1986 Four Young Romantic Painters, Canadian Cultural Centre. (Same exhibition with a different publication at Canada House, London, December 1986 - January 27, 1987.)

Exhibitions For The Vancouver Art Gallery

- June 24 - July 2, 1981 Fourth Annual Helen Pitt Graduate Awards
- Aug. 1 - Sept. 13, 1981 Catherine McLean: Soundfield. (Handout with essay.)
- Nov. 7 - Dec. 13, 1981 Barry Cogswell: Brittany Landscape. (Catalogue essay "The Sacred Landscape: Thoughts on the Context of Barry Cogswell's New Work". 24 pp.
- Dec. 19 - Dec. 31, 1981 Borduas, Gagnon, Gaucher and Molinari from the Collection. (No Publication)
- Jan. 9 - Feb. 7, 1982 Geoffrey Smedley. (Catalogue essay "Naming the Piece: Geoffrey Smedley and the Post-Modern Imagination", 106 pp.
- May 8 - July 4, 1982 Mise en scene: Kim Adams, Mowry Baden, Roland Beiser, Al McWilliams, Liz Maqor and Jerry Pethick. (with Lorna Farrell-Ward and Jo-Anne Birnie-Danzker. "Mise en scene: A Mutually Interrupted Text" and "Roland Brener's Amnesia" and "Stratagems of Distortion: An Interview with Jerry Pethick". 132 pp.
- May 11 - June 24, 1984 Art and Photography: Roy Arden, Marion Penner Bancroft, Jim Ball, Andrew Keating, Chick Rice, Cheryl Sourkes, Tom Burrows, Roy Kiyooka, Ken Straiton, Ian Wallace. (Catalogue essay "Art and

- Photography". 52 pp.
- Dec. 11, 1982 - Canadian Pictures: 1951 (A Reinstallation of a  
 March 4, 1983 1951 Exhibition of 1951 Acquisitions). (No  
 publication)
- Dec. 11, 1982 - Cy Twombly: Prints. (Handout with essay)  
 Mar. 19, 1983
- Oct. 15 - Dec. 31, Vancouver: Art and Artists, 1931-1983. (with  
 1983 Lorna Farrell-Ward and Jo-Anne Birnie-Danzker.  
 "Art in the Fifties: Design, Leisure and Painting  
 in the Age of Anxiety", and "Terminal City: Place,  
 Culture and the Regional Inflection". 440 pp.
- Feb. 11 - Mar. 25, Jerry Pethick: Traces of Discovery. (see under  
 1984 Exhibitions)
- Aug. 10 - "Drawings by Sculptors and Conceptual Artists from  
 Sept. 16, 1984 the Praxis Collection. (Handout with essay)
- Nov. 9, 1984 - Jack Shadbolt: Act of Painting. (Catalogue essay  
 Jan. 2, 1985 "Jack Shadbolt: Act of Painting". 52 pp.)
- Sept. 7 - Gathie Falk Retrospective. (catalogue essay,  
 Nov. 11, 1985 "Gathie Falk's Sources and Rituals", p. 5.)
- Sept. 28 - bill bissett: fires in th tempul. (catalogue  
 Nov. 18, 1985 essay "bill bissett: fires in th tempul". 40 pp.)
- Mar. 16 - May 26, The Single Brushstroke: 600 Years of Chinese  
 1985 Painting from the Ching Yuan Chai Collection.  
 (with James O. Caswell who wrote the major  
 catalogue essay.)
- June 8 - Aug. 25, Young Romantics: Graham Gillmore, Angela  
 1985 Grossmann, Vicki Marshall, Philippe Raphanel,  
Charles Rea, Attila Richard Lukacs, Derek Root and  
Mina Totino. (catalogue published as insert in  
Vanguard, "Surface, Ruin, Flesh: The Return of  
Romantic Values in Painting", 16 pp.)
- June 29 - Oct. 6, Canadian Traditions: Works from the Collection.  
 1985 (no catalogue)
- Feb. 1 - Mar. 16, Christos Dikeacos. (catalogue essay "The Legend of  
 1986 Icarus: From Subversion to Transgression", 39 pp.)
- July 8 - Oct. 13, Luxe, Calme et Volupte: Aspects of French Art,  
 1986 1960-1986. Daniel Buren, Robert Combas, Robert  
Filliou, Gerard Garouste, Pierre Klossowski, Jean  
Le Gac, Annette Messenger, Martial Raysse. (with

Jo-Anne Birnie-Danzker and Bernard Marcade. "A rebours", 68 pp.)

April 1987

Recent Acquisitions.

Exhibitions For Fine Arts Gallery, U.B.C.

- Oct. 11 - Nov. 18, 1989 Canadian Works from U.B.C. Collections and Related Archival Material.
- No. 21 - Dec. 22, 1989 Mary Scott. (touring exhibition from Art Gallery of Southern Alberta)
- Jan. 4 - Feb. 4, 1990 Ian Wilson. (Collaboration with Delfryd Celf, Wales) Publication of bookwork, Section 49.
- Feb. 6 - Mar. 17, 1990 Ian Wallace: The Idea of the University. Catalogue 64 pp. (essay "Critical Potentialities".)
- Mar. 22 - Apr. 21, 1990 Anne Ramsden: Urban Geography (A video installation.) Handout 8 pp.
- May 1 - July 31, 1990 For the Record: Documents, photographs and objects from the UBC Fine Arts Gallery Archives.
- Aug. 1 - Sept. 15, 1990 Peter Hujar: A Retrospective. (organized by the Grey Gallery, N.Y.U.)

Books

1990 Jack Shadbolt (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre)

Articles and Reviews

- May 1979 "Realite Poetique: The Fell Collection", Vanguard, Vol. 8, No. 4, pp. 8-11
- September 1980 "Chris Reed at Pumps", Vanguard, Vol. 9, No. 7, p. 31
- November 1981 "Joey Morgan at Open Space", Vanguard, Vol. 10, No. 9, pp. 40-41
- February 1982 "Geoffrey Smedley and the Post-Modern", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp. 10-16. (article same as catalogue essay, see Exhibitions)

- April 1982 "Stephen Horne at Open Space", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 3, pp. 27-28
- May 1982 "Michael Morris", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 4, pp. 27-28
- Summer 1982 - "Stephen McCaffrey at the Western Front", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 5/6  
 - "The Braineaters at the Unit Pitt", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 5/6  
 - "Fred Fitzpatrick at the Western Front", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 5/6
- September 1982 "Terry Larkin and Rosa Lee at Reflections", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 7, p. 28
- Oct./Nov. 1982 "Jack Harmon at the Provincial Law Courts", Vanguard, Vol. 11, No. 8/9, p. 31
- 1982 "Unbashed Heroics: Randy & Berenicci at the Western Front", ArtCom, No. 18, pp. 28-29
- December 1982 - "John Greyson at the Western Front", Vanguard, Vol 11, No. 10, p. 27  
 January 1983
- February 1983 "L'Esprit de Corps Nouveau at the Unit Pitt", Vanguard, Vol. 12, No. 1, p. 31
- October 1983 "Painting the Streets", Vanguard, Vol. 12, No. 8, pp. 46-53
- May 1984 "Charles Rea at the Western Front", Vanguard, Vol. 13, No. 4, p. 31  
 "Jeannie Kamins", Vanguard, Vol. 13, no. 5/6, p. 37
- Fall 1984 "E.J. Hughes in Perspective", Canadian Art, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 64-69
- Winter 1984 "The Erotized Landscape: A Conversation about Art in Super Natural British Columbia", Arts Manitoba, Vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 51-53
- February 1985 "Jack Shadbolt: The Act of Painting", Vanguard, Vol. 14, No. 1, pp. 20-23 (article same as catalogue essay, see Exhibitions)
- Spring 1985 "Futura Bold: Flesh and Void", C, No. 5, pp. 22-23

- Summer 1985
- "On Board the Titanic", C, No. 6, pp. 49-51
  - "Stan Douglas: The Afterlife of Interiority", C, No. 6, p. 23
  - "Surface, Ruin, Flesh: The Return of Romantic Values in Painting", Vanguard, Vol. 14, No. 5/6, 16 p. supplement (same article as exhibition essay, see Exhibitions)
- Fall 1985
- "Gathie Falk", (with Sandra Martin) Canadian Art, Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 52-59
- Summer 1986
- "B.C. Binning: Modernism in a Classical Calm", Vanguard, Vol. 15, No. 3
  - "Luminous Sites", Parachute, No. 43, pp. 38-39
- Fall 1986
- "Shelagh Keeley", Canadian Art, Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 107-108
- March/April 1987
- "Anselm Kiefer: Bilder 1980-1986 at the Stedilijk", Wolkenkratzer, No. 2/1987, pp. 60-61
- Spring 1987
- "Jack Shadbolt", Canadian Art, Vol. 4, No. 1
- Fall 1987
- "Angela Grossman", Canadian Art, Vol. 4, No. 3
- October 1987
- "Desiring Transparency", for "Artropolis", (Vancouver Artist's League) pp. 11-14
- Winter 1988
- "Ted Wan", PhotoCommunique
- March/April 1988
- "Zweimal Canada Dry—Sechs Künstler aus Vancouver: Jeff Wall, Ian Wallace, Rodney Graham, Ken Lum, Roy Arden and Stan Douglas", Wolkenkratzer Art Journal, No. 2/1988, pp. 28-33
- Jan./Feb. 1988
- "Herman Nitsch at Pedersen", Artscribe, No. 67
- March 1988
- "Adoration and Denial", Catalogue essay for Attila Richard Lukacs, Kuenstlerhaus Bethanien, Berlin, pp. 7-10
- May/June 1988
- "Democratic Style", Artscribe, No. 69, pp. 10-11
  - "Shinkel Goes to Hollywood: Charles Jencks, Die Postmoderne Architektur und Democratie", Wolkenkratzer Art Journal, No. 3/1988, pp. 44-49
- Summer 1988
- "Wasser, Bitte!", Catalogue essay for "Martin von Ostrowski", Nikolas Sonne Galerie, Berlin
  - "The Instrument and the Wound: Joseph Beuys



- at the Martin-Gropiusbau, Berlin", Vanguard, Vol. 17, No. 3, pp. 18-23
- July/Aug. 1988 "Bilder, Zeichen, Raume: A.R. Penck Retrospective in der Nationalgalerie, Berlin", Wolkenkratzer Art Journal, No. 4-1988, pp. 45-47
- Sept. 23 - Nov., 1988 "Totegeborene Metaphysik", In catalogue for Arbeit in Geschichte: Geschichte in Arbeit, Kunsthaus Hamburg, pp. 161-165
- March 1989 "Three Masks for Al Neil", Catalogue article for Al Neil: Origins, Western Front Gallery, pp. 16-22. A slightly revised version was also printed in The Capilano Review, Series 2, No. 1, Fall 1989, pp. 15-22
- April/May 1989 "Signing Off", Vanguard, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp. 20-25. Also an article for Behind the Sign, catalogue, Artspeak, Vancouver, September 1988
- July/August/September 1989 "Guido Molinari at the Vancouver Art Gallery", Parachute, No.55, pp. 52-53
- Dec. 6-7, 1989 "Vancouver Photography", for the Akademie Schloss Solitude, Stuttgart. Proceedings published, 1990

#### Current Projects

- Fall 1990
- A book on Jack Shadbolt for Douglas & McIntyre. Published, Fall 1990
  - A lecture and article on the early Vancouver Conceptualism (tentative title) for Vancouver Anthology
  - A paper on Robert Mapplethorpe for the Powerplant
- Early 1990
- An article on Peter Hujar for the retrospective of his work at the Grey Gallery, N.Y.U., New York
- 
- An article for the Walter Philipps Gallery at the Banff Centre
  - Article for Vincent Trasov Catalogue
  - Article for Moffett/Gonzales-Torres

Williams, Carol

Published Papers and Critical Reviews

- Oct. 31, 1990      The Vancouver Anthology: Present and Persistent Feminist Cultural Practice in Vancouver over the past two decades, Catalogue essay and lecture on feminist activity in Vancouver, Lecture, publication due in Spring 1990 (by invitation).
- April 1990      Reading Beyond the Margins, catalogue essay for the exhibition Reading by Lorna Brown, Artspeak Gallery, catalogue published September 1990.
- May 1990      "Wilma Needham--'Operations in the Sphere of the Vulgar'" full-length article, Canadian Women's Studies Journal: special issue on Art and Feminism in Canada, (by invitation).
- September 1990      "Operations in the Sphere of the Vulgar" Harbour magazine, (by invitation).
- Jan./Feb. 1990      "Lorna Brown: Mobility" Parachute, (by invitation).
- February 1989      "Haunted House" - a review of photographs by Bob Bean, Vanguard, Vol. 18, No. 1.
- September 1987      "Visual Evidence - Sites of Resistance", Vanguard, Vol. 16, No. 4.
- December 1986-  
January 1987      "Margaret Naylor, Installation Sculpture", C Magazine, No. 12.

Lectures and Panel Discussions

- October 1990      "John Thomson and Adolphe Smith: Street Life of London and the disruption of Social Documentary" 2nd year Photo class, Emily Carr College of Art.
- November 1990      "Vancouver/Halifax Photo-based Production" Canadian Art History Class, Emily Carr College of Art and Design.
- October 31, 1990      "Present and Persistent: Feminist Cultural Practice in Vancouver 1971-1990", The Vancouver Anthology lecture series, organized by Stan Douglas on behalf of the OR gallery, Vancouver.

- Oct. 25-28, 1990 "Present and Persistent: Feminist Cultural Practice in Vancouver 1971-1990", to be given at panel entitled: An Assessment of the Decade Feminist Practice in Canada at the University Art Colleges Association annual conference in Montreal. There are two panels on feminist cultural activities in Canada at the UAAC conference this year organized by myself, Anne Ramsden and Allyson Clay.
- Sept. 26, 1990 "Investigations of an Archive - Orientalism and Nineteenth Century European Painting and Photography" Department of Art History, University of Guelph, Ontario.
- April 1990 "Four Contemporary Women Producers from Vancouver and their Relationship to Photography and Language" The Art Gallery of Nova Scotia, Halifax, Nova Scotia, (by invitation of curator, Cathy Busby).
- March 15, 1990 "Investigations of an Archive—Orientalism and Nineteenth Century European Painting and Photography" Department of Fine Art, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon.
- Mar. 22-25, 1990 "Ideology and Morality" panel for Voices/Voix: A Symposium on Photography, Language and the Poetic, The Banff Centre for the Arts, Photography Department.
- Nov. 16, 1989 "Investigation of an Archive—the Photographic folio of La Comtesse de Croix Mesnil", lecture given at a lecture series titled: Photography, Painting and Social Formations sponsored by the Fine Arts and Art History Department, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia. Other speakers include: Abigail Solomon-Godeau, Monika Gagnon, Martha Rosler, Jeff Wall.
- March 1989 "Art Work and Survival". A colloquium held in association with the exhibition EX EX EX, at Mount Saint Vincent University, curated by Mary Sparling. The panel speakers were former exhibition officers at the Mount gallery: Cliff Eyland; Michele Gallant; Beth Campbell. Co-sponsored by Nova Scotia College of Art and Design. I chaired this panel.
- May 1987 "Reworking Patriarchal Images". A historical and theoretical introduction to photo-montage and photoworks which collage appropriated images, and it's application to contemporary feminist

production. This event featured film and video by Toronto film-maker, Frances Leeming and Halifax video artist Liz MacDougall. It was co-sponsored by Women in Focus Gallery and Cineworks, Vancouver, Canada.

— "Women and Photography". A presentation of 19th and 20th century. Photographic production by women (European, American and Canadian), including contemporary Vancouver producers set within an analysis of feminist suffrage movement and the contemporary critique of art history. Given at:

March 1987 Art History Department, Kwantlen College, Surrey, Canada.

February 1986 Photography Department, Emily Carr College of Art, Vancouver, Canada.

August 1986

"Performance and the Voice". My paper addressed production by women performance artists and the influence of feminist, Helene Cixous's theory which develops a notion of women-centered speech. This brief presentation was given as part of a panel entitled Performance Now which included Wilma Needham, Rita McKeough, Marcella Bienvenue at the University Art Association Conference, University of Victoria, Victoria, Canada.

Wood, William

Publications

- 1990
- "Punctum or Perish", Camera Lucida (Banff: Walter Phillips Gallery)—forthcoming
  - "Keith Higgins", Parachute 60 (Fall)—forthcoming
  - "Donald Moffett and Felix Gonzales-Torres", Canadian Art, 7:3 (Fall)—forthcoming
  - Daniel Congdon: Praktik (Vancouver: Or Gallery)—forthcoming
- 1989
- "By the Lake: The Lunatic of One Idea", Public 2, 6-13
  - Robert McNealy: The Garden of the Unsuccessful Politician (Lethbridge: Southern Alberta Art Gallery)
- 1988
- "Being There (Anne Ramsden)", Vanguard, 17:6, (December 1988- January 1989), 36
  - "Becoming Worse (Don Gill and Michelle Normoyle)", Vanguard, 17:5 (November), 40
  - "The Patient Wait: Ian Wallace", Vanguard, 17:4 (September -October), 10-15
  - "The Difference of Times" and "Facing West", West: Roy Arden (Vancouver: Artspeak)
  - "Projectionists (Nomi Kaplan and Cheryl Sourkes)", Vanguard, 17:3, (Summer), 38
  - Mark Lewis: Burning (Vancouver: Artspeak)
  - "Mina Totino", Vanguard, 17:1 (February/March), 42
- 1987
- "Ni recompense, ni jury: 'Artropolis'", Vanguard, 16:6 (December 1987/January 1988), 18-21
  - "Bill Jones", Vanguard, 16:5 (November 1987), 31-32
  - "At Play", Will Gorlitz (New York: 49th Parallel)
  - "A Circular Insanity: Documenta 8", Vanguard, 16:4 (September/October), 20-24
  - "Dithering on, Petering Out (Noel Harding)", C magazine, 13 (Spring), 24-29
  - "Jeff Wall", C magazine, 13 (Spring), 70
  - "Dark/Light", Vanguard, 16:1 (February/March), 29-30
  - "Approval (Sandra Meigs)", C magazine, 12 (Winter), 54-55

- 1986
- "Robert McNealy", Vanguard, 15:6 (December/January), 30
  - "Skinjobs ('Songs of Experience')", C magazine, 11 (Fall), 78-87
  - "Back to the Walls ('How We See What We Say')", C magazine, 10 (Summer), 36-39
  - "Saint Jack (John Massey)", C magazine, 9 (Spring), 35-40
  - "Absent Celebration (Ron Benner)", C magazine, 8 (Winter), 29-31
- 1985
- "Sauve qui peut", Fire + Ice (Toronto: Chromazone)
  - "Sustaining Testimony: 'Under the Gaze of Criticism'", Vanguard, 14:6 (September), 20-22
  - "No-Place in Particular (John McEwen, Robert McNealy)", C magazine, 6 (Summer), 30-31
  - "Stephen Horne", Vanguard, 14:3 (May), 34
  - "Painting Disorders: Marc de Guerre", C magazine, 5 (Spring), 12-17
  - "Lee Paquette", Vanguard, 14:2 (March), 38
  - Pauline Choi (Stratford: Art Gallery of Stratford)
  - "Arguing with Manet, the Piano and a Dead Bear (Joanne Tod)", C magazine, 4 (Winter), 24-26
- 1984
- "Three These on Jeff Wall", C magazine, 3 (Fall), 10-15
  - "The Irony of Power (Robert Wiens)", C magazine, 2 (Summer), 16-17
- 1982
- Proposal Sheets: The Electrophotostatic Production of Fred Fitzpatrick (Vancouver: Western Fron Society)

## SECTION EIGHT

### Differential Analysis of the First Date of Publication of Primary Language Edition to Secondary Language Edition.

Note: The purpose of this analysis is to establish if there is a corresponding time frame for the publishing of translations of major French post-war, and German pre, and post-war intellectual figures that have been cited the 30 Canadian Authors. The criteria for the selection of these figures is based upon those individuals listed in Part D of Section Three. Furthermore, this analysis will be also restricted to the date of publication of the first actual published work of each figure, the first translation of a given monograph, and the first publication of an edited collection of translated articles and essays. In the case of edited collections one of my assumptions was that readers of translations will tend to rely on these sources for articles or essays rather than search out single translated articles published in various serials, an assumption that, in at least Foucault's case, was entirely correct. [Please see questionnaire responses in section nine]

#### A) Theodor Adorno

- 1931            'Die Aktualitat der Philosophie', Gesammelte Schriften, ed. Rolf Tiedeman, Frankfurt: Suhrkamp (1970-).
- 1947            With Horkheimer, Dialektik der Aufklarung:  
Trans. 1972    Philosophische Fragmente, Amsterdam: Querido, and trans. John Cumming as Dialectic of Enlightenment, New York: Herder & Herder 1972
- 1955            Prismen: Kulturkritik und Gesellschaft, Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, and trans. Samuel and Shierry Weber as Prisms, London: Neville Spearman 1967

#### B) Roland Barthes

- 1953            Le degre zero de l'ecriture. Paris, Seuil, 1953.  
Trans. 1968    Writing Degree Zero. Trans. Annette Lavers and Colin Smith. Pref. by S. Sontag. New York, Hill & Wang, 1968.
- 1957            Mythologies. Paris, Seuil, 1957, 1970.  
Trans. 1972    Mythologies. Selected and trans. Annette Lavers. New York, Hill & Wang, 1972; London, Jonathan Cape, 1972.

C) Jean Baudrillard

- 1968            La societe de consommation; ses mythes, ses structures.
- 1975            Le mirror de la production.  
1975            The Mirror of Production.
- 1988            Jean Baudrillard: Selected Writings. ed. by Mark  
Poster.

D) Walter Benjamin

- 1928            Ursprung des deutschen Trauerspiels, Berlin: Rowohlt,  
Trans. 1977    and trans. John Osborne as Origin of German Tragic  
Drama, London: New Left Books, 1977.
- Trans. 1968    Illuminations, ed. and intro. Hannah Arendt, Trans.  
Harry Zohn, New York: Harcourt, Brace: 1968.

E) Jacques Derrida

- 1962            L'Origine de la geometrie. Paris, Presses  
Universitaires de France, 1962.
- 1967            De la grammatologie. Paris, Minuit, 1967.  
Trans. 1976    Of Grammatology. Trans. Gayatri Spivak. Baltimore,  
Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976.

F) Michel Foucault

- 1952?           Sur L'emploi de la penicilline par voie buccale. Paris:  
[Universite] Faculte de medecine. These, 1952[?].
- 1961            Folie et deiaison. Histoire de la folie a l'age  
Trans. 1965    classique. Paris: Plon, 1961. and trans. Richard  
Howard as Madness and Civilization. New York:  
Pantheon, 1965.
- Trans. 1977    Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and  
Interviews. Edited by Bouchard. Trans. by Donald  
Bouchard and Sherry Simon. Ithaca: Cornell University  
Press, 1977.

G) Julia Kristeva

- 1969            Semeiotike: Recherches pour une semanalyse. Paris:  
Seuil, 1969.



- 1974                    Des Chinoises. Paris: des femmes, 1974.  
 Trans. 1977           About Chinese Women. New York: Citizen Books, 1977.
- 1980                    Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art. Ed. Leon S. Roudiez. New York: Columbia University Press, 1980.

H)     Jacques Lacan

- 1932                    De la psychose paranoïaque dans ses rapports avec la personnalité. Doctoral thesis. Paris, Le Francois, 1932, Seuil, 1975, 1980.
- 1956                    Fonction et champ de la parole et du langage en psychanalyse, Vol. I (Paris, 1956').  
 Trans. 1968           The Language of the Self: The Function of Language in Psychoanalysis, in 1968. Baltimore, Johns Hopkins Press, 1968, 1981; New York, Dell, 1975.
- 1966                    Ecrits. 2 vols. Paris, Seuil, 1966.  
 Trans. 1977           Ecrits. A Selection. Trans. Alan Sheridan. London, Tavistock, 1977; New York, Norton, 1977.

I)     Jean-Francois Lyotard

- 1954                    La Phenomenologie. Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1954.
- 1979                    La Condition post-moderne: rapport sur le savoir. Paris, Editions de Minuit, 1979.  
 Trans. 1984           The Post-modern Condition: a Report on Knowledge. Trans. Geoff Bennington and Brian Massumi. Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1984; Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1984.

SECTION NINE

Questionnaire Responses - Bibliography of Foucault's Published Work.

- A) Numbered code for all authors who filled out the questionnaire.  
Note: Walter Klepac, Marnie Fleming and Russell Keziere did not fill out the questionnaire though from the interviews they, like the rest of the author's had read Foucault's "The Order of Things".
- B) Sources for Questionnaire/Bibliography:
- Clark, Michael. Michel Foucault: An Annotated Bibliography. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1983
- Bernauer, James and Rasmussen, David. The Final Final Foucault. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 1988
- |                    |                     |
|--------------------|---------------------|
| 1) Philip Fry      | 7) William Wood     |
| 2) Philip Monk     | 8) Heather Dawkins  |
| 3) Scott Watson    | 9) Lesley Johnstone |
| 4) Robert Graham   | 10) Cheryl Simon    |
| 5) Trevor Gould    | 11) James Patten    |
| 6) Bruce Grenville | 12) Carol Williams  |
- A1) Sur l'emploi de la penicilline par voie buccale. Paris: [Universite] Faculte de medecine. These, 1952[?]. 56 pages.
- Brief account of the therapeutic use of penicillin. (The National Union Catalog lists this item as published in 1949.)
- 1) Maladie mentale et personnalite. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1954. Cf. #9 below.
- 2) "Introduction". To Ludwig Binswanger, Le reve et l'existence ("Traum und Existenz"). Translated from the German by Jacqueline Verdeaux. Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1954, 9-128.

- 
- 2ET) "Dream, Imagination, and Existence." Translated by Forrest Williams. **Review of Existential Psychology and Psychiatry** XIX, 1 (1984-1985) 29-78.
- 
- 3) "La recherche scientifique et la psychologie." In **Des chercheurs français s'interrogent** Edited by Jean-Edouard Morère. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1957, 171-201
- 
- 4) Translation into French with Daniel Rocher of Viktor von Weizsaecker, **Le cycle de la structure (Der Gestaltkreis)** With a preface by Henry Ey Paris: Desclée de Brouwer, 1958
- 
- 5) **Thèse complémentaire** for the doctorat ès lettres, University of Paris, Faculty of Letters and the Human Sciences, 1961. The Director of Studies Jean Hyppolite A typescript in two volumes that is available at the Bibliothèque Sorbonne, Paris This thesis is an introduction to and translation, with notes, of Immanuel Kant, **Anthropologie (Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht)**  
Vol I: Introduction, 128 pp Vol II Translation and Notes, 347 pp This volume was later published as **Anthropologie du point de vue pragmatique** Paris Vrin, 1964
- 
- 6) **Folie et deraison Histoire de la folie à l'âge classique.** Paris: Plon, 1961. Reissued in an abridged form in 1964, Paris: Union Générale d'Éditions. Reissued in original complete form as **Histoire de la folie à l'âge classique** (Paris Gallimard, 1972) with different preface and two appendices "La folie, l'absence d'oeuvre" (**La Table Ronde**, May, 1964) and "Mon corps, ce papier, ce feu" (**Paideia**, September, 1971). Reissued in the TEL collection without the appendices. Paris. Gallimard, 1978
- 
- 1-2-3-4-8-9-10-11-12-13 6ET) **Madness and Civilization** Translated by Richard Howard Introduction by José Barchilon New York Pantheon, 1965 The English version is a translation of the drastically abridged edition of 1964 with some slight additions from the original edition
- 
- 7) "La folie n'existe que dans une société " **Le Monde** 5135 (July 22, 1961) 9 An interview with Jean-Paul Weber
- 
- 8) Review of Alexander Koyre. **La révolution astronomique, Copernic, Kepler, Borelli** **La Nouvelle Revue Française** 108 (December, 1961) 1123-1124

---

9) **Maladie mentale et psychologie**. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1962, 1966. This is the revised edition of #1 above with a totally different second part and conclusion.

1. 4. 13.

---

9ET) **Mental Illness and Psychology**. Translated by Alan Sheridan. New York: Harper and Row, 1976.

---

10) "Introduction." To **Rousseau juge de Jean-Jaques: Dialogues**. Paris: Librairie Armand Colin, 1962, vii-xxiv.

---

11) "Le 'non' du père." **Critique** 178 (March, 1962) 195-209. An essay on Jean Laplanche's **Holderlin et la question du père**.

2.

---

11ET) The Father's 'No'." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews**. Edited by Donald Bouchard. Translated by Donald Bouchard and Sherry Simon. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1977, 68-86.

---

12) "Les déviations religieuses et le savoir médical." **Hérésies et sociétés dans l'Europe pré-industrielle 11e-18e siècles**. Communications et débats du Colloque de Royaumont présentés par Jacques LeGoff. Paris: Mouton, 1968, 19-29. Foucault's presentation and the discussion which followed took place at a conference from May 27-30, 1962.

---

13) "Le cycle des grenouilles." **La Nouvelle Revue Française** 114 (June, 1962) 1159-1160. Presentation of a text by Jean-Pierre Brisset.

---

14) "Un si cruel savoir." **Critique** 182 (July, 1962) 597-611. An essay on Claude Crébillon's **Les égarements du cœur et de l'esprit** and J.A. Reveroni de Saint-Cyr, **Pauliska ou la perversité moderne**.

---

15) "Dire et voir chez Raymond Roussel." **Lettre Ouverte** 4 (Summer, 1962) 38-51. In a modified version much of this essay was later published as the first chapter of his volume on Raymond Roussel. Cf. #18 below.

---

16) Translation into French of Leo Spitzer, "Art du langage et linguistique." **Etudes de style**. Paris: Gallimard, 1962, 45-78. Original English: "Linguistics and Literary History," in Spitzer's **Linguistics and Literary History**. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1948, 1-39

- \_\_\_\_\_ 17) **Naissance de la clinique. Une archéologie du regard médical** Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1963. Revised edition published in 1972, cf. #87 below.
- 2.3.4.6.8.11.12.13 17ET) **The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception.** Translated by Alan Sheridan Smith. New York: Pantheon, 1973. (A translation of revised edition with some exceptions).
- \_\_\_\_\_ 18) **Raymond Roussel.** Paris: Gallimard, 1963.
- 2.3.6.13 18ET) **Death and the Labyrinth: The World of Raymond Roussel.** Translated by Charles Ruas, with an introduction by John Ashberry. New York: Doubleday and Company, 1986
- \_\_\_\_\_ 18A) "Le métamorphose et le labyrinthe." **La Nouvelle Revue Française** 124 (April, 1963) 638-661. This is chapter 5 of Raymond Roussel.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 19) "Wächter über die Nacht der Menschen." In Hans Ludwig Spegg, ed., **Unterwegs mit Rolf Italiaander: Begegnungen, Betrachtungen, Bibliographie.** Hamburg: Freie Akademie der Kunst, 1963, 46-49.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 20) "Préface à la transgression." **Critique** 195-196 (August-September, 1963) 751-769.
- 4.13 20ET) "A Preface to Transgression." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 29-52.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 21) "Un 'Fantastique de bibliothèque'." **Cahiers Renaud-Barrault** 59 (March 1967) 7-30 Republished as the introduction to G. Flaubert, **La tentation de Saint Antoine** with the title "La bibliothèque fantastique." Paris: Le Livre de Poche, 1971, 7-33. This essay, written in 1964, was originally published in a German translation by Anneliese Botond and used as the afterword to Flaubert, **Die Versuchung Des Heiligen Antonius.** Frankfurt: Insel, 1964, 217-251.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 21ET) "Fantasia of the Library." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 87-109
- \_\_\_\_\_ 22) "Débat sur le roman " **Tel Quel** 17 (Spring, 1964) 12-54 A discussion, held at Cérisy la Salle in September, 1963, directed by MF.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 23) "Débat sur la poésie " **Tel Quel** 17 (Spring, 1964) 69- 82 A discussion, held at Cérisy la Salle in September, 1963, in which MF participated

- \_\_\_\_\_ 24) "Le langage à l'infini." *Tel Quel* 15 (Autumn, 1963) 44-53.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 24ET) "Language to Infinity." In *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*. 53-67.
2. \_\_\_\_\_ 25) "Guetter le jour qui vient." *La Nouvelle Revue Francaise* 130 (October, 1963) 709-716. On Roger Laporte, *La Vielle*.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 26) "Distance, aspect, origine." *Critique* 198 (November, 1963) 931-945.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 27) "La prose d'Actéon." *La Nouvelle Revue Francaise* 135 (March, 1964) 444-459. On Pierre Klossowski.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 28) "Le langage de l'espace." *Critique* 203 (April, 1964) 378-382.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 29) "La folie, l'absence d'oeuvre." *La Table Ronde* 196 (May, 1964) 11-21. Republished as appendix to 1972 edition of *Histoire de la folie*, 575-582.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 30) "Nietzsche, Freud, Marx." *Cahiers de Royaumont 6: Nietzsche*. Paris: Éditions de Minuit, 1967, 183-200. Conference, at which this paper was first delivered, took place in July, 1964.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 30ET) "Nietzsche, Freud, Marx." Translated by Jon Anderson and Gary Hentzi. *Critical Texts* III,2 (Winter, 1986) 1-5. The discussion which followed Foucault's paper is not included in this version.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 31) "Pourquoi réédite-t-on l'oeuvre de Raymond Roussel? un précurseur de notre littérature moderne." *Le Monde* 6097 (August 22, 1964) 9.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 32) "Les mots qui saignent." *L'Express* 688 (Aug. 29, 1964) 21-22. Review of Pierre Klossowski's translation of Virgil's *Aeneid*.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 33) "Le Mallarmé de J.-P. Richard." *Annales* 19, No. 5 (Sept.-Oct., 1964) 996-1004. A review of Richard's *L'univers imaginaire de Mallarmé*.

- \_\_\_\_\_ 34) "L'obligation d'écrire." **Arts** 980 (Nov. 11-17, 1964) 7. On Gérard de Nerval.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 35) "Philosophie et psychologie." **Dossiers pédagogiques de la radio-télévision scolaire** 10 (February 15-27, 1965) 61-67. An interview conducted by A. Badiou.
- 1.9 \_\_\_\_\_ 36) **Les mots et les choses: une archéologie des sciences humaines**. Paris: Gallimard, 1966.
- 1.2.3.4.5.6.7.8.11.12.13 \_\_\_\_\_ 36ET) **The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences**. Unidentified collective translation. New York: Pantheon, 1971.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 36A) "Les suivants." **Mercure de France** 1221-1222 (July-August 1965) 366-384. Identical to first chapter in LMC.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 36B) "La prose du monde." **Diogène** 53 (Jan.-March, 1966) 20-41. This is a shortened version of the second chapter of LMC, in which it bears the same title. This was also published as "The Prose of the World." Translated by Victor Velen. **Diogènes** 53 (Spring, 1966) 17-37.
- 2.13. \_\_\_\_\_ 37) "L'arrière-fable." **L'arc** 29 (1966) 5-12. On Jules Verne.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 38) "Entretien: Michel Foucault, 'les mots et les choses.'" **Les Lettres Françaises** 1125 (March 31, 1966) 3-4. An interview with Raymond Bellour. Republished in Bellour's **Le livre des autres**. Paris: Éditions de l'Herne, 1971, 135-144.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 39) "Entretien." **La Quinzaine Littéraire** 5 (May 16, 1966) 14-15. An interview with Madeleine Chapsal.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 40) Excerpt of a letter from MF to René Magritte, dated June 4, 1966, published in René Magritte, **Ecrits complets**, ed. by André Blavier. Paris: Flammarion, 1979, 521. Responds to letter from Magritte of May 23, 1966 which is included in **Ceci n'est pas une pipe** (cf. #53 below).
- \_\_\_\_\_ 41) "L'homme, est-il mort: Un entretien avec Michel Foucault." **Arts et loisirs** 38 (June 15, 1966) 8-9. An interview with Claude Bonnefoy.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 42) "La pensée du dehors." **Critique** 229 (June, 1966) 523-546. On Maurice Blanchot. Reprinted in book form: **La pensée du dehors**. Montpellier: Editions Fata Morgana, 1986

---

43) "Une histoire restée muette." **La Quinzaine Littéraire** 8 (July 1, 1966) 3-4. Review of Ernst Cassirer, **The Philosophy of the Enlightenment**.

---

44) "C'était un nageur entre deux mots." **Arts-loisirs** 54 (Oct. 5, 1966) 8-9. An interview with Claude Bonnefoy on André Breton.

---

45) "La pensée médicale." **Le concours médical** 88 (October 22, 1966) 6285-6286.

---

46) "Un archéologue des idées: Michel Foucault." **Synthèses** 245 (October, 1966) 45-49. An article on LMC by Jean-Michel Minon, with extensive quotations from an interview with MF.

---

47) "Introduction générale." To Friedrich Nietzsche, **Oeuvres philosophiques** Vol. 5: **Le gai savoir**. Texts and variations established by G. Colli and M. Montinari. Translated from the German by Pierre Klossowski. Paris: Gallimard, 1967, i-iv.

---

48) "Des espaces autres." **Architecture-Mouvement-Continuité** 5 (October 1984) 46-49. A lecture delivered on March 14, 1967.

7.

---

48EΓ) "Of Other Spaces." Translated by Jay Miskowiec. **Diacritics** 16, 1 (Spring, 1986) 22-27.

---

49) "Deuxième entretien: Sur les facons d'écrire l'histoire." **Les Lettres Françaises** 1187 (June 15, 1967) 6-9. Second interview with Raymond Bellour. Republished in R. Bellour, **Le livre des autres**. Paris: Éditions de l'Herne, 1971, 189-207.

---

50) "Conversazione con Michel Foucault." **La Fiera Letteraria** 39 (Sept. 28, 1967). An interview conducted by P. Caruso and published in Italian. Republished in Caruso's **Conversazione con Levi-Strauss, Foucault, Lacan**. Milano: U. Mursia and Co., 1969, 91-131. There is a German translation by Walter Seitter published as "Gespräch mit Michel Foucault" in the collection of MF's writings: **Von der Subversion des Wissens** Frankfurt: Ullstein, 1978, 7-31.

---

51) "Préface." To Antoine Arnaud and Pierre Nicole, **Grammaire générale et raisonnée**. Paris: Paulet, 1969, iii-xxvii.



- \_\_\_\_\_ 51A) "La grammaire générale de Port Royal." **Langages** 7 (September, 1967) 7-15. An extract from #51.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 52) "Les mots et les images." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 154 (Oct. 25, 1967) 49-50. A review of Irwin Panofsky's **Essais d'iconologie** and **Architecture Gothique et Pensée Scolastique**.
9. \_\_\_\_\_ 53) "Ceci n'est pas une pipe." **Les cahiers du chemin** 2 (Jan. 15, 1968) 79-105. This essay on the painter René Magritte was reissued in an enlarged version as **Ceci n'est pas une pipe**. Montpellier: Scholies, Fata Morgana, 1973.
2. 3. 4. 5. 6. 8. 9. 10. 13 \_\_\_\_\_ 53ET) "Ceci n'est pas une pipe." Translated by Richard Howard. **October** 1 (Spring, 1976) 6-21. This translation was of the first edition but included some material from the enlarged version which was translated and edited by James Harkness. **This Is Not A Pipe** (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982).
1. \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_ 54) "Foucault répond à Sartre." **La Quinzaine Littéraire** 46 (March 1-15, 1968) 20-22. A radio interview with Jean-Pierre El Kabbach. The publication of this unedited transcript provoked a sharp reply from MF in the journal's following issue (March 15-31), 21: "Une mise au point de Michel Foucault."
- \_\_\_\_\_ 55) "Réponse à une question." **Esprit** 371 (May, 1968) 850-874.
4. 6 \_\_\_\_\_ 55ET) "History, Discourse and Discontinuity." Translated by Anthony Nazzaro. In **Salmagundi** 20 (Summer-Fall 1972) 225-248, and reissued in **Psychological Man**, edited by Robert Boyers. Harper: Colophon, 1975, 208-231. A revised translation by Colin Gordon was published as "Politics and the Study of Discourse." **Ideology and Consciousness** 3 (Spring, 1978) 7-26.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 56) "Lettre de Michel Foucault à Jacques Proust" **La Pensée** 139 (May-June, 1968) 114-117. This comments on the discussion which the same journal published as "Entretiens sur Michel Foucault." **La Pensée** 137 (Feb., 1968) 3-37.
- \_\_\_\_\_ 57) "Réponse au Cercle d'épistémologie." **Cahiers pour l'analyse** 9: **Généalogie des sciences** (Summer, 1968) 9-40. Excerpted as "Réponse au Cercle d'épistémologie." **Les Lettres Françaises** 1240 (July 10, 1968) 3-6.

<u>13</u>	57ET) "On the Archaeology of the Sciences." <b>Theoretical Practice</b> 3-4 (Autumn, 1971) 108-127. An abridged translation with no translator identified.
<u>1.</u>	58) <b>L'archéologie du savoir</b> . Paris: Gallimard, 1969.
<u>1. 2. 3. 4. 5. 6. 8. 12. 18</u>	58ET) <b>The Archaeology of Knowledge</b> . Translated by A. M. Shendan Smith. New York: Harper Colophon, 1976.
	59) "Médecins, juges et sorciers au XVIIe siècle." <b>Médecine de France</b> 200 (1969) 121-128.
	60) "Jean Hyppolite (1907-1968)." <b>Revue de Métaphysique et de Morale</b> 74, 2 (April-June, 1969) 131-136. This was originally presented at the memorial session for Hyppolite on Jan. 19, 1969, at the Ecole Normale Supérieure.
	61) "Ariane s'est pendue." <b>Le Nouvel Observateur</b> 229 (March 31, 1969) 36-37. A review of G. Deleuze's <i>Différence et répétition</i> .
	62) "En bref: Précision." <b>Le Nouvel Observateur</b> 229 (March 31, 1969) 39. Correction to "Une petite histoire," <b>Le Nouvel Observateur</b> 227 (March 17, 1969) 43. On MF's being prevented from speaking in London.
	63) "La naissance du monde." <b>Le Monde des livres</b> 7558 (May 3, 1969) viii. A conversation with Jean-Michel Palmier.
	64) "Michel Foucault explique son dernier livre." <b>Magazine littéraire</b> 28 (April-May, 1969) 23-25. An interview on AS conducted by J.J. Brochier.
	65) "Qu'est-ce qu'un auteur?" <b>Bulletin de la Société française de Philosophie</b> 63 (July-September 1969) 73-104. First presented as a lecture on Feb. 22, 1969. Foucault's remarks are followed by a discussion in which the following participated: Maurice de Gandillac, Lucien Goldmann, Jacques Lacan, Jean d'Ormesson, J. Ullmo, Jean Wahl.
<u>5. 6. 8. 9. 12</u>	65ET) "What Is An Author?" In <b>Language, Counter-Memory, Practice</b> , 113-138. Translation is slightly abridged and the discussion is omitted.
	66) "La situation de Cuvier dans l'histoire de la biologie II." <b>Revue d'histoire des sciences et de leurs applications</b> XXIII,

1 (Jan.-March, 1970) 63-92 This presentation was made at a conference held May 30-31, 1969 and was followed by a discussion. Foucault also made comments on another paper delivered at the conference, that of Francois Dagonet, "La situation de Cuvier dans l'histoire de la biologie I" (presentation is on pp. 49-60 in the same issue of the journal with Foucault's comments on pp. 61-62).

66ET) "Cuvier's Position in the History of Biology." Translated by Felicity Edholm. *Critique of Anthropology* IV, 13-14 (Summer, 1979) 125-130.

67) Two letters from MF to Pierre Klossowski, dated July 3, 1969, and Winter, 1970-71, reproduced in *Cahiers pour un temps: Pierre Klossowski* Paris: Centre Georges Pompidou, 1985, 85-88 and 89-90.

1. 68) *L'ordre du discours*. Paris: Gallimard, 1971 MF's inaugural lecture at the Collège of France, Dec. 2, 1970.

4.7. 68ET) "Orders of Discourse." Translated by Rupert Swyer, *Social Science Information* (April, 1971). Republished as "The Discourse on Language," an Appendix to ET of *L'archéologie du savoir* (cf. #58 above), 215-237.

69) "Présentation." To Georges Bataille, *Oeuvres Complètes I: Premiers Écrits 1922-1940*. Paris: Gallimard, 1970, 5-6.

70) "Sept propos sur le 7e ange." A preface to Jean-Pierre Brisset, *La grammaire logique*. Paris: Tchou, 1970, vii-xix. Republished in book form as *Sept propos sur le septième ange*. Montpellier: Editions Fata Morgana, 1986.

71) "Le piège de Vincennes." *Le Nouvel Observateur* 274 (Feb. 9, 1970) 33-35. An interview with Patrick Loriot.

72) "Il y aura scandale, mais . . ." *Le Nouvel Observateur* 304 (Sept. 7, 1970) 40. A note on Pierre Guyotat's *Eden, Eden, Eden*.

72ET) "Open Letter to Pierre Guyotat " Translated by Edouard Roditi. *Paris Exiles* 2 (1985) 25

73) "Croître et multiplier " *Le Monde* 8037 (Nov 15-16, 1970) 13. A review of Francois Jacob, *La logique du vivant*

---

74) "Theatrum Philosophicum." **Critique** 282 (November, 1970) 885- 908. This is a reflection on two books of Gilles Deleuze, **Différence et répétition** and **Logique du sens**.

---

74ET) "Theatrum Philosophicum." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 165-196.

---

75) "Foreword." To the 1971 English edition of **LMC**. In **The Order of Things**, ix-xiv. Cf. #36 above.

---

76) "Entrevista com Michel Foucault." In **O homem e o discurso**. Rio de Janeiro: Tempo Brasileiro, 1971, 17-42. An interview conducted by Sergio P. Rouanet and J.G. Merquior. In Portuguese.

---

77) "Nietzsche, la généalogie, l'histoire." In **Hommage à Jean Hyppolite**. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1971, 145-172.

---

77ET) "Nietzsche, Genealogy, History." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 139-164.

---

78) "A Conversation with Michel Foucault." **Partisan Review** 38 (1971) 192-201. An interview by John Simon.

---

79) "Mon corps, ce papier, ce feu." **Paideia** (Sept., 1971). Reissued as Appendix to 1972 edition of **Historie de la folie**, 583-603. Cf. #6 above.

---

79ET) "My Body, this Paper, this Fire." Translated, with an introduction, by Geoff Bennington. **Oxford Literary Review** IV, 1 (Autumn, 1979) 5-28.

---

80) "Lettre " In **La Pensée** 159 (Sept.-Oct., 1971) 141-144. Foucault wrote in criticism of an article by Jean-Marc Pelorson, "Michel Foucault et l'Espagne." **La Pensée** 152 (August, 1970) 88-99.

---

81) "Human Nature: Justice versus Power." Published in **Reflexive Water: The Basic Concerns of Mankind**, edited by Fons Elders. London: Souvenir Press, 1974, 134-197. A discussion between MF and Noam Chomsky. Televised in November, 1971 by the Dutch Broadcasting Company and moderated by Fons Elders.

---

82) "Par delà le bien et le mal " **Actuel** 14 (Nov., 1971) 42-47. Interview with M.A. Burnier and P. Graine. Republished

with slight modifications as "Entretien." **C'est demain la veille.** Paris: Seuil, 1973, 19-43.

82ET) "Revolutionary Action: 'Until Now.'" In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 218-233.

13.

83) "Monstrosities in Criticism." Translated by Robert J. Matthews. **Diacritics** 1, 1 (Fall, 1971) 57-60. This was written as a reply to a review of **The Order of Things** by George Steiner: "The mandarin of the hour—Michel Foucault." **The New York Times Book Review** (Feb. 28, 1971) 8, 23-31

1.

84) "Foucault responds 2" **Diacritics** 1, 2 (Winter, 1971) 60  
Foucault's response to Steiner's own reply to the preceding entry. Steiner's piece was published as "Steiner Responds to Foucault" **Diacritics** 1, 2 (Winter, 1971) 59.

85) "Le discours de Toul." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 372 (December 27, 1971) 15

86) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 71 (1971) Summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1971 Lecture: "La volonté de savoir" Seminar: "Le fonctionnement du système pénal en France à partir du XIXe siècle" Republished as Appendix in Angèle Kremer-Marietti, **Michel Foucault** (Paris: Seghers, 1974) 195-200

86ET) "History of Systems of Thought." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 199-204

87) **Naissance de la clinique: Une archéologie du regard médical.** Revised, second edition Paris. Presses Universitaires de France, 1972

87ET) Cf #17 above

88) "Préface" To new edition of **Histoire de la folie à l'âge classique** Paris: Gallimard, 1972. 7-9

89) "Sur la justice populaire: Débat avec les maos" **Les Temps Modernes** 310 (1972) 335-366 A discussion with Philippe Gavi and Pierre Victor

2.4.

89ET) "On Popular Justice: A Discussion with Maoists" Translated by John Mepham. In **Power/Knowledge: Selected**

**Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977**, edited by Colin Gordon. New York: Pantheon, 1980, 1-36.

---

90) "Les intellectuels et le pouvoir." *L'arc* 49 (1972) 3-10. A conversation between MF and Gilles Deleuze which took place on March 4, 1972.

---

90ET) "Intellectuals and Power." In **Language, Counter-Memory, Practice**, 205-217.

---

91) "Michel Foucault on Attica." *Telos* 19 (1974) 154-161. An interview with John Simon in 1972.

---

92) "Table ronde." *Esprit* 413 (April-May, 1972) 678-703. A discussion, in which MF participated, on questions relating to social work and its clients. Other participants were: Jean-Marie Domenach, Jacques Donzelot, Jacques Julliard, Philippe Meyer, Rene Pucheu, Paul Thibaud, Jean-Rene Treanton, Paul Virilio

---

93) "Gaston Bachelard, le philosophe et son ombre: Piéger sa propre culture." *Le Figaro* 1376 (Sept. 30, 1972) Litt. 16.

---

94) "Un dibattito Foucault-Preli." *Bimestre* 22-23 (Sept.-Dec. 1972) 1-4. A debate in Italian conducted by Michele Dziejuszycki.

---

95) "Médecine et lutte de classes." *La Nef* 49 (Oct.-Dec., 1972) 67-73. An edited round-table discussion between MF and members of the Health Information Group (Groupe Information Santé).

---

96) "Les deux morts de Pompidou." *Le Nouvel Observateur* 421 (Dec. 4, 1972) 56-57. Excerpts reprinted as "Deux calculs." *Le Monde* 8676 (Dec. 6, 1972) 20.

---

96ET) "The Guillotine Lives." Translated in abridged form by Paul Auster. *The New York Times* (April 8, 1973) section 4, p 15.

---

97) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 72 (1972) 283-286. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1972. Lecture: "Théories et institutions pénales." Seminar: "Psychiatrie et pénalité au XIXe

siècle." Reprinted as appendix in Kremer-Marietti, **Michel Foucault**, 201-205.

98) "Préface." To Serge Livrozet, **De la prison à la révolte**. Paris: Mercure de France, 1973, 7-14.

99) "Présentation." To **Moi, Pierre Rivière, ayant égorgé ma mère, ma soeur et mon frère**. Edited by Michel Foucault. Paris: Gallimard, Julliard, 1973, 9-15.

6.7.13.

99ET) "Foreword." To I, **Pierre Rivière, having slaughtered my mother, my sister and my brother**. Edited by Michel Foucault. Translated by Frank Jelinek. New York. Pantheon, 1975, vii-xiv.

99A) "Une crime fait pour être raconté." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 464 (October 1, 1973) 80-112. This article is an abbreviated version of his "Présentation" to **MPR** with excerpts from the memoir itself.

100) "Les meurtres qu'on raconte " **MPR**, 265-275

100ET) "Tales of Murder." In I, **Pierre Rivière . . .**, 199-212

101) "Pour une chronique de la mémoire ouvrière " **Liberation** (Feb. 22, 1973) 6. A brief conversation with MF, a journalist and a worker named José.

102) "En guise de conclusion " **Le Nouvel Observateur** 435 (March 13, 1973) 92. A commentary on David Rosenhan, "Je me suis fait passer pour fou," 72-93.

103) "La force de fuir." **Derrière le Miroir** 202 (March, 1973) 1-8. On the artist Rebeyrolle

104) "L'intellectuel sert à rassembler les idées, mais . . . son savoir est partiel par rapport au savoir ouvrier." **Libération** 16 (May 26, 1973) 2-3 A conversation between MF and a worker named José

105) "Un nouveau journal?" **Zone des tempêtes** 2 (May-June, 1973) 3

106) "A verdade e as formas jurídicas " Translated into Portuguese by R. Machado **Cadernos do P.U.C.**, 1974, 5-102

Five conferences by Foucault at the Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro on May 21–25, 1973. A discussion with MF is on 103–133.

107) "Entretien avec Michel Foucault: à propos de l'enfermement pénitentiaire." **Pro Justicia: Revue politique du droit** 3–4 (October, 1973) 5–14. An interview conducted by A. Krywin and F. Ringelheim.

108) "Gefängnisse und Gefängnisrevolten." **Dokumente: Zeitschrift für übernationale Zusammenarbeit** 29 (June 1973) 133–137. An interview conducted by Bodo Morawe.

109) "Convoqués à la P.J." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 468 (Oct. 29, 1973) 53. Written in collaboration with Alain Landau and Jean-Yves Petit.

110) "Entretien avec Gilles Deleuze, Felix Guattari." **Recherches** 13 (December, 1973) 27–31, 183–186.

111) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 73 (1973) 255–267. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1973. Lecture: "La société punitive." Seminar: "Pierre Rivière et ses oeuvres." Reprinted as appendix in Kremer-Marietti, **Michel Foucault**, 206–221.

112) "Les rayons noirs de Byzantios." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 483 (Feb. 11, 1974) 56–57. A review of **Trente dessins de Byzantios**.

113) "Sexualité et politique." **Combat** 9274 (April 27–28, 1974) 16.

114) "Entretien." **Cahiers du Cinéma** 251–252 (July-August, 1974) 5–15. An interview with Pascal Bonitzer and Serge Toubiana.

7-13.

114ET) "Film and Popular Memory." Translated with some minor omissions by Martin Jordin. **Radical Philosophy** 11 (Summer, 1975) 24–29.

115) Three lectures on the history of medicine delivered at the Instituto de Medicina Social, Centro Biomédico, Universidad Estatal de Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, in October, 1974. "Crisis de



un Modelo en la medicina?" **Revista Centroamericana de Ciencias de la Salud** 3 (Jan.-April, 1976) 197-210. "El nacimiento de la medicina social." **Ibid.** 6 (Jan.-April, 1977) 89-108; "Incorporacion del hospital en la tecnologia moderna." **Ibid.** 10 (May-August, 1978) 93-104.

---

116) "Table ronde sur l'expertise psychiatrique" **Actes: Cahiers d'action juridique** 5-6 (Dec. 1974-Jan. 1975). Reprinted in **Actes: Délinquances et ordre** (Paris: Maspero, 1978) 213-228 Other participants were Y. Bastie, A. Bompard, Diederichs, F. Domenach, P. Gay, J. Hassoun, J. Lafon, C. Marechal, P. Sphyras, F. Tirllocq. MF's interventions collected and republished as "L'expertise psychiatrique." **Actes** 54: La gouvernamentalité (Summer, 1986) 68.

---

117) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 74 (1974) 293-300. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1974. Lecture. "Le pouvoir psychiatrique." Seminar: "Explication des textes médicaux et juridiques du XIX siècle."

---

117A) A longer version of this text was later published as "La casa della follia." Translated by C. Tarroni. In Franco Basaglia and Franca Basaglia-Ongaro, ed., **Crimini di Pace**. Torino: Einaudi, 1975, 151-169 The original complete French text was then published in Basaglia and Basaglia-Ongaro, ed., **Les Criminels de paix: Recherches sur les intellectuels et leurs techniques comme préposés à l'oppression**. Translated by Bernard Fréminville. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1980, 145- 160.

---

118) **Surveiller et punir: Naissance de la prison** Paris: Gallimard, 1975.

2. 3. 4. 8. 9. 10. 11. 12. 19.

118ET) **Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison**. Translated by Alan Sheridan. New York. Pantheon, 1977.

---

118A) "La naissance des prisons." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 536 (Feb 17, 1975) 69-86 This article is made up of excerpts from SP

---

119) "La peinture photogénique" An introduction to an exhibition of paintings by Fromanger. **Fromanger: Le désir est partout**. Paris: Galerie Jeanne Bucher, 1975 (10 pages, no pagination).

---

120) "Préface." To Bruce Jackson, **Leurs Prisons**. Paris: Plon, 1975, i-vi.

---

121) "Un pompier vend la mèche." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 531 (Jan. 13, 1975) 56-57. A review of Jean-Jacques Lubrina, **Enfer des Pompiers**.

---

122) "Des supplices aux cellules." **Le Monde** 9363 (Feb. 21, 1975) 16. An interview with MF conducted by Roger Pol Droit.

---

122ET) "Michel Foucault on the Role of Prisons." **The New York Times** (Aug. 5, 1975) 31. Excerpts translated by Leonard Mayhew.

---

123) "Sur la sellette." **Les nouvelles littéraires** 2477 (March 17, 1975) 3. An interview conducted by Jean-Louis Ezine.

---

123ET) "An Interview with Michel Foucault." Translated by Renée Morel. **History of the Present** 1 (Feb., 1985) 2-3, 14.

---

124) "Entretien sur la prison." **Magazine littéraire** 101 (June, 1975) 27-33. An interview conducted by J.J. Brochier.

---

124ET) "Prison Talk: an interview with Michel Foucault." Translated by Colin Gordon. **Radical Philosophy** 16 (Spring, 1977) 10-15. Republished in **Power/Knowledge**, 37-54.

---

125) "Pouvoir et corps." A June interview with MF in **Quel corps?** 2 (1975). Reissued in a collection of texts from the review and published as **Quel corps?** Paris. Francois Maspero, 1978, 27-35.

3.6.8.12.

---

125ET) "Body/Power." In **Power/Knowledge**, 55-62. Translated by Colin Gordon.

---

126) "Foucault, passe-frontières de la philosophie." **Le Monde** (Sept. 6, 1986). An interview conducted by Roger-Pol Droit on June 20, 1975.

---

127) "La machine à penser s'est-elle detraquée?" **Le Monde Diplomatique** 256 (July, 1975) 18-21. Quotes MF, among others, in an inquiry into "a crisis of thought?," conducted by Maurice Maschino

---

128) "Aller à Madrid." **Libération** 538 (Sept. 24, 1975) 1, 7. An interview conducted by Pierre Benoit concerning a delegation of seven French intellectuals, including MF, expelled from Madrid while denouncing death sentences imposed on anti-Franco militants

- 129) "Faire les fous: Réflexions sur Histoire de Paul." **Le Monde** 9559 (Oct 16, 1975) 17. On the film by René Feret
- 130) "À propos de Marguerite Duras." **Cahiers Renaud Barrault** 89 (October, 1975) 8-22. A conversation between MF and Hélène Cixous.
- 131) "Sade, sergent du sexe." **Cinématographe** 16 (Dec., 1975-Jan., 1976) 3-5. Interview conducted by Gérard Dupont.
- 132) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée " **Annuaire du Collège de France** 75 (1975) 335-339. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1975. Lecture: "Les anormaux." Seminar: "L'expertise médico-légale en matière psychiatrique."
1. 133) **Histoire de la sexualité I: La volonté de savoir**. Paris: Gallimard, 1976.
1. 2. 3. 4. 6. 8. 10. 11. 13. 133ET) **The History of Sexuality I: An Introduction** Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978
- 134) "Les têtes de la politique " A preface to **En attendant le grand soir**, a book of sketches by Wiaz Paris: Denoël, 1976, 7- 12
- 135) "Un mort inacceptable." A preface to Bernard Cuau, **L'affaire Mirval ou Comment le récit abolit le crime** Paris: Les presses d'aujourd'hui, 1976, vii-xi.
- 136) "La politique de la santé au XVIIIe siècle " The introduction to Part I, "L'Institution hospitalière au XVIIIe siècle," of a three part study done under the direction of MF and published as **Généalogie des équipements de normalisation: Les équipements sanitaires**. Fontenay-sur-Bois: Centre d'Études, de Recherches et de Formation Institutionnelles (CERFI), 1976, 1-11.
- 136ET) "The Politics of Health in the Eighteenth Century." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 166-182
- 137) "La crisis de la medicina o la crisis de la antimedicina." **Education medica y salud** 10, 2 (1976) 152-170.
- 138) "Sur Histoire de Paul." **Cahiers du Cinéma** 262-263 (January, 1976) 63-65. A conversation between MF and René Féret

PAGINATION ERROR.

ERREUR DE PAGINATION.

TEXT COMPLETE.

LE TEXTE EST COMPLET.

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF CANADA.

BIBLIOTHEQUE NATIONALE DU CANADA.

CANADIAN THESES SERVICE.

SERVICE DES THESES CANADIENNES.

---

139) "Questions à Michel Foucault sur la géographie." **Hérodote** 1 (Jan.-March, 1976) 71-85.

---

139ET) "Questions on Geography." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 63-77.

---

140) "Crimes et châtements en U.R.S.S. et ailleurs " **Le Nouvel Observateur** 585 (Jan. 26, 1976) 34-37. An interview with K.S. Karol.

---

140ET) "The Politics of Crime." A translation of large excerpts by Mollie Horwitz. **Partisan Review** 43 (1976) 453-459.

---

141) "Corso del 7 gennaio 1976," and "Corso del 14 gennaio 1976." In **Microfisica del Potere**. Edited by Alessandro Fontana and Pasquale Pasquino. Torino: Einaudi, 1977, 163-177, 179-194. Italian translation of two lectures, unpublished in France, which were delivered in January, 1976 at the Collège de France.

---

141ET) "Two Lectures." Translated by Kate Soper. In **Power/Knowledge**, 78-108

---

142) "L'extension sociale de la norme." **Politique hebdo** 212 (March, 1976) 14-16. An interview, with P. Werner, on Szasz's **Fabriquer la folie**.

---

143) "Sorcellerie et folie." **Le Monde** 9720 (April 23, 1976) 18. A conversation with MF conducted by Roland Jaccard on Thomas Szasz's **Fabriquer la folie**.

---

144) "Intervista a Michel Foucault." An interview in June, 1976, conducted by Alessandro Fontana and Pasquale Pasquino. It serves as an introduction to their **Microfisica del Potere**, 3-28. Cf. #141 above for full entry.

---

144ET) "Truth and Power." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 109-133.

---

144A) This interview was released in French as "Vérité et pouvoir " **L'Arc** 70 (1977) 16-26. Excerpts had appeared earlier as "La fonction politique de l'intellectuel " **Politique hebdo** 247 (Nov. 29, 1976) 31-33. An English translation of the latter was made by Colin Gordon and published as "The Political Function of the Intellectual " **Radical Philosophy** 17 (Summer, 1977) 12-14.

---

145) "Des questions de Michel Foucault à Hérodote " **Hérodote** 3 (July-Sept , 1976) 9-10. Foucault's questions were

---

replied to in the same journal, issue #6 (April-June, 1977) 7-30.

146) "Bio-histoire et bio-politique." **Le Monde** 9869 (Oct. 17-18, 1976) 5. Remarks on J. Ruffie's **De la biologie à la culture**.

147) "L'Occident et la vérité du sexe." **Le Monde** 9885 (Nov. 5, 1976) 24.

2.6.

147ET) "The West and the Truth of Sex." Translated by Lawrence Winters. **Sub-Stance** 20 (1978) 5-8.

148) "Entretien avec Michel Foucault." **Cahiers du Cinéma** 271 (Nov. 1976) 52-53. An interview conducted by Pascal Kane on the René Allio film of **Moi, Pierre Rivière**.

149) "Malraux." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 629 (Nov. 29, 1976) 83.

150) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 76 (1976) 361-366. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1976. Lecture: "'Il faut défendre la société.'" Seminar: "L'utilisation des techniques psychiatriques en matière pénale."

150ET) "War in the Filigree of Peace. Course Summary." Translated by Ian McLeod. **Oxford Literary Review** IV, 2 (1980) 15-19.

150A) **Vom Licht des Krieges zur Geburt der Geschichte**. Edited by Walter Seitter. Berlin: Merve Verlag, 1986. This volume is made up of German translations of two of the lectures from this course (Jan. 21 and Jan. 28).

2.3.6.8.

151) "Preface " To the English translation of Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari, **Anti-Oedipus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia**. Translated by Robert Hurley, Mark Seem and Helen Lane. New York: Viking, 1977, xi-xiv.

152) "Vorwort zu deutschen Ausgabe." An introduction to the German edition of **VS: Sexualität und Wahrheit: I: Die Wille zum Wissen**. Translated by Ulrich Raulf. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1977, 7-8.

153) "Avant-propos." Foreword to **Politiques de l'habitat 1800-1850**, a study done under the direction of MF. Paris: CORDA, 1977, 3-4.

- 154) "L'oeil du pouvoir." Introduction to Jeremy Betham's **Le panoptique**. Paris: Pierre Belfond, 1977, 7-31. A conversation with Jean-Pierre Barou and Michelle Perrot.
9. 154ET) "The Eye of Power." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 146-165.
- 155) "Le supplice de la vérité." **Chemin de Ronde 1** (1977) 162-163.
- 156) "Die Folter, das ist die Vernunft." **Literaturmagazin 8** (1977) 60-68. A conversation with Kurt Boesers.
- 157) "Préface." To Mireille Debard and Jean-Luc Hennig, **Les juges kaki**. Paris: Editions Alain Moreau, 1977, 7-10. Also published as "Les juges kaki." **Le Monde** 10214 (Dec. 1-2, 1977) 15.
- 158) "Historia de la medicalizacion." **Education medica y salud** 11, 1 (1977) 3-25.
- 159) "Les rapports de pouvoir passent à l'intérieur des corps." An interview conducted by Lucette Finas. **La quinzaine littéraire** 247 (Jan. 1-15, 1977) 4-6.
- 159ET) "The History of Sexuality." Translated by Leo Marshall. In **Power/Knowledge**, 183-193.
- 160) "La vie des hommes infâmes." **Les Cahiers du Chemin** 29 (Jan. 15, 1977) 12-29. This piece was to serve as the introduction to a volume to be edited by Foucault and published under the same title by Gallimard
- 160ET) "The Life of Infamous Men." Translated by Paul Foss and Meaghan Morris. In the collection of essays they edited, **Power, Truth, Strategy**. (Sydney, Australia. Feral, 1979) 76-91.
- 161) "Michel Foucault: à bas la dictature du sexe!" **L'Express** 1333 (Jan. 24, 1977) 56-57. A review of **VS** by Madeleine Chapsal, with extensive quotations from an interview with MF
- 162) "Pouvoirs et stratégies." **Les revoltes logiques** 4 (Winter, 1977) 89-97.

162ET) "Powers and Strategies." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 134-145.

163) "Non au sexe roi." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 644 (March 12, 1977) 92-130. An interview conducted by Bernard-Henri Levy.

163ET) "Power and Sex: An Interview with Michel Foucault." Translated by David Parent. **Telos** 32 (Summer, 1977) 152-161.

164) "Les matins gris de la tolérance." **Le Monde** 9998 (March 23, 1977) 24. A review of a film by P. Pasolini, **Enquête sur la sexualité (Comizi d'Amore)**.

165) "L'asile illimité." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 646 (March 28, 1977) 66-67. A review of Robert Castel's **L'ordre psychiatrique**

166) "La géométrie de Maxime Defert." **Les Nouvelles Littéraires** 2582 (April 28 1977) 13. Review of an art exhibit.

167) "La grande colère des faits." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 652 (May 9, 1977) 84-86. Reissued in **Faut-il brûler les nouveaux philosophes?**, edited by Sylvie Bouscasse and Denis Bourgeois. Paris: Nouvelles Editions Oswald, 1978, 63-70. A reflection on André Glucksmann's **Les maîtres penseurs**.

168) "L'angoisse de juger." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 655 (May 30, 1977) 92-126. A debate on capital punishment with Robert Badinter and Jean Laplanche, edited by Catherine David.

169) "Le jeu de Michel Foucault." **Ornicar?** 10 (July, 1977) 62- 93. A discussion with MF. Participants were: Alain Grosrichard, Gérard Wajeman, Jacques-Alain Miller, Guy Le Gouffey, Catherine Millot, Dominique Colas, Jocelyne Livi, Judith Miller.

169ET) "The Confession of the Flesh." Translated by Colin Gordon. In **Power/Knowledge**, 194-228

170) "Une mobilisation culturelle." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 670 (Sept 12, 1977) 49

171) "Enfermement, Psychiatrie, Prison." **Change: La folie encerclee** 32-33 (Oct , 1977) 76-110. A dialogue between MF, David Cooper, Victor Fainberg, and Jean-Pierre Faye.



---

172) "About the Concept of the 'Dangerous Individual' in 19th-Century Legal Psychiatry." Translated by Alain Baudot and Jane Couchman. **International Journal of Law and Psychiatry** 1 (1978) 1-18. Originally delivered in English at a symposium in Toronto, October 24-26, 1977.

---

172A) This was later issued in French as "L'évolution de la notion d'individu dangereux' dans la psychiatrie légale." **Revue déviance et société** V (1981) 403-422.

---

173) "Va-t-on extraditer Kaus Croissant?" **Le Nouvel Observateur** 679 (Nov. 14, 1977) 62-63.

---

174) "'Désormais, la sécurité est au-dessus des lois.'" **Le Matin** 225 (Nov. 18, 1977) 15. An interview conducted by Jean-Paul Kauffman.

---

175) "Lettre à quelques leaders de la gauche." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 681 (Nov. 28, 1977) 59.

---

176) "'Wir fühlen uns als schmutzige Spezies.'" **Der Spiegel** 31 (Dec. 19, 1977) 77-78.

---

177) "Préface." To **My Secret Life**. Translated from the English by Christine Charmaux et al. Paris: Editions les Formes du Secret, 1978, 5-7.

---

178) "Introduction." To Georges Canguilhem's **On the Normal and the Pathological**. This is the English translation of **Le normal et le pathologique**. Translated by Carolyn Fawcett. Boston: D. Reidel, 1978, ix-xx.

---

178A) This was later issued in French as "La vie: l'expérience et la science" in **Revue de métaphysique et de morale** 90 (January-March, 1985) 3-14.

---

179) "Note." To **Herculine Barbin dite Alexina B.** Presented by MF. Paris: Gallimard, 1978, 131-132.

---

**3. 8. 9. 13.**

---

179A) "Introduction." To the English translation: **Herculine Barbin, Being the Recently Discovered Memoirs of a Nineteenth Century French Hermaphrodite**. Translated by Richard McDougall. New York: Pantheon Books, 1980, vii-xvii. This introduction is a totally new work dated January, 1980. The original brief note to the French edition is on pages 119-120 of the translation.

180) "La grille politique traditionnelle." **Politique-Hebdo** 303 (1978) 20.

181) "M. Foucault. Conversazione senza complessi con il filosofo che analizza le 'strutture del potere.'" A discussion with J. Bauer. **Playmen** 12, 10 (1978) 21-30.

182) "Incorporacion del hospital en la tecnologia moderna." **Educacion medica y salud** 12, 1 (1978) 20-35.

183) "Un jour dans une classe s'est fait une film." **L'Edicateur** 51, 12 (1978) 21-25.

184) "Eugène Sue que j'aime." **Les nouvelle littéraires** 2618 (Jan. 12-19, 1978) 3. A reflection on the reissued **Les mystères du peuple** by Sue.

185) "Une érudition étourdissante." **Le Matin** 278 (January 20, 1978) 25. A review of Philippe Ariès' **L'Homme devant la mort**.

186) "Alain Peyrefitte s'explique . . . et Michel Foucault lui répond." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 689 (Jan. 23, 1978) 25.

187) "Precisazioni sul potere. Riposta ad alcuni critici." **Aut Aut** 167-168 (Sept.-Dec., 1978) 3-11. Response to written questions from Pasquale Pasquino in February, 1978.

188) "La governamentalità." **Aut Aut** 167-168 (Sept.-Dec., 1978) 12-29. The Italian transcript, translated by Pasquale Pasquino, of a lecture given at the Collège de France in February, 1978

188ET) "Governmentality." Translated by Rosi Braidotti. **Ideology and Consciousness** 6 (Autumn, 1979) 5-21.

188A) This lecture was released in a French translation by Jean-Claude Oswald as "La gouvernamentalité," **Actes** 54 (Summer, 1986) 7-15.

189) "Attention: danger." **Libération** 1286 (March 22, 1978) 9.

190) **Le poussière et le nuage.** **L'impossible prison: Recherches sur le système pénitentiaire au XIXe siècle.** Ed-

ited by Michelle Perrot. Paris: Seuil, 1980, 29-39. Although not published until May, 1980, this was written in 1978 as a reply to a text by Jacques Léonard which appears in the same volume: "L'historien et le philosophe: A propos de. **Surveiller et punir; naissance de la prison** ". Both papers served as the basis for a discussion with MF which was published as the following entry.

---

191) "Table ronde du 20 mai 1978." In **L'impossible prison**, 40-56 (cf. #190 for full details). While specific interventions were not cited by name with the exception of those from MF, participants in this discussion were: Maurice Agulhon, Nicole Caston, Catherine Duprat, Francois Ewald, Arlette Farge, Alexandre Fontana, Carlo Ginzburg, Remi Gossez, Jacques Léonard, Pascal Pasquino, Michelle Perrot, Jacques Revel.

---

191ET) "Questions of Method." Translated by Colin Gordon. **Ideology and Consciousness** 8 (Spring, 1981) 3-14.

---

192) "Postface." To **L'impossible prison** (cf. #190), 316-318.

---

193) "Vijftien vragen van homoseksuele zijde van Michel Foucault." **Interviews met Michel Foucault**, ed. by M. Duyves and T. Maasen. Utrecht: De Woelrat, 1982, 13-23.

---

194) "Du pouvoir." **L'Express** 1722 (July 13, 1984) 56-62. An interview with MF, conducted by Pierre Boncenne in July, 1978 but not published until after Foucault's death.

---

195) "Du bon usage du criminel." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 722 (Sept 11, 1978) 40-42.

---

196) "Taccuino Persiano: L'esercito, quando la terra trema." **Corriere della Sera** 103, No. 228 (Sept. 28, 1978) 1-2. The first of a series of articles in Italian on the revolution in Iran.

---

197) "Teheran: la fede contro lo Scia." **Corriere della Sera** 103, No. 237 (Oct 8, 1978) 11.

---

198) "A quoi rêvent les Iraniens?" **Le Nouvel Observateur** 726 (Oct. 9-16, 1978) 48-49.

---

199) "Le citron et le lait." **Le Monde** 10, 490 (Oct. 21, 1978) 14. A review of Philippe Boucher's **Le ghetto judiciaire**

---

200) "Ein gewaltiges Erstaunen." An interview on the exposition "Paris-Berlin" which took place in Paris in 1978. *Der Spiegel* 32 (Oct. 30, 1978) 264.

---

200ET) "Interview with Michel Foucault." Translated by J.D. Steakley. *New German Critique* 16 (Winter, 1979) 155-156.

---

201) "Une rivolta con le mani nude." *Corriere della Sera*, 103, No. 261 (Nov. 5, 1978) 1-2.

---

202) "Sfida all'opposizione." *Corriere della Sera*, 103, No. 262 (Nov. 7, 1978) 1-2.

---

203) "I 'reportages di idee.'" *Corriere della Sera*, 103, No. 267 (Nov. 12, 1978) 1.

---

204) "Réponse de Michel Foucault à une lectrice iranienne." *Le Nouvel Observateur* 731 (Nov. 13, 1978) 26.

---

205) "La rivolta dell'Iran corre sui nastri delli minicassette." *Corriere della Sera*, 103 No. 273 (Nov. 19, 1978) 1-2.

---

206) "Il mitico capo della rivolta nell'Iran." *Corriere della Sera*, 103, No. 279 (Nov. 26, 1978) 1-2.

---

207) *Colloqui con Foucault*. Salerno: 10/17 Cooperative editrice, 1981. A series of 1978 interviews between MF and Duccio Trombadori.

---

208) "Lettera di Foucault all'Unità." *L'Unità* 55, no. 285 (December 1, 1978) 1.

---

209) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." *Annuaire du Collège de France* 78 (1978) 445-449. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1978. Lecture: "Sécurité, territoire, et population." Seminar: "La Médicalisation en France depuis le XIXe siècle."

---

209ET) "Foucault at the Collège de France I: A Course Summary." Translated, with an introduction, by James Bernauer. *Philosophy and Social Criticism* VIII, 2 (Summer, 1981) 235-242.

---

209A) An edited version of this course's lectures has been translated into German by Andreas Pribersky and published

as "Vorlesungen zur Analyse der Macht-Mechanismen 1978: Das Denken des Staates." In MF, **Der Staub und die Wolke** (Bremen: Verlag Impuls, 1982) 1-44.

---

210) "L'esprit d'un monde sans esprit." A conversation with MF conducted by Claire Brière and Pierre Blanchet. Published as an appendix to their **Iran: la révolution au nom de Dieu**. Paris: Seuil, 1979, 225-241.

---

211) "Préface." To Peter Brückner and Alfred Krovoza, **Ennemi de l'État**. Claix: La pensée sauvage, 1979, 4-5.

---

212) "La phobie d'état." **Libération** 967 (June 30-July 1, 1984) 21. An excerpt from a lecture by Foucault on Jan. 31, 1979 at the Collège.

---

213) "Manières de justice." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 743 (Feb 5, 1979) 20-21.

---

214) "Una polveriera chiamata Islam." **Corriere della Sera** 104, No. 36 (Feb. 13, 1979) 1

---

215) "Michel Foucault et l'Iran." **Le Matin** 647 (March 26, 1979) 15. A short reply to an article which had attacked his position on Iran's revolution. Cf. Claudie and Jacques Broyelle, "A quoi rêvent les philosophes?" **Le Matin** 646 (March 24, 1979) 13.

---

216) "La loi de la pudeur." **Recherches** 37 (April, 1979) 69-82. A transcript of radio discussion on April 4, 1978 with Guy Hocquenghem and Jean Danet

---

216ET) Excerpts from Foucault's remarks were translated by Daniel Moshenberg and published in **Semiotext(e)** (Summer, 1980) 44, 40-42

---

217) "Une plaisir si simple." **Le Gai Pied** 1 (April, 1979) 1, 10.

---

217ET) "The Simplest of Pleasures." Translated by Mike Riegle and Gilles Barbedette **Fag Rag** 29, p. 3.

---

218) "Lettre ouverte à Mehdi Bazargan." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 753 (April 14, 1979) 46

---

219) "Pour une morale de l'inconfort." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 754 (April 23, 1979) 82-83. A review of Jean Daniel's **L'ère des ruptures**.

---

220) "Le moment de vérité." **Le Matin** 673 (April 25, 1979) 20. On the death of Maurice Clavel.

---

221) "Vivre autrement le temps." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 755 (April 30, 1979) 88. A testimony to Maurice Clavel.

---

222) "Inutile de se soulever?" **Le Monde** 10, 661 (May 11, 1979) 1-2.

---

222ET) "Is it useless to revolt?" Translated, with an introduction, by James Bernauer. **Philosophy and Social Criticism** VIII, 1 (Spring, 1981) 1-9.

---

223) "La stratégie du pourtour." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 759 (May 28, 1979) 57.

---

224) "Omnes et Singulatim: Towards a Criticism of 'Political Reason.'" Lectures delivered at Stanford University on Oct. 10 and 16, 1979. In Sterling McMurrin, ed., **The Tanner Lectures on Human Values II** (1981). Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1981, 225-254.

---

224A) "Omnes et Singulatim: Vers une critique de la raison politique." Translated by P.E. Dauzat. **Le débat** 41 (Sept.-Nov., 1986) 5-35.

---

225) "Luttes autour des prisons." **Esprit** 35 (Nov., 1979) 102-111. A discussion between MF (under the pseudonym of "Louis Appert"), Anotoine Lazarus, and Francois Colcombet, on the prison movements of the 1970s.

---

226) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 79 (1979) 367-372. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France. in 1979. Lecture: "Naissance de la biopolitique." Seminar: "Problèmes de méthode en histoire des idées."

---

226ET) "Foucault at the Collège de France II: A Course Summary." Translated, with an introduction, by James Bernauer. **Philosophy and Social Criticism** VIII, 3 (Fall, 1981) 349-359.

---

227) "Les quatre cavaliers de l'Apocalypse." **Cahiers du cinéma** 6 (1980) 95-96.

- 228) " 'Le Nouvel Observateur' e l'unione della sinistra." **Spirali** 15 (Jan., 1980) 53-55. Excerpts from a conversation between MF and Jean Daniel, first broadcast on a France-Culture radio program conducted by Denis Richet.
- 229) "Lettre." **Le Nouvel Observateur** (Jan. 14, 1980).
- 230) "Préface " To Roger Knobelspiess, **Q.H.S.: Quartier de haute sécurité**. Paris: Stock, 1980, 11-16 (March 31, 1980).
- 231) "Le philosophe masqué." **Le Monde Dimanche** 10,945 (April 6, 1980) I and XVII. An interview conducted by Christian Delacampagne and originally published without identifying Foucault.
- 232) "Conversation with Michel Foucault " **The Threepenny Review** I, 1 (Winter-Spring, 1980) 4-5 An interview conducted by Millicent Dillon.
13. 233) "Sexuality and Solitude." **London Review of Books** (May 21- June 3, 1981) 3, 5-6. The text of Foucault's James Lecture, delivered Nov. 20, 1980 at the New York Institute for the Humanities. This was later published in **Humanities in Review** I (1982), edited by David Rieff. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1982, 3-21.
- 234) "Le vrai sexe." **Arcadie** 27 (November, 1980) 617-625.
- 235) "Roland Barthes." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 80 (1980) 61-62
- 236) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 80 (1980) 449-452 A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1980. Lecture. "Du gouvernement des vivants." Seminar "Liberalisme et Etatisme à la fin du fin du XIXe siècle."
- 237) "De l'amitié comme mode de vie." **Le Gai Pied** 25 (April, 1981) 38-39
- 237ET) "Friendship as a Lifestyle. An Interview with Michel Foucault." **Gay Information** 7 (Spring, 1981) 4-6 No translator identified

---

238) "L'intellectuel et les pouvoirs." **La Revue Nouvelle** 80 (1984) 338-345. Interview conducted on May 14, 1981 by Christian Panier and Pierre Watté.

---

239) "Est-il donc important de penser?" **Libération** (May 30-31, 1981) 21. An interview with MF conducted by Didier Eribon.

---

239ET) "Is it really important to think?" Translated, with an afterword, by Thomas Keenan. **Philosophy and Social Criticism** 9, 1 (Spring 1982) 29-40.

---

240) "Face aux gouvernements, les droits de l'Homme." **Libération** 967 (June 30-July 1, 1984) 22. A statement by Foucault in June, 1981, but published only after his death. It concerned Southeast Asian "boat people."

---

241) "Il faut tout repenser la loi et la prison." **Libération** 45 (July 6, 1981) 2. On hunger strikes by prison inmates.

---

242) "Lacan, il 'liberatore' della psicanalisi." **Corriere della Sera** 106, No. 212 (Sept. 11, 1981) 1. An interview with MF conducted by Jacques Nobécourt after the death of Jacques Lacan.

---

243) "De la nécessité de mettre un terme à toute peine." **Libération** 108 (Sept. 18, 1981) 5.

---

244) "Les réponses de Pierre Vidal-Naquet et de Michel Foucault." **Libération** 185 (Dec. 18, 1981) 12. Concerns the French governments's reaction to the imposition of martial law in Poland.

---

245) "Conversation." In Gérard Courant (ed.), **Werner Schroeter**. Paris: Cinémathèque Française et Goethe Institute, 1982, 38-47. A discussion between MF and Werner Schroeter as recorded by Courant on December 3, 1981.

---

246) "Notes sur ce qu'on lit et entend." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 893 (Dec. 19, 1981) 21. On the imposition of martial law in Poland.

---

247) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 81 (1981) 385-389. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1981. Lecture: "Subjectivité



et vérité." Seminar: "Problèmes du libéralisme au XIXe siècle."

---

248) **Le désordre des familles: Lettres de cachet des Archives de la Bastille** A collection of police documents, edited with introductions by MF and Arlette Farge. Paris: Gallimard/Julliard, 1982.

---

249) "Nineteenth Century Imaginations." Translated by Alex Susteric. **Semiotext(e)** IV, 2 (1982)182-190.

4-5-6-8-9-10-13.

---

250) "The Subject and Power." An afterword to Hubert Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow, **Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics**. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982, 214-32. Part I was written in English by Foucault, Part II was translated by Leslie Sawyer. Republished in **Critical Inquiry** 8 (Summer, 1982).

---

251) "Non aux compromis." **Gai Pied** 43 (1982) 9 A conversation with R. Surzur.

---

252) Response to speech by Susan Sontag **The Sohn** Jews (March 2, 1982) 13.

---

253) "Space, Knowledge, and Power." **Skyline** (March, 1982) 16-20. An interview with P. Rabinow, translated by Christian Hubert.

---

254) "Histoire et Homosexualité: Entretien avec M. Foucault." **Masques** 13 (Spring, 1982) 14-24. An interview conducted by J.P. Joecker, M. Ouerd and A. Sanzio

---

255) "Sexual Choice, Sexual Act: An Interview with Michel Foucault." **Salmagundi** 58-59 (Fall, 1982-Winter, 1983) 10-24. Conducted by James O'Higgins in March 1982

---

255A) This appeared in French as "Lorsque l'amant part en taxi." **Gai Pied Hebdo** 151 (January 5, 1985) 22-24, 54-57

---

256) "La combat de la chasteté " **Communications** 35 (May, 1982) 15-25.

---

256ET) "The Battle for Chastity " In **Western Sexuality: Practice and Precept in Past and Present Times**, edited by Phil-

ippe Ariès and André Béjin and translated by Anthony Foster. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985, 14-25.

---

257) "The Social Triumph of the Sexual Will." **Christopher Street** 64 (May, 1982) 36-41. A conversation with MF, conducted by Gilles Barbedette and translated by Brendan Lemon.

---

258) "Des caresses d'homme considérées comme un art." **Libération** (June 1, 1982) 27. A review of K.J. Dover's **Homosexualité grecque**.

---

259) "An Interview." **Ethos** 1, 2 (Autumn, 1983) 4-9. Conducted by Stephen Riggins on June 22, 1982.

---

260) "Michel Foucault, An Interview: Sex, Power and the Politics of Identity." **The Advocate** 400 (Aug. 7, 1984) 26-30, 58. Conducted by Bob Gallagher and Alexander Wilson in June, 1982.

---

260A) This later appeared in a French translation by Jacques Hess as "Que fabriquent donc les hommes ensemble?" **Le Nouvel Observateur** 1098 (Nov. 22-28, 1985) 54-55.

---

261) "Le terrorisme ici et là." **Libération** (Sept. 3, 1982) 12. A discussion with D. Eribon.

---

262) "Pierre Boulez ou l'écran traversé." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 934 (Oct. 2, 1982) 51-52.

---

263) "En abandonnant les Polonais, nous renonçons à une part de nous-mêmes." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 935 (Oct. 9, 1982) 36. A conversation with Bernard Kouchner and Simone Signoret, conducted by Pierre Blanchet.

---

264) "L'expérience morale et sociale des Polonais ne peut plus être effacée." **Les nouvelles littéraires** 2857 (Oct. 14-20, 1982) 8-9. An interview with MF conducted by Gilles Anquetil.

---

265) "La Pensée, L'Emotion." In **Duane Michals: Photographies de 1958 à 1982** Paris: Paris Audiovisual, Musée d'Art Moderne de la Ville de Paris, 1982, iii-vii. An exposition at the Musée d'Art Moderne in Paris, Nov 9, 1982-Jan. 9, 1983.

---

266) "L'âge d'or de la lettre de cachet." **L'Express** 1638 (Dec. 3, 1982) 35-36. An interview with MF and Arlette Farge, conducted by Yves Hersant on **Le Désordre des familles** (#248 above).

---

267) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 82 (1982) 395-406. A summary of the course given at the Collège de France in 1982. Lecture: "L'herméneutique du sujet." An abridged presentation of Foucault's lectures was edited and published by Helmut Becker and Lothar Wolfstetter as "Michel Foucaults Hermeneutik des Subjekts" in their collection **Freiheit und Selbstsorge** (Frankfurt: Materialis Verlag, 1985) 32-60.

---

268) "L'écriture de soi." **Corps écrit** 5 (1983): **L'autoportrait**, 3-23.

---

269) "Rêver de ses plaisirs: sur l'onirocritique d'Artémidore." **Recherches sur la philosophie et le langage** 3 (1983) 53-78. A slightly altered version of this material became chapter 1 of **Le souci de soi**. Cf. #286 below.

---

270) "Un système fini face à une demande infinie." In **Sécurité sociale: l'enjeu**. Paris: Editions Syros, 1983, 39-63. An interview with R. Bono.

---

270ET) "The Risks of Security." **History of the Present** 2 (Spring, 1986) 4-5, 11-14.

---

271) "Un cours inédit." **Magazine littéraire** 207 (May, 1984) 35-39. A lecture at the Collège de France, January 5, 1983, on the question of enlightenment in Kant.

---

271ET) "Kant on Enlightenment and Revolution." Translated by Colin Gordon. **Economy and Society** 15 (February, 1986) 88-96.

---

272) "À propos des faiseurs d'histoire." **Libération** (Jan 21, 1983) 22. An interview with Didier Eribon.

---

273) "An Exchange with Michel Foucault." An exchange of letters between MF and Lawrence Stone. **The New York Review of Books** (March 31, 1983) 42-44. Foucault's letter was written in criticism of Stone's earlier essay, "Madness," in **The New York Review of Books** (Dec. 16, 1982) 28-36

---

274) "Structuralism and Post-Structuralism: An Interview with Michel Foucault." *Telos* 55 (Spring, 1983) 195-211. An interview conducted by Gérard Raulet and translated by Jeremy Harding. First published in German as "Um welchen Preis sagt die Vernunft die Wahrheit?" *Spuren* 1-2 (1983).

---

275) "The Power and Politics of Michel Foucault." *Inside* (April 22, 1983) 7, 20-22. An interview in the weekly magazine of the *Daily Californian* (University of California at Berkeley) conducted by Peter Maass and David Brock.

7.9.12-

---

276) "Politics and Ethics: An Interview." Translated by Catherine Porter. In *The Foucault Reader*, edited by Paul Rabinow (New York: Pantheon Books, 1984) 373-380. Edited interviews conducted in April, 1983, by Paul Rabinow, Charles Taylor, Martin Jay, Richard Rorty and Leo Lowenthal.

---

277) "On the Genealogy of Ethics: An Overview of Work in Progress." In the 2nd edition of their *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983, 229-252. An interview conducted by Hubert Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow. An abridged French translation by Jacques B. Hess appeared as "Le sexe comme une morale." *Le Nouvel Observateur* (June 1, 1984) 62-66.

---

278) "La Pologne, et après? Edmond Maire: Entretien avec Michel Foucault." *Le débat* 25 (May, 1983) 3-34.

---

279) "La Musique contemporaine et le publique." *CNAC Magazine* 15 (May-June, 1983) 10-12. A discussion between MF and Pierre Boulez, in the magazine of the Pompidou Center.

---

280) "Vous êtes dangereux." *Libération* 639 (June 10, 1983) 20.

---

281) "Archéologie d'une passion." *Magazine littéraire* 221 (July-August, 1985) 100-105. An edited interview conducted by Charles Ruas on Sept. 15, 1983.

---

281ET) "An Interview with Michel Foucault." Postscript to Ruas's translation of *Raymond Rousset* (cf. #18 above), 169-186.

---

282) "Usage des plaisirs et techniques de soi." *Le débat* 27 (November, 1983) 46-72. This is a very slightly modified ver-

sion of the introductory chapter to **L'usage des plaisirs**. Cf #285 below.

283) "Qu'appelle-t-on punir?" **Revue de l'université de Bruxelles** (1984): **Punir mon bon souci, Pour une raison penale**, 35-46. An interview with Foulek Ringelheim, conducted in December 1983.

284) "Histoire des systèmes de pensée." **Annuaire du Collège de France** 83 (1983) 441. Foucault's last submitted course description reads simply: **Le cours a porté sur: "Le gouvernement de soi et des autres."**

285) **Histoire de la sexualité 2: L'usage des plaisirs**. Paris: Gallimard, 1984.

2. 3. 4. 11.

285ET) **The Use of Pleasure**. Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Pantheon, 1985.

285A) Earlier version of "Preface." Translated by William Smock. In **The Foucault Reader**, 333-339.

286) **Histoire de la sexualité 3: Le souci de soi**. Paris: Gallimard, 1984

1. 3. 4. 10. 12. 13.

286ET) **The Care of the Self**. Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Pantheon, 1986.

287) "Interview met Michel Foucault." **Krisis: Tijdschrift voor filosofie** 14 (1984) 47-58. A discussion with J. Francois and J. de Wit.

288) "L'éthique du souci de soi comme pratique de liberté." **Concordia** 6 (1984) 99-116. An interview with Raul Fernet-Betancourt, Helmut Becker and Alfredo Gomez-Müller, conducted on Jan. 20, 1984.

288ET) "The Ethics of Care of the Self as a Practice of Freedom." Translated by Joseph Gauthier. **Philosophy and Social Criticism** XII, 2-3, 112-131.

289) "Philippe Ariès: Le souci de la vérité." **Le Nouvel Observateur** 1006 (Feb 17-23, 1984) 56-57.

290) "Le style de l'histoire " **Le Matin** 2168 (Feb 21, 1984) 20-21. Interview conducted by Francois Dumont and Jean-Paul Iommi-Amunstegui, with Ariette Farge, on Philippe Ariès.

291) "A Last Interview with French Philosopher Michel Fou-

cault." *City Paper* 8, 30 (July 27-Aug. 2, 1984) 18. Conducted by Jamin Raskin in March, 1984.

292) "Interview de Michel Foucault." *Actes* 45-46 (1984): **La prison autrement?**, 3-6. An interview conducted by Catherine Baker in April, 1984.

293) "Le souci de la vérité." *Magazine littéraire* 207 (May, 1984) 18-23. An interview conducted by Francois Ewald.

293ET) "The Regard for Truth." An abridged translation, with an introduction, by Paul Patton. *Art and Text* 16 (Summer, 1984) 20-31.

294) "What Is Enlightenment?" A translation by Catherine Porter of an unpublished French text. In *The Foucault Reader*, 31-50.

295) "Une esthétique de l'existence." *Le Monde Aujourd'hui* (July 15-16, 1984) xi. An interview with Alessandro Fontana on April 25, 1984.

296) "Polemics, Politics and Problematizations." Translated by Lydia Davis. In *The Foucault Reader*, 381-389. Foucault's written responses to questions from Paul Rabinow and Tom Zummer in May, 1984, based on the transcript of an interview conducted earlier.

297) "Pour en finir avec les mensonges." *Le Nouvel Observateur* 1076 (June 21-27, 1985) 76-77. An interview conducted by Didier Eribon.

298) "Le retour de la morale." *Les Nouvelles* 2937 (June 28-July 5, 1984) 36-41. An interview conducted by Gilles Barbedette and André Scala. Conducted on May 29, 1984, this is probably the last interview which Foucault gave.

298ET) "Final Interview." Translated by Thomas Levin and Isabelle Lorenz. *Raritan V*, 1 (Summer, 1985) 1-13.

## **B) Miscellaneous Materials**

1) Excerpt from an April, 1968 letter from MF to Maurice Clavel. Published in Clavel's *Ce que je crois* (Paris: Grasset, 1975) 138-139

- 2) "Création d'un 'Groupe d'Information sur les prisons.'" **Esprit** 401 (March, 1971) 531-532. Co-signed by MF, Jean-Marie Domenach, and Pierre Vidal-Naquet.
- 3) "Ceremonie, Théâtre, et Politique au XVIIe Siècle." **Acta 1. Proceedings of the Fourth Annual Conference of XVIIth Century French Literature**. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Graduate School, 1972, 22-23. A summary in English by Stephen Davidson of a lecture given at the University on April 7, 1972.
- 4) "Power and Norm: Notes." Notes from a lecture at the Collège de France on March 28, 1973. Translated by W. Suchting, in **Power, Truth, Strategy**, 59-66.
- 5) A radio interview of an hour between MF and Jacques Chancel, "Radioscopie." on March 10, 1975. A tape of this interview is available at the library of the Georges Pompidou Center in Paris.
- 6) "Punir ou guérir." Dialogues, Radio-France (Oct 8, 1976).
- 7) "Toujours les prisons." An exchange of letters with Paul Thibaud and Jean-Marie Domenach in **Esprit** 37 (January, 1980) 184-186.
- 8) Otto Friedrich "France's Philosopher of Power." **Time** 118, No. 20 (Nov. 6, 1981) 147-148. A news article with extensive quotations from an interview with MF
- 9) **Discourse and Truth: The Problematization of Parrhesia** Notes to the Fall, 1983 seminar given by MF at the University of California, Berkeley. A privately printed transcription of Foucault's presentations by Joseph Pearson.
- 10) A July, 1983 letter to Hervé Guibert. In "L'autre journal d'Hervé Guibert." **L'Autre Journal** 10 (December, 1985) 5
- 11) Letters of and conversations with MF quoted extensively in Claude Mauriac's series "Les Temps immobile," published by Grasset in Paris: vol 2, **Les Espaces imaginaires** (1975), vol 3, **Et comme l'espérance est violente** (1976), vol 7, **Signes, rencontres, et rendez-vous** (1983), vol. 9, **Mauriac et fils** (1986), and in **Une Certain rage** Paris. Laffont, 1977.