NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilming. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

Si manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut faiblir à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur. SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.
PHOTOGRAPHY, IMMIGRATION, AND CANADIANISM: 1896-1921

Anna Maria Carlevaris

A Thesis
in
the
Department of Art History

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of the Master of Arts
Concordia University
Montréal, Québec, Canada.

April 1992

© Anna Maria Carlevaris, 1992
The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ABSTRACT

PHOTOGRAPHY, IMMIGRATION, AND CANADIANISM: 1896-1921

Anna Maria Carlevaris

In the years between 1896 and 1921 a massive influx of immigrants to Canada directly affected the economic, political and social life of the nation. In an era of rapid industrialization, growing population and an escalating crisis in the administration of government services, immigration became the focus for larger questions about national identity and social consciousness. The period under study also marks the emergence of the modern era of photographic industrialization. Because of technical developments the photograph became an important vehicle for visual communication within networks such as those of the popular press and those of government run advertising campaigns. By examining the use of the photograph in several types of immigration-related material the thesis serves as a study of the relationship between photographic discourse and issues of national and ethnic identity.
Acknowledgments

I thank my advisor, Dr. Brian Foss, for his guidance; Dr. Christine Ross for her insightful comments, and Stanley Triggs for unfaltering encouragement. I especially thank my family and all my kind friends (too many to mention here) for their steadfast support and generosity of spirit.
the thesis is dedicated to my parents

Pietro Carlevaris
and
Giovanna Giaquinta
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS.............................................vii

INTRODUCTION..........................................................1

CHAPTER 1. The Industrialization of Photography
in the Age of "Kodak"............................................11

CHAPTER II. Immigration to Canada:
Economic, Social and Political History.....18

CHAPTER III. Advertising the West: Visual Attraction.....24

CHAPTER IV. Strangers Within Our Gates:
Promoting Assimilation
in Social Reform Literature.........................40

CHAPTER V. Romantic Canada: Pictorialist Photography...58

CONCLUSION .............................................................77

BIBLIOGRAPHY ..........................................................81

ILLUSTRATION SOURCES ............................................88

ILLUSTRATIONS .........................................................90
INTRODUCTION

The present study attempts to critically assess the role played by photography in articulating social difference vis-à-vis the representation of immigrants in Canada in the early part of the current century. The thesis attempts to integrate archival research and contemporary photo-historical criticism in the examination of the representation of the immigrant within selected discursive fields. The hypothesis of the thesis reflects an idea put forward by Homi Bhabha, which postulates that the colonizer's position, in relation to the colonized subject, is one of ambivalence.¹ The colonizer creates an image of the colonized as "a subject of difference that is almost the same, but not quite," so that he (the colonizer) may feel justified to enter and lay claim to the space of the other as his own.² An attempt is made to lessen difference in order to create an image of the foreigner that will allow for his assimilation into the hegemonic order; this process withdraws the exclusionary status of difference without, however, granting an equal and separate identity. Thus, the foreigner is never fully divested of difference, and assimilation is never total; the immigrant remains an "almost


² Ibid., 126.
same but not quite" entity that is neither completely foreign/different nor completely Canadian/same.

The thesis will therefore demonstrate how photographs function as a visual corollary to a cultural view of the immigrant as "almost same but not quite". It will be shown that this process is problematic because it rests on the articulation of ideas about nationalism that, in the case of Canadian identity, were particularly unclear in the era under analysis. The thesis will argue that assimilation, or "Canadianization", was a process of aculturation that was racial and moral in its intent. The present study does not attempt to speak from within the place of the immigrant, nor specifically from within that section of the population that was virulently against immigration. Rather, it addresses the middle-of-the-road Canadian public as exemplified within three aspects of image production: a) government advertising, b) social reform literature, and c) popular journalism. The study will suggest that in confronting the "immigrant problem", the class of Canadians who produced the literature related to immigration was faced with attempting to resolve its own ambivalent identity. Bhabha's psychoanalytic approach thus

3 "Canadianizing" and "Canadianization" were contemporarily used as interchangeable terms for 'assimilation'.

4 It should be noted that the "Canadian public" refers to the members of the middle-class who participated in social welfare activities, read and wrote for popular magazines, and whose opinion coloured the official face of Parliament.
becomes a valuable argumentative tool for bridging what seem like irreconcilable differences between the images and texts covered in the thesis - ambiguities that result from the complex task at hand: the naming of the Canadian in relation to the foreigner. The thesis posits that the images and texts must be considered as mutually dependent on each other if the interpretation of the images is to be refrained from floating into the modernist paradigmatic dichotomy of art v. documentary photography.

Bhabha addresses a situation in which the colonizer (Great Britian) intrudes or enters the space of the colonized subject (India). In this thesis, however, the movement is reversed - i.e., the immigrant, the colonized subject, enters the 'territory' of the colonizer, Canada (although one may argue that the immigrant is "enticed" to enter by immigration propaganda). The thesis will reveal that a strategy similar to Bhabha's concept of "mimicry" is at play when the immigrant who enters Canadian space is represented, for the colonial relations of power existed within Canada itself. Indeed, Canadian references to "block" settlements of immigrants were contemporarily referred to as "colonies" as if Canada's own vast north-western territories were aspects of an extended self that, like the idea of empire, remained rationally whole and yet psychically fragmented.

Sander Gilman's psychoanalytic interpretation of stereotypes serves as another source for the thesis hypothesis
of ambivalence as a methodological key to examining the
selected material. Gilman's notion of "the protean nature of
stereotypes" serves as a means of demonstrating how images of
the immigrant are drawn from similar paradigmatic
articulations of sameness/difference and order/chaos that
inform identity formation. The thesis will define the image
of the immigrant as a screen upon which Canadianism could be
projected so that the psychic work of becoming Canadian could
unfold. The three areas of study selected (government
advertising, social reform literature, and popular journalism;
see above) are used as examples within which the hypothesis
of the notion of same/Canadian and different/foreigner is
examined within the central idea of ambivalence.

The problematic issues raised by the photographic basis
of the representations will be addressed by examining two
modes of photographic discourse - the use of the photograph
as document, and its use as art. The writings of Alan Sekula
and John Tagg form the theoretical basis for aspects of this

5 Sander Gilman, Difference and Pathology Stereotypes of
Sexuality, Race, and Madness (Ithaca and London: Cornell University
Press, 1985). Regarding the psychoanalytic reading of stereotypes
as they apply to cultural ideas of sexuality, race and madness,
Gilman writes: "Stereotypes are a crude set of mental
representations of the world....They perpetuate a needed sense of
difference between the "self" and the "object" which becomes the
"Other". Because there is no real line between self and the Other,
an imaginary line must be drawn....This line is as dynamic in its
ability to alter itself as is the self...thus paradigm shifts in
our mental representations of the world do and can occur....
Stereotypes are inherently protean rather than rigid" (p. 18).

6 Ibid., Introduction, 15-35.
part of the discussion. Sekula's concept of the honorific and repressive functions of the photographic portrait will be discussed in terms of how both the pictorial (honorific) and document (repressive) forms of photographic portraits construct ideological arenas that are historically determined. However, the thesis will reformulate Sekula's argument in order to demonstrate that meaning is not exclusively prescribed by photographic modes (art/document), but is affected by extra-photographic conditions such as text and context.

Chapter 1 offers a survey of photographic practices in the era under study; it summarizes the complex and rapidly evolving nature of photographic technology and practice in the early twentieth century. Paraphrasing remarks in this section, it is important for the reader to be aware that the era under study was already a "modern" visual culture, subject to a diverse range of visual media. Although the photographs discussed herein probably circulated within a range of discourses, the thesis is restricted to aspects of their varied existence.

The material in Chapter 11, which presents the economic, political and social context, is drawn from a rich body of secondary sources available on Canadian social history, and

---

related disciplines such as ethnic, labour, social work and women's histories. The historical framework is indispensable for understanding how cultural factors influenced the production and reception of photographs of immigrants.

In Chapter 111, the three discursive categories described above as those within which immigrants appear as representations are examined: a) government-sponsored photographs, as exemplified by the work of John Woodruff and William Topley, c.1908-11; and commercial work by William MacFarlane Notman b) social reform literature in J.S. Woodsworth's Strangers Within Our Gates Or Coming Canadians, 1909\(^8\); and c) pictorialist photography in Victoria Hayward and Edith S. Watson's, Romantic Canada, 1922.\(^9\)

The analysis of government-sponsored photographs is based primarily on archival research which included manuscripts in the Immigration and Colonization files of the National Archives of Canada and the Topley and Woodruff collections in the picture collection of the same archives.\(^10\) Although pictures by Topley and Woodruff have been reproduced as

---

\(^8\) James S. Woodsworth Strangers Within Our Gates Or Coming Canadians (Toronto: Musson Books, 1909).

\(^9\) Victoria Hayward and Edith S. Watson Romantic Canada (Toronto: The Macmillan Company of Canada, Ltd. at St. Martin's House, 1922); see bibliography for list of articles.

\(^10\) Department of Interior, Department of Immigration and Colonization, RG 76 (National Archives of Canada, Ottawa); William James Topley, and John Woodruff Collections, Documentary Art and Photography (National Archives of Canada, Ottawa).
illustrations in many publications dealing with social history, only two published sources exist that specifically treat these pictures - a short passage in Greenhill and Birrell, and an article by archivist Claude Minotto.¹¹ Additional background for the investigation of the government sponsored photographs is based on secondary sources dealing with immigration propaganda. This area has been extensively researched by historians dealing with the advertising campaigns waged by the C.P.R. to solicit tourism (such as E. J. Hart, in The Selling of Canada), and in general histories dealing with government immigration propaganda techniques.¹² Material on the Notman photographs has been drawn primarily from Stanley Triggs' William Notman: The Stamp of a Studio.¹³


Another useful source of information on government-sponsored and commercial photography for immigration purposes is Keith Bell's recently-produced study of photographic immigration advertising as it relates to land settlement on the Prairies. Although Bell states that propaganda images "varied slightly" from 1880 to the outbreak of the Second World War, the significance of "changing immigration policies" is not given due importance in his essay. As this thesis will establish, changes in immigration policy were extensive and far-reaching while effects in propaganda strategies were subtle. Bell suggests that the dominant discourse provided by government (in league with commercial interests) was so persuasive and pervasive that it remained unified, uninterrupted and unchallenged in its control of the national image bank. He argues that images of an ideal West found resistance only in isolated pockets of small-town commercial photographers and amateurs whose images were more revealing of actual Prairie settlement conditions.

Without rejecting Bell's hypothesis, the present study proposes that although changes in immigration policy altered the production and nature of national images, these signs of

---


15 Ibid., 16.

16 Ibid., 25-27.
mu be sought in separate but parallel discussions such as those of social reform literature and popular journalism. The official propaganda images of ideal life existed within a larger context of the public social conscience which engaged (and sometimes resisted) the ideology of these images within its own arguments about model social life. These views created their own visual rhetorics of ideal nationalism which were, however, underscored by doubt and apprehension, as will be uncovered in the investigation of the two books examined in the thesis (Chapter 111, b and c): J.S. Woodsworth's Strangers Within Our Gates, and Victoria Hayward and Edith S. Watson's Romantic Canada.

The exploration of the images in Strangers Within Our Gates and Romantic Canada relied heavily on the texts which the pictures illustrate. The texts in turn have been situated both within their genre and within their era. For example, Strangers was compared to several other examples of social welfare material (such as those listed in Strangers's "list of books") and to articles in The Canadian Magazine, (1890-1925). Romantic Canada was examined in the context of a perusal of The Canadian Magazine, wherein the material in the book appeared in article format, before and after the date of the book's publication.

Victorianist photography was examined against a wide body of secondary material that exists on this subject as well as its specific relation to amateur photography in Canada, and
to women photographers.\textsuperscript{17} The \textit{Canadian Magazine} was also examined for articles and photography by women, as well as for advertisements directed at camera hobbyists.

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
The Industrialization of Photography in the Age of "Kodak"

The technological developments of the late nineteenth century produced a complex, shifting field of photographic discourse which resulted in less than clearly defined distinctions amongst types of photographers and photographies. The industrial changes that occurred during the last decade of the last century affected not only manufacturing as a whole but also the production, distribution and reception of photographic products. Whether as a product of the Eastman Kodak assembly line, or as an exhibited work by The Studio Club, or as illustration in an immigration pamphlet, photographic images must be located by the organizing principles of their production and dissemination.

The history of photography bears witness to continual technological change through inventive manufacturing techniques and marketing strategies. During the late nineteenth century the speed of these developments accelerated. Changes in photographic technology, supported by an increasingly industrialized economy, altered the photography market. Like any commodity, photographic products could now be manufactured at a rate that accommodated the high-yield, low-cost goals of photo-industrialists such as
George Eastman, founder of the Eastman Kodak Company.\(^{18}\)

Eastman's style of business was viewed as a successful example of the application of entrepreneurial spirit to technological invention, and as such he represented the nineteenth-century capitalist dream merger of science and industry. The Kodak system represented the new machine-oriented, science-governed conception of commodity production. Toronto journalist R.R. Johnson's enthusiastic review of the production facilities of the Canadian Kodak plant express the era's techno-utopic yearnings:

Huge batteries of self-stoking boilers supply the steam for running the immense dynamos that supply power and light throughout the plant. The dazzling array of brightly polished switches and meters lining the walls of the power room, and the swift, silently-running dynamos, together with the spotless floors and natty attire of the engineers, serve to impress upon the visitor most forcibly the spirit of ultra modernism that prevails everywhere through out the plant.\(^{19}\)

The industrialization of the photograph coincided with the appearance of new ideas about work and the management of

\(^{18}\) George Eastman (1854-1932), an American, started his first company, the Eastman Dry Plate and Film Company, in 1880. In 1888, the first Kodak camera was produced, followed in 1892 (the same year the company became incorporated) by transparent film and in 1900, the Brownie, a camera designed for children. By 1927 the company had a virtual monopoly of the photographic industry in the U.S.A. and Canada; see Reese V. Jenkins Images and Enterprises: Technology and the American Photographic Industry, 1839-1925 (Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1975); for a brief history of Canadian Kodak see anon, "A History of Kodak Canada Ltd.," Photographic Canadiana 6.2 (July/August 1980): 4-7.

\(^{19}\) R.R. Johnson "The Growth of a Well-known Canadian Industry," The Canadian Magazine October 1911: 34.
work as conceptualized in Frederick Winslow Taylor's theory of scientific management. The adoption of Taylorism in the work place promised to increase production while lowering costs through the application of worker efficiency models, known as time and motion studies. In *The Kodak Primer*, published by the Eastman Company in 1888, the modernization of Kodak technology is at least as much attributable to the separation of the labour process as in its low cost and simplicity. Johnson comments on the "marvellous dexterity of the operatives" while pointing out "another entertaining feature" of the Kodak plant:

Long practice in performing one set of operations have given them almost uncanny skill and speed. But without equal accuracy this speed would avail but little as the system of inspection for every product is searching to the highest degree, and the slightest deviation from the absolutely right turns that product back to the employee for correction.

The technological changes that allowed for Eastman's success also affected a revolution in the press. Although the technology of the illustrated press had been developing since the early nineteenth century, it was not until the later

---


21 *The Kodak Primer* (Rochester: The Eastman Dry Plate and Film Co., 1888), n.p.

22 Johnson, 34.
decades of the century that photographically-based illustrations became economically viable. The invention of the half-tone process permitted photographs and type to be printed simultaneously, at a rate and cost designed to meet the needs of press production. Lighter camera bodies, faster exposure times, and practical methods of producing artificial light, contributed to the technological basis upon which the newly-established profession of press photographer relied. The modern notion of the news photograph as visual fact, its immediacy and perceived authenticity, enabled the visual message to compete with or even overwhelm the printed word. The contemporary idea of a 'visual culture' had been in evidence since the early nineteenth century but it was with the advent of the technological changes of the later part of the century that the status of the photographic document became reified as the new language of visual truth; "the nineteenth century, began by believing that what reasonable was true, and it wound up by believing that what it saw a

---

23 Marianne Fulton, *The Eyes of Time: Photojournalism in America* (Toronto, London: Little, Brown and Co., a New York Graphic Society Book published in association with the International Museum of Photography at George Eastman House, 1988), 38-73; although the appearance of the first successful application of the process is generally attributed to the *Daily Graphic* in 1880, the process was not viable until the early 1900's. The half-tone allowed for the intaglio method of rotogravure to make feasible by 1914 the *en masse* reproduction of photographic sources for the 'special' picture sections that were offered as a Sunday bonus to readers. The half-tone gradually replaced competing methods of mechanical reproduction of illustrations, signalling the demise of the engraver's role in the illustrated press and making the trade of hand tooled reproductions practically obsolete by WWI.
photograph of, was true."  

The position of the art photographer within this schema of increasing industrialization became a key issue of contention within late nineteenth-century photographic aesthetics. The degree to which automation could be implicated within photographic practice became a gauge for measuring the relative autonomy of the photographer. The more evident the presence of the photographer within the entirety of the photographic process, from exposure to development and photo-finishing, the more the process could be viewed as being under the control of the photographer, rather than vice-versa. The proximity of the producer to the process, or ratio of hand work to machine work, became an expedient criterion for demarcating the opposing positions of art and industry within the aesthetic debates of the era.  

Regardless of the diverse roles for photographers, all were required to adapt to the almost daily changes appearing within the field of photographic practice. The industrialized process was overtly important to two types of camera users—the press photographer and the amateur. For both, what mattered most was a product that was relatively cheap and easy to use: qualities that allowed for quantity and speed of production. However, for the professional studio photographer for whom portraiture was the commercial mainstay, procedures

---

remained organized along traditional lines - large-format cameras, custom photo-finishing, personalized service. Nonetheless, the demands of financial survival often necessitated studio workers to be familiar with modern improvements in order to facilitate other kinds of commissions, especially those undertaken outside the studio environment. Photographic artists, on the other hand, benefited from a technical freedom not accorded to other types of photographic workers, including the privilege to reject modern advances. For many photographic artists, photography became something done not with the help of technology, but in spite of it.

The photographs in this study reside within the era of Kodak. The new (modern) era of indistrial technology underwrites the production and reception of photographic representations. The age of Taylorism informs the immigration ventures of government and commercial interests, the system by which propaganda images were distributed and the reason for their uniform appearance. The new technology allowed for a proliferation of the visual document in popular literature on immigration; now professional press photographers as well as amateur photographers, such as missionaries and social workers, could use the camera to document the "immigration problem". In an ironic coupling, the new camera technology and its association with modernity joined forces with the elegiac art of pictorialist photography to produce an extraordinary
work entitled *Romantic Canada* (1922). The popularly styled ethnography of this work envisioned the immigrant farmer as a vestige of a lost Canada for the disillusioned Canadian living in the post-war machine age.
In 1896 Sir Wilfrid Laurier was elected Prime Minister, beginning an era of Liberal government that was to last until 1911 when Conservative Robert Borden came to power. 1896 also marked the end of a world-wide depression and the beginning of increasing prosperity for industrialized nations. By the time Borden resigned in 1921, Canada's population had risen by more than two million, an increase of 64% in a twenty-year period, and one that ended reached a peak of 400,000 arrivals in 1912-13. The sudden surge in a "foreign element" in the population, together with the urgency of resolving domestic and international issues, combined to produce a psychic shock, contemporarily known as "the immigration problem".

During this period, two new provinces, Saskatchewan and Alberta, entered the Confederation. The addition of these members coincided with a tremendous growth in the economy of the prairie region due in large part to an economic revolution in which wheat replaced fur and timber as the main staple of Canada's export market. Central Canada's industries were in great part supported by Western need for manufactured goods.

25 Robert Craig Brown and Ramsay Cook, Canada 1896-1921, A Nation Transformed (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974), 50; this text served as a guide to the historical background of this period.
The integration of the economies of east and west was essential not only to national growth but to Canada's international status within the new imperial world order. The favourable international market coincided with technological innovations crucial to the exploitation of grain farming, the gradual decrease in freight rates, and the closing of the American West which resulted in a rechanneling of the migration route to the Canadian West. Thus, all elements were in place for making the prairies a region of accelerated expansion and prosperity; in government brochures the Canadian West was referred to as "The Last Best West." The importance of the western issue in terms of its scale and future ramifications for the country as a whole necessitated that the western issue be acknowledged as being also a national issue. Because of this, the prairie provinces' concerns regarding immigration were managed and directed by the federal government.

Clifford Sifton, as Minister of the Interior and, therefore, head of immigration matters, determined the overall thrust of Canada's immigration policies between 1896 and 1905. Sifton reorganized the Department to make it more productive, changing it from a "a department of circumlocution" into a

26 Troper, 86-7. The Last and Best West (Ottawa, 1906 and 1907) was a popular promotional pamphlet published by the government. It contained photographs, maps, descriptive text and a question-and-answer section.
modern organization, modeled along the lines of a corporation. By centralizing supervisory control in Ottawa and increasing executive discretionary powers, the Department developed into an efficient administrative machine. The informal (sometimes covert) partnership formed by the federal government and transportation companies allowed for a pooling of resources which resulted in the implementation of sophisticated programmes for attracting and settling immigrants.

In order to fill the 'empty' land as quickly and efficiently as possible, Sifton promoted the 'open door' approach to immigration; that is, anyone who had experience as a farmer, especially in homesteading, had a reasonable chance of being admitted to Canada. The policy was based on the idea that the economic success of the settlement programme depended on the rate at which agricultural workers could be processed. During this period the criteria for admittance into Canada were based on the preference for rural over urban 'types', because Sifton believed that people emigrating from urban centres would not have the experience or skills that

27 Craig Brown and Cook, 55.

28 See James B. Hedges, Building the Canadian West, the Land and Colonization Policies of the Canadian Pacific Railway (New York: The MacMillan Co., 1939), 132. The North Atlantic Trading Company was a covert co-operative venture formed between the federal government and transportation interests that enabled "non-preferred" groups like the Austro-Hungarians to immigrate into Canada even though the countries of origin prohibited emigration.
would make them immediately productive as farm workers. Thus, even though the majority of immigrants still originated from the British Isles and the United States, the numbers of peasant farm workers arriving from Russia, and from eastern and southern Europe, began to grow at a tremendous rate. The 'open door' policy, in respect to its disinterested approach to ethnic preference, was the result of administrative expediency, not generosity. As a system for supplying Canada with a constant source of agricultural labour it reflected the nineteenth-century laissez faire style of capitalism.

When Frank Oliver succeeded Sifton in 1905, government policy shifted considerably towards an approach to immigration that was to remain much more restrictive up until the Second World War (even though Oliver was replaced after the Liberal election loss of 1911). Although under Sifton settlement had been handled as essentially an economic problem, public opinion now began to view immigration as a cultural issue. American literature and research on immigration became Canada's index for assessing its own policy planning. The fear of repeating the American experience, marked by the social collapse of American cities because of mismanaged immigration, influenced the Canadian perception of unrestricted immigration as a real threat to the Canadian way of life:

We do not live to produce wheat. We live to produce people, to produce a social condition, and to build up a country, and if you give us only those who can produce wheat, and who cannot take their places as citizens, you do us injury....

The growing resentment towards certain groups of immigrants reflected the era's broader fears of social disintegration. During the last decade of the nineteenth century and the first of the current century, social reform had become a national concern³⁰. The rapid growth of industry, the full-scale migration of rural populations to manufacturing centres and the influx of massive numbers of immigrants into the cities, was manifested in the inhumane working conditions of factories and mills and the squalor of city slums. Within the professional sector, notably in the fields of medicine, education and religion, the call for social reform was strongest. Women were prominent in the crusade and the women's suffrage movement was especially active in promoting social causes³². Unfortunately, in the reformers' quest to improve


the living conditions of the city and the nation, eugenics appeared as a viable solution to social and racial "degeneration". Between a rock and a hard place, the federal government needed to allay the public's fears of social and racial decline while attempting to execute settlement programmes which were, as stated above, fundamentally economic in nature.

immigration, including, the role of women as domestic workers. (The Canadian economy was badly in need of not only farm workers (men), but also domestics (women).

33 See Angus McLaren, Our Own Master Race: Eugenics in Canada, 1885-1945 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1990); see also Kealey, and Valverde, for the relationship between the women's suffrage movement and eugenics.
Advertising the West: Visual Attraction

It was with Sifton that an efficient system of immigration sales agents was put into place, with offices in the United States and overseas. As an example of Sifton's aggressive strategy, agents were paid a cash bonus for each new immigrant who selected Canada as a destination. Sifton was also responsible for launching the "160 free acres" campaign, as well as an extensive advertising network.34

The advertising programme was ambitious in its scope and productive in its results. New methods were adapted to already established mass-advertising techniques. The press was an especially important advertising medium and Sifton devised ways to exploit it fully. For example, rather than working with individual newspapers to place ads, larger markets were accessed by targeting newspaper unions as distribution centres. Tours for press groups were co-operatively funded by both government and the transportation companies. Since they were promoted as 'working holidays', extra attention was given to the press members' comfort and entertainment; in order to make their work 'smoother', they were supplied with carefully edited press releases.

But reporters were not the only ones to receive excursion

34 See Troper, 79-99 and Hedges, 94-125. For a discussion of publicity for tourism purposes, see Hart.
subsidies. Special reduced group rates were offered to prospective settlers. In particular, 'return men' could enjoy a free trip to the home country in exchange for promotional speaking engagements. Brochures and pamphlets, published by the thousands and constantly updated, were found in every ticket office and agent's pocket and were part of the packages that were sent free of charge to any person requesting information. To answer the enquiries that resulted from the advertising campaign, a system of form letters was prepared in order to retain the semblance of personal contact between government and prospective citizen. The immigration offices themselves, as well as rail stations and hotels, were showcases for photographs, paintings, reproductions and posters promoting Canada as the promised land. Agricultural fairs became primary focal points and their displays were of special consideration to immigration officials. All attempts were made to assemble attractive displays of Canadian products so that the overall effect connoted the idea of cornucopia. Even school children were targeted. Atlases and other sources of information on Canadian history and life were donated to schools abroad, and Britain-wide writing contests were organized around 'Canada' as a theme.

35 For the promotional application of work by landscape artists and photographers see Reid, and Triggs; for critiques of both Reid and Triggs see Miles; for critical analysis of the promotional role of photography in western settlement see Bell; for a general discussion of photographers, landscape, and tourism in Western Canada see Hadley.
Photography played a key role in the promotional activities of the work of travelling agents. Because the government was eager to supply promotional material and the C.P.R. was 'generous' in offering discounts on transportation costs, many 'unofficial' ambulatory salesmen also took part. Professional speakers earned their living travelling the social club circuit; others, like members of the clergy, considered immigration lectures an extension of their regular duties. Others still were of the new breed of 'journalists' willing to take the show on the road, with or without experience. The ambulatory nature of the work was assisted by the exhibition van or 'omnibus', and later the exhibition rail car. The idea of using these vehicles in immigration work had been appropriated by Sifton from the techniques of the travelling salesman. The exhibition van allowed agents to have access to communities that were not located alongside rail lines where 'desirable farming types' were most likely to be found. The vans were put to their greatest use in Great Britain in the early part of the twentieth century.

Of special importance to the travelling speakers was the use of lantern slides, a precursor of the modern 35mm transparency. The projected pictures were animated by live

36 Lantern slides are transparent positives on glass for projection by means of the optical lantern, known popularly as the magic lantern. Various types of light source could be used; limelight gave way to electric light (the arc lamp) in the early twentieth century. See Cassell's Cyclopaedia of Photography (London, New York, Toronto and Melbourne: Cassell and Company Ltd., 1911). The cinematograph was one of several
commentaries that, depending on the performance skills of the speakers, could turn the ‘information’ session into an entertainment event. Unlike the print media, the lantern show was a theatrical event - a social outing that drew people together in an atmosphere of ease and emotional expectation (like the movies). For this reason the use of lantern slides was an effective communication tool, particularly in fundraising for social causes.\textsuperscript{37} Assisted by the magic lantern and the cinematograph,\textsuperscript{38} the immigration lecturer sometimes delivered his anxious appeal between vaudeville acts, competing amongst a variety of entertainment spectacles. In the modern visual era of the early twentieth-century, the lantern slide was an indispensable vehicle for attracting potential immigrants.

The administrative challenge posed by the lantern slide

---


\textsuperscript{38} The cinematograph was one of several competing systems for early motion picture film process that used screen projection. Projected moving pictures were introduced in Canada in 1896; see Peter Morris, \textit{Embattled Shadows, A History of Canadian Cinema, 1895-1939} (Montreal: McGill-University Press, 1978), 6-7. Movies were a very important vehicle for immigration promotion and were being produced as early as the 1890's, see Morris, 30-33.
was immense. A system for filing and cross-referencing had to be implemented, as did careful procedures for shipping by train and steamer. The photographers, the actual producers of the products, in reality were merely 'suppliers' of material to a rapidly expanding archive whose perimeters were set by the administrative requirements of the state. Photographs, because of their mechanical base, fulfilled the need of a system of information manufacture and distribution that was already securely in place within the administrative arm of government. The re-presentation of Canada was thus only incidentally attributable to the 'artistic intentions' or authorship of individual photographers; but it was also only incidentally attributable to the notion of a single overriding 'voice' of the state. Rather, because photographic meaning depends on the organizing principles of the production, distribution and reception of photographs, the complexity of the field of photographic practice needs to be considered. The variety of options available to photographers during this period was dependent upon the nature of, and interaction between, early twentieth-century corporate management, advertising techniques and the limits posed by technology.

For example, although advertising philosophy suggested

39 This is based on a survey of material covering this period and now held in public records: Department of Interior, Department of Immigration and Colonization, RG 76, National Archives of Canada, Ottawa.
flooding the market with pictures, technological conditions in this period were such that photographers were still restricted by the limitations of their medium. Photographers continued to use glass plates in order to achieve the technical quality they wanted; photographic characteristics such as high definition and evenly distributed tonal range were especially important if photographs were to be reproduced or displayed. Nevertheless, studio photographers chose to incorporate the new technology of the hand-held camera into their work because of the convenience of the smaller formats. The expansion of the traditional market necessitated the application of new technologies and working strategies even as the everyday production of portraiture remained largely unchanged. While some of the promotional work, such as the C.P.R. commissions, consisted of landscape work and relied on the production conventions of landscape, other work was more like that of the press photographer which demanded familiarity with the new hand camera technology. However, the transition to the newer formats sometimes proved to be difficult even for experienced photographers.

A case in point is the Western work produced by the Notman studio for the C.P.R. after 1900. The Notman studio of Montreal had been the favoured photographic firm of the C.P.R. for many years. In 1901 the Notman firm, with William

40 See Triggs, 69-77 for information related to the Notman studio's western work.
McFarlane Notman (1857-1913) as photographer, was granted a joint commission to photograph the royal tour of the Duke and Duchess of York, from Québec City to Victoria. Along with the large-format cameras (8"x10"), Notman used a 5"x7" film camera. (The latter were commonly used by press photographers.) In 1903 the Notman firm was commissioned to accompany the six-week Western tour of the Chambers of Commerce of the Empire, a group of more than 250 businessmen who were holding their international congress in Montreal. The tour was co-sponsored by the C.P.R. and the government; the C.P.R. was responsible for paying Notman, whose job it was to produce souvenir albums of the trip for the delegates. As a supplement to the view camera, Notman used a whole plate roll film camera so that he could produce 'instantaneous' pictures. A combination of formats was also used for the 1904 commission to photograph the North West Irrigation Company site at Lethbridge, Alberta, which had recently become the property of the C.P.R. and was being developed as a settlement site. Some of the results produced by the smaller camera (the newer technology) in the 1903 and 1904 trips were considered failures because they didn't measure-up to technical and aesthetic standards. The smaller formats, although more convenient, were not technically sensitive enough to the type

41 Two other photographers shared the commission: Samuel McLaughlin and William Topley, see Triggs, 74.

42 Hedges, 169-211.
of control professional photographers needed; for example, camera shake resulted in tilted horizon lines and blurred images. It is this idea of failure in terms of the context of the art photograph that I would like to address.\textsuperscript{43}

As noted above, the newer formats had been introduced in response to the shift that had occurred in the field of photographic practice since the early 1890's - that is, during the Kodak era. Though studio photographers criticized the new breed of amateurs, they could not avoid being affected by the changes. Traditional studio firms like the Notman studio in Montreal and the Topley studio in Ottawa had always included the selling of amateur camera equipment and supplies\textsuperscript{44}, and by the late nineteenth century the sale of these products had become an increasingly important adjunct to photographic business.\textsuperscript{45}

Photographers like Notman turned to the smaller-format

\textsuperscript{43} For comments on camera difficulties, see Triggs, 76.

\textsuperscript{44} A.J. Birrell suggests that after 1900 the Topley Studio grew increasingly dependent on the amateur market in the selling of camera equipment, supplies and photo-finishing - A.J. Birrell, "William James Topley," unpublished manuscript, Photographers' Files, Documentary Art and Photography, National Archives of Canada, 4.

\textsuperscript{45} William James Topley (1845-1930) began his career in the Notman studio in Montreal in 1864. He later opened the Ottawa branch of Notman's studio, which he bought in 1872. He was successful as a portraitist and also did promotional work for both the C.P.R. and the government. He was assisted by his son in the later years of his career; see The Canadian Encyclopedia s.v. "Topley, William," by Andrew Birrel; see also A.J. Birrel "William J. Topley", Ibid.
cameras because of the constraints of the commissions. Both the 1903 and 1904 trips, for example, demanded a fast-paced schedule. These types of commissions displaced Notman from the security of the studio environment into the sphere of the press photographer, where the 'event' dictated the order of things. The 'event' had been transformed by the early twentieth-century newspaper age into a new type of happening requiring a different pictorial vocabulary; the document became the new visual syntax for the modern age. The increased demands on the part of the press for photographic illustrations thus instigated a change in the role of the photographer and in the choice of photographic technology. However, even for an expert photographer like William MacFarlane Notman the transition was not easy nor immediately successful; thus some of the pictures on the 1904 trip have been referred to as "disappointing" and others as "highlights".⁶ Some, such as Grading Machine (ill.1), are considered successful because they display a mastery of the hand-held camera. By incorporating the slightly blurred outlines produced by accidental camera movement into the overall design, Notman was able to achieve a painterly effect in the photograph. The slight movement of the camera gives the otherwise static composition a sense of motion to the clouds of grain dust and to the clouds in the sky. The "machine", the

⁶ Triggs, 75.
male figures sitting upon it and the team of horses pulling it, are squarely positioned in the center of the composition dominated by a vast horizon line; a Dutch landscape formula (two thirds sky, one third flat land) governs the composition. The heads of the two men are the only elements which break the horizon, while all else is submerged below it. The prairies are envisioned as a sublime landscape where the grandeur of the open land and the strength of machine (both animal and technical) are unified in the figure standing upright in the center of the scene - the conquering farmer-hero, the frontline soldier of Progress. Grading Machine becomes a successful advertising image because the discourse of pictorialist landscape photography subdues its commercial intent, which was to promote the C.P.R.'s Alberta Irrigation Canal site as good farming land. As Grading Machine shows well, photographs are both pictorial constructions and documents and the promotional photograph in particular draws from both discourses to achieve its effects.

If in turn, the photographic portrait in relation to immigration advertising is questioned, a complex and subtle interaction between artistic convention and propagandistic drive is revealed. By examining government-sponsored photographs of immigrants, portraiture may be positioned within a historically specific context of cultural and political intent.

About 1910 a group of photographs was produced for the
immigration office at Quebec City. Though they are usually attributed to William Topley\textsuperscript{47} there is a suggestion that they may have been produced by John Woodruff (1859-1917), who was the official government photographer for the Department of the Interior (the Department responsible for immigration).\textsuperscript{48} Some of these photographs have been reproduced as illustrations for recent studies in Canadian history, immigration history and photographic history\textsuperscript{49}. I would like to address these photographs in terms of the way two of them (ill. 2, 3) are treated in the only general historical survey of Canadian photography that exists – \textit{Canadian Photography: 1839-1929} (1979) by Ralph Greenhill and Andrew Birrell. The photographs are discussed in the chapter titled "Documentation", but the

\textsuperscript{47} The Topley group of immigration photographs are in "Album 16", W.J. Topley collection acc. no. 1936-270, Documentary Art and Photography, National Archives of Canada. Note that the photographs are are identified by ethnic origin, in writing, on the negatives.

\textsuperscript{48} Greenhill and Birrell, 144-145. For an analysis of this particular group of photographs as related to immigration policy see Claude Minotto, "Le Centre d'immigration de Québec (1908-1910), seul de l'Amérique," \textit{Archives} 9,1 (June 1987): 11-17. For biographical information on Woodruff see "John Woodruff," unpublished manuscript in Photographers' Files, Documentary Art and Photography, National Archives of Canada.

choice of photographs that are reproduced, as well as their
description, belie the authors' preference for discussing
these government-commissioned works in aesthetic terms:

A fascinating series of what are virtually informal
portraits...the best of the portraits of immigrants,
such as the charming study of the little English boy
travelling alone, or that of the German family, were
probably taken by Ottawa photographer, W.J. Topley.
The original negatives of those photographs were
found in the Topley Collection, and there is a
marked difference between the excellent Topley
pictures and the more ordinary photographs known to
have been taken by Woodruff. 50(ill.2,3)

Let me address these photographs according to Alan
Sekula's notion of the "myth of the denotive univocality of
the legal image" 51 and apply this idea to the use of the
photograph as a 'testament'. The photograph as testament is
a visual document that testifies to a certain reality in the
world (Roland Barthes's denoted message) 52. This visual record

50 Greenhill and Birrell, 144-5. The combination of these two
authors' voices (Greenhill as an art collector and Birrell as
photographic archivist) produces a curious "forked-tongue"
discussion that attempts to integrate the discourses of "the
document" and "the art photograph" within the modernist idea
of an aesthetics of documentary. For a critical examination
of the modernist discourse "art v. documentary", see Alan
Sekula "The Invention of Photographic Meaning". It is
interesting to note that Sekula's argument includes an
examination of two photographs whose subject is immigrant-
related - Lewis Hine Immigrants Going Down Gangplank, New York
(1905) and Alfred Stieglitz's The Steerage (1907). Hine's work
is used as an example of "documentary" photograph and
Stieglitz's as an "art" photograph.


Heath, ed. Vicki Goldberg, Photography in Print: Writings from
1816 to the Present (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico
in turn introduces the symbolic by having the particular 'stand in', metonymically, for the general. The statement of Superintendent of Immigration W.D. Scott about the photographs needs scrutiny: "I do not want a line of immigrants of various nationalities with Immigration Officers interspersed but what is wanted is individual types taken for the most part singly." 53 Scott's declaration must be seen not as an aesthetic preference, but within the context of his role as administrator of a government policy. The decision to select one pictorial strategy over another - that is, to choose the 'portrait' (individual types) over the identification document (a line of immigrants) - has less to do with humanistic tendency than with political strategy. Scott clearly understood the propaganda potential of the portrait over that of the document. In respect to the difficult moment the government was facing in regard to demands for increased restriction of immigrants, the 'personalization' of immigrants was as important as a defence against a potentially hostile Canadian audience, as it was as an incentive to prospective immigrants. Although the authors Greenhill and Birrell acknowledge that "seeing pictures similar to themselves" would encourage emigration, the "charming" effect - viewed in relation to government policy promotion - must be seen as the use of 'personalization' as a politically motivated strategy.

53 William Duncan Scott, became Superintendent of Immigration in 1903; quoted in Greenhill and Birrell 145.
for gaining public support.

It is thus that the promotional photographic portrait fulfills what Sekula describes as a "double system: a system of representation capable of functioning both "honorifically" (constructing individuality) and "repressively" (removing individuality).\textsuperscript{54} For example, Chadwick Sandles ("English immigrant travelling alone, Quebec") (ill.3) in its pictorialist choice of deep shadow and soft window light as modeling features, together with the conventional 'formal yet relaxed' studio portrait pose, suggests a quiet, almost melancholic mood. The boy is portrayed as a docile innocent and we are asked to empathize with his predicament. Chadwick Sandles is a portrait that in its honorific capacity demands that we attribute character and individualism to the person represented. In German Immigrants (ill.2), the fact that this is a family grouping is important for establishing similar cultural associations, i.e. the nuclear family structure, between the viewer and the immigrants. Thus, this photograph is more reminiscent of a studio family portrait than an identification picture.

On the other hand, Sekula's notion of the repressive function of photographic representations of people withdraws individuality, emphasizing instead the subject as a member of a class. For example, in the photograph of deports (ill.4),

\textsuperscript{54} Sekula, 6.
the group, flanked by immigration officials, is assembled in a frieze that is clearly lit. Almost all look directly at the camera. Some appear to have been caught unprepared, in the midst of arranging their clothes, or looking away. The crippled boy is centered in the composition and stands apart from the group behind him; he has probably been positioned there by the photographer. Neither the group, nor the boy are close enough to the camera to evoke feelings of intimacy from the viewer, but neither are they far enough away not to be recognized. The placement of the figures and their distance from the camera allows the viewer to look at but not to identify with the people represented. By lessening the personalizing or honorific aspect of the photograph a distance between the viewer and the subject is constructed. The intimate space of the Sandles boy is gone, as is the quality of tactility produced by the modelling of light and shadow. In its stead is the corridor that runs between observer and observed. The boy with crutches, so 'obviously' defective, dispassionately gazes back across an infinite gulf of silence. The boy wears the sign of his difference; his body displays the reason for his deportation. The other figures, because they are members of this group, are also defective in some way. Their failure does not announce itself physically, but it is implied by association, and extra-photographically by the political decisions that designate them as "undesirable immigrants". As a photograph Immigrants to be deported functions repressively
by creating a document for a politically generated archive to which the different, deviant and defective copies of the real-ideal Canadian could be removed.

Beyond the discourses of government and commercial interests, which were restricted by a variety of conditions, immigrants were also the subject of parallel discourses such as those of social reform and popular journalism. In the following section, the thesis analyzes the way immigrants were represented by text and photographs in contemporary social reform literature which addressed immigration as an urgent national "problem".
Strangers With Our Gates: Promoting Assimilation in Social Reform Literature

Out of the remote and little known regions of northern, eastern, and southern Europe forever marches a vast and endless army. Nondescript and everchanging in personnel, without leaders or organization, this great force, moving at a rate of nearly 1,500,000 each year, is invading the civilized world.  

During Oliver's term the ability to be assimilated or 'Canadianized' became the criterion by which potential immigrants were judged 'desirable' or 'undesirable'. Americans (whites), the largest group of this period, were seen as being most assimilable because they were already adjusted to prairie farm life and because they brought capital. In terms of preferred countries the criterion was based on long-held assumptions about the relationship of race and character to geographical origin, so that groups sharing Canada's northern traits were considered most desirable:

The adjective "northern" came to symbolize energy, strength, self-reliance, health and purity, and its opposite, "southern", was equated with decay and effeminacy, even libertinism and disease.  

The opposition between 'north' and 'south' was reinforced by

55 Woodsworth, 12.

the arbitrary division of 'the colour line'. Immigrants of colour were not only unsolicited but actively discouraged, if not prohibited, from entry into Canada. However, in cases where the colour line was not obviously being transgressed, ethnic and racial assessments were also used to evaluate immigrants' value in terms that were strictly utilitarian and work-related; thus a low rating on the cultural scale could mean a higher ranking in terms of employers' needs. East Europeans, although not officially solicited in this period, continued to be sought for their 'peasant qualities', which many believed allowed them the ability to endure the difficult conditions in northern homesteading regions. East and south Europeans and south Asians also served as an abundant supply of cheap, seasonal labour in mining, lumber and railway camps.57 The only prospective immigrants not to suffer the race or ethnic classification were the mentally and physically disabled, the sick and the destitute, who were immediately rejected at the port of entry for being dangerous to the Canadian gene pool and a drain on resources. It is important to note that class became enough of an issue by 1908 to warrant stringent restriction of the English poor, thereby eliminating any advantages, resulting from imperial sentiment.

57 See Donald Avery, "Dangerous Foreigners" European Immigrant Workers and Labour Radicalism in Canada 1896-1932 (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1979) for an analysis of how agricultural workers were used as seasonal labour in other areas of the economy.
that had existed previously.\textsuperscript{58}

In 1908, in response to British Columbia's appeal to keep that province "a white man's country,"\textsuperscript{59} a series of policy changes were enacted that in effect all but stopped emigration from India and severely limited the entry of people from Asia.\textsuperscript{60} Although the decisions were racially determined, they were legislated without the actual naming of any of the non-preferred countries; rather, the exclusion was put into practice by a series of technical stipulations, circumventing possible reprimands of unethical behaviour. However, even with circuitous tactics, restrictive policies were passed in Parliament with little opposition. On the economic front the policy changes were directed at maintaining a steady supply of farm workers and domestics while stemming the growth of the urban labour market; on the cultural level immigration policy was directed at keeping Canada white and trouble-free. The 1910 Immigration Act contained all the provisions listed above as well as more criteria for keeping non-whites (specifically negroes, but also Hindus and Orientals) out.\textsuperscript{61} By drawing on

\textsuperscript{58} See Roberts for an in-depth discussion of deportation policy and procedures as they affected various social groups, including an extensive study of "anarchists" as a category of non-preferred immigrants.

\textsuperscript{59} Cameron, 81.

\textsuperscript{60} The Vancouver riots of 1907 (and later, the Komagata Maru affair of 1914) are an indication of the volatile state of race relations on the west coast at this time.

\textsuperscript{61} "Hindus" was the common designation of immigrants from India, "Orientals" for those from China and Japan, and "Negro"
the nineteenth-century argument of geographical essentialism, restriction could be imposed on "immigrants belonging to any race deemed unsuited to the climate or requirements of Canada". The legislative establishment of Boards of Enquiry at ports of entry consolidated the power of the Department of Immigration; immigration agents were given full authority to admit or reject, and applicants did not have recourse to an appeal in a Canadian Court of Law.

Immigration had become a national crisis - a malady requiring the specialized skills of professional healers and a complex network of institutional control. Once the immigrant was admitted into Canada, his social adjustment became the responsibility not of the federal government but of the churches and schools. It is therefore not surprising that a broad alliance of social interest groups continued the work of the immigration officer by extending the state apparatus of control past the point of debarkation into the immigrant's daily life.

In this respect the work of James Shaver Woodworth was typical. Woodworth, a Methodist minister working in Winnipeg, became one of Canada's leading spokespersons for immigration reform. In 1909 he published Strangers Within Our Gates Or for American Blacks; the thesis utilizes the ethnic and racial terms used in Woodworth.

62 Cameron, 96.

63 At the time of his book's publication in 1909, James Shaver Woodworth (1874-1942) was superintendent of All Peoples'
Coming Canadians, which was received as "not a religious book in the ordinary sense, but a sociological study." In Strangers, Woodsworth proposed assimilation as the remedy to the "immigration invasion".

As a philosophy, assimilation reveals the political position of social reformists as essentially one of support for the status quo rather than for radical change (i.e., social work, not socialism). Assimilation attempted to make the foreigner adjust to Canadian society, rather than vice-versa. The elimination of ethnic nationalisms was seen as critical to the forging of a single Canadian nationalism, and to equal partnership in the Empire:

In western Canada there is to be seen to-day that most fascinating of all human phenomena, the making of a nation. Out of breeds diverse in traditions, in ideals, in speech, and in manner of life, Saxon and Slav, Teuton, Celt and Gaul, one people is being made. The blood strains of great races will mingle in the blood of a race greater than the greatest of them all. It would be our wisdom to grip these peoples to us with living hooks of justice and charity till all lines of national cleavage disappear, and in the Entity of our Canadian national life, and in the Unity of world wide

Mission, Winnipeg, and a Methodist minister. He resigned from the ministry in 1918. He eventually became the first leader of the C.C.F. (Cooperative Commonwealth Federation), founded at Regina in 1933; for more discussion of Woodsworth's role in social reform see Allen.

64 The Globe, Toronto, March 6 1909, 14.

65 Two years later, Woodsworth produced a book directed at the problems of urban poverty (the urban poor included a large number of immigrants) - James Woodsworth, My Neigbor (Toronto: Musson Books, 1911).
Empire, we fuse into a people... 66

The idea of Canadianization, however, presents a difficult dilemma for the project of assimilation because it rests on the theoretical articulation of the symbolic construct, 'Canadian'. Woodsworth's study is emblematic in that it reveals the ambivalent nature of the colonialist position when it is confronted with naming itself in respect to its own colonized subject:

There has not been sufficient time to develop a fixed Canadian type, but there is a certain indefinite something that at once unites and distinguishes us from all the world besides. Our hearts all thrill in response to the magical phrase - 'This Canada of Ours!' We are Canadians. As yet we have not entered fully into our national privileges and responsibilities, but great national problems are already forcing themselves upon our attitudes. In grappling with and solving these we shall attain our national manhood. 67

Thus the immigration problem becomes a disturbing reminder of the tendentious position of the Canadian national identity (male but not quite a man). Although 'Canadian' may not yet have been a fully formed idea, it is clear that its heritage was Anglo-Saxon and Protestant:

A line is drawn across the Continent of Europe from

66 Ralf Connor, The Foreigner; a Tale of Saskatchewan (Toronto: Westminster, c. 1909), preface, n.p. Ralf Connor was the pen name of Charles William Gordon (1860-1937), "the most successful Canadian novelist of the early 20th century" (The Canadian Encyclopedia s.v. "Gordon, Charles William" by Terrance Craig); for an examination of the portrayal of immigrants in literary fiction see Peter Klaus Stich, "Immigration and the Canadian West: From Propaganda to Fiction" (Ph.D., diss., University of London, 1975).

67 Woodsworth, 16.
north east to southwest (that) separates countries not only distinct in races but also of distinct civilizations...Protestant Europe from Catholic Europe...Teutonic Races from Latin, Slav, Semetic and Mongolian races....

In Strangers the 'line' is reinforced; chapters are devised by ethnic origin, and listed in order of ethnic desirability - British, Americans, Scandinavians and ending with those considered undesirable and completely unable to assimilate - the Orientals (Chinese, Japanese, Hindus). As an indication of confused intentions, two additional groups - "the Negro and the Indian" - are discussed even though, as the book concedes, they are not immigrants; but because "they both stand out entirely by themselves" they are included. Thus the visibly different person is never completely divested of 'foreignness', so that the process of assimilation, of reformulation into sameness, becomes in effect a rhetorical function; the Canadianized foreigner takes on the role of mimic: "a subject of difference that is almost the same but not quite." The colonized subject is the refracted image of

68 Woodsworth, 164.

69 This format is used in Jacob Riis, How the Other Half Lives: Studies among the Tenements of New York (New York: Charles Scribner Sons, 1890) which is listed as a reference in Woodsworth, 10; however, Woodsworth's book does not use any of Riis's photographs. Riis was a very popular American social reformist and photography played a key role in his success; see Stange.

70 Woodsworth, 158.

71 Bhabha, 126.
the colonizer, a projected shadow of the real thing serving to confirm the authenticity, the authority, of the Canadian Voice. In an era in which the threat of American absorption and demands of empire played simultaneously upon the Canadian psyche, the immigration problem became a vehicle for consolidating Canada's own unnamed self(s). As a stereotype, the foreigner became a projection of the Self upon the Other: a protean image of the contradictory forces of desire and fear, and the image field upon which a dialectic of control and loss were played out.  

The ambiguous position of the speaker in Strangers underscores the nature of the problem with self-identification. In the text the foreigner is defined, described, explained and evaluated in tables of statistics, the opinions of specialists, the evidence of photographs. But the text itself is without an individual voice - without an author - as it is in large part a compilation of excerpts from American sources (at times concealed). Thus Strangers on several levels presents an impossible task of proposing Canadianization as a solution without directly identifying Canadianism itself: without taking its own position as Subject. Canadianism as an empty signifier becomes a discursive tool for establishing the ethical authority of assimilation, allowing the policing function of the project

72 Gilman, 18; see also thesis footnote no. 5.
to remain obscured. Taking the idea of assimilation as the key to *Strangers*, the book's thesis may be divided into a basic paradigms of 'sameness v. difference' and 'order v. chaos'.

In *Strangers* it is clear that the successful implementation of the assimilation project rests on the positive, co-operative response from the reader, a member of the Canadian middle class. As in the tradition of the promotional literature of charity institutions, the aim is to convince the potential supporters that the object of charity is in need of help, and that they, the readers, are in a position of being able to supply that assistance. Thus a 'distinction' must first be established between the two parties, a division based upon dichotomies of 'wellness/illness', 'have/ have not', etc. That is, the object of charity must be made to appear as in some way lacking, as a 'less than' who stands outside the social centre. But in order to 'move' the reader, that is to stimulate a moral response and not simply a feeling of alienation, the object of charity must appear to need/want what the reader needs/wants himself, thus becoming the image of desire itself - the desire that compels the middle-class reader to want/deserve what others want/ have.

In *Strangers* the aim is to show the immigrant as both lacking and desiring sameness, that is, as aspiring to be like the reader, to be a Canadian. This is accomplished in the text by the strategy of personalizing the immigrant in order to
invoke a sympathetic response from the reader, much as government-sponsored photographs 'personalized' desirable immigrants at the same time as they 'de-personalized' undesirables. According to Woodsworth "We are not dealing with figures but with men, women and children - with their hopes and struggles, their victories and defeats. What idyls - what tragedies lie behind these figures. If only we knew one life!"\textsuperscript{73}. The strategy here is based on the attraction of 'real life drama' - the appeal of narrative together with the authenticity of the testimonial - "the story of an immigrant as told by himself". This is common to the scenario of the evangelist's service (in the moment of conversion when the penitent confesses and is redeemed), but popular as well as an advertising ploy. In immigration promotion the government's use of "the return man" as a public crier of the benefits of western settlement was based on the same notion.\textsuperscript{74}

A photograph may also function like the oral testimonial, in that the visual record also confirms a truth, which in this case is extra-photographic. In Barthesian analysis, the denotative function of the photographic image works as a relay

\textsuperscript{73} Woodsworth, 17.

\textsuperscript{74} The "return man", after a successful homesteading experience, was paid by the government to go on promotional tours. The government attempted as much as possible to encourage accurate, but selective, information; transportation agents and real estate speculators were the most frequent users of false advertising (although one could argue that they existed in a symbiotic relationship with government).
for the connoted or symbolic message - "It is precisely the syntagm of the denoted message which 'naturalizes' the system of the connoted message". An examination of the photographs in relation to the text of *Strangers* will reveal how the photographs function as a visual corollary to a cultural view of the immigrant as "almost same but not quite".

In *Strangers* (ill.5), 'before/after' photographs produced by the Barnardo Homes institution were used in the discussion of charity-sponsored immigration. (The Barnardo Home system was founded in 1871 as a refuge for destitute children. A few years later photography became a regular tool of documentation of the thousands of children who eventually passed through the Barnardo Homes.) Pictures, such as those in ill.5, were used as documents that disclosed the children's poor state of appearance, their dirty, torn clothes and their unhappy faces, when they entered the Barnardo Home (before) and their improved condition, clean clothes and smiling faces, after they had spent some time in the Home (after). The institution also used photographs in its fund-raising campaigns and it was in this capacity that the photographs came to be at the centre of a legal dispute. Dr. Barnardo was charged with misrepresenting the children's actual state of destitution: "He is not satisfied with taking them as they really are, but

75 Barthes, 523-525.

he tears their clothes, so as to make them appear worse that they really are. They are also taken in purely fictitious positions."77 Barnardo claimed that since his intention was to portray types rather than individuals, the charge of distorting the (visual) facts was irrelevant. Though this line of defence did not win him his case, the assertion is interesting in that it addresses the actual nature of the before/after picture - that is, its advertising use as a fund-raising device. In the photographs lack is created and then fulfilled; the individual child is changed for the better. But the individual child stands in metonymically for all poor children, as a representative of a category, and the photograph of the individual (the specific) enters the symbolic (the general). As symbol the image enters into a complex field of cultural and social signs that set the field of social desire - health, cleanliness, goodness, happiness etc; thus the child's desire is society's desire. The semantic function of the realist photograph is its ability to 'seem' completely natural while at the same time partaking of the mythic or symbolic; the children are both types and individuals, general and specific.

The idea of assimilation is based on the assumption of consensus (i.e., the immigrant wishes to be like other Canadians); however, this agreement, may be superficially

77 Quoted in Tagg, 85.
based on enforced uniformity. When this uniformity does not correspond to racial terms it may be evoked according to conditions of cultural similarities. Foreigners participate in forms of community organization like the family and church, and thus share common expectations of 'belonging' and have the capacity to subordinate individual desires to those of the group. Recurring photographic themes in Strangers such as home and church architecture, and collective farm work, emphasize the idea of community and co-operation; the group family portrait suggests a common belief in the stabilizing role of the nuclear family (ill.6). The suggestion of order and stability guides the viewer to project his own desire onto the Other, a confirmation that overpowers whatever idea of difference may exist (the workers are barefoot, their churches look strange); in effect difference is read as a unfulfilled desire or longing for sameness. In photographs of school children in Strangers all distinctions of dress have been eliminated; uniformity seems accomplished but the caption reveals that they are "foreign children"(ill.7). The caption works to establish the order of difference extra-photographically, and the photograph is 'read' as a visual document that confirms the cultural meaning of 'education' as a difference-erasing, nation-building institution. Thus Marylin Barber, in the introduction to Strangers writes of the "middle position" (neither pessimistic nor overly optimistic) of the social reformist: "For these Canadians, assimilation
was not a natural and inevitable process, but one which required assistance and direction" (through institutional controls)\textsuperscript{78}. How then is one to interpret "Mending day in the Chinese Girls' Home" in the context of the accompanying text, which states that "orientals cannot be assimilated"\textsuperscript{79}(ill.8)? Dressed in working-class Sunday-best clothes, the young women, in a closely-knit group, smile at the camera. Although their clothes are western, and although they attend a Canadian institution, the text warns us that their full assimilation into Canadian life is not possible. Their difference is permanently traced in the features of their faces and the colour of their skin. Canadianization in this case is limited to Bhabha's concept of mimicry, which postulates that the foreigner may emulate but not become the same as the society that governs him. The project of assimilation was not seen as a guarantee of Canadianization in all situations. In some cases the process could be expected to function only as a deterrent or control of foreignness. One may surmise that the project of Canadianism was threatened from within by a psychic insecurity which suggested that ultimately the cultural could not be learned but only imitated. Thus the 'cultural' perimeters of Canadianism, are determined by the discursive function of the paradigm of sameness/difference and its

\textsuperscript{78} Woodsworth, xvii, introduction by Marylin Barber (1972).

\textsuperscript{79} Woodsworth, 155.
corollary, order/chaos.

The government's need to project an aura of control and efficient management may be seen in the group of government-commissioned photographs of immigrants taken at the port of Québec City about 1910-11. These photographs, by Topley and Woodruff, are views of the interior of the debarkation sheds, dining rooms, hospital and other areas of the immigration centre (ill. 9). They are an indication of an "order and space" that permeates the entire immigration process. It is a view antithetical to those other popular images, the rush of settlers as they approach real estate offices and as they disembark from the steamers:

A l'intérieur du Centre d'immigration, tout est plutôt calme. Pas de foules qui se bousculent, pas de files impatientes. L'ordre règne, semble-t-il, et nul besoin d'intervention de la part des autorités du Centre.... Toute la photographie de l'aménagement représente des qualités que l'on veut associer non seulement aux locaux du Centre d'immigration, mais aussi à l'ensemble du pays recevant: l'ordre et l'espace libre. 80

But the order is not only a projection intended for the immigrant to imagine; it is also imposed upon the immigrant. The chaos of the invasion is subdued and ordered by modern techniques of efficient management - a logic that metaphorically extends to government policy itself as being rational and right. It is clear from the government reports by the immigration doctors who worked at the Québec City

80 Minotto, 11.
reception site that conditions were poor and overcrowded, that rats openly circulated in the immigration sheds, and that more control was continuously advocated for a situation that was obviously tending towards collapse. How is the viewer to understand these pictures? As a reflection of the 'wide open' spaces of the prairies? As indicators of the rational, democratic spirit of the state, the benevolent but authoritative father? Like the "ultra modernism" of the Kodak factory, the resolution of the immigration problem was a matter of applying modern models of management to the problem of immigration. Like the actual confusion that existed in the immigration sheds and quarantine hospitals, the management of the images themselves was an administrative problem that tended towards breakdown. The disorder that existed within the immigration process, the contradictions and arguments that existed at the parliamentary level are not apparent neither in the photographs nor in the filing systems that theoretically kept all in its place. It was not only lantern slides and pamphlets that circulated within the bureaucratic maze of government administration; it was also people or, more specifically, the decisions that affected people's lives.

Barbara Roberts' analysis of deportation practice in Canada between 1900 and 1935 argues that deportations were handled as "purely administrative proceedings," controlled by the exigencies of officials, in particular the medical officers, who had assumed powers that should have belonged
only to Parliament and to the justice system.\textsuperscript{81} Photographic historians such as Tagg and Sekula have proposed that the growth of the regulatory functions of institutions, such as the state, paralleled the increasing deployment of photography as a device for systematic information gathering—a role derived from photography's discursive force as 'evidence'. Sekula's analysis of the invention and early use of the Bertillon system of criminal photography implicates photography as a adjunct to the policing operations of society, displacing the myth of the "denotative univocality of the legal image."\textsuperscript{82} Sekula's argument is joined to Robert's study of deportation practice in the Canadian immigration department's decision to use the Bertillon system around 1907-8:

It has occurred to me that in the case of deported criminals, and certain other persons, it would be of value as a a matter of record, to have photographs taken and a short history of each case made. These could be kept in a special book, and referred to when necessary.... Having photographs of any of these deported people, and others, who might escape from our buildings would aid us very

\textsuperscript{81} Barbara Roberts, "Purely Administrative Proceedings": The Management of Canadian Deportation, Montreal, 1900-1935," (Ph.D. diss., University of Ottawa, 1980), 440.: "Deportation was a necessary albeit unsavoury part of immigration, the equivalent of the sewage system of cities. It was the drain through which our immigration refuse was directed, in order to assure that 'the river of our national life would not be unnecessarily polluted by the turbid streams' of the immigrant unfit, unemployed, and unprofitable".

\textsuperscript{82} Sekula, 6.
much in their recovery.\textsuperscript{83}

It is clear from government correspondence that immigration officials were fully aware of photography's use as a technique for policing immigrants who were awaiting deportation and might escape detention (not only criminals, but all who were considered "undesirable"). The Bertillon system in particular, and photographic identification in general, were efficient administrative tools for carrying out the immigration department's extra-judicial decisions to "drain the sewage from the river of our national life."\textsuperscript{84} As Tagg states in The Burden of Representation, in the criminal photographic portrait:

The political axis of representation had been entirely reversed. It was no longer a privilege to be pictured but the burden of a new class of the surveilled. It is another history of portraiture... which has less to do with commodity production than with its precondition: the exercise of a new power on the social body, generating new kinds of knowledge and newly refined means of control.\textsuperscript{85}

\textsuperscript{83} The first indication of an interest in systematically using photography for documenting deportees is a letter from A.D. Stewart, medical inspector at the Montreal Detention Hospital, to W.D. Scott, Superintendent of Immigration, dated August 7, 1907. A letter from W. De Courcey of the Topley Studio to W.D. Scott, dated March 14, 1908, confirms the sale of a Bertillon system. - RG 76, Vol. 459, file 704525. De Courcey, William Topley's son, took over the studio after his father's retirement in 1923; the studio closed in 1926 - A.J. Birrell, Ibid., 4.

\textsuperscript{84} See thesis footnote no. 80.

\textsuperscript{85} Tagg, 59. See also, Tagg, Ibid., "A Means of Surveillance: The Photograph as Evidence in Law", Chapter 3, 66-102.
The use of photography in immigration matters went far beyond picturesque landscapes and genteel portraits when exercised as a means of policing those classified as 'undesirables'. It is ironical, that the Topley Studio's sale of the Bertillon system (cameras, filing cabinets, revolving chair etc.) to immigration officials, was simply another aspect of business routine\textsuperscript{86}, and that the convenience of the hand-held camera was here seen not for its value to photography hobbyists, but as a tool in the deployment of the regulatory powers of government\textsuperscript{87}.

\textsuperscript{86} See thesis footnote no. 82.

\textsuperscript{87} In a letter to John Hoolahan, Dominion Immigration Agent at Montreal, from [Sanford ?], the various advantages of the Primo Folding Kodak camera in deportation photography are listed - portable (could be carried in a coat pocket), loads by day light, can use plates or film packs of 12 exposures, exposures can be processed individually - RG 76, Vol. 459, file 704525.
The growing sense that Canada's social system was threatened with collapse was a prevalent concern in the writings of popular journalism, and corresponded to a disillusionment with the new machine age, the trauma of a world war, and the gradual shift from rural to urban settlement that took place in central Canada. Despite the growth in the agrarian sector of the national economy, by 1914 Ontario and Quebec had become predominantly urban, and by 1921 the rural-urban ratio was about even throughout the country. The growth of urban centres coincided with the rise of the manufacturing sectors. The basic organizational structures of business became the corporation, monopoly and trust.

The technological era of machines was underway and for some it produced the modern sense of alienation and a sense of approaching chaos:

Acres of primeval Canadian forest disappear to provide tons of paper in turn to make our minds like so much blotting-paper, permeable to the mass suggestion of advertising. Even the farm has lost its isolation and farming methods become more dependent on industrial weapons - machinery and mass production. The world becomes narrower...until the (home) begins to become a dormitory cubicle of the city - a place to sleep - not always a place to eat. 88

However, the growth of the manufacturing industries and the economy as a whole, while contributing to the disintegration of city life and to growing insecurity about the future, also effected beneficial changes by slowing the exodus of Quebecers to the New England textile towns. Quebec's loss of 13% of its population during the 1880's-90's prompted nationalists like Henri Bourassa to launch a campaign of repatriation. Although boosted by the upswing in Quebec's economy, the campaign was not solely a matter of economic concern. The influx of immigrants into Canada, of which a high percentage was made up of anglophones and allophones, English, threatened the security of the francophone culture and the balance of the Founding Nations concept of state power. The compromised settlement of the Manitoba separate schools issue of 1890 clearly indicated to Quebec that French language and culture were not in a secure position and could not be left unguarded. Quebec realized that even though a large number of immigrants to Canada were Catholics, a vote of sympathy for francophone leadership in government was not guaranteed.

Thus, even as the federal government and Western provinces embarked on aggressive campaigns to attract

C.N.R. Colonization Department in 1925. His career demonstrates the utilitarian roles social scientists began to play in the 1930's.

settlement - from the United States, Britain and the Continent - Quebec, while working the obvious francophone sources of immigration in Europe, hoped to call back native sons through promises of prosperity, economic security and emotional appeals to nationalist sentiment. Quebec's colonization programme attempted to relocate workers in the northland, to areas such as Lac St-Jean, in the hope of encouraging the traditional, small-town francophone way of life to endure in an era of encroaching industrialization and anglicization. Quebec's strategies for attracting immigration addressed not only economic needs but also the province's specific cultural needs, which differed from those of other regions. In the cover illustration of a Quebec colonization publication, the use of a Notman photograph responds to ideas about craft, home and patrimoine. In the illustration some decorative changes have been made but, suggestively, the crucifix has attained a stronger presence. It is significant that this particular image appears on the cover of the publication while scenes of farming are reserved for the inside of the book.  

The superimposition of order upon a disordered world also occurred on another level and in a broader geographical context in the selection of what Leo Marx has called the

90 Triggs, 76; the photographs were made by William MacFarlane Notman, between 1898-1900, during his summer holidays at Cap à l'Aigle near Murray Bay, Québec.
"sentimental pastoral" as a subject in art and literature. In this idyllic landscape the immigrant farmer is uttered as a figure of speech in a rhetoric spoken/sung by the urban romantic. The peasant is equated with ideas about tradition, craft, timelessness. The stability offered by tradition is invoked as a remedy against the turbulence of modern times. Like the habitant, the peasant immigrant becomes a representative of folklore, just as the prairies metamorphose into a pastoral Eden.

A good example of this is the collaborative work of Victoria Hayward (1876-?) and Edith S. Watson (1861-1943). Hayward and Watson who began working together in 1912, and continued as a team for more than thirty years, collaborated on photographically illustrated stories for the popular

91 Leo Marx, The Machine in the Garden, Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America (New York: Oxford University Press, 1964), 6: "The soft veil of nostalgia that hangs over our urbanized landscape is largely a vestige of the once dominant image of an undefiled, green republic, a quiet land of forests, villages, and farms dedicated to the pursuit of happiness."

press. Watson produced the photographs that accompanied the texts written by Hayward. Their work thus falls within a third category (i.e., other than government-sponsored texts and photographs, and social reformist literature) in which the representation of immigrants is central. Hayward's texts, illustrated by Watson's photographs, can best be described as socially-uplifting stories, meant to educate the middle-class, urban reader to the multi-ethnic fabric of Canadian rural life. Their work was a celebration of folk culture and a conscious effort to save traditional handicraft skills from extinction. It is significant that these stories were produced at the end of the War years; Hayward's response to the 'war effort' is the urgent appeal to national heritage. With words that evoke feminine virtues of nurturing and endurance, the book focuses on the role of women in the war effort. But it is rural women who are given attention and honour, while disparaging references are made to middle-class, non-working women. One wonders how Hayward and Watson would classify their own profession?

The work of Watson is representative of that of many other middle-class photographers of her day, many of them

93 Hayward and Watson published for a variety of magazines as well as for commercial companies such as the C.P.R., and the Methodist and Baptist Churches, see: Rooney, "Edith S. Watson", 48.

94 Hayward and Watson also worked for commercial companies, including the C.P.R., Ibid.
women. Her representations of Canadian rural life, seen in relation to immigration issues, function - in relation to Hayward's text - within an intricate set of relationships between discourses of pictorialist aesthetics, the photography industry, and the position of middle-class women in early twentieth-century Canada. They may therefore be examined as paradigmatic examples of a wealth of similar works produced by individuals operating within comparable parameters. And before the images themselves are examined at greater length, the discourses within which they were produced must be briefly considered.

Like other photographers whose work relied on the contemporary conventions of pictorialism, Watson owed much to the successful industrialization of the camera industry, which allowed the picture press and movie business to flourish. The development of the hand-held camera and mass-production of film and prints, was the key to George Eastman Co.'s success within the highly competitive field of amateur photography. With the advent of dry plates in the 1880's, factory-produced photographic supplies began to supplement the manually-directed practice of the amateur and to a lesser extent the studio photographer. By appropriating much of the control photographers had earlier exercised over their materials, Eastman's method of centralizing camera manufacture and picture processing virtually assured the client's dependence and consequent consumer loyalty. In exchange, the Eastman Co.
offered a simplified technology that, while it was severely limited in terms of image quality, promised to be "easy enough for a child to use."\textsuperscript{95} For the amateur Sunday photographer who, with Brownie in hand, set out to make Kodaks for the family album\textsuperscript{96}, and on occasion a pretty picture, the issues that troubled the artists were, if not unknown, at least irrelevant. The amateur's primary concern was the historicization of the family; technical considerations were left to the factory to attend to. Composition of the image, often influenced by chance and constrained by the limitations of the apparatus, was loosely guided by conventional pictorial notions.

Eastman's clever approach to manufacturing was extended to the use of aggressive advertising campaigns which guaranteed low-cost, stress-free photography - "you press the shutter, we do the rest."\textsuperscript{97} The assurance of a manageable, unobtrusive technology compatible with the pace and interests of middle-class family life allowed for the exploitation of a newly-targeted clientele - women and children. The family became not only the subject of the Kodak snapshot, but also the object of the corporate gaze. Indeed, photographic images,

\textsuperscript{95} \textbf{The Kodak Primer} (Rochester New York: The Eastman Dry Plate and Film Co., 1888), n.p.

\textsuperscript{96} "Kodaks" and "Kodakery" were contemporary terms for snapshots and snapshot-taking. The Brownie, patented 1900, was developed especially for children by the Eastman Kodak Co.

\textsuperscript{97} \textbf{The Kodak Primer} n.p.
whether as snapshots or front-page material, proved to be a most suitable product in the era of free-wheeling individualism and *laissez-faire* capitalism.

Women, the prime audience for whom Kodak advertisements were designed (as evidenced in the "Kodak Girl") entered into the field of photographic journalism in the same way that they participated as writers for magazines for which, again, they were also an important new audience. Women like Edith Watson photographed for women, just as women like Victoria Hayward wrote for other women about "womanly" things – social reform, child welfare, education, health and travel, and immigrant aid. For these middle-class women, educated,

98 The Kodak girl: at the turn of the century, Kodak ads often employed the image of a slim, smartly dressed young woman with a camera in hand.

The Kodak Girl
She is delicate and sweet;
She is pretty and petite;
Her hair is either fluffly or in curl;
And a man with any taste
Would go far to clasp her waist;
While her dainty ankles make your senses whirl.

socially engaged, but excluded from professions that offered
them the chance to wield direct power, journalism and press
photography offered an avenue into the world of
professionalism. As authors for popular magazines like The
Canadian Magazine, women penned stories that ran a fine line
between fiction and reportage; the stories, drawn from current
social issues, were intended as uplifting moral parables for
the socially-concerned, politically-aware modern women.

To understand the relationship between social issues and
subject matter in fiction and pictorialist photography one
must examine the social meaning of pictorialist photography
as it was practised by photographers. Pictorialism as a Fine
Art movement occurred between the late 1880's and the pre-
First World War period; but its popular existence lasted much
longer, and it is thanks to the amateur artists that
pictorialism as a photographic style became so pervasive as
to have become, today, closely associated with this era. The
ideological importance of pictorialism is that it appeared at
the same time that a 'save the family/damn the machine'
sentiment was growing within middle-class social conscience.
Amateur artists, for the most part, belonged to the middle-
class; it was they who made up the ranks of the art clubs and
associations, within which the theories of fine art were
popularized and colloquially translated. It was also this same
aesthetically-conscious group who sometimes forayed into the
field of journalism and social reform activism.
However, in opposition to the needs of the 'Kodaker', the pictorial artist's primary intent was not to commemorate the social moment but rather to transcend it; not to take (imprint) a picture of the event, but to transform the event into a picture. To attain this goal a plenitude of photographic art manuals existed, describing the rules of proper composition, lighting, pose, etc. To those who belonged to camera clubs the competitive challenge of juried exhibitions emphasized the need to excel at technique.

For example the work of Arthur S. Goss (1881-1940)\(^{100}\), a prominent member of the art photography scene and active member of the Toronto Camera Club, shows his familiarity with the pictorialist aesthetic. In Child and Nurse Goss displays his knowledge of pictorialist technique; the figures are awash in a luminous glow that connotes ideas about purity and innocence. The modernist framing, that allows only a partial glimpse of the woman, focuses attention on the proximity of the two figures to each other, their similar tonality of shimmering white, and the gesture of holding hands (ill.12). But the photograph is not only about an idealized vision of childhood; it is also about motherhood, femininity and

\(^{100}\) See Koltun, 312-313; Greenhill and Birrell, 127-128, 146; and, Market Gallery, Arthus S. Goss, City Photographer: Works by Toronto's Official Photographer 1911-1940 (Toronto: City of Toronto Archives, 1980). A future study of the two aspects - art and documentary - of Goss's photographic career should prove to be a valuable addition to Canadian photographic criticism.
tradition (the daughter will one day become a woman/caretaker/mother herself). Although *Child and Nurse* is an 'art photograph', its content reflects the interests of the middle-class woman's concern with protecting the status of the nuclear family. In this light, Goss's photograph may be seen as an aestheticized Kodak snapshot of domestic life. This aspect of pictorialist photography legitimated art by embedding morality within aesthetics. By making the ideals of social life and art similar to each other, art appeared democratized or, in other words, de-politicized. Thus, as a sanctioned form of self-expression pictorialist art photography became an adjunct to middle-class cultural life. Once an art style practiced by an elite minority, pictorialist photography was absorbed into middle-class life as a "hobby" or socially condoned pleasurable activity.¹⁰¹

Goss' use of pictorialism as an expression of middle-class values and virtues was adopted by artists like Edith Watson, and was joined to Victoria Hayward's prose (with which it shared much) in their book *Romantic Canada* (1922) - a book in which the discourses of photograph technology, the position and concerns of middle-class women, and pictorialist photography intersected and were brought to bear on the

---

connected issues of Canadian-ness and immigration. In *Romantic Canada* a major cause of urban social poverty (i.e., the massive numbers of immigrants who drifted from agricultural areas to urban centres because of unemployment) is abscented from the portrayal of immigrant farmers (and other rural types). Hayward and Watson chose to bypass urban scenes for bucolic tableaus of the Canadian countryside. The book is a pictorialist work both in its photographic style and its literary portrayal of rural peoples as symbols of an ideal and blissful, domesticated world.

That reviewers referred to the book as a travel book testifies to its middle-class orientation. *Romantic Canada* is, in fact, a collection of articles which first appeared in *The Canadian Magazine*, a general interest publication.102 The tradition of the picturesque is evident in the curious blend of a popularly styled ethnography and travel guide, perhaps reflecting the era's belief that enjoyment must always be underscored by humanitarian concern, thereby securing social conscience as a policing agent of pleasurable activities. Significantly, *Romantic Canada's* ethnographic aspirations are acknowledged in the book's preface, through a comparison to the work of folklorist Marius Barbeau. This reference did not

---

102 Material in *Romantic Canada* appeared in article format in *The Canadian Magazine* between 1918-1925 (see bibliography for list of articles). However, there is indication that at least some of the photographs may have been made as early as 1913: see, the entry for accession no. 1989-120, Watson, Edith S., Documentary Art and Photography, National Archives of Canada.
go unnoticed by reviewers, nonetheless, Watson's photographs were criticized by some for having an "evil desire to see Millets and Breton scenes, and high-land crofters in fact to see through other eyes instead of her own eyes".  

The disappearance of artisanal skills due to the factory-driven migration of rural people to the urban centres provides the impetus to Romantic Canada's associative reference with the art of the Barbizon painter Millet. Hayward's text is sympathetically illustrated by Watson's pictorialist-styled photographs, in which the emphasis is on atmospheric tonality, together with a traditional approach to genre subject matter, in a way that visually underscores the eulogizing tone of Hayward's prose. In one sense they are typical of nineteenth-century social reformists' concerns with preserving traditional family life; it is not unlikely that Hayward and Watson were familiar with the literature of the social reform movement and with its strategic use of photographs as propaganda tools for altering public opinion. But the stylized prose and images indicate that the authors were attempting to produce a poetic interpretation of rural life in Canada, rather than a document of social science. Unlike books by

103 The Times Literary Supplement, December 20, 1923, 111 4.  
104 Jean Francois Millet's (1814-75) preferred subject was the life and labour of French peasants. His best-known work is Angelus (1857-9).
reformists who focused on city slums, Romantic Canada, because of its exclusion of the city or any signs of poverty or illness, remains, as the title of the book concedes, a sentimental attempt to weave a Canadian identity from the threads of disappearing and diverse folk cultures in a modern, industrialized nation.

The work of Hayward and Watson therefore relied heavily on the romantic idea of the immigrant peasant as a vestige of a golden past. In *pulling flax* (ill.13), a Doukhobour woman, photographed through the pictorialist atmospheric 'screen', becomes a living relic of a collective memory. As in Barthes' order of myth, in this timeless image of agrarian life, farm work is represented as a elemental, natural activity completely divested of historical contingencies. The female figure bends forward in an arc that mimics the direction of the grain and the curves of the folds of her dress that almost seems to bind her; her figure is submerged beneath the horizon line so that she shares the space of earth and not sky. Faceless and stooped, her representation opposes government advertisements which show men standing shoulders above the grain or sitting on threshing machines\(^{105}\) (ill.1, 15). In terms

---

105 Illustration no. 15 also appears in an article on Canada by John Vanderpant (1884-1939) for the Dutch magazine *Op de Hoogte* (April, 1913) for which he worked as a photo-journalist. Between 1911 and 1914, when he settled in Canada, he prepared features on Canada for Dutch magazines. In 1912 he was hired to do emigration propaganda in the Netherlands for the Canadian immigration department. Vanderpant became a
of the ideology of the conservative side of the women's suffrage movement, Hayward's peasant women appear as images of pre-industrial womanhood, natural and authentic:

Thus one gets from them in the first moments of meeting an impression of the spirit of permanency and stability, qualities greatly needed in a newly-settled country. The West far from seeming crude and new appears old, established and time-softened as you look into their strong faces and note their capable hands and sturdy bodies.  

The peasant woman farmer, habitan tes and Acadiensnes conveniently fit a pictorial model established in the nineteenth century by Millet:

These women are not posed but are working just as the artist happened to come upon them...Not the twentieth century, not Canada, lay before us, but the Old Testament days and lands. Yet Millet, too, and France were here, before us....  

A celebration of the artless as art, of craft over technology, also corresponded to the tenets of pictorialist aesthetics. But ideas about craft also agreed with nationalist longing for stability, history and a return to an Arcadian past and a pure landscape. This was an ambition not only of Canadian

prominent member of the west coast art community and leading photographer during the 1920s-30s : Charles C. Hill, John Vanderpant Photographs, Photographies (Ottawa: National Gallery of Canada, 1976), 14. The illustration is interesting in that it is completely typical of promotional scenes of grain farming in its frieze-like placement of figures in a field of grain.


intellectuals and artists but also the directive of the province of Québec whose repatriation project attempted to secure a cultural future by way of the past.

The past as a refuge was at odds with the official promotional images projected by government brochures. In these, the promise of tomorrow and belief in a prosperous future motivated the literature that suggested success is always the result of hard work and good citizenship. In images of tomorrow, the pilgrim's reward is guaranteed - the modern house, the bountiful harvest, the boom town; progress is as inevitable as the "Evolution of the Prairie by the Plow". ¹⁰⁸ For some, like the popular writer Ralf Connor, the West represented renewal and regeneration for the alienated Canadian for whom modernity offered nothing more than the stagnation of city life. ¹⁰⁹ A return to small-town values was expressed by writers such as Stephen Leacock and represented the voice of a part of the Canadian intellectual community for whom farming stood not for economic progress but as a symbol of the traditional values of home and community. ¹¹⁰

¹⁰⁸ This is the title of a popular immigration pamphlet, Craig Brown and Cook, 60.

¹⁰⁹ See Stich for an examination of literary representation of immigrants.

¹¹⁰ Mary Vipond, "The Nationalist Network: English Canada's Intellectuals and Artists in the 1920's," Canadian Review of Studies in Nationalism 7,1 (Spring 1980): 32-52. Vipond suggests that within the community of intellectuals and artists the post-war climate in Canada was one of
Hayward envisioned a Canada that was motherly and nurturing and the prairies as the feminine heart of the country. For Hayward the prairies became an iconic representation of an emerging post-war Canadian identity which she perceived as distinctly feminine:

One conceives this western city of Canada (Winnipeg), from the viewpoint of a sculptor, not as a "strong man" but as a woman, eternally feminine, with trailing garments, with the immediately surrounding country out and beyond as far to the north and west as Canada goes, extending the hands of Romance, to cling fast to her skirts; as a figure of a mother held in leash and hardly able for the many loving hands of clinging children.\(^{111}\)

But Hayward also envisions a Canada that is psychically integrated, feminine and masculine, northern and southern in a metaphorical union of pine and palm: "There is a psychology and powerful suggestion in linking up the fronded palm, fanning beside the Gulf, with the sturdy evergreen of the North."\(^{112}\) In Hayward's prose and Watson's photographs the progress towards redemption is a temporal shift backwards in collective memory and laterally, away from the present disillusionment with promises of technology, though curiously scientific management techniques were used to promote their interests throughout the entire nation; it is interesting to note the Canadian Magazine was publishing articles about the Group of Seven at the same time as those by Hayward.

\(^{111}\) Hayward and Watson, 191.

\(^{112}\) Ibid., 197.
problems of modern life. For a disenchanted middle-class, Romantic Canada offered solace and the promise of renewal through images of a romanticized past, a past in which immigrant farmers were re-presented as projections of longing. 113

113 Popular writers such as Ralf Connor promoted the West as a romantic, adventurous experience for urban easteners.
CONCLUSION

A great deal of research is still required in order to trace the interstices of issues of social identity and photographic representations and their relationship to discussions about ethnicity and nationalism. An exploration of these paths will certainly present new interpretations and insights into the nature of the photographic meaning of early twentieth-century pictures in which immigrants are represented.

Although there is a rich body of sources available on the American experience\(^1\), it is important to note, in consideration of the limitations within which this study devolved, that very little research exists of the relationship between photography, immigration and the social issues in Canada, in the early part of the current century. Two issues of Ovo Magazine were devoted to immigration to Canada (1977) and emigration from Québec to New England (1982). Although photographs from the period covered by the thesis are reproduced in the former, they are not actually discussed other than in a brief excerpt from Minotto.\(^2\)

To date, most of the photographic historical research

---

\(^1\) Stange, see Chapters 1 and 2, pp. 1-87. It is important to note that the social reform movement in Canada in the early part of the century relied heavily on American sources (see thesis Chapter 111b).

\(^2\) Ovo Magazine No 27/28 (1977); Vol 12 No 46 (1982).
in Canada has dealt with either landscape or studio portraiture\(^ {116} \); and virtually none has been undertaken that deals with early social documentary as it dealt immigration and the urban poor, whose story is intimately tied to that of immigration history. It should be noted that existing research relies heavily on archivists (who are responsible for much of the initial research) and by the accessibility to well-documented collections as, for example, the Notman Archives. This is why, recent studies in photographic history have tended to expand in areas in which extensive research has already been made.

This thesis is a preliminary study which attempts to bridge two areas of academic research, Canadian immigration history and Canadian photographic history, which, to date, have practically remained mutually exclusive areas of study, notwithstanding the fact that academic research into ethnic social history in Canada is an invaluable source of scholarly investigation. The current state of related academic studies of Canadian photographic history lags far behind. The history of photography as it relates to ethnic history in Canada, has yet to be explored for its wealth of archival material that remains, to a large extent, unexploited. Much of the groundbreaking work accomplished by the first generation of

\(^ {116} \) Research in the history of visual representation of Canada's First Peoples is an important area of study that has recently begun to 'emerge'.

78
photographic historians, who were employed for the most part, as archivists in public institutions, has tended to focus solely on the collection of biographical data on photographers and photographic firms. Unfortunately, current photographic historical criticism remains at an impasse. This situation can be explained not only by the scarcity of critical writings on Canadian photographic history, but also by the dearth of actual archival research being undertaken by the second generation writers on photography.\footnote{117}

The frustration engendered by this state of affairs in photographic history writing proves exasperating when one is confronted by the wealth of material, produced by Canadian social and labour historians, which exists near at hand but remains unbridged. This explains why, the major historical reference sources in Canadian photographic history, such as Greenhill and Birrell's \textit{Canadian Photography: 1839-1920} do not consider socio-historical implications. Recently, however, research in photographic history which includes discussion of nationalism and challenges modernist readings in landscape photography, has appeared. These writings redefine landscape within the context of tourism and related issues of property.

\footnote{117 One reason why research has slowed may be attributable to the fact that the economic euphoria within which the arts were situated in the late 1960's and early 1970's no longer exists; another may be that much of the revisionist history has dealt with the nineteenth century and the pictorialist work of the early twentieth century appears to remain overshadowed by avant-garde art.}
and power (Miles) and economic greed as the nexis of immigration propaganda (Bell). It is interesting to note that in both Miles' and Bell's work, Dennis Reid and Stanley Triggs are disparaged for being modernists, even though Reid and Triggs remain valuable and rare sources of information. However, recent revisionist historical studies have yet to extend importance to that other train traveller, the third-class passenger, the officially unsolicited class of immigrant farmers who became the objects of a different, but related, kind of campaign to lay claim to unknown territory. The present study is an attempt to temporarily redirect the discussion of nationalism, a longstanding preoccupation in Canadian art history, away from images of the land to images of people.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS


Bruce, Jean. The Last Best West. Toronto, Montreal, Winnipeg, Vancouver: Fitzhenry & Whiteside Limited (In association with the Muliculturalism Programme, Department of Secretary of State), 1976.


Lake St. John Repatriation and Colonization Society. *"Annual Report presented at the annual general meeting at the Private Bills Hall, Government Buildings, Quebec, Wednesday April 1, 1903.*


**ARTICLES**


---------. "Romantic Canada." *Canadian Historical Review* iv, 1 (March 1923) : 76.


-----. "Wayside Crosses and Garden Shrines". *Canadian Magazine* December 1920 : 137-144.


Larivière, Céline. "La Photographie de reportage au service de la colonisation," *Archives* 11.3 (August, 1979) : 45-50.


**UNPUBLISHED THESIS / DISSERTATION**


NEWSPAPERS

The Globe Toronto, Saturday March 6 1909, 14.


UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPTS IN PUBLIC ARCHIVES


UNPUBLISHED PAMPHLETS

The Kodak Primer. Rochester: The Eastman Dry Plate and Film Co., 1888.

PUBLIC RECORDS

Public Archives of Canada. Department of Interior, Department of Immigration and Colonization, RG 76.
LIST OF ILLUSTRATION SOURCES


2. "German immigrants, Quebec". Greenhill, Ralph, and Andrew Birrell. plate 86.


4. "Immigrants to be deported, Quebec". Archives national de Québec à Montréal, phototheque.

5. "A boy who was given a chance: (a) Taken August 1st, 1902. (b) Taken February 5th, 1903". Woodsworth, J.S. p. 53.

6. "Beginning life in the new land: (a) Ruthenian wedding group. (b) Lithuanian wedding group". Woodsworth, J.S. p. 103.

7. "(a) Galician children with some of our W.M.S. workers in Edmonton. (b) A kitchengarden class of foreign children at All People's Mission, Winnipeg". Woodsworth, J.S. p. 207.


9. "Main dining room, immigration centre, Quebec". Archives national de Québec à Montréal, phototheque.

10. Lake St. John Repatriation and Colonization Dept. 1903, cover.

11. "Spinning, Cap à l'Aigle, Quebec". Triggs, Stanley. p. 95.


14. "Fit Subject for a Millet". 
Hayward, Victoria, and Edith S. Watson. p. 40.

15. "Western Canada" C.P.R. Pamphlet, C.P.R. Archives.
1. "Grading Machine at Work"
William Macfarlane Notman, 1904
2. "German immigrants, Quebec"
Probably by W.J. Topley, c. 1911
3. "Chadwick Sandels, Quebec"
Probably by W.J. Topley, c. 1911
4. "Immigrants to be deported, Quebec"
   by J. Woodruif, c. 1908
5. "A boy was given a chance:
a) Taken August 1st, 1902 b) Taken February 5th, 1903"
6. "Beginning life in a new land:  
a) Ruthenian wedding group b) Lithuanian wedding group"
7. "a) Galician children, Edmonton
b) A kitchengarden class of foreign children, Winnipeg"
8. "Mending day in a Chinese girls' home, Victoria"
9. "Main dining room, immigration centre, Quebec"
W.J. Topley, c. 1910

98
10. "Lake St. John Repatriation and Colonization Dept. Report, 1903 (cover)"
11. "Spinning, Cap à l'Aigle, Quebec"
William Macfarlane Notman, c. 1898

100
12. "Nurse and Child"
Arthur S. Goss, 1906

101
13. "Pulling Flax"
Edith S. Watson (1922)

102
14. "Fit Subject for a Millet"
   Edith S. Watson (1922)
EXCELLENT SERVICE. LOW COLONIST RATES.
ANY AGENT WILL GLADLY FURNISH PARTICULARS.

15. C.P.R. Pamphlet (c. 1911-14)