Understanding Issues of Oppression Related to Western Symphonic Instruments used in Music Therapy

Shalini Persaud

A Thesis

in

The Department

of

Creative Arts Therapies

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

for the Degree of Master of Arts

Concordia University

Montreal, Quebec, Canada

April 2018

CONCORDIA UNIVERSITY

School of Graduate Studies

This is to certify that the thesis prepared

By: Shalini Persaud

Entitled: Understanding Issues of Oppression Related to Western Symphonic Instruments used in Music Therapy

and submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts (Creative Arts Therapies, Music Therapy Option)

complies with the regulations of the University and meets the accepted standards with respect to originality and quality.

Signed by the final Examining Committee:

_____ Chair
Sandra L. Curtis

_____ Examiner
Guylaine Vaillancourt

_____ Examiner
Kristen Corey

_____ Supervisor
Sandra L. Curtis

Approved by _____
Yehudit Silverman, Chair, Department of Creative Arts Therapies

_____2018 _____
Rebecca Taylor Duclos, Dean, Faculty of Fine Arts

ABSTRACT

Understanding Issues of Oppression Related to Western Symphonic Instruments used in Music Therapy

Shalini Persaud

This study made use of philosophical research to make a case for the importance of understanding the issues of oppression related to the instruments used in music therapy sessions. Literature was reviewed to summarize the history of Western symphonic instruments (specifically brass instruments) and how they have been and continue to be sites of marginalization. The main findings from the literature were related to gender discrimination and indicated that the challenges women experience in brass playing are related to physical appearance, physical abilities, and representation in brass sections. Though small in number, some studies have indicated that brass instruments are also sites for issues of race and sexuality. The findings were analyzed through an approach drawn from material culture to show how instruments, as objects, influence people, the music therapy context, and the client's social world. Suggestions for a more informed use of musical instruments included addressing social issues with clients in sessions, conducting personal research on instruments used in sessions, and exploring social issues related to instruments in supervision.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many thanks go to Sandi Curtis, my supervisor and really all of my professors at Concordia whose patience and openness provided me with the support to explore this topic and conduct this research. I was given the space to develop as a music therapist here, explore a new field of deep interest and importance to me, and share that passion with all of you.

I am very thankful for the many new friendships I have developed through this program. It was through our discussions that I was led to this topic and it was our continuous conversations that motivated and helped me navigate the writing process. I am super excited to see how we all grow as friends, musicians, and music therapists.

To my friends and family, thank you for your endless support, validation, and love. You have all pushed me to continue striving for what I want in life and helped me find purpose in all the things that I do. I am so lucky to have all of you in my life.

My deepest gratitude goes towards my mom. Mom, you have always encouraged me to go for it and pushed me to believe that anything is possible. You have only ever had positive words for me and always believed in my abilities. You really are an amazing woman and role model, one that is so incredibly strong, smart, funny, and filled with love. I just want to say that I love you and thank you so much for everything that you do, for being so amazingly amazing, and for inspiring me to be a better person every day.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1. Introduction

Relevance to Music Therapy

In a publication addressing feminist, sociological perspectives on music therapy, Adrienne (2006) maintains that the practices of music therapy influence and are influenced by the politics that govern the society in which clients live. Specifically, music therapists use music and instruments that were developed within the context and culture of particular societies and as a result, societal issues may be implicitly embedded within the music and instruments being used in clinical practice (Adrienne, 2006; Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015). This can include issues related to forms of oppression that continue to exist in today's world in similar or different ways (Adrienne, 2006). For example, limitations in musical engagement due to one's gender or race. As a result, it is possible that issues of oppression related to instruments used in clinical practice could inadvertently be perpetuated with clients (Adrienne, 2006; Rolvsjord, 2006).

While Adrienne, Halstead, and Rolvsjord make the case for the influence of oppression related to instruments in music therapy, there is little other research available on this topic. Existing literature on issues of oppression related to musical instruments used in clinical practice specifically examines the voice and the electric guitar (Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015; Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013; Scrine, 2016). However, there is as yet no music therapy literature that closely examines issues of oppression related to Western symphonic instruments, instruments which have been used clinically because of specific musical characteristics considered to be inherently therapeutic (Loombe, Rodgers, Tomlinson, & Oldfield, 2015).

Personal Relevance

My interest in this topic stems from my experiences of privilege and marginalization as an educated, able-bodied, middle-class, cis-gendered woman of colour, and how those experiences influence and shape my relationship with the French horn, my primary instrument, and my identity. While learning to play this instrument, I was conscious of the identity differences between myself and my peers. I felt that those differences both expanded and limited my learning and abilities as a horn player. For example, I was often lucky to play in sections that had a fairly even number of women

and men which eased my comfort and helped me recognize my abilities. However, I was also often conscious of the other aspects of my identity when in musical contexts which sometimes detracted from my sense of belonging in music contexts and other non-music contexts. Exploring feminist theories helped me to better understand my experiences, where such experiences start, how they continue to exist, and how they might be addressed.

In reviewing the literature, I discovered several publications that explored how gender is associated with symphonic brass instruments and how such associations have remained fairly stable since the late 1970s (Hallam, Rogers, & Creech, 2008; Abeles, 2009). These findings indicate that oppressive issues related to instruments are not isolated incidents of the past but continue to exist and influence people in the present day. I hope to be able to address these issues within my future practice by embracing an anti-oppressive approach to ensure that I use the French horn in ways that effect positive change for my clients. Furthermore, I hope that by addressing this topic, I might provide an impetus for other music therapists to reflect more deeply on the instruments that they use in sessions and how they use them.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this thesis was to make a case for the importance of music therapists' awareness about issues of oppression related to Western symphonic instruments and to explore how these issues might be addressed in clinical practice.

Assumptions

I assume that a heightened awareness of oppressive issues related to Western symphonic instruments could help music therapists use these instruments in more knowledgeable and constructive ways thus lessening risk of harm and/or inadvertent exposure to oppression for clients.

Key Terms

Anti-oppressive music therapy approach is defined by Baines (2014) as: "discerning the health impact of the social and political status of service users, advocating for service users, and working to mediate oppressive social and political structures that negatively impact health" (p. 183). *Marginalization* is a process in which certain groups

of people are excluded from society or social opportunities based on various aspects of their identity (Dean, 2007). *Oppression* is a systematic force that divides individuals into either privileged groups or deprived groups. The forces restrict choices and decisions of the oppressed or deprived group and thus shape the life experiences of both groups (Frye, 2000). *Western symphonic instruments* are instruments that have been introduced to the Western orchestra by the 20th century. These include strings (violin, viola, cello, and double bass), woodwinds (oboe, flute, bassoon, and clarinet), brass (trumpet, French horn, trombone, and tuba), and percussion (Naxos, 2016).

Research Questions

Primary research question. Why is it important for music therapists to be aware of issues of oppression related to the Western symphonic instruments that they may use in sessions?

Subsidiary research questions. (a) What issues of oppression are associated with Western brass symphonic instruments? (b) What are the implications of these issues in clinical music therapy? (c) Considering that these issues are perpetuated through the uninformed use of Western symphonic instruments, how might music therapists address these issues with clients?

Chapter Summary

Chapter 1 provides a brief introduction into the significance of this study. Chapter 2 is a literature review that describes current research in the field of music therapy and the gap in the literature. Chapter 3 outlines the methodology used to gather and organize information to address the research question. Chapter 4 examines the history of brass instruments and the current issues of oppression related to such instruments that continue to exist. Implications for music therapy and recommendations for a more informed use of musical instruments in practice are also included in this chapter. Chapter 5 includes a summary, limitations, and suggestions for future research.

Chapter 2. Literature Review

From a sociological standpoint, Adrienne (2006) indicates that music therapy, and the various types of work that occur within it, influences the sociopolitical world. However, discourse in music education on the sociopolitical context of music – an important tool in music therapy – is limited (Scrine, 2016). A potential reason for the usual neglect of the sociopolitical context of music in music education is that it is often approached from an aesthetics perspective (Scrine, 2016). This restricts the discourse of political context of music among students thus continuing the patriarchal perspectives of the time (Scrine, 2016). However, existing literature shows how music and music therapy influences and is influenced by society.

Edwards and Hadley (2007) take note of how the various professional practices of music therapy are social and political in their very nature, thus supporting Adrienne's (2006) perspective. For instance, when professionals engage in debating theory and publishing research, they influence the social world of the readers by challenging and potentially changing how they think and interact with others, notably their interaction with clients (Edwards & Hadley, 2007). Adrienne (2006) also notes that the work that occurs between music therapists and clients shapes each person's understanding of the constructs of race, class, and gender within the sociopolitical environment. If music therapists are not aware of the nature of these constructs, it is possible that their sessions may contain methods or materials which uphold oppressive aspects of the constructs and inadvertently resocialize clients to them (Adrienne, 2006).

In critically examining the political discourse of gender, Rolvsjord (2006) identifies the ways in which music therapy discourse resocializes clients to current gender norms. She questions the extent to which music therapy discourse maintains current gender values through the use of musical objects such as instruments, genres, and gendered metaphors that describe music (Rolvsjord, 2006). Specifically, Rolvsjord (2006) explores the term "holding mother" (p. 318) used in music therapy discourse. The term "holding mother" is currently used to describe qualities of the therapist and music as holding and containing, qualities which resemble a mother (Rolvsjord, 2006). However, directly referring to mothers in identifying these qualities excludes other qualities that women have and the fact that other genders have these qualities (Rolvsjord, 2006). A

direct reference to mothers continues to perpetuate the historical gender role of mothers as women who have no personal desires and are only there to care for others (Rolvsjord, 2006). The breakdown of this term shows how "sites of power are concealed through norms that structure relationships as "natural," as a given" (Hadley, 2006, p. 15). This example shows how easily music therapists can influence a client's understanding of social constructs – which clients are viewed as having trouble with – which adds weight to the importance of music therapists gaining a solid, foundational knowledge base of these social constructs (Adrienne, 2006).

When looking at the socioeconomic status and well-being of women, Adrienne (2006) concludes that the current values of gender are not beneficial to women. Thinking of this perspective within a music therapy context, she asks "what is the music therapy experience reflecting back to our clients about gender?" (Adrienne, 2006, p. 42). If music therapists use music as the primary tool in their work with clients, they need to examine the social aspects of the music to ensure that gendering does not continue (Adrienne, 2006). Close examination of the gendered associations of the music used in sessions is needed if changes in values are to be made (Adrienne, 2006). In examining an approach to feminist music therapy as developed by Curtis (1996), the need for change and the path that leads there, as specified by Adrienne, may be realized.

An underlying principle of a feminist music therapy approach is the development of a knowledge base of the sociopolitical context of men and women through critically examining social constructs (Curtis, 1996, 2006, 2012). The constructs that are of particular importance to this approach include power and privilege, as well as oppressors such as race and class, and how they influence the marginalization of groups of people (Curtis, 1996, 2006, 2012). The two central components of this approach are to examine gender and power with clients and to engage in political activism with clients (Curtis, 2006, 2012). In developing the working components of a feminist music therapy approach, Curtis (1996, 2006) noted necessary transformations of the client-therapist relationship, the therapist, goals, and techniques in order to align with feminist principles. She recommended shifting towards a client-therapist "relationship which is equal in respect and worth" (Curtis, 1996, p. 181), while trying to diminish the power differential. She also noted that therapists must work on their personal self through analysis of social

constructs, making changes towards equality, and engaging in social activism (Curtis, 1996, 2006). A number of goals were outlined including addressing pathology as sociopolitical, valuing women and their voices, focusing on women's issues, examining power and gender dynamics, engaging in social change, and striving for equal client-therapist relationships (Curtis, 1996, 2006). Curtis (1996, 2006) also identified a number of music therapy techniques that would address these goals, notable ones being lyric analysis and songwriting to analyze social constructs of power and gender.

York and Curtis (2015) further describe the application of lyric analysis and songwriting with women survivors of abuse. They also suggest the use of techniques such as receptive music therapy and improvisation to address feminist music therapy goals when working with women survivors of abuse (York & Curtis, 2015). In light of these approaches that consider and address the social context of clients, other elements of music therapy practice are beginning to be critically examined through a social lens. Specifically, the critical analysis of music therapy practice has extended to objects, which are made and used by people thus reflect and shape the social norms of their culture (Dant, 1999).

Adrienne (2006) explores the tangible objects that are used within music therapy and what such objects may reflect about the developing values of the music therapy culture. Objects identified include "the instruments, the printed music, the therapy room, the case notes" (Adrienne, 2006, p. 42) and were said to reflect music therapy's values of social constructs such as gender. Considering that musical instruments have a long-standing history outside of music therapy, Adrienne (2006) and Rolvsjord (2006) note that music instruments may contain associations from previous uses that may uphold oppressive perspectives, a claim can be supported by looking towards the field of material culture.

Material culture acknowledges that the assumption that people have complete agency in their use of objects may be correct in some aspects; however some argue that objects also have an effect on people (Woodward, 2007; Dant, 1999). As culture provides a basis for interpreting what physical properties of materials are meaningful or valuable, culture eventually becomes embedded in objects (Dant, 1999). Thus over time, objects themselves become symbols of culture and influence what the people of society deem

meaningful. Objects are also often used to mediate daily interactions between people and in this way, they provide a means of sharing or imparting one's personal values onto others (Dant, 1999). If objects can influence people in these ways, it would be important to gain awareness of how the instruments used in sessions are situated within a sociopolitical context and what aspects of social constructs they represent.

Halstead and Rolvsjord (2015) note that instruments found in Western cultures are often used by elite groups, but are also used in everyday life. They contend that learning about the cultural context of instruments provides insight into how clients and therapists engage in music therapy (Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015). Halstead and Rolvsjord (2015) looked at the literature on instruments – specifically electric guitar – and gender, and found that certain instruments were strongly associated with femininity and others with masculinity (Abeles & Porter, 1978; Doubleday, 2008). After a deeper search of how instruments are predominantly represented in society, they found that there is a dominance of male instrumentalists and concluded that the gender associations of instruments may restrict how people engage with an instrument (Doubleday, 2008; Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015).

Rolvsjord and Halstead (2013) looked at how society imposes gender on the voice and the implications this gendering has for music therapy. In reviewing the literature they found that male voices were associated with masculinity while female voices were associated with femininity (Feinberg, Jones, Little, Burt, & Perrett, 2005a; Feinberg, et al., 2005b). Scrine (2016) also examined the gendering of the voice. In her writing, she summarizes Lucy Green's perspective that singing, in the absence of technology, supports the continuation of the misogynistic perspective that women are considered unable to operate technology and must look to men for help (Scrine, 2016).

In response to the issues concerning gendering of instruments, some solutions have been suggested (Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013; Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015; Scrine, 2016). Halstead and Rolvsjord (2015) propose engaging in social action to address gender stereotypes. In practice, this might include challenging how gender stereotypes are addressed in music education and therapy settings and increasing social visibility of clients and therapists who play instruments that are typically associated with the opposite gender (Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015). In addition, the authors stress the importance of

understanding the implications of using gendered instruments in sessions (Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015). They recommend thinking about how the very use of gendered instruments by clients could reinforce current gender norms or break them, how goals could reinforce current gender norms or break them, and how the use of such instruments could influence the power dynamic between therapist and client to be more equalitarian or hierarchical (Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015).

With regards to voice, it has been noted that the ways in which male and female voices are used in singing practices usually uphold gender norms but that there are situations where those norms are disrupted (Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013; Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015). An example of a disruption can be seen in the case of a female client with a low voice who began to use her voice after many years of being self-conscious about its low range (Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013). However, some questions can be raised regarding the effectiveness of disrupting gender roles in this way. These questions include: To what extent do these suggested solutions for females to enter roles usually dominated by males disrupt gender norms? If women are working to achieve what men have achieved, are they not upholding standards created by men? For instance, in the presented case, when the female client began to use her voice, a gender norm may have been upheld as the client began to use her voice while doing house work, a stereotypically feminine task (Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013). In the words of Rolvsjord (2006), "the challenge for the feminist music therapist must be to find non-gendered concepts to describe general human abilities" (p. 322).

Scrine (2016) suggested a focus that encompasses only the "essential and universal, or liberating and connecting qualities of music" (abstract, para. 1) for use in music therapy in order to overcome the traditional norms that result in oppression of marginalized groups. The suggested solution is similar to Adrienne's (2006) – using music that has been used to achieve social justice in the past – however, Scrine does not elaborate on what the universal qualities of music are, nor on how those qualities are conceptualized in a sociopolitical context.

Scrine (2016) also identifies a need for more musical role models that reflect a wider variety of identities, such as race and gender. Fulfilling this gap would provide more children with a variety of role models that they can look up to and identify with.

When looking at popular music literature, Maus (2011) concludes that historical summaries do not include information of the female singers in their timelines. This suggests that there have been many great female musicians but that they have not been documented, thus adding another level of change to Scrine's (2016) solution, where in addition to the need for more role models, there is also a need for society to be more inclusive towards who is acknowledged as a role model.

Although the music therapy literature is beginning to integrate research on the gendering of instruments used in clinical music therapy, such as voice and guitar, there is still little music therapy research that specifically addresses the gendering of Western symphonic instruments (Rolvsjord & Halstead, 2013; Halstead & Rolvsjord, 2015; Scrine, 2016). Continuing in practice without addressing these issues could potentially lead to music therapists perpetuating society's current gender roles. This could conflict with two of the three goals that underlie the various approaches to feminist therapy, "to eliminate the oppression of women; … and to enable women to deal with the internalization of this oppression" (Curtis, 2006, p. 229). In fact, if the music therapy discourse does not evolve and the un-informed use of musical objects continues in sessions, people might not even have the opportunity to gain awareness of how oppression is internalized in order to begin dealing with the internalization.

In light of the findings of this review of literature, the purpose of this research is to examine the gendered characteristics of Western symphonic instruments, the implications of using gendered Western instrument for clients without addressing issues, and potential ways symphonic instruments might be used to break social gender norms.

Chapter 3. Method

Design

Philosophy involves exploring and analyzing common assumptions about the world. As a result, some purposes of philosophy include gaining a better understanding of concepts, "knowledge, ethics, and aesthetics" (Stige & Strand, 2016, p. 1064). An additional function of philosophy is to develop new concepts that thoroughly integrate current social and political issues (Stige & Strand, 2016). Such concepts could lead to an increased awareness of the world and the creation of plans with objectives that target issues of the present day. In other words, the need for philosophy often arises within a cyclic process where: philosophy helps to clarify concepts; those concepts are then applied to practice; the practice produces new data; and finally, as the new data needs to be interpreted, philosophy is used to develop different concepts which help make sense of the new data (Aigen, 2005; Stige & Strand, 2016).

Philosophical thinking is relevant to music therapy as challenges that arise in the field are often philosophical in their nature (Stige & Strand, 2016). In order to apply a "philosophical [mode] of thinking" (Aigen, 2005, p. 526) to music therapy phenomena, philosophical inquiry is used as a methodology to conduct research in the field. According to Bruscia (as cited as personal communication in Aigen, 2005), philosophical inquiry allows us to "analyze and contextualize theory, research, and practice within the history of ideas" (p. 526-527). Philosophical inquiry was chosen for the present study to make a case for gaining awareness of the issues of oppression that might be related to the instruments used in music therapy sessions. To accomplish this, I examine how practices in music therapy perpetuate previous and current issues of oppression and explore potential ways of responsibly addressing those issues in clinical practice.

The specific components of this research design included: "evaluating and comparing theories, theoretical systems, and comprehensive philosophical systems of thought"; addressing "axiological" and "ethical issues"; and "presenting a philosophy" (Aigen, 2005, p. 530-534). Topics that was evaluated and compared included issues of oppression related to those instruments (Aigen, 2005). This process aimed to "[facilitate] communication between individuals from different theoretical traditions" (Aigen, 2005,

p. 530). as it demonstrated links between music therapy concepts and sociological and feminist concepts The axiological issue of "the role of music therapy in society" (Aigen, 2005, p. 533) was addressed by exploring how the use of Western symphonic instruments in clinical work inadvertently perpetuate issues of oppression that influence the society in which our clients live. In addition, an ethical issue was addressed by making the case that being informed of the issues of oppression related to the Western symphonic instruments "constitutes [a] moral action" (Aigen, 2005, p. 533) in clinical work. Finally, a philosophical approach was presented as the study introduced appropriate ways of addressing issues of oppression related to Western symphonic instruments used in clinical practice (Aigen, 2005).

Delimitations

This project delimited the research to addressing issues that were specifically and clearly related to Western symphonic brass instruments. Issues of oppression were not delimited to those that are gender specific; instead other issues such as those related to socioeconomic status and ethnicity were examined. Research was delimited to the years of 1975-2017 to include key sources in the review of gender and instruments. A limited number of sources outside of these years were included due to their relevance to this research.

Data Collection

The search engines used to gather data included ProQuest, EBSCO publishing, and Google Scholar. Publications were found in the following databases: JSTOR, eBook Collection, Academic Search Complete, America: History and Life, Art Full text, ERIC, PsychInfo, RILM, Education Source, LGBT Life with Full Text, Arts Premium Collection, ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, and CLUES. Peer-reviewed articles were found in music therapy journals including the *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy and Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy.* Peer-reviewed articles were also found in journals from related fields including music education, ethnomusicology, social science, and music psychology. In addition, data was collected by doing a hand search through scholarly books related to music therapy and material culture. Key terms used to search the databases included music therapy, musical instrument*, brass, femini*, female*,

women, gender, sex, race, racial, sexuality, stereotyp* class, socioeconomic, oppression, and intersectional*

Data Analysis

Data was first organized into key terms that emerged from the literature and then grouped into major themes and sub-categories. Then, the philosophical procedures of "exposing and evaluating underlying assumptions" and "relating ideas as systematic theory," were used to further analyze the literature (Aigen, 2005, p. 528-529).

The underlying assumptions regarding the therapeutic benefits of Western symphonic instruments and impact of music therapy on politics and society were exposed and evaluated (Aigen, 2005). Issues of oppression related to Western symphonic instruments and the ways in which these issues could be perpetuated within music therapy were identified thereby relating ideas or systems of thought of music therapy, sociology, feminism, and material culture as a unified systematic theory (Aigen, 2005).

Chapter 4. Results

Femininity and Musical Instruments

In the late 18th and early 19th centuries, the accepted activities for women and men influenced how they engaged in music (Gee, 2010). During the rise of the industrial economy, upper-class women were perceived as delicate since their domestic work, which was not assigned a wage, was not considered labour (Hersey, 2006). In addition, women were expected to maintain their physical appearance to ensure they could marry and have children as society thought that the purpose of a woman's life was to have and take care of a family (Jenkins, 2016). As a result of being perceived as delicate, or the weaker sex, and being required to maintain their physical appearance, upper-class women were expected to engage in musical activities that require little exertion (Gee, 2010). Singing and playing the keyboard or guitar were musical activities that naturally required minimal physical exertion and movement of the body and face, which as a result, enhanced femininity. If an instrument enhanced a woman's femininity, it was used to represent a woman's acceptable social identity. However, as evidenced in the following sections, brass instruments were thought to decrease femininity and thus were perceived as unacceptable instruments for women to play, a view that is also subtly present today.

Physical ability. In contrast to guitars and keyboards, brass instruments were associated with masculinity because they demand a high level of exertion (Macleod, 1993). As women were perceived as delicate, society thought that women did not have the stamina to successfully play brass. The belief that women were weaker than men was supported by early science. However, during this time, scientific information about the human body was often incorrect and unreliable (Hersey, 2006). For example, scientists claimed that the physical traits and anatomy of women were less evolved or smaller than men (Hersey, 2006). Because the public often did not have the capacity to understand scientific processes, which were often biased, they accepted any information that was shared (Hersey, 2006). The belief of women as the weaker sex is still common today, but one that emerged from early, unreliable sources.

The belief that women did not have enough stamina often resulted in female brass musicians losing positions after advancing to the final round of auditions where their

gender was revealed (Jenkins, 2017). In the 1980s, Abbie Conant, a female trombone player, took numerous physical, medical tests to prove that she had the physical capacity to play for the position that she had won in an audition and was denied once her gender was revealed (Hersey, 2006). All tests proved Conant was well equipped to fill the position and she gained her spot back after many years. Despite the evidence of such medical tests today, outdated beliefs regarding female stamina continued to prevail. For example, in the 1990s, Rolf Smedvig, a famous trumpet player, criticized female brass musicians during a master class, saying their poor performance was due to their sex and thus lack of strength (Hersey, 2006). A forum between the students and teacher was held in response in order to address the issue, but unfortunately did not result in corrective action.

Gee's (2010) research revealed that there are still mixed perceptions of women's physical abilities as some participants maintained that women are less able than men to perform well due to their smaller lung capacity. However, there were also some responses which acknowledged the inaccuracy of the belief of women's inability to perform as well as men due to biological differences and stated that there are people today who still believe it is true.

Physical appearance. Brass instruments were also associated with masculinity because one had to change their facial features in order to play and adjust their body to hold the bigger, heavier instrument (Macleod, 1993; Gee, 2010). It was considered inappropriate for a woman to play a brass instrument because it would distort her physical appearance, especially her face (Macleod, 1993). It was also thought to be difficult for women to appear graceful and decorative while supporting the larger instrument. Thus, playing a brass instrument would disrupt a woman's femininity.

When trying to establish a sense of belonging, adolescents often consider how others perceive their physical appearance (Abeles, Hafeli, & Sears, 2014). Playing an instrument that does not conform to one's gender may make a student feel different and in turn, heighten insecurities around their physical appearance. In a study examining computer mediated communication (CMC), where brass instrumentalists were represented in the sample, Abeles, Hafeli, and Sears, (2014) found that women and men brought up issues regarding their physical appearance in relation to the instrument they

played. The authors concluded that in CMC, people "make an effort to reinforce their gender identity through their appearance" (Abeles, Hafeli, & Sears, 2014, p. 361). The authors suggest that based on the findings, musicians perceive the instrument they play as one of their identities and that musicians look for support in integrating this identity when it does not align with stereotypical gender norms or they make changes in their choices/life.

Musical ability versus physical appearance. All-female ensembles (explained in more detail later on) gained popularity partially due to the novelty of seeing women play all orchestral instruments (Macleod, 1993). These ensembles often used the novelty of their gender to draw in a wider audience by putting as much work into their appearance and costumes as they did into the musical performance (Hersey, 2006). They portrayed themselves as high-class through their outfits in order to distinguish themselves from lower-class burlesque performers, which were also popular during this period. In addition, to address the incongruity of their gender and instrument, the women in these ensembles emphasized their femininity so that they would be more accepted while playing masculine instruments. However, the emphasis on femininity, in order to be perceived as similar to the common upper-class woman, was sometimes so exaggerated that its perpetuated "the stereotype of women's weak and frivolous nature" (Hersey, 2006, p. 60).

In research that highlights the lives of female trumpet players, Card (2009) discovered a number of present day female musicians who used the novelty of being a female who plays a brass instrument to further their career. One example is Carole Dawn Reinhart who decided to go the soloist route and use her gender to her advantage. Similarly, Gee (2010) found that current marketing strategies include display of both men and women's bodies on album covers. This equal emphasis on appearance and musicality by early females ensembles was reflected in the reviews which often noting the performers' appearance in addition to commenting on the music.

Reviews which commented on both the performers' appearance and their musicality were not exclusive to these female ensembles that chose to emphasize these qualities. These types of reviews were apparent for all types of female acts regardless of age, time period, context, and type of act, as long as they were female. For example, in

Paris, Alphonse Sax was trying to promote female musicians by speculating about the health benefits of wind and brass playing for women who were at the time often becoming sick with tuberculosis (Ellis, 1999). However, reviews of the female ensemble that Sax promoted focused on the how the female performers' body looked while playing a brass instrument. Reviews that commented on a female performers' physical appearance also occurred in the U.S. for all-women orchestras, brass bands, and young girls who played brass instruments in school marching bands (Card, 2009; Hersey, 2006; Macleod, 1993).

In the present day, comments on a female performer's musicality as well as their appearance are still common. Gee (2010) identified written articles of professional female brass performers, some of which included references to the performer's appearance even in the title of the article. In addition, Abeles, Hafeli, and Sears (2014) found that in only a few cases of CMC did males only comment on the playing ability of female brass musicians. More often, comments on female performers playing stereotypically masculine instruments were sexual and negative about the quality, though there were some comments that were positive. Specifically, males' comments often consisted of sexual references and devalued the quality of female performances based on their gender and physical appearance.

Sexuality

Although there did not appear to be extensive research on the perceptions of an individual's sexuality in relation to their instrument choice, a few studies indicated similar trends. Abeles, Hafeli, and Sears (2014) examined CMC on musicians who played instruments that were not stereotypical of their gender, such as female trumpet players. The authors found that CMC consisted of assumptions of the musician's sexuality, specifically that people often assumed that a person was homosexual if they played an instrument that did not conform to their gender. Similarly, Gee (2010) found that participants who taught private music lessons had interactions with parents who inquired about child's sexuality. For example, a parent wondered whether their child was homosexual when their child did not play a stereotypically gender-appropriate instrument.

Race

Scientific information was not only biased with regards to gender but also with regards to race as, similar to thoughts on women, it was also believed that the physical traits and anatomy of people of colour were less evolved or smaller white people (Hersey, 2006). This type of distinction between people based on the colour of their skin is evident in other realms. For example, during World War II, when military band positions opened up for women (more on this later), the US Army claimed that there would not be any discrimination towards those who auditioned for spots within the military bands (Card, 2009). However, all black women who auditioned for military bands were assigned to a separate band.

Today, while there has not been extensive, current research on race and brass instruments, a few studies have explored this topic. Johnson and Stewart (2004) conducted a study in which band directors assigned instruments to students after either viewing the student's face or only the student's mouth. They noticed a trend where the black student was often being assigned trombone or trumpet by male band directors. The authors had not factored in race in the original sample, indicating that the finding was not conclusive. The authors conducted a follow-up study in which race was accounted for and did not find any significant differences on instrument assignment based on race (Johnson & Stewart, 2005).

While these studies did not indicate a racial discrimination for instrument assignment, an earlier study found differences in performance grades that intersected with race. Elliot (1995/1996) conducted a study in which one audio recording of a trumpet excerpt was lined up with four videos of students: one black, female student; one white, female student; one black, male student and; one white, male student. The videos were of each student playing the excerpt, but the audio was the same for each video. In addition, the students were taped from a great enough distance that the viewer could not distinguish their facial features or bodily gestures. An evaluator, who was unaware that the audio was the same for each video, watched the auditions and graded the students. Although the audio was the same for each student, black students were graded lower than white students on their trumpet performance.

Women Playing Instruments

Although music was often described as having the same qualities as women, numerous social beliefs limited women to a narrow range of musical activities (Macleod, 1993). The realm of performing music was considered unsuitable for upper-class women as it consisted of practices that would take women outside of their usual domestic responsibilities (Gee, 2010). In addition, successful performances required skills and characteristics that were traditionally associated with men only (Macleod, 1993). These included self-assertion, control over nerves, and competition to further one's career.

Women were able to transition to performing in the public sphere in a number of ways, a notable one being solo performances such as when women began to publically perform on piano. Although women were known to play this instrument, the public was introduced to women's ability to play powerfully on stage, demonstrating "the strength and mastery required of a soloist," (Macleod, 1993, p. 292) traits usually attributed to men. When women demonstrated these traits during a performance, reviews of the performance described women as demonstrating a man's ability; essentially disregarding the possibility that such traits are also inherent in women. The acceptance of women performing violin was also a result of young female performers who gained popularity and inspired other women to take up violin (Macleod, 1993). The public was more accepting of children's "expression of passion and mastery" (Macleod, 1993, p. 294) than they were of women.

As more women became successful on violin, society adapted. For instance, reviewers began to describe it as "not only an acceptable but even an appropriate and noble pursuit for women." (Macleod, 1993, p. 294). However the way society adapted may have been problematic: reviewers changed the way they described the instrument by focusing on attributes that aligned with femininity such as the instrument's light weight and emotional expressiveness. This only reinforced the perceived differences between men and women. Nonetheless, performing on violin led to acceptance of women playing other stringed instruments, eventually also expanding to winds and brass (Macleod, 1993).

All-women ensembles and World War II (WWII). Although women were seen successfully performing solo, there was resistance to opening the ensemble for women to

join because of: prevailing, limited perceptions of women's stamina; attitudes about which instruments were acceptable for women to play; and the belief that women should not do anything that interferes with their appearance (Macleod, 1993). Men were also concerned about being distracted by the presence of women (Macleod, 1993). Additional social beliefs preventing women from obtaining professional music positions included the thought that paying a woman meant not providing a man with money to support his children and that it would be inappropriate for a woman to work after having children as she should want to care for her family (Jenkins, 2016).

All-women ensembles of various types were developed in response to provide women with a space to play music with others (Macleod, 1993). At first, the instrumentation was affected by the social limitations women faced earlier in that they mostly trained on strings and smaller instruments. As a result, there was often an imbalance in the instrumentation of all-women orchestras. With time, the instrumentation balanced out, leading to all-women brass bands and full orchestras which flourished (Sullivan, 2008, Hersey, 2006).

When men in the U.S. joined the military during WWII, orchestral positions opened up to women, and many horn players got positions in major orchestras (Jenkins, 2016). People were not completely accepting of this change and commented on the lowering standard of the orchestra that resulted in having to hire women to fill positions (Jenkins, 2016). Swing bands and college bands also became more popular when men were at war (Sullivan, 2008). Women provided a distraction from the war with music which may also be interpreted as women filling a nurturing and entertainment role. Many government-funded military band positions also opened up for women during this time as well (Sullivan, 2008). Women filled the spots that were left open when men were drafted for war and by playing in such bands, women helped raise money that was much needed to support the costs of war.

All-women's orchestras closed in response to the war as their best players were gone and because there was a resultant lack of business (Jenkins, 2016). However, participation in all-women bands provided women with the foundational performance experience needed to be able to fill in the opened orchestral and military band positions.

After the war: Biases resurface. After the war, the majority of the military ensembles were male again and female military bands no longer received funding (Sullivan, 2008). Women were not thrown out of orchestras as quickly as they were in other workplaces, however they were slowly weeded out despite having proved that they could successfully perform alongside men (Jenkins, 2016). Previous arguments for why women should not be in ensembles were used again. Eventually, some women were admitted into major orchestras and were able to extend their playing career; however the number of women admitted decreased substantially.

The International Conference of Symphony Orchestra Musicians (ICSOM) helped women have a fairer opportunity in obtaining positions in professional music orchestras by creating rules that ensured public advertising of orchestral positions and by establishing a hiring process that involved more than one judge. Blind auditions were also introduced in the U.S.; however, "many orchestras continued to hold unscreened final rounds" (Jenkins, 2017, p. 62) leaving an opportunity for adjudicators to choose based on the gender of the person auditioning.

Hersey's (2006) research in highlighting notable female brass players revealed that in a number of cases, female brass players were not hired simply because they were women - potentially a result of which instruments are considered acceptable for women to play. Susan Slaughter even began initialing her audition requests to hide her gender so that she could receive more invitations to audition (Card, 2009).

What has resulted over time is an underrepresentation of females playing brass instruments in a variety of settings from schools to the professional world of music-making. This poses a problem, as according to Gee's (2010) findings, brass musicians consider playing in ensembles as part of their social identity. In the UK, some of the top-rated brass ensembles are all male reflecting the belief that "these are the type of people who can succeed" (Gee, 2010, p. 151). The following studies demonstrate a continuing trend of more males than females playing brass instrument starting from the 1960s.

Instruments played. Zervoudakes and Tanur (1994) examined elementary, high school, and college band programs from the 1960s to 1980s. They found that the average number of females playing feminine instruments increased while the average number of females playing masculine instruments decreased or stayed the same. The proportion of

females in principle positions also remained the same. Results from another study that included data from a similar time period, the 1960's to 2000s, revealed that at one university, more males than females played trumpet, trombone, and euphonium (Peters, 2016). In contrast, consistently more females than males played French horn.

Similarly Hallam, Rogers, and Creech (2008) found that relatively equal number of girls and boys played French horn while more boys than girls played trombone and tuba. Based on the results of a survey, a significant relationship was found between student gender and their instrument choice for both beginners and experienced music students (Wrape, Dittloff, & Callahan, 2016). Specifically, more boys than girls played trumpet and only boys played trombone, euphonium, and tuba. In addition, although girls classified trombone as a girl instrument, none played the trombone, and similar to the above studies, a relatively equal number of boys and girls played French horn.

To expand the research on instruments played to include various countries around world, Sheldon and Price (2004) carried out a preliminary study. While considering that that their method of data collection was not scientific, the results of their study align with those within the U.S. In analyzing instrument selections per country, with and without figures from the U.S., they found that more males than females play the trumpet, trombone, and tuba. Also, a fairly equal number of males and females play horn, leaning slightly more towards males. It appears that in terms of actual instrument played, most brass instruments are pursued by males with the exception of the French horn which was often found to be played by fairly even number of females and males.

Classifying Instruments. For brass instruments, both male and female undergraduates ranked the trumpet and tuba as masculine and the French horn as feminine (Griswold & Chroback, 1981). Delzell and Leppla (1992) found similar results in that music and non-music majors ranked trombone and trumpet as masculine instruments. Wrape, Dittloff, and Callahan's (2016) also found similar results in ranking brass instruments, but that student gender and level of band experience appeared to influence rigidity of gender associations. All students from 6th to 8th grade classified tuba as a boy instrument. In addition, a higher number of students who had more band experience classified trombone, trumpet, and French horn as boy instruments, than did

students who had less band experience. Also, a higher number of girls classified trumpet and trombone as girl instruments than did boys.

Research has indicated that variables other than instrument and student gender influence the gender associated to an instrument. Marshall and Shibazaki (2011) found that musical genre appeared to have a stronger influence on gender associations for some instruments than did the instrument itself. Trumpet was perceived as a more neutral instrument in this study, a shift from previous studies where trumpet was rated as masculine. The authors noted a number of other possible explanations of this finding including that the trumpet melody in both excerpts had similar musical elements and thus concluded that instrument and musical genre interact in highly complex ways. However, in a later study, musical genre did not appear to influence gender nominations of instruments (Marshall & Shibazaki, 2013). The authors also investigated the effect of an image on gender nominations and found that in the picture condition, most children made male associations for trumpet whereas in the sound condition, most children made female nominations for trumpet. Combining results of both conditions, most boys and most girls made male nominations for trumpet.

Instrument preferences. Survey research indicated that 35% of the participants would prefer the instrument they currently play which for females were woodwind instruments and for males were brass instruments or percussion (Fortney, Boyle, & DeCarbo, 1993). Sinsel, Dixon, Jr., and Blades-Zeller (1997) explored how children's sex-type influenced their instrument preferences. Results indicated that most of the sex-typed children (i.e., those who scored high on masculinity and low on femininity or high on femininity and low on masculinity) preferred instruments that conformed to their gender and least preferred instruments that were stereotypically classified as the opposite gender, confirming results from previous studies. For example, males most preferred trombone or tuba. In addition, most of the androgynous children (i.e., those who scored high on masculinity and high on femininity) chose neutral instruments, for example French horn or trumpet. While they least preferred sex-typed instruments, a higher proportion of the androgynous children than the sex-typed children preferred some sex-typed instruments.

In exploring how musicians demonstrating instruments influence children's instrument preferences, Killian and Satrom (2011) found that in the pre-test, the majority of boys chose trumpet and the majority of girls chose flute. Although not statistically significant, more children chose instruments that conformed to their gender even when they saw a musician of the same gender demonstrate all the instruments. However, although not statistically significant, after seeing an opposite-gender musician demonstrate all the instruments, a relatively equal number of children chose gender-consistent instrument and those who chose a gender-inconsistent instrument. In another demonstrator study, Pickering and Repacholi (2001) found that boys preferred a masculine instrument, including trumpet and trombone, even after they saw a male demonstrate gender-inconsistent instruments. In comparison, more girls preferred a masculine instrument after seeing a female demonstrate gender-inconsistent instruments.

Instrument preferences versus classifying instruments. Delzell and Leppla (1992) examined whether fourth grade students' instrument preferences aligned with which instruments the children predicted other boys and girls would prefer. The authors found that, when first and second choices were combined, more boys than girls ranked trombone as their preferred instrument to play and that a relatively equal number of boys and girls ranked trumpet as a preferred instrument to play. They also found that both boy and girl participants often predicted which instruments boys would prefer to play. O'Neill and Boulton (1996) also explored 9-11 year-old children's instrument preferences and which instruments the children thought other boys and girls would not prefer. The authors found that more boys than girls ranked trumpet higher as a preferred instrument and that most of the children maintained that their preferred instrument would not be preferred by a child of the opposite gender. Harrison and O'Neill (2003) found similar results in a study where they presented hypothetical scenarios of new students and the instrument they played, and asked participants to indicate preferences of the hypothetical new students. Results for specific instruments showed that most boys and girls thought that boys would prefer trumpet. For the presented scenarios of new students, results indicated that when the new student's gender was known, the participants thought that the new student had gender stereotypical preferences, even if the hypothetical student played a gender-inconsistent instrument. Also, when the new student's gender was unknown, the

participants indicated gender stereotypical preferences based on the instrument the new student played.

The introduction of instrument demonstrators appeared to influence children's preferences. Specifically, Harrison and O'Neill (2000) found that more boys than girls ranked trumpet higher as their instrument preference. However, children who observed demonstrators, of the opposite gender, playing an instrument that aligned with the child's gender (i.e. when a boy saw a female demonstrator play trumpet), children ranked gender-consistent instruments as less preferred. The authors also found that both boys and girls thought that their most preferred instrument would be played by other children of the same gender and that their least preferred instrument would be played by other children of the opposite gender.

Personality Traits. A couple of studies examined the traits associated to musicians based on their gender and instrument played. Cramer, Million, and Perreault (2002) found that male and female musicians who played masculine instruments, including trumpet, were ranked highly on the dimensions of dominance, leadership, and activity, which the authors classified as masculine traits. In comparison, male and female musicians who played feminine instruments were ranked highly on dimensions of caring, sensitivity, warmth, which were classified as feminine traits. This suggests that masculine instruments are associated with masculine personality traits. Similarly, Ziv (2013) conducted research on music and non-music majors' perception of the traits of instrumentalists. Results indicated that generally, both music and non-music majors rated trumpet players higher on masculine dimensions; specifically, trumpet players were considered as more "extraverted, friendly, tough, and assertive and less introverted, anxious, sensitive, and shy" (p. 174) than flute or violin players.

Overall, these studies demonstrate that a masculine stereotype has prevailed over the years, suggesting that some of the extreme beliefs about female brass players exist in some way today.

Implications for Music Therapy

Most of the existing literature on the early perceptions of brass playing reveal a number of restrictions based on gender. Framing these findings within a material culture perspective shows how they may be present in clinical music therapy and how continued

use of instruments in sessions – without acknowledging and addressing their role – may reinforce the same problems that clients come to sessions for help with.

Within in the field of material cultures, there are many approaches that are considered appropriate for studying objects (Woodward, 2007; Dant 1999, 2005). A limitation that has been identified in current approaches is that methods of studying objects only explore what cultural values and beliefs objects symbolize. This restricts our understanding of how objects act on people; thus, a proposed solution has been to study how people use and interact with objects. As no specific method of this type has been developed, Dant (2005) identified two philosophers, whose phenomenological perspectives contain concepts that would enable a study of how people use and interact with objects. Of the philosophers outlined by Dant (2005), Merleau-Ponty (1962) and the concepts of the "phenomenal field" (p. 60), "intentionality of act" (p. xx), and "operative intentionality" (p. xx) are relevant to this analysis.

In his phenomenological perspective, Merleau-Ponty's (1962) argues that physical actions depend on previous experiences of embodying such actions rather than the natural functions of our senses. The previous experience may have been acquired through direct involvement in the process or through indirect involvement by being taught or watching other people, in one's culture, embody the process.

A concept Merleau-Ponty (1962) develops to further explain his perspective is the phenomenal field. The phenomenal field is the point where we interact with other beings and objects and where we can start to understand interactions with other people and objects. It is within this field that common actions take place and that obstacles may be identified. Merleau-Ponty (1962) also summarizes the differences between intentionality of act and operational intentionality as described by Edmund Husserl, where intentionality of act is the conscious judgement of a situation that influences a change in our response. It may arise when an obstacle in the phenomenal field is identified. In contrast, operative intentionality is the unconscious judgement of a situation which calls on a previously learnt response or habit. In this process, people are presented with familiar situations in which they know how to respond to achieve the result they desire.

Material culture analysis. In examining the literature for the types of physical actions required in brass playing, it was found that brass instruments required a high level

of exertion and a change in facial features (Macleod, 1993). Because of initial beliefs that women were the weaker sex, women were not considered to have the physical abilities to be able to play brass instruments (Gee, 2010; Hersey, 2006). Additionally, as women were expected to maintain their physical appearance, it was considered unacceptable for them to play an instrument that demanded a change in facial features (Jenkins, 2016; Gee, 2010). The concern of physical features involved in brass playing is also still present today as evidenced in CMC (Abeles, Hafeli, & Sears, 2014). These issues initially restricted women from playing brass instruments and when they later began to play brass, their public and professional opportunities were highly limited (Macleod, 1993).

Meanwhile it was acceptable for men to play brass as they were thought to have the required physical capacity and were not expected to maintain their physical appearance (Macleod, 1993). This led to increasingly higher representation of male brass players which was observable by the public. I would argue that this observation taught various social groups including young children, youth, adults, music directors, music teachers, etc. that brass playing is only acceptable for men and only men have the capacity to play brass.

Once women actually engaged in playing brass, they demonstrated that they did in fact have the physical capacity to play. This is evident in women successfully filling vacant orchestral and military band positions when men were drafted for WWII (Jenkins, 2016). In addition, Abbie Conant passed multiple medical tests which measured her physical abilities, providing evidence that she, a woman, did have the physical capacity to play equally as well as a man (Hersey, 2006).

All-women's orchestras often emphasized their femininity in addition to mastering their brass instruments (Hersey, 2006). However, there were still obstacles in the environment, or the phenomenal field, that prevented them from being well-received by audiences. The focus on appearance reflects an intentionality of act as it shows that the prior standard of an acceptable performance, physical ability, was not sufficient and an additional action was necessary. Research shows that this obstacle is still present today as there are female brass players who still emphasize their femininity in addition to their highly exceptional standard of playing (Card, 2009; Gee, 2010).

What was initially taught through observation to the public appeared to have prevailed over the physical evidence. This is evident in numerous situations that have occurred after women were seen having successful careers as brass players and years after the Abbie Conant case. Such incidents include: women losing positions after their gender was revealed during auditions; the incident of Rolf Smedvig; and survey responses saying that women have small lung capacity and are less able to play (Hersey, 2006; Jenkins, 2017; Gee, 2010). In addition, numerous research studies reveal that often, the majority of brass players, at all levels and ages, are male. These incidents and trends document that people still respond to female brass players in similar ways as they did in the 19th century reflecting the process of operative intentionality; that such ways of responding to female brass players have become habits.

In the music therapy room. The research reveals that many of the issues surrounding the use of brass instruments are still present today. In the music therapy context, I argue that as these issues are still present in society, they may influence a broad array of parameters, including which instruments our clients choose to play in sessions and how they choose to play certain instruments in sessions. These issues may influence a client's perception of the therapist's playing, other clients' playing, and their own playing. In terms of perception, it might influence whether they are accepting of their playing, critical towards what they play, or whether they identify with what they have played. Although clients may not have had substantial experiences with musical instruments, a number of studies have shown that prior to any type of music instruction, individuals still classified and indicated preference for instruments in ways that follow traditional gender stereotypes. This suggests that there are incidences in the everyday environment that influences one's perception of instruments.

In therapy, especially relevant to the creative arts, one foundational concept is that what occurs in the context of a therapy room will increasingly transfer to other areas of a client's personal life. In the therapy room, challenges are explored by recreating our daily experiences whether actual events, emotions, or thought processes; the therapy room is used as a safe space to practice techniques that will help a client progress towards their goals. If instruments are used in an uninformed manner, I argue that we may

inadvertently reinforce the marginalizing beliefs that guide how people interact with objects which may transfer to other areas of the client's life.

Towards a More Informed Clinical Practice

Instruments in music therapy sessions may be used as a point of reference for a larger discussion with clients about the social issues and the challenges they face. Instruments may present a safe way to begin exploring bigger issues such as limited opportunities and personal characteristics which may be sensitive topics for clients. Such a discussion might be opened up in situations that are similar to those mentioned above – where social issues may influence a client's therapeutic process. Music therapists might ask clients why they chose a certain instrument and ask about their perception of their own, others', or the therapist's playing. I believe that this could be one way of bringing awareness to underlying social beliefs regarding actions and objects, and may eventually lead to a change in response (Merleau-Ponty, 1962).

Starting to do personal research on the history of your instruments would be important, but what may be even more insightful especially at the beginning, is conversations with colleges and friends on these topics. Sharing experiences, asking questions, and gaining new insights can be a very informative way of expanding one's awareness of the issues related to objects used daily. One very important part of this type of conversation is to acknowledge your own biases and privileges. Facing them in the presence of others and making changes is an important step in making positive change in your surroundings.

Chapter 5. Conclusion

Summary of Findings

Most of the existing literature on the early perceptions of brass playing reveals a number of restrictions based on gender. A few studies also revealed issues where race or sexuality intersected with brass instruments. Uninformed understanding of women's physical abilities guided the public's perception of women's interests and capabilities. Two of the main challenges female musicians faced included proving that they had the stamina to play brass instruments and pursuing interests – that were outside of the home environment – that may change their physical appearance. This led to obstacles when women tried to expand their musical endeavours to a wider variety of instruments, to perform in public, and to play musical groups.

In the current day, many feel that the extreme comments and restrictions of the 19th and 20th centuries are highly unlikely and would not go unaddressed. However, I have argued that these early beliefs and values continue to inform the way people interact with each other and with objects. I also argued that these findings have implications for the music therapy context. These include influencing clients' choice of instrument, their musical engagement during clinical interventions, and their perception of others', the music therapists' and their own playing. In addition, these findings of oppressive beliefs point towards the possibility that continued uninformed use of instruments in music therapy may reinforce such beliefs and transfer to other areas of the client's life.

The established research questions have been addressed as a review and analysis the literature revealed a number of issues related to gender in the current use of Western symphonic brass instruments in society; along with a select number of studies that address sexuality and race in the same context. These issues have persisted throughout history despite stemming from biased beliefs that were socially constructed based on unreliable information. These issues may then impact the music therapy context by influencing the client's participation in sessions and eventually influencing their everyday environment. In addressing these research questions, a clear case has been made for the importance for music therapists of understanding the issues of oppression related to Western symphonic instruments used in music therapy.

Limitations

The limitations of this research include my limited clinical and research experience in music therapy. Thus, I am still developing my personal approach and philosophical orientation. While I am hopeful that change can be made, I may not be fully aware of the realities of the work force and the full scope of issues that clients may want to address in sessions. The delimitation of brass instruments also acted as a limitation, as specific issues identified might not transfer to other instruments. In addition, there was limited information on other issues of oppression when the search was delimited to brass. Another limitation of this research is that being written by a single author it necessarily reflects only one perspective, my own which may be influenced by my particular identity, social locations, and world view. An understanding of this issue could be enriched by contributions from others with diverse world views.

Future Research

Future research into other instruments are used in sessions could benefit the music therapy profession. This could result in increased access by music therapists to valuable information. In addition, this research on issues of oppression could be expanded to explore more computer mediated communication (CMC) which is constantly growing and is an accessible mode of information for the society at large. Case studies of therapeutic processes that address social issues through objects could also be helpful in showing how such a process may unfold. Surveys assessing clients' perspectives on the usefulness of a process that explores social issues could help therapists understand the benefits, disadvantages, and areas that still need to be addressed in this type of approach. Finally, therapeutic interventions might be developed to provide music therapists with a template for using such techniques.

References

Abeles, H. (2009). Are musical instrument gender associations changing? *Journal of Research in Music Education, 57*(2), 127-139. doi:10.1177/0022429409335878

Abeles, H. F., Hafeli, M., & Sears, C. (2014). Musicians crossing musical instrument gender stereotypes: A study of computer-mediated communication. *Music Education Research, 16*(3), 346-366. doi:10.1080/14613808.2014.906395

Abeles, H. F., & Porter, S. Y. (1978). The sex-stereotyping of musical instruments. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 26*(2), 65-75. doi:10.2307/3344880

Adrienne, J. (2006). A feminist sociology of professional issues in music therapy. In S. Hadley (Ed.), *Feminist perspectives in music therapy* (pp. 41-62). Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.

Aigen, K. (2005). Philosophical inquiry. In B. Wheeler (Ed.), *Music therapy research* (pp. 526-539). Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.

Baines, S. (2014). Giving voice to service user choice: music therapy as an anti-oppressive practice. (Doctoral Dissertation, University of Limerick, Limerick, Ireland). Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/10344/4264

Card, R. D. (2009). *Women as classically-trained trumpet players in the United States* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Database. (UMI No. 3377520)

Cramer, K. M., Million, E., & Perreault, L. A. (2002). Perceptions of musicians: Gender stereotypes and social role theory. *Psychology of Music, 30*(2), 164-174. doi:10.1177/0305735602302003

Curtis, S. L. (1996). *Singing subversion, singing soul: Women's voices in feminist music therapy* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Database. (Order No. NQ44871)

Curtis, S. L. (2006). Feminist music therapy: Transforming theory, transforming lives. In S. Hadley (Ed.), *Feminist perspectives in music therapy* (pp. 227-244). Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.

Curtis, S. L. (2012). Music therapy and social justice: A personal journey. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 39*, 209-213. doi:10.1016/j.aip.2011.12.004

Dant, T. (1999). *Material culture in the social world: Values, activities, lifestyles.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Dant, T. (2005). *Materiality and sociality.* Berkshire, England: Open University Press.

Dean, H. (2007). Marginalization, outsiders. In G. Ritzer (Ed.), *The Blackwell encyclopedia of sociology.* doi:10.1111/b.9781405124331.2007.x

Delzell, J. K., & Leppla, D. A. (1992). Gender association of musical instruments and preferences of fourth-grade students for selected instruments. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 40*(2), 93-103. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Doubleday, V. (2008). Sounds of power: An overview of musical instruments and gender. *Ethnomusicology Forum, 17*(1), 3-39. doi:10.1080/17411910801972909

Edwards, J. & Hadley, S. (2007). Expanding music therapy practice: Incorporating the feminist frame. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 34*, 199-207. doi:10.1016/j.aip.2007.01.001

Elliott, C. A. (1995/1996). Race and gender as factors in judgments of musical performance. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* (127), 50-56. Retrieved from http://bcrme.press.uillinois.edu/index.html

Ellis, K. (1999). The fair sax: Women, brass-playing and the instrument trade in 1860s Paris. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association, 124*(2), 221-254. doi:10.1093/szjrma/124.2.221

Feinberg, D. R., Jones, B. C., Little, A. C., Burt, D. M., & Perrett, D. I. (2005a). Manipulations of fundamental and formant frequencies influence the attractiveness of human male voices. *Animal Behaviour, 69*(3), 561-568. doi:10.1016/j.anbehav.2004.06.012

Feinberg, D. R., Jones, B. C., DeBruine, L. M., Moore, F. R., Law Smith, M. J., Cornwell, R. E.,… Perrett, D. I. (2005b). The voice and face of woman: One ornament that signals quality? *Evolution and Human Behavior, 26*(5), 398-408. doi:10.1016/j.evolhumbehav.2005.04.001

Fortney, P. M., & Others, A. (1993). A study of middle school band students' instrument choices. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 41*(1), 28-39. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Frye, M. (2000). Oppression. In L. Code (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of feminist theories* (pp. 370-370). Abingdon: Taylor & Francis.

Gee, K. A. (2010). *Lives and careers in music: A social identity perspective on brass music-making* (Doctoral Dissertation, The University of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK). Retrieved from http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/

Griswold, P. A., & Chronback, D. A. (1981). Sex-role associations of music instruments and occupations by gender and major. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 29*(1), 57-62. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Hadley, S. (2006). Embracing feminism: An overview. In S. Hadley (Ed.), *Feminist perspectives in music therapy* (pp. 1-35). Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.

Hallam, S., Rogers, L., & Creech, A. (2008). Gender differences in musical instrument choice. *International Journal of Music Education, 26*(1), 7-19. doi:10.1177/0255761407085646

Halstead, J. & Rolvsjord, R. (2015). The gendering of musical instruments: What is it? Why does it matter to music therapy? *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy, 26*(1), 3-24. doi:10.1080/08098131.2015.1088057

Harrison, A. C., & O'Neill, S. A. (2000). Children's gender-typed preferences for musical instruments: An intervention study. *Psychology of Music, 28*(1), 81-97. doi:10.1177/0305735600281006

Harrison, A. C., & O'Neill, S. A. (2003). Preferences and children's use of gender-stereotyped knowledge about musical instruments: Making judgments about other children's preferences. *Sex Roles, 49*(7/8), 389-400. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/journal/volumesAndIssues/11199

Hersey, J. R. (2006). *"Such unfeminine instruments," women brass musicians in America before 1940* (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Thesis Database. (UMI No. 3214505)

Jenkins, E. (2016). Women horn players in the US part I: The early 20th century. *The Horn Call: Journal of the International Horn Society, 46*(3), 27-29. Retrieved from https://www.hornsociety.org/publications

Jenkins, E. (2017). Women horn players in the US part II: 1946-present. *The Horn Call: Journal of the International Horn Society, 47*(2), 58-63. Retrieved from https://www.hornsociety.org/publications

Johnson, C. M., & Stewart, E. E. (2004). Effect of sex identification on Instrument Assignment by band directors. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 52*(2), 130-140. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Johnson, C. M., & Stewart, E. E. (2005). Effect of sex and race identification on instrument assignment by music educators. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 53*(4), 348-357. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Killian, J. N., & Satrom, S. L. (2011). The effect of demonstrator gender on wind instrument preferences of kindergarten, third-grade, and fifth-grade students. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education, 29*(2), 13-19. doi:10.1177/8755123310396985

Loombe, D., Rodgers, S., Tomlinson, J., & Oldfield, A. (Eds.). (2015). *Flute, accordion or clarinet?: Using the characteristics of our instruments in music therapy.* London: Jessica Kingsley [ebook version]. Retrieved from https://www.ebscohost.com/ebooks/academic

Macleod, B. A. (1993). `Whence comes the lady tympanist?' gender and instrumental musicians in America, 1853-1990. *Journal of Social History, 27*(2), 291-308. Retrieved from https://academic.oup.com/jsh

Marshall, N. A., & Shibazaki, K. (2011). Instrument, gender and musical style associations in young children. *Psychology of Music, 40*(4), 494-507. doi:10.1177/0305735611408996

Marshall, N., & Shibazaki, K. (2013). Gender associations for musical instruments in nursery children: The effect of sound and image. *Music Education Research, 15*(4), 406-420. doi:10.1080/14613808.2013.826641

Maus, F. E (2011). Music, Gender, and Sexuality. In M. Clayton, T. Herbert, & R. Middleton (Eds.), *The cultural study of music: A critical introduction*, (pp. 317-329). New York, NY: Routledge.

Merleau-Ponty, M. (1962). *Phenomenology of perception.* (C. Smith, Trans.). London: Routledge. (Original work published 1945)

O'Neill, S. A., & Boulton, M. J. (1996). Boys' and girls' preferences for musical instruments: A function of gender? *Psychology of Music, 24*(2), 171-183. doi:10.1177/0305735696242009

Orchestra. (2016). In *Naxos Music Library.* Retrieved from http://www.naxos.com/mainsite/NewDesign/fglossary.files/bglossary.files/Orchestra.htm

Peters, G. (2016). Do students see themselves in the music curriculum? A project to encourage inclusion. *Music Educators Journal, 102*(4), 22-29. doi:10.1177/0027432116644330

Pickering, S., & Repacholi, B. (2001). Modifying children's gender-typed musical instrument preferences: The effects of gender and age. *Sex Roles, 45*(9/10), 623-643. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/journal/volumesAndIssues/11199

Rolvsjord, R., & Halstead, J. (2013). A woman's voice: The politics of gender identity in music therapy and everyday life. *The Arts in Psychotherapy, 40,* 420-427. doi:10.1016/j.aip.2013.05.015

Rolvsjord, R. (2006). Gender politics in music therapy discourse. In S. Hadley (Ed.), *Feminist perspectives in music therapy* (pp. 311-327). Gilsum, NH: Barcelona.

Scrine, E. (2016). Enhancing social connectedness or stabilising oppression: Is participation in music free from gendered subjectivity? *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy, 16*(2). doi:10.15845/voices.v16i2.881

Sheldon, D. A., & Price, H. E. (2005). Sex and instrumentation distribution in an international cross-section of wind and percussion ensembles. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education,* (163), 43-51. Retrieved from http://bcrme.press.uillinois.edu/index.html

Sinsel, T. J., Dixon, W. E., Jr., & Blades-Zeller, E. (1997). Psychological sex type and preferences for musical instruments in fourth and fifth graders. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 45*(3), 390-401. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com/loi/jrm

Stige, B., & Strand, R. (2016). Philosophical inquiries. In K. Murphy, & B. Wheeler (Eds.), *Music therapy research* (3rd ed.) (pp. 1064-1082). Dallas, TX: Barcelona [ebook version]. Retrieved from https://www.ebscohost.com/ebooks/academic

Sullivan, J. M. (2008). A century of women's bands in America. *Music Educators Journal, 95*(1), 33-40. doi:10.1177/0027432108321314

Woodward, I. (2007). *Understanding material culture.* London: Sage

Wrape, E. R., Dittloff, A. L., & Callahan, J. L. (2016). Gender and musical instrument stereotypes in middle school children: Have trends changed? *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education, 34*(3), 40-47. doi:10.1177/8755123314564255

York, E. & Curtis, S. L. (2015). Music therapy for women survivors of domestic violence. In B. L. Wheeler (Ed.), *Music therapy handbook,* (pp. 379-389). New York, NY: Guildford Press.

Zervoudakes, J., & Tanur, J. M. (1994). Gender and musical instruments: Winds of change? *Journal of Research in Music Education, 42*(1), 58-67. doi:10.2307/3345337

Ziv, N., Ayash, Y., & Ornstein, L. (2013). Instrument timbre and trait attribution. *Psychomusicology: Music, Mind, and Brain, 23*(3), 168-176. doi:10.1037/pmu0000012